Transnational Ageing in Place. The Case of Pakistani and Polish migrants in Norway

Katrine Mellingen Bjerke

Thesis for the degree of Philosophiae Doctor (PhD)
University of Bergen, Norway
2020

UNIVERSITY OF BERGEN

Transnational Ageing in Place. The Case of Pakistani and Polish migrants in Norway

Katrine Mellingen Bjerke

Thesis for the degree of Philosophiae Doctor (PhD)
at the University of Bergen

Date of defense: 04.12.2020

Year: 2020

Title: Transnational Ageing in Place. The Case of Pakistani and Polish migrants in Norway

Name: Katrine Mellingen Bjerke

Print: Skipnes Kommunikasjon / University of Bergen

Acknowledgements

Writing this thesis has been a challenging endeavour, one that I have many times feared would not be completed until I myself became old. It is also a lonely endeavour, and to many it may appear that academics constitute the personification of independence and autonomy. However, as the thesis accentuates; human beings are all interdependent on each other, and there are so many people I have relied upon throughout the process.

First of all I would like to express my profound and sincere gratitude to the participants in this study – for inviting me into their homes, for showing me around in their communities, but most of all for sharing their life stories with me. Each and every story is truly remarkable, and I hope I have done justice to all in my report.

I am thankful to my supervisor, Karen Christensen, for her patience, sound advice, encouragement, and support throughout the research process.

Research is very much a collective effort, and I have been lucky to do my research at the Department of Sociology, University of Bergen. Thanks to all of you for providing such a good academic milieu. Special thanks to Liv Johanne Syltevik for always being so encouraging and for all her great advices. Thanks also to the VUL-group who have provided me with constructive feedback on chapters and article drafts.

At the Department of Sociology, a PhD seminar is organised monthly, where we provide feedback on each other's works, and afterward have stimulating discussions over a beer in a nearby "watering hole". Thanks to all the members of this PhD-group, many of you who are not only my colleagues, but whom I am also happy to call my friends. Special thanks to my colleague, but most of all my brilliant friend Mariya Bikova. Not only has she read all my chapters and given invaluable constructive feedback, but she has also provided me with much needed emotional support along the way.

Abstract

This thesis combines the research field of social gerontology and the field of migration research to explore the experiences of "ageing in place" among Pakistani and Polish migrants in Norway. In the social gerontological usage the concept of ageing in place refers to a set of ideals and ageing policies based on the premise that older people would prefer to stay in their home environments for as long as possible. In migration research the concept refers to the fact that most of the labour migrants and refugees who travelled to northern European countries – including Norway – after World War Two (WW2) are growing old in the destination country of migration. Hence, they are ageing in place in these destination countries.

The study constitutes a comparative biographical case study, based on biographical interviews and participant observation. Pakistani and Polish migrants were chosen because I wanted to compare the experiences of ageing in Norway among migrants from a country within and from a country outside of Europe. Although there is wide agreement that non-European migrants are more likely to be vulnerable and disadvantaged than those coming from within Europe, there are hitherto few studies that compare differences and similarities in their experiences. Consequently, this study constitutes an important empirical contribution to scholarship on ageing and migration.

The thesis adopts a multidimensional approach whereby experiences of ageing in place is explored through the lens of three theoretical perspectives: A life course perspective; a transnational perspective; and an intersectionality perspective. Firstly, the life course perspective draws attention to how experiences of ageing as a migrant are shaped by forces operating at the macro, meso and micro level. At the macro level, this includes considering the social, economic, and cultural contexts which shapes the lives of older migrants. At the meso level, experiences of ageing in place is examined in relation to community formations, and in relation to family and kin. At the micro level, the experience of ageing in place is analysed in relation to the migrants' individual life course experiences. Secondly, the transnational perspective

serves to highlight migrants' ties to their countries of origin as these are biographically articulated, through migrants having spent parts of their lives in a different national context, as well as through their continuing transnational ties. Thirdly, the intersectionality perspective illuminates how inequality dimensions such as gender, ethnic background and class intersect in shaping older migrants' experiences of ageing in place in different ways.

In a transnational context, migrants live their lives in-between two different – sometimes contradictory – socio-political, structural, and cultural contexts which shapes their experiences of ageing in place. In the thesis, I explore this in relation to three dimensions: Firstly, I examine how migrants negotiate cultural expectations of family care and support. Secondly, I explore their experiences of ageing in place in relation to their incorporation in a formal support system, including their relation to the Norwegian welfare state. Thirdly, I explore their social embeddedness in Norway and the meanings of this social embeddedness for their sense of identity and belonging.

The study finds that Pakistani older migrants have stronger cultural expectations of family care than the Polish older migrants. These cultural expectations are collectively shared and upheld in the Pakistani migrant community in Norway. Polish older migrants do not have similar expectations and would rather make use of formal care services to protect their loving and affectionate family relationship. Norway promotes an ideal of dual earner/ dual carer families. This shapes the capacity of adult children to provide care for older family member. Thus, Pakistani older migrants must negotiate cultural expectations of family care in a context where adult children might not be able to take on full responsibility for care provision.

Another important finding of the thesis is that both the Pakistani and Polish older migrants have developed an intimate familiarity with the Norwegian welfare state and place a great deal of trust that the welfare state will be there in times of need. This intimate familiarity may be understood with regards to the relative resourcefulness of the migrants interviewed, and the relatively universal provision of welfare benefits

and services in Norway. Moreover, incorporation in the Norwegian health care system shapes their transnational mobility patterns – when to travel and for how long. However, while the Polish older migrants have access to a health care system in both Poland and Norway, due to membership in the European Union, Pakistani migrants do not have similar access to a health care system in Pakistan as they do in Norway. This means that for the Pakistani older migrants, incorporation in the Norwegian health care system is more important and shapes their transnational mobility patterns.

Combined, these dimensions put the Pakistani older migrants at greater risk of being vulnerable and disadvantaged than the Polish migrants. However, through the analysis I show that most of the Pakistani older migrants find ways to reconcile cultural expectations and normative behaviours from Pakistan, with the structural, cultural, and institutional demands of the Norwegian context. Moreover, Pakistani older migrants have developed a vibrant ethnic and religious community which serves to provide a buffer against some vulnerabilities, particularly feelings of loneliness and boredom. Because of norms of gender segregation in the Pakistani migrant community it is mostly Pakistani men who attend social gatherings in the public sphere – such as the mosque and ethnic community associations – and they do so several days a week. Women are not obliged to attend the mosque, but they often spend an afternoon a week there. The Polish older migrants who live in the larger cities also have strong ties to a religious community but gatherings in these communities occur less frequently. Pakistani men's frequent attendance in the mosque and gatherings in the ethnic community association indicates that the emotional and social support functions of these gatherings are greater than it is for Pakistani women, and for Polish older migrants in general.

Contents

Chapter 1. Introduction

1. Introduction

It is widely known today that labour migrants and refugees who migrated to northern Europe, including Norway, after World War Two (WW2), are growing old in the destination country of migration (Warnes et al, 2004;White, 2006, Ciobanu, Fokkema & Nedelcu, 2017). This migratory ageing represents a significant demographic shift in the cultural and socioeconomic make-up of the ageing population, which also contributes to the diversity of experiences and lifestyles in old age (Biggs & Daatland, 2004). This study explores the experiences[1] of ageing among migrants living in Norway.

Migration to Norway after WW2 occurred relatively late compared to other Northern European countries. In the 1970s onwards, after countries such as the United Kingdom (UK), Sweden and Denmark had introduced heavier restrictions on immigration, the number of labour migrants coming to Norway increased (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018). Most of the migrants who came to Norway in the 1970s came in early adulthood as labour migrants – either from southern parts of Europe – or from countries outside of Europe such as Morocco and Pakistan (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2012).

In 1975, Norway introduced a ban on immigration, which marked the start of a more restrictive and selective approach to immigration. After 1975, migrants could only gain legal residence based on refugee status, as family migrants or based on expert or student visas (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010)[2]. Consequently, in the decades

---

[1]The concept of experience in this study does not refer to experience in the phenomenological sense of the word. Although I draw inspiration from some phenomenological concepts in my analysis, my approach is not purely phenomenological. What distinguishes my approach from a phenomenological one is that I apply a life course perspective. In this approach, the concept of experience is used in a general encompassing sense of the word – aimed at highlighting how ageing migrant's present life circumstances relate to their former life course experiences, and how these are in turn shaped by broader structural, cultural and institutional characteristics of the social contexts in which they live their lives.

[2] Since 1954, there has been a common Nordic labour market. This means that migrants from the Nordic countries are exempt from regulation (NOU,2011:7). In addition, Norway is a member of the EEA, which means that migrants from EU and EEA member countries have free access to apply for work in Norway (Brochmann & Hagelund,2012).

following the ban the number of labour migrants to Norway has decreased while the numbers of family migrants and refugees have increased.

Migrants to Norway have come from a diverse array of countries, including other Northern European countries and the US, Eastern Europe, and from Asia, Africa, and Latin America (Henriksen & Mørk, 2010). On average, migrants in Norway are still relatively young compared to the native Norwegian population, however given that many of the migrants who have come to Norway in the 1970s onwards are staying put, the numbers of migrants who are growing old in Norway are steadily increasing (Henriksen & Mørk, 2010).

Among the migrants facing old age today, I have selected to conduct biographical interviews and ethnographic observations with migrants from Poland and Pakistan, who arrived in Norway in early or mid-adulthood and who are now ageing in place. The main purpose of selecting these two groups is to compare the experiences of migrants from within and from outside of Europe, and from countries with a different welfare system, and mode of care provision than the Norwegian.

2. Conceptual clarifications – what is an older migrant?

We understand the world through categories. It is through categories that we can classify, distinguish between different classes of objects, persons, or phenomena (Gubrium & Holstein, 2008). In this process of categorisation, however, we run the risk of constructing opposites between categories, thereby overemphasising similarities within a category and overlooking the differences within the category. In doing so, we run the risk of constructing, maintaining, or reproducing stereotypes (Gubrium & Holstein, 2008). Both "old age" and "migrant" represent categories subject to stereotyping, and as Torres (2006) points out the concept of "older migrant" equally so. Hence, there is a need to clarify how I define and make use of these concepts in the present study.

In the thesis, I make use of the concepts of "older," "ageing" and "later life" interchangeably. Following the arguments of Walsh & Näre (2016), I do not use these

concepts to refer to a fixed biological notion of age – nor are they understood in terms of chronological age. Rather, they are understood as sociocultural constructions emerging in specific places, and at particular historical times. In a life course perspective, concepts of young, adult, and old are understood as life phases with specific historically contingent characteristics, and the movement from one phase to another is conceptualised in terms of different institutionally embedded transitions (Settersten, 2006).

One of the transitions, used to mark the transition into old age is retirement from working life, which is institutionally defined by chronological age (Settersten, 2006). In Norway, the official age of retirement is the age of 67. However, in some professions workers have the option of taking out contractual early leave pension from the age of 62. Some also retire early because of health issues and may receive a disability pension. Some may also choose to retire later, in their early 70s (Christensen, 2018). This serves to illustrate the fluidity in the way in which the category old or ageing may be understood, as well as the difficulties in defining old age in terms of a specific chronological age limit.

Defining old age solely in terms of retirement is also problematic because it excludes people not employed in paid work, or who have worked on a part-time basis. In such cases, the transition from having childrearing obligations, or the escalation of health problems and increasing dependence on care in daily life can be added to define old age. However, regarding the latter, improved living conditions and increased longevity also means that people stay healthy longer. This means that poor health and care dependence should not be regarded as a defining characteristic of old age or later life. With that in mind, the concepts of the third and fourth age, as a distinction between the first and last phase of later life deserves mention. Whereas, the third age refers to the period after retirement when a person is of good health and free from the responsibilities of paid work and childrearing obligations, the fourth age refers to the period of declining health and increasing need of care (Christensen, 2018). The concepts of the third and fourth age has been subject to criticism, among other things, for presenting a dichotomous view of later life (cf. Gilleard & Higgs, 2010; Kafkovà,

2016). Consequently, I make use of both these concepts, albeit in a modified form, in the thesis. I will elaborate on how I make use of them in the chapter on theoretical frameworks.

In sum, I define old age broadly as consisting of a combination of the different life course transitions, including the possible transition to retirement; the possible decline on childrearing obligations and responsibilities; and the potential increase of health problems and care needs in daily life. Concerning chronological age, all the participants in the study are above the age of 60, have retired from working life, and have varying degrees of health problems and care needs. Following the arguments made by Walsh and Näre (2016, p.2) the thesis explores "the everyday lives of older people where aging is one, but not the only defining feature of their lives".

In defining the concept of migrant in this study, I draw on the official definition of the concept immigrant provided by Statistics Norway. They define an immigrant as a person who is born outside of Norway, with both parents, and four grandparents born in a foreign county (Dzamarija, 2019). This definition is a descriptive one, and it does not distinguish between persons based on, for instance, grounds for residence. Thus, the definition encompasses persons who have come to Norway from different countries and on different grounds, involving labour migrants, family migrants, refugees, and asylum seekers (Dzamarija, 2008). In the study, I make use of the concept migrant, rather than immigrant. This is mainly because of the historical legacies of the concept immigrant in migration scholarship, whereby the concept of immigrants has tended to denote a strong degree of permanence – also entailing a severing of all ties to the migrants' country of origin, and fully incorporating into the new country of residence (Schiller, Basch & Blanc, 1995). This fails to address the ongoing and continuing cross-border ties which migrants maintain, and the transnational behaviours of migrants, be it through maintaining contact with people in their countries of origin through activities such as for instance email, letters, telephone calls or Skype, or through circular migration – i.e. travelling back and forth between the two countries. Schiller et al. (1995, p.48) suggests the concept of "transmigrants" to highlight the complex ways in which migrants engage in

transnational practices. However, as much of the literature on ageing migrants in transnational contexts makes use of the concept migrant rather than transmigrant (cf. Ciobanu et al., 2019; Näre Walsh & Baldassar, 2017; Warnes et al., 2004; Warnes & Williams, 2006), I shall stick to using the concept migrant in this study.

In a study of the conceptualisation of older migrants in Swedish research, Torres (2006) has identified a tendency to treat older migrants as a singular category denoting a homogeneous group, who are culturally different from the majority population, have lower educational levels, poor language skills, poor socio-economic background and health. Torres (2006) argues that, in consequence, older migrants are constructed as a monolithic group who have special needs. In turn they become regarded as problematic others who represents a challenge for health and social care providers.

This stereotypical representation of older migrants predominantly stems from a failure to differentiate between older migrants according to where they have migrated from, when they have come (early or late in life), or grounds for migration and residence (in terms of labour migration, refugee, family migration and so on) (Torres, 2006).

In Northern European research on ageing and migration, the focus has been on the experience of different migrant groups – for instance in relation to migration status and timing of migration. Attention has especially been directed towards two groups of older migrants. The first ones are the so-called postwar guest workers[3], either from within Europe or from outside of Europe. The second one is the so-called "sunbelt" or "snowbird migrants" – defined as amenity seeking retirement migrants, who move

---

[3] The label guest-worker reflects the status of these migrants in the destination countries of migration. In many countries these migrants migrated to Western Europe to work and were hired on temporary work contracts. There was a high expectation that these migrants would return to their countries of origin following the expiration of their contracts, or at least after retirement. Initially this was also the plan for many of the migrants themselves – a process captured in the so-called "myth of return" (Anwar, 1979). However, research finds that the return decision is continuously postponed. Furthermore, over time many of these predominantly male migrants were joined by their families and the wish to return became more elusive. In consequence, most of these so-called guest workers have stayed in the destination countries of migration, and are ageing in place (Ciobanu, Fokkema & Nedelcu, 2017).

permanently or on a seasonal basis from Northern to Southern Europe, because of the better climate in these parts of Europe (Warnes et al., 2004; Ciobanu et al., p. 166).[4] The migrants in this study may be placed in the category of postwar labour migrants, who have migrated to Norway between the time span of the 1970s and 1990s. However, not all of them are labour migrants, and there are some important differences between the two groups, including timing of arrival, settlement patterns and incorporation within Norwegian society. Thus, at this point there is a need to specify some characteristics of migrants from Pakistan and Poland in Norway.

3. A brief history of Pakistani and Polish migration to Norway

3.1 A brief history of Pakistani migration to Norway

The first Pakistani migrants, who came to Norway, came as labour migrants in the late 1960s. Although they came from a diverse array of educational and class backgrounds in Pakistan, most of them worked in the low-skilled sections of the labour market – such as factory work or with hotel and cleaning services (Brochmann & Kjelstadli, 2008). Migration from Pakistan eventually showed traits of a chain migration, whereby networks between Pakistani migrants in Norway and people living in Pakistan motivated more people to migrate. Between 1967 and 1975 – when the ban on immigration to Norway was implemented – the number of Pakistani labour migrants in Norway had risen from 10 in 1967 to 3500 in 1975 (Carling, 1999). Between 1971 and 1975 migrants from Pakistan constituted the largest migration group to Norway (Carling, 1999). The chain migration also meant that new migrants would receive help by more established migrants in the settlement process (Brochmann, 2003), and this facilitated the construction of a relatively tight knit Pakistani community, especially in and around the major cities of Norway (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018).

---

[4] There are of course other groups worthy of mention, such as for instance former political refugees, late in life labour migrants and the so-called zero generation, i.e. parents of adult children who have migrated, who move to a their children's country of residence, either permanently or move back and forth (cf. Ciobanu et al.,2017). Recent literature has also focused on the specific experiences of retirement return migrants (see Ciobanu & Ramos, 2016 for a state-of-the-art review on retirement return migration)

The sheer numbers of migrants from Pakistan, and their dense residential patterns in and around major cities contributed to make migrants from Pakistan a very visible presence in Norway. This also entailed that Pakistani migration came to symbolise the new immigration to Norway in the 1970s, and the challenges associated with it, particularly in the mass media portrayal (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018). As Korbøl & Midtbøen (2018) writes, the perceived problems with immigration to Norway in the 1970s was transformed into the Pakistani problem in the mass media.

The initial plan for many of the Pakistanis in Norway was to stay a few years and then return to Pakistan (Brochmann & Kjelstadli, 2008). However, many decided to stay, and they wanted their families to come to Norway. The Pakistani women in this study came as family migrants – that is, they came to Norway to reunite with their husbands.

Although there is still a significant number of new migrants from Pakistan, mainly through marriage migration, migration from Pakistan has steadily declined, particularly after 2000 (Henriksen, 2009). However, if we include the children of Pakistani migrants who are themselves born in Norway, Pakistani migrants constitute the second largest group of migrants from outside of Europe currently living in Norway, only surpassed by Somali migrants (Steinkellner, 2020).

3.2 A brief history of Polish migration to Norway

Polish migration to Norway has steadily grown, especially after the enlargement of the European Union (EU) in 2004. Today, Polish migrants constitute the largest group of migrants to Norway (Statistics Norway, 2016). Friberg & Golden (2014) divide Polish migration to Norway into three different phases: the first phase from 1980 to 1990; the second phase from 1990 to 2004; and the third and largest phase from 2004 onwards (Friberg & Golden, 2014). The people interviewed in this study are part of the first and second phase, which primarily consists of refugees from the Polish communist regime, highly educated persons who came on expert visas, and family migrants (Friberg & Golden, 2014). Most of them are highly educated, and many have come to work as highly qualified workers in the university or oil sector. A few have come to work as musicians and artists. Moreover, some women came

because they met and married Polish men living in Norway or Norwegian men (Friberg & Golden, 2014). It is difficult to find numbers on exactly how many Polish migrants came in the first and second phase of Polish migration to Norway. According to Godzimirski (2011), there were 3790 migrants from Poland in 1989. Moreover, in this first and second phase, most of the Polish migrants to Norway are women, because of the aforementioned marriage migration (Henriksen, 2007).

Unlike migration from Pakistan, the first Polish migrants to Norway did not have the character of chain migration. A small majority of the migrants from Poland settled in and around the larger cities. However, compared to the Pakistani migrants, who often reside in areas of proximity to one another, their residential pattern is more geographically dispersed (Henriksen, 2007).

Polish migration to Norway has, before the EU accession in 2004, received little attention in the mass media, and in research. The lack of research into Polish migrants from the first and second phase, means that little is known about how these migrants fared in Norwegian society (Friberg & Golden, 2014). The little research that exists, suggests that Polish migrants from the first and second phase, have adapted well to Norwegian society (Szelagowska, 2011). Consequently, in contrast to the first Pakistani migrants who were very visible in the media debates on immigration, the polish migrants in Norway, from the first and second phase, have not been very visible.

4. Ageing in place in a transnational migratory context

The thesis explores the experiences of older Pakistani and Polish migrants in Norway, through the lens of ageing in place. In the study, the concept of ageing in place contains two meanings – one related to migration, and one related to a broader social gerontological usage. In relation to migration the concept simply denotes that, contrary to widespread beliefs that postwar labour migrants and refugees would at some point return to the countries they had emigrated from, many of the migrants are staying put in the destination country – hence they are "ageing in place" in the destination country of migration (Warnes et al., 2004).

In a broader social gerontological usage, the concept of ageing in place refers to a set of ideals and ageing policies based on the premise that older people would prefer to stay in their home environments for as long as possible. Policies aimed at facilitating this ageing in place; through delivery of care services to older people's homes and improving their residential environments, have now become widespread in advanced capitalist states (Christensen & Pilling, 2018). These policies also have a financial rationale. It is less costly to provide care services in the home of an older person, than it is to provide the more costly option of institutional care (Christensen & Wærness, 2018; Wiles et al. 2012).

Originating from the field of environmental gerontology, the social gerontological understanding of ageing in place rests upon assumptions that the home is central to a person's personal and social identity – particularly in old age. The assumption is that attachments to place and home environments are important for older people because of the length of time spent in the same place (Phillipson, 2007). In this understanding the home and local environment is a central site for memories, and social relationships with others. Moreover, people have developed familiar habits and routines in relation to their home environments, and the home therefore becomes an important source for maintaining autonomy and independence as people grow older (Phillips, Ajrouch & Hillcoat-Walletamby, 2010; Rowles, 1983; Rubinstein & Parmelee, 1992).

The understandings of place attachment underscoring ideas and policies promoting ageing in place, primarily centres upon people's attachments to physical and social environments, ranging from the immediate home environment to the neighbourhood and local community (Wiles et al, 2012). However, as Wiles et al. (2012) point out, the concepts of ageing in place, and place attachment are ambiguous. They are especially critical of the predominantly functional and physical understanding of place underlying ageing in place, and they argue that homes are not just physical, but also contain social and symbolic aspects. Scholars have also argued for the need for a multidimensional approach whereby the experiences of ageing in place are regarded as shaped by a person's physical and mental health, by social networks of family,

friends and neighbours, by incorporation in formal or informal support systems, and by broader social, political and economic forces (Lau et al., 2007; Paganini-Hill, 2013).

In migration scholarship, the assumption of continuity inherent in the concept of ageing in place has been subject to criticism. This assumption is evident in, amongst other things, the premise that place attachment develops through lifelong or long-term residence in the same physical and social environment. This continuity is not necessarily applicable to a migratory context – whereby life courses have been characterised by discontinuity rather than continuity in place (Phillipson & Ahmed, 2004; Phillipson, 2015; Torres, 2004). Not only have migrants, at some point in their lives, left behind their former safe and familiar physical environments, and had to adapt to new one. They have also left behind the safe and familiar social and cultural contexts and they must familiarise themselves with a new social and cultural context (Torres, 2004). In consequence, older migrants have been described as experiencing a state of being out of place (Becker, 2003), or a state of being "in-between" places (Torres, 2004, p.128). The latter concept of "in-between" is particularly applicable in a transnational migratory context, whereby countries of origin and the destination country of migration are drawn together in a singular transnational social context. Thus, ageing as a migrant means having to negotiate a complex web of social and spatial worlds, and constantly being exposed to different cultural beliefs, attitudes, values and normative behaviours from (at least) two national contexts (Blaakilde, 2015; Torres, 2004, p. 128).

Furthermore, McHugh and Mings (1996) argue that the concept of ageing in place implies a unitary static concept of home, whereby home is understood as one singular place. In turn, these assumptions juxtapose ageing in place with mobility and migration, regarding these as mutually exclusive phenomena. These assumptions exclude the experiences of older migrants, who often have a dynamic understanding of the concept of home attached to multiple different places, and who frequently combine ageing in place with transnational mobility (McHugh & Mings,l996; Walsh & Näre,2016). Consequently, as Blaakilde (2015, p.159) has argued, the concept of

ageing in place needs to be lifted from "a delineated national framework", and that we need to interrogate transnational settings as a place for ageing in place. In such an exploration, it is important to interrogate how migrants ageing in place in a transnational setting negotiate cultural practices, identities, and forms of belonging.

In exploring the experiences of ageing in place among Pakistani and Polish migrants I adopt a multidimensional approach to ageing in place. This means that I conceive of the concept of ageing in place more broadly. Rather than adopting the concept of "place attachment", narrowly understood as attachments to immediate physical and social environment, I approach ageing in place through the concept of "belonging" (May & Muir, 2015, p.1). This concept encompasses people's identifications with, and their attachments to, their relational, material, and cultural surroundings (May & Muir,2015,p.1) which have developed across the life course, and which are shaped by the structural, institutional and cultural contexts in which their lives are embedded.

5. Research on migrants ageing in place – a state-of-the art review

Historically speaking the topic of ageing in contexts of migration has been located at the margins of both social gerontology and the study of migration. The research field of migration studies has mainly been preoccupied with the lives of younger migrants and particularly with the stages when migration occurs. Moreover, migration studies in Norway which grapples with questions of belonging and identity has, with a few exceptions (cf. Moen, 2009; Markussen, 2020), tended to focus on the children and youth who are born in Norway (cf. Andersson, 2003; Fangen, 2007; Vestel, 2009).

There are three main reasons why the study of ageing and migration has been marginal to the field of social gerontology. The first reason is that the ageing of migrants who came to Northern European countries in the aftermath of WW2 constitutes a relatively recent phenomenon. The second reason is the hitherto popular belief that labour migrants in particular, would stay in the destination country of migration only temporarily, and at least that they would return to their countries of origin at retirement (i.e. the myth of return) (Phillipson, 2015). The third reason is the aforementioned assumption of continuity, which is not necessarily applicable to the

experiences of ageing among migrants who, because of migration, have experienced disruption and discontinuity in their life courses (Phillipson & Ahmed, 2004; Torres, 2004; Torres & Karl, 2016).

However, given the increase in the number of older migrants who are actually ageing in place in the destination country of migration, the number of studies on ageing and migration has steadily grown in recent decades (Torres & Karl, 2016). Over the course of the last 15-20 years a remarkable number of social science books and special issues have been published on the topic (cf. Baldassar, Baldock & Wilding, 2007; Ciobanu et al. 2017; Ciobanu & Hunter, 2017; Horn & Schweppe, 2016; Karl and Torres, 2016; Näre et al.,2017; Lawrence & Torres, 2016; Torres & Lawrence,2012; Walsh & Näre, 2016; Warnes & Williams, 2006; Zubair & Norris,2015).

With a few exceptions (cf. Buffel, 2015; Buffel & Phillipson, 2016; Liversage & Mirdal, 2017), none of these studies engage explicitly with the social gerontological concept of ageing in place. Still, keeping in mind the understanding of ageing in place as multidimensional – many of these studies do address topics and dimensions that are central to the experiences of ageing in place among older migrants.

In the following, I shall provide a topical review of the scholarship on ageing and migration. I have divided the review into 4 sections, starting out with the research on living conditions – including the emphasis on vulnerabilities and disadvantage – which has predominated in the early scholarship. Moving on, I discuss research focusing on the subjective experiences of ageing as a migrant, including questions of quality of life and well-being. The third topic of research addressed is research on ageing migrants and social care. Although the topic of transnationalism crosscuts the other topics, I will address research on transnational dimensions of migrant ageing separately, in the fourth subsection.

5.1 Research on living conditions - emphasis on vulnerabilities
Research on migrant and ethnic minority ageing emerged in the late 1940s in the United States (US), and later in the 1960s in the northern European context. What this

research has in common is the strong focus on vulnerabilities and disadvantage experienced by different groups of migrants and ethnic minorities – particularly in relation to income, social interaction and engagement, health status, life satisfaction and mortality. This is captured in the double and triple jeopardy hypothesis, where ageing migrants and ethnic minorities are regarded as disadvantaged both in terms of ethnicity and in terms of old age (Dowd & Bengtson, 1978; Mutchler & Burr, 2011). In the triple jeopardy hypothesis, gender has been included as an added dimension of disadvantage (Havens & Chappell, 1983). In a northern European research context, the disadvantages faced by ageing migrants has commonly been conceptualised in terms of the "three As", whereby migrants are facing disadvantaged in terms of poverty (arme), old age (alte), and foreigner status (ausländer) (White, 2006).

The emphasis on vulnerabilities has informed the research field, far beyond the initial research. Studies indicate that ageing migrants are particularly vulnerable to loneliness (cf. Bolzman et al., 2004; Cela & Fokkema, 2016; De Jong Gierveld, Van der Pas & Keating, 2015; Fokkema & Naderi, 2013; King et al., 2014; Wu & Penning, 2015). These studies identify several different factors contributing to the vulnerabilities of older migrants ageing in place. In particular, studies draw attention to a lack of proficiency in the language of the destination country which hampers the opportunity to communicate with people outside the family or ethnic community (White, 2006). Moreover, many migrants have adverse health situations due to hazardous or physically demanding work prior to retirement, and a lower socioeconomic status. The research also finds that many live in bad housing and deprived neighbourhoods and have more physical and mental health difficulties (Bolzman et al., 2004; Fokkema & Naderi, 2013).

The overall focus on disadvantages in this early literature has been criticised for ignoring heterogeneities between different groups of older migrants (Warnes et al., 2004), as well as within group heterogeneity (Phillipson, 2015; Torres, 2006). By extension, Warnes et al (2004) developed a typology of different migrant groups according to their motives for migration (in terms of labour migration, amenity seeking retirement migrants, family-oriented international retirement migration) –

and the hypothesised levels of resources and preparedness for old age for each group. They further subcategorise labour migrants into European and non-European labour migrants. This is based on the assumption that non-European labour migrants are more likely be disadvantaged along several dimensions. They are perceived as disadvantaged in terms of language skills, in terms of religion and cultural differences, in terms of racism and discrimination, and in terms of marginalisation in relation to the formal care and support system. They are also disadvantaged due to EU friendly national immigration policies favouring migrants from within Europe (Warnes et al. 2004).

The typology constructed by Warnes et al. (2004) serves to highlight the diverse make-up of older international migrants, not only in terms of ethnic backgrounds, but also in terms of motives of migration, migration status, timing of migration, and potential resources. In doing so, the complex intersections between migration history, current social position, and national policies – including access to social security, housing privileges, and informal and formal care – are accentuated (Warnes et al., 2004, p. 314). However, although emphasising the potential for heterogeneity within groups of migrants, their comparisons of variations are predominantly between groups, thereby obscuring in group variation in levels of (dis)advantage and vulnerabilities (Ciobanu et. al., 2017). Phillipson (2015) suggests a life course approach aimed at highlighting both between and within group variation, as well as the accumulation of (dis)advantages across the life course as a more fruitful approach.

5.2 Research on subjective experiences of quality of life and well-being

The strong focus on structural disadvantages has also been criticised for focusing only on objective indicators of life quality, thereby failing to take into account subjective experiences of – and meanings attached to – quality of life and well-being among migrants in later life (cf. Bajekal et al., 2004; Ciobanu & Fokkema, 2017; Grewal et al., 2004; Maynard et al., 2008; Torres, 1999; Wray, 2003). This critique contains two overall foci. Firstly, researchers within this strand of research are critical of how concepts such as quality of life, well-being and successful ageing are defined.

For instance, in standard definitions, successful ageing entails having a positive attitude, remaining active, maintaining control and independence, and empowerment – concepts which are themselves elusive and hard to define. These are in turn used as universal indicators of quality of life and successful ageing, despite their strong connections to western (i.e. American and British) individualism (cf. Wray, 2003; 2004; Maynard et al., 2008). Central to this critique is an argument for a need of understanding these concepts as contextually located according to cultural background, location and lived experiences (Torres, 1999; Wray, 2003; 2004). Consequently, scholarship adopting this perspective argues for the need to move away from standard definitions and pre-established criteria for measuring quality of life, and rather use open-ended questions, urging research participants to define what these concepts mean to them. This critique also argues for a stronger emphasis on the agency of older migrants – that is what older migrants with different ethnic and national backgrounds do to create quality of life despite health, social or economic disadvantages (Wray, 2003; Ciobanu et al., 2017).

Most of this research is located in the UK, where they register ethnicity in terms of self-identification. By asking research participants with different ethnic identifications what they define as quality of life and ageing successfully, researchers were able to identify so-called component factors of quality of life, which were similar independent of ethnic identification. These involved having a socially valued role through the family, having a social network, doing voluntary or paid work, having access to social and emotional support, having and being able to enjoy time and feeling independent (cf. Wray, 2003, 2004; Grewal et al 2004; Bajekal et al, 2004, Maynard et al, 2008). Among participants with a migrant or minority ethnic background, social networks outside of the family were strongly tied to religious or ethnic communities. By contrast, for research participants identifying as White British volunteering in local or national charities or through maintaining some form of paid work after retirement was important to gain a sense of purpose in later life (cf. Wray, 2003, 2004; Grewal et al. 2004; Bajekal et al., 2004, Maynard et al., 2008).

The importance of religion and ethnic community for the quality of life of older migrants is also emphasised in more recent studies on older migrants in different countries in Europe. These studies find religion and participation in ethnic communities to be important for migrants in later life regardless of the timing of migration and migration status (cf. Palmberger, 2017; Ciobanu & Fokkema, 2017), and regardless of the level of incorporation in the destination country of migration (cf. Patzelt, 2017).

The studies by Buffel (2017) and Buffel & Phillipson (2016) are of particular importance for the topic of ageing in place. These studies focus on how migrants (predominantly Muslim) living in deprived neighborhoods, construct a sense of home in their current neighbourhoods and local environments. These studies highlight how older migrants have transformed their current neighbourhoods into transnational social spaces – by establishing mosques, teahouses, and halal butchers – and by nurturing close bonds and proximity to others from their own cultural community. By doing so, older migrants achieve a sense of belonging to their current residential environments. They also find a clear gender dimension in relation to the migrant's neighbourhood practices. The male migrants in their study held informal gatherings in teahouses and the mosques, while the women reported a lack of such female spaces in public. This is mainly because of Islamic prescriptions of gender segregation (Buffel, 2015; Buffel & Phillipson, 2016). In sum, this strand of research serves to highlight the importance of religious and ethnic communities both for achieving a sense of quality of life, and for developing a sense of place attachment for migrants ageing in place. However, as Buffel & Phillipson (2016) argue, access to these settings are often highly gendered. This points to the need to explore how meanings of these settings for migrants ageing in place is shaped by inequality dimensions such as gender, class, and health situation,

5.3 Ageing migrants and social care

Research on ageing migrants and social care mainly focuses on how older migrants care needs are met – informally, through family or friends, or formally through publicly provided care services. This topic also covers the preferences and

expectations of older migrants regarding care. Usually, studies of these topics focus on migrants who come from a context where family constitutes the most important provider of care, to a context where there is an option of public provision of long-term care for older people. An overall finding in these studies is a strong expectation and preference for family care, particularly among ageing migrants with south Asian and/or Muslim backgrounds (cf. Gardner,2002; Kannick, 1997; Moen, 2002; Nergård, 2009; Næss & Vabø, 2014;Victor, Martin & Zubair, 2012). These studies also find that among south Asian older people being dependent on care from the state is regarded as negative – as a reflection of a lack of family loyalty, and a source of stigma in the wider ethnic community (Næss & Vabø, 2014; Victor et al., 2012). There is a significant gendered component to these preferences, whereby wives and more frequently daughters-in-law are expected to fulfil family caregiving obligations. Sometimes, the family goes to great lengths to maintain these practices, as the findings in the study by Liversage (2016) suggests. Liversage's (2016) study is one of the few studies that examine the linkages between family care and marriage migration, and the findings indicate that marriage migration at an earlier point in time enables the maintenance of family care practices in the destination country.

When it comes to the utilisation of formal, state provided long term care services, results from studies are somewhat mixed. While many studies find that ageing migrants are utilising formal care comparably less than the majority population (cf. Albin et al., 2005; Hansen,2014; Hjelm & Albin, 2014; Hovde, Edberg & Hallberg, 2008; Min,2005; Sasson, 2001), other studies find no significant differences in the utilisation of long-term care services between migrants and natives (Bolzman & Vagni, 2017). These mixed results may owe to the fact that the size of the migrant population reaching old age is still rather small compared to the majority population, which leads to problems with attaining a representative sample of older migrants (Ingebretsen, 2011). Moreover, variations in the utilisation of formal care services between countries, may also relate to differences in the provision of care for older people between the countries, for instance in relation to what types of care is provided, and how much older people themselves are charged for the services

(Hansen, 2014). This means that findings about the level of utilisation of care services in one country, are not immediately transferrable to another country.

Studies mapping the types of formal care services that are preferred amongst ageing migrants indicate that services delivered to the homes of older migrants are favoured above institutional care (cf. Ingebretsen, 2010; 2011; Hansen, 2014; Bolzman & Vagni, 2017). This is also in line with ageing in place policies, whereby services provided to people's homes are prioritised above institutional care (Christensen & Wærness, 2018). Moreover, the research identifies three main reasons for why ageing migrants prefer home based care services. One reason is that home-based care services are easier to combine with practices of family care. Another reason is that some older migrants tend to juxtapose institutional care – conceived as cold and uncaring – with family care – conceived as warm and affectionate (cf. Naldemirci, 2013; Næss & Vabø. 2014; Karl, Ramos & Kühn, 2017). The third reason identified, is a fear of social isolation in institutions, because of language difficulties and a lack of shared reference points, such as shared traditions, memories, and food habits (cf. Kannick, 1997; Karl et.al., 2017).

The studies point to several different factors mediating expectations of care in later life – be it expectations of informal family care – or expectations towards formal care services. Among these are linguistic competence, cultural expectations of family care combined with negative perceptions of state provided care, and difficulties in navigating the system (Ahmed & Jones, 2008; Hjelm & Albin, 2014; Victor et al., 2011). Moreover, studies find that older migrants experiences of – and future expectations towards – care are shaped by the intersections of different dimensions, such as gender, educational level, working biography, marital status, age and health (Karl et al.,2017; Bolzman & Vagni, 2017). Reasons for migration, life stage and age at the time of arrival, as well as former experiences with the welfare state and health care services are also considered to be important in mediating the encounter with, attitudes towards, and experiences with formal care services (Naldemirci, 2013; Karl et al., 2017). The number of different factors mediating the relation between older migrants and care services suggest the need for more research and theoretical

frameworks attending to these complexities. Arguably, the combination of a life course and an intersectional perspective on ageing is well suited for this purpose.

5.4 The intersection of ageing and transnational migration studies

Research on ageing and migration has been slow to develop a transnational research agenda (Phillipson & Ahmed, 2004; Horn & Schweppe, 2017). As is the case with social science in general, the hesitation to develop a transnational perspective in relation to ageing relates to a dominant methodological nationalism within the field of social gerontology. Social gerontological research has mainly centred on access to welfare benefits, care services and social policies catering to older people. Since these social policies and the welfare state in general are nationally bound, studies on ageing have also been confined to the nation state (Horn & Schweppe, 2017). However, researchers on ageing and migration have gradually realised that the technological development – and the so-called time-space compression inherent in globalisation – has profound effects on the everyday lives of older migrants (Horn & Schweppe, 2017).

Research adopting a transnational lens on ageing and migration, may be divided into two partly overlapping strands. The first strand is concerned with how migrants who are geographically separated from their family members by nation state borders continue to maintain mutual, reciprocal caregiving relationships (cf. Baldassar et al., 2007; Baldassar, 2008; Baldassar et al., 2016; Horn, 2019; Kilkey & Merla, 2013). By identifying the diverse forms in which migrants engage in caregiving practices with family members, this scholarship challenges several assumptions in social gerontology and research on family life. By showing how migrant families engage in different types of care – ranging from practical, financial, moral and emotional support – to practical and personal hands-on care at a distance – this scholarship challenges assumptions that provision of care within the family requires physical co-presence between family members (Baldassar, 2007; Baldassar et al., 2016). Within these transnational family caregiving arrangements, older people act as both receivers and providers of different forms of care and support. Consequently, the findings from

these studies challenges dominant understandings of older people solely as receivers of care and support – provided by family members or by the state (Baldassar, 2007).

The studies situate transnational caregiving arrangements as emerging out of so-called negotiated commitments that develops from family histories and relationships, and culturally embedded normative obligations. These are in turn shaped by institutional arrangements such as migration and integration policies, employment policies, and care regimes in the country of origin and the destination country of migration (Baldassar, 2008; Kilkey & Merla, 2013; Horn, 2019). The studies also illustrate that transnational caregiving arrangements may fluctuate across the life course according to different and changing circumstances (Baldassar, 2008; Zontini, 2015).

The second strand of research adopting a transnational lens, is concerned with transnational mobility and forms of belonging when ageing as a migrant in transnational contexts. This research explores – amongst other things – decision making processes regarding staying in the destination country after retirement, returning to country of origin, or circular migration, i.e. moving back and forward between destination country and country of origin. A number of different contingencies serves to shape these decision making processes, including former life course experiences, cultural and religious values, social relationships – in particular relations with kin in both destination country and country of origin (Baykara-Krumme, 2013; Klok et al., 2017). Health and the availability of medical and care services in each country are also factors shaping older migrant's transnational mobility and decision making regarding where to spend old age (Hunter. 2016;2018; Amman & Holten, 2013). Income and the affordability of travel is also important in shaping the transnational mobility of migrants after retirement. Studies have identified that retired migrants are increasingly opting for the third solution of circular migration, travelling back and forth between the two countries (Baykara-Krumme, 2013; Hunter, 2018; Näre, 2017). This decision is influenced by a number of different aspects, the most important ones being the whereabouts of family members, as well as social, emotional ties to (people in) both places (cf. Amman &

Holten, 2013; Bolzman, Fibbi, & Vial, 2006; Hunter, 2011; Baykara-Krumme, 2013). Some studies identify circular migration as a strategy, whereby ageing migrants make use of both informal and formal health and social care opportunities in two national contexts, while at the same time being able to maintain social and emotional relations with both places (Amman & Holten, 2013; Hunter, 2011; Näre,2017). Studies also emphasise that decline in health may serve to hamper these transnational mobility patterns (cf. Näre, 2017; Zontini, 2015)

This strand also focuses on how ageing migrants construct a sense of home in relation to both local and transnational settings (Moen, 2002; Lamb, 2002; Gardner, 2002; Näre & Walsh, 2017; Buffel & Phillipson, 2016). These studies highlight complex interrelationships between actual transnational mobility in later life, and sense of belonging. As Zontini (2015) argues, although maintaining transnational mobility may become increasingly difficult in later life, older migrants continue to foster and maintain emotional attachments and a sense of belonging, which involve more than one nation state. Consequently, these studies identify an ambivalent relationship towards both the destination country of migration as well as the country of origin – also highlighting dynamic understandings of the concept of home (Näre, 2017; Walsh & Näre, 2016). According to these studies, home needs to be understood as relational not limited to relations with kin – but also based on locally and transnationally embedded social relationships with friends – and having developed a vibrant cultural and ethnic community in the place of settlement (Buffel & Phillipson, 2011;2016; Palmberger, 2017; Ciobanu & Ramos; 2017; Markussen, 2020).

Many of these studies incorporate an intersectional perspective, looking at how the experiences of ageing as a migrant, are also shaped by the intersecting dimensions of inequality – the intersection of gender and class in particular (Liversage & Mirdal, 2017; Näre, 2017; Walsh & Näre, 2016). This is also the case in a study of Somali older men in Norway conducted by Markussen (2020). Markussen (2020) finds that these men engage in complex negotiations of masculine identities through participating in Somali associations, and through volunteering and associational work. Through participating in these settings, the men gain recognition for traditional

skills, which do not gain recognition in Norwegian mainstream society, such as capacity for oral storytelling and guidance. The negotiations of masculinity are also dependent upon clan, class and generational divisions within the Somali diaspora in Norway and shaped by their position as migrants in Norway. Return visits or permanent return is considered a good option for older Somali men who fail to attain or to negotiate so-called respectable masculinities in the Norwegian context (Markussen, 2020).

6. Research questions and contributions of the thesis

The main objective of the study is to explore – from a bottom up perspective – the experiences of ageing in place in Norway among Pakistani and Polish older migrants. The study draws inspiration from the former research in the section and contributes to the literature by drawing on a life course perspective to examine the experiences of ageing in place. As described earlier in this chapter, the aim of the study is to compare the experiences of ageing in place in Norway among migrants coming from a European country and migrants coming from a Non-European country. Consequently, the overall research question of the thesis is:

How do migratory experiences of ageing in place vary according to European and non-European national backgrounds?

This overall research question has been specified in the following two research questions:

-How do the intersections of national background, gender, and class, as well as former life course experiences and choices shape the experiences of ageing in place among migrants from Poland and Pakistan in Norway?

- How do migrants from Poland and Pakistan negotiate cultural values and norms, forms of belonging, and identities in a transnational social context?

As already described, I adopt a multidimensional approach to ageing in place, whereby I specifically explore the experiences of older migrants in relation to three dimensions: firstly, I examine how migrants negotiate cultural expectations and

behaviours of family care and support. Secondly, I explore their experiences of ageing in place in relation to their incorporation in a formal support system, including their relation to the Norwegian welfare state. Thirdly, I explore their social embeddedness in Norway, and the meanings of this social embeddedness for their sense of identity and belonging in Norway.

The research contributes with new insights into the understandings of ageing in contexts of migration in several different ways. Firstly, the study contributes through comparison of experiences of ageing in place among migrants from one country within Europe and one from outside of Europe. As already discussed, several different dimensions are assumed to contribute to differences in the ageing experience among European and non-European labour migrants (Warnes et al, 2004). As described in section 5.1, there is an assumption that non-European older migrants are more disadvantaged on several accounts. However, with the exception of Moen (2002) who compares the experiences of Pakistani and Danish older migrants in Norway, most of the studies focus on either one migrant group, or compares different groups from countries within Europe, or from countries outside Europe. The comparison of migrants from a European and a non-European country therefore represents a major contribution to the research field.

The combination of a life course, a transnational and an intersectionality perspective places the experiences of ageing in place in the context of the migrants' individual life courses in a context comprising both their countries of origin and Norway as a destination county of migration. By examining the experiences of ageing in place in a life course perspective, the thesis contributes to providing nuance to portrayals of older migrants. The study emphasises both between group and within group variations among the migrants, as well as the process which this stems from – their lived lives. The thesis does not treat the older migrants solely in terms of vulnerabilities and disadvantage. However, as White (2006) argues, in some cases older migrants are vulnerable and disadvantage, and the failure to recognise these vulnerabilities may potentially strengthen these vulnerabilities.

By bringing together the research field of social gerontology and migration research this study contributes new insights into both fields. The discontinuity and disruption involved in the process of migration, act as a source for rethinking central assumptions in socio-gerontological theoretical models (Blakemore, 1999; Torres, 2004). The thesis provides nuance both to assumptions that ageing well demands continuity of life courses and to assumptions that ageing as a migrant means ageing out of place – by looking at how older migrants develop a sense of belonging to multiple different places. Moreover, the thesis looks at how living their lives in-between two different social, structural and cultural contexts simultaneously serves to shape different aspects of older migrant's lives when ageing in place, and how they make choices about their lives through evaluating opportunities and constraints in each context.

The study also contributes to the field of migration studies as it provides insights into the dynamic and temporal nature of processes of migrant settlement, integration, and transnationalism (Liversage & Mirdal, 2017; Näre, 2017; Zontini, 2015). Thus, the study contributes to scholarship examining the temporal nature of the migration, settlement and incorporation, which should not be regarded as a singular event, but as a process – developing over time and through negotiations of belonging in different phases of the life course including later life (Liversage & Mirdal, 2017). As Levitt & Schiller (2004, p.1012), two of the founding figures of transnational migration studies, contend; "transnational practices ebb and flow in response to particular incidents or crises." Old age represents one such incident, as it constitutes a phase of life where identities, roles and forms of belonging are renegotiated (Näre et al., 2017). Thus, studies on ageing and migration – particularly the ones adopting a life course perspective – enable an exploration which takes into account the long view of migrant's relations to both the destination country of migration and their country of origin (Zontini,2015).

7. Overview and outline of the chapters

In the following chapter, chapter 2, I broadly outline the social, economic, and political contextual backgrounds of the study. The chapter starts by outlining the historical development of immigration and integration policies in Norway, as well as some key features and discourses on immigration in Norway. Moving on, I outline some important institutional and cultural characteristics of Pakistan and Poland. Although the main focus in this section is the characteristics of the countries at the time when the migrants in this study lived there, I also provide some information on how the countries have changed since. This is important in order not to portray the countries as static but undergoing constant changes. This is also important given the transnational perspective of the study, whereby the two national contexts are drawn together in a singular transnational social space. Lastly, the organisation of care in the three countries constitutes important frames of reference concerning the migrants' expectations and practices in relation to care. Consequently, the last section of the chapter addresses the organisation of care in Pakistan, Poland, and Norway, respectively.

In chapter 3, I outline the theoretical frameworks of the thesis. Three theoretical perspectives have informed this study – the life course perspective, the transnational perspective and the intersectionality perspective. In the chapter, I outline central principles of all three perspectives, and discuss how I make use of them in this study. I conclude the chapter by discussing how the three perspectives can be fruitfully combined in an analysis of ageing in contexts of migration.

Chapter 4 describes the research design, methodology and the empirical material of the thesis. To provide transparency into the research process, the chapter describes the different steps of the research, from the initial study design, the process of collecting the empirical material, including processes of recruitment, interviewing, and participant observation. I also present the participants in the study. Moving on, I discuss the analytical approach and the role of theory in the study. Lastly, the chapter also discusses the quality of the study and ethical challenges.

The three proceeding chapters – Chapter 5, 6 and 7 – represent the empirical analyses of the thesis. Chapter 5 examines older migrant's negotiations of family care and support in a Norwegian context. Both Pakistan and Poland represent national contexts where care is primarily regarded as a family responsibility, whereas in Norway the state constitutes an important provider of care alongside the family. Drawing from the concept of transnationalism as a mode of cultural reproduction, the chapter examines how expectations and practices of family care and support are negotiated in the intersection between the Pakistani and Polish context of care, on the one hand and, the Norwegian context of care, on the other. The chapter presents a selection of individual case studies, aimed at contextualising the forms of care and support exchanged in the family, in terms of each person's individual and group based migration trajectories, in terms of gender and class, and in terms of their relations to their family.

Chapter 6 explores how migrants from Poland and Pakistan who are now ageing in place in Norway relate to the welfare state. In the chapter I examine they perceive the welfare state, and what role access to welfare state benefits and services plays in their decision-making process regarding where to spend their old age, and in shaping their geographic mobility patterns. Towards the end of the chapter, I take a closer look at the older migrant's experiences of one of the major results of ageing in place policies in Norway, namely the home-based care services. I examine how they relate to these home-based care services, and the demands of activity, rehabilitation and user involvement accompanying the provision of these services.

Whereas chapters 5 and 6 mostly makes use of the study's interview material, chapter 7 also draws from the ethnographic observations. This chapter examines the meanings of localised social embeddedness after retirement for the older migrants in this study. The chapter starts by looking broadly at social embeddedness as something that emerges from former stages of the life course, related to occupation, places of residence and family ties and relationships. Moving on, the chapter explores the meaning of participating in faith communities and ethnic communities for older migrants. These sites emerged empirically, as important social settings for the

participants after retirement. Aside from providing a buffer from social isolation, loneliness and boredom, these spheres emerged as important sites for negotiating identities and roles after retirement. Thus, the chapter explores how Polish and Pakistani older migrants negotiate different aspects of their identities and ageing roles in terms of national background, class, and gender through social embeddedness in these different social contexts.

Chapter 8 provides a summary and discussion of the main findings of the study, as well suggesting directions for further research.

Chapter 2. Contextual backgrounds

1. Introduction

A main principle of the life course perspective is the importance of looking at how individual biographies are shaped by the historical and institutional contexts in which they are lived. The purpose of this chapter is to shed light on some of the historical developments and institutional structures which I regard as central in understanding the life course experiences, and in particular the experiences of ageing in place, among the Pakistani and Polish older migrants in this study.

The chapter is divided into three main subsections. The first section describes Norway as a context for immigration – addressing both the historical development of immigration politics, as well as the debates and discourses about immigration and immigrants in Norway.

Brochmann & Hagelund (2010) divide the sphere of immigration politics into an outer and an inner sphere. The outer sphere – which I in the following account conceptualise as immigration policies – consists of questions of who should be allowed to enter Norway and on what grounds migrants gain legal residence. The inner sphere, further referred to as integration policies, involves the preconditions – including rights and duties – for settlement and incorporation into the new country. These preconditions encompass three dimensions: a socio-legal dimension (for instance rights attached to legal residence and requirements for the attainment of citizenship); a socio-economic dimension (access to health care and welfare provision, participation in education and the labour market); and a less tangible cultural-religious dimension. The cultural-religious dimension entails questions of how far immigrants are expected to abandon their cultural and religious heritage and practices to adapt to a new society (Penninx & Garcés-Mascareñas, 2016).

The first subsection broadly traces the historical development of Norwegian immigration and integration policies after WW2. The aim of the historical outlook is to identify the conditions, which have served to shape the process of migration and settlement of the Pakistani and Polish older migrants in this study. In this section I

shall also address some key features of the debates and discourses about immigration in Norway which are important for understanding the way in which migrants negotiate their identities and their general experience of ageing in place in Norway.

The second section of the chapter addresses characteristics of the migrants' countries of origin – Poland and Pakistan. Starting out with Pakistan, I identify some general characteristics of Pakistan as a country. I address the topics of religion, economic development, education, and the welfare system – paying specific attention to the historical and institutional developments taking place at the time where the migrants in this study lived in Pakistan. Moving on, I describe central characteristics of Poland at the time when the migrants in this study lived there.

In the third section of the chapter, I describe how care for older people is organized in Pakistan, Poland, and Norway, respectively. In a transnational perspective, the older migrants' negotiations of care are regarded as taking place within a social space comprising both their country of origin, and Norway as the destination country of migration. Therefore, I find it important to describe how care for older people is organized in all three contexts.

In the description of the welfare and care context, I draw upon Lyon and Gluckmann's (2008) framework of the "total social organization of labour". Applied to the analysis of care, this framework highlights country specific linkages between formal and informal, and how these are linked with the dimensions paid and unpaid care work. The framework is also useful to examine how care for older people is divided between different modes of provision (state/public; family; community; voluntary; not for profit; market; for profit); and how these modes of provision intersect, producing contrasting configurations of care in different countries (Lyon & Glucksmann, 2008, p.102). The framework is useful as it accentuates how contrasting configurations of care relate to broader structural, institutional, and sociocultural developments. In particular, it highlights the interrelationships between the labour market, gendered divisions of labour and country specific care configurations (Glucksmann & Lyon, 2006; Lyon & Glucksmann, 2008, p. 102). In this chapter, I use the framework descriptively to outline the way in which care is organized in the

different national contexts. Although the framework is applied to describe all three-care contexts, I also find it important to describe some aspects of the Norwegian organisation of care services, which go beyond what is addressed in the framework of Lyon and Glucksmann. This includes the increasing bureaucratization of services, the increase in younger user groups, and the Norwegian approach to adaptation of care services to a more diverse group of older people. This is important because it speaks to the question of access to formal care services as well as the appeal of these formal care services for older migrants.

2. The Norwegian context of immigration

2.1 The development of immigration policies in Norway post 1945

In the wake of WW2, there was an increase in the number of people migrating either from southern parts of Europe – or from outside of Europe – to the northern European countries. These so-called postwar migrants started to come to Norway in the late 1960s, which is relatively late compared to other northern European countries (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010). During this period, immigration policies developed from being a rather marginal political question, to being placed highly on the political agenda. In part, policies regulating who is allowed entry, and who can reside legally in Norway, have developed in response to immigration from so-called non-Western countries in the late 1960s (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010).

The development of immigration and integration policies in Norway needs to be regarded as framed by the overall institutionalization of the welfare state, with its emphasis on securing social cohesion and equality through redistribution (Brochmann, 2003). According to Brochmann and Djuve (2013), the post-war era in Norway constituted a gigantic nation-building era, where solidarity amongst citizens was to be established through welfare state development. The aim was to create societal integration through institutionalised social rights and increase equality through redistribution. Redistribution was to be maintained through relatively high levels of taxation on labour. Thus, the maintenance of this welfare model depended upon a high employment rate. The labour movement slogan "Gjør din plikt, krev din

rett" (Do your duty, claim your right) has been a dominant slogan in Norwegian politics ever since the nascent period of welfare state development. Furthermore, Norway entered a period of growth from the 1960s onwards, which spurred the demand for labour. A principle of equal treatment was to ensure economic transfers and services, and thus a basic security net for all individuals residing legally in Norway (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010). Migrants coming to Norway in the 1970s thus encountered a prosperous and state governed society, where ideals of equality and faith in redistribution was part of the national self-image (Brochmann, 2003, p.152).

Migration to Norway is regulated through the Immigration Act[5], which until 1988 was an enabling act allowing for considerable flexibility and discretion in relation to shifting interests and needs (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010; Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018). In the 1950s and 60s immigration was only regulated through the demands of the labour market. According to Korbøl (2019) practically everyone was granted residence permits if legal papers such as criminal records and passports were in order. As we shall see in the following account, the control of immigration to Norway has gradually become more restrictive.

The first migrants, who came to Norway in the post-war period, were cold war refugees, mainly from Europe, but gradually also from countries outside of Europe, such as Vietnam and Latin America. The first labour migrants came from industrial countries, such as the U.S, the UK, and Germany. They were followed by an influx of migrants from Southern and Eastern Europe. A small number of Polish migrants also came to Norway, particularly after 1956, where a small liberalisation of the communist political system occurred (Godzimirski, 2011). These initial migrant groups were considered similar to native Norwegians in terms of religion and ethnicity, and the only attempts at restrictions were aimed at Eastern Europeans – whose loyalty to the communist regime of the Soviet Union – was questioned (Tjelmeland, 2003).

---

[5] Norway became part of a common Nordic labour market in 1954, which means that Nordic Citizens are exempt from the Alien act. Nordic citizens thus have free right of movement, work, and equal welfare rights within all the Nordic countries.

As already mentioned in chapter 1, from the early 1960s onwards, other Northern European countries – including the UK, Sweden, and Denmark – implemented restrictions on immigration. In consequence, the number of migrants who came to Norway increased substantially at this time. Among them was a high number of Pakistani migrants[6]. Historically, the UK was the preferred destination for Pakistani labour migrants, owing to the former status of Pakistan as a British colony. However, in the 1960s the UK implemented a series of new restrictions, and quota systems for immigration. Consequently, labour migrants from Pakistan went to Denmark, who introduced an immigration stoppage in 1970. When Denmark introduced this immigration stoppage, many opted for Norway as a destination country (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018). Thus, in the late 1960s the number of migrants from Pakistan was relatively low, compared to other migrant groups, constituting 1 % of the economically active migrant population in Norway (Carling, 1999). However, by 1973 this number had risen considerably, from 10 to 1439 in total numbers, and from 1% to 28 % of the labour migrant population in Norway, making Pakistani migrants the largest group of migrants from outside of Europe residing in Norway (Carling, 1999).

Migrants from Turkey, Morocco and Pakistan were classified as "fremmedarbeidere" (foreign or guest workers). Although they came from a diverse array of educational and class backgrounds, most of them could only attain work in low-skilled or semiskilled occupations, such as factory work or with hotel and cleaning services (Brochmann & Kjelstadli, 2008). They often worked under bad conditions and received low pay. Consequently, they were considered an easily exploitable labour reserve, as they lacked knowledge of their rights in Norway. This led to concerns that their presence would serve to decrease Norwegian wages overall (Tjelmeland, 2003).

 Moreover, concerns were raised about the housing situation of migrants. Whereas refugees coming to Norway were in direct contact with the state governed support system – which aided, amongst other things, in the provision of housing - the labour

---

[6] Many migrants at this time also came from Turkey and Morocco.

migrants mostly had to fend for themselves (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2012). Many migrants often shared small and cramped apartments, or stayed in hostels, which raised concerns about their living conditions (Khan, 2009; Tjelmeland, 2003).

From the late 1960s until the implementation of the ban on immigration in 1975, Norway gradually implemented stricter restrictions on labour migration. Whereas foreigners in 1960 could freely apply for jobs and a work permit after arrival to Norway, in the early 1970s a requirement to have a work permit prior to entry was introduced (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018). According to Korbøl & Midtbøen (2018) this regulation was introduced mainly to limit migration from more remote countries in Asia and Africa. Furthermore, stricter educational criteria as a requirement for legal were also introduced. For instance, in 1973 demands were raised for migrants, Pakistani migrants in particular, to be in command of a European language such as English to be allowed entry. Thus, language tests were performed in Pakistan. However, what was considered a satisfactory command was unclear and the opportunity to appeal against decisions made were limited. Moreover, labour migrants also became subject to stricter maintenance requirements – having to prove acceptable employment conditions and wages, and suitable housing – to gain legal residence (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018)

In sum, several factors constituted the basis of the implementation of the ban on immigration to Norway in 1975. Among these were employment and housing conditions, as well as assumptions that certain migrant groups – because of cultural differences – would have difficulties in adapting to Norwegian society (Korbøl & Midbøen, 2018). The ban was introduced based on an idea that Norway needed a pause from immigration to take care of the ones that are already here. The ban was at several times extended and was in reality a permanent ban on some forms of immigration (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010).

The ban contained several exemptions. Migrants could now obtain legal residency in Norway if they were family members of legal residents, refugees, students, or experts in high demand. Primarily, family reunification schemes applied to the spouses and children of a person who had obtained legal residence and in Norway. Parents and

other close relatives who were provided for by the person living in Norway could also apply. In any case, family reunification was only granted if a maintenance requirement was met – that is if the person legally residing in Norway could document that they were able to support their family members upon entry, and that they were able to provide them with suitable housing (Carling, 1999)[7]. A major reason for this maintenance requirement was to make sure that family migrants would not overburden the welfare state (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010).

Rather than being a ban on all forms of immigration, the ban of 1975 constituted a more selective approach to immigration, which favoured high-skilled migration from western countries (Brochmann, 2003). The immigration stoppage spurred a two track system of immigration politics, one where migrants were seen as in need of incorporation into Norwegian mainstream society (primarily family migrants and refugees), and one track that was driven by temporary demands for labour in different industries (Brochmann, 2003). A small number of Polish migrants came on these temporary work contracts, primarily to work in farming industries. Due to the temporary nature of this migration many were not registered as residents and before 1980 there was a small, yet unknown, number of Polish migrants in Norway (Friberg & Golden, 2014). Moreover, Norway is committed to accepting a certain number of refugees each year, regulated through the UN refugee agency, and particularly from the 1980s onwards the number of refugees to Norway has increased considerably. Among the refugees arriving in the 1980s, were a relatively small number of Polish refugees. In the wake of the Solidarność uprising, and the institution of martial law in Poland in 1981, tens of thousands Polish dissidents emigrated, and a couple of thousands of these came to Norway. Some were granted asylum as political refugees. Many of these political refugees were highly educated intellectuals or artists, and they quickly became well established in Norway (Friberg & Golden, 2014)

---

[7] According to Bø (1987, p.51-53), the criteria for suitable housing were noticeably unclear, and did not give rise to equal treatment. She argues that the control of dwellings was particularly strict in relation to family reunification of Pakistani labour migrants.

In the decades following the ban on immigration in 1975, the number of refugee claimants in Norway has grown in an unprecedented scale (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010). At the same time, migration to Norway through the family reunification scheme has risen considerably, and continues to rise because descendants of labour migrants sometimes marry people from their parent's country of origin (Carling, 1999).Thus, during the 1980s the Norwegian government consolidated the ban on immigration through, amongst other things, the establishment of the Norwegian Directorate of Immigration (UDI). UDI was a "central coordinating body responsible for dealing with all applications for residence and work permits, political asylum family reunification, and citizenship" (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2012, p. 173).

In 1994 Norway joined the European Economic Area (EEA), and thereby became part of a common European labour market. This Europe wide labour market gives citizens from within the EU or the EEA a formal right to free movement across member state borders. Through membership in the EEA, Norway is also committed to a principle of equal treatment of all EU citizens concerning welfare and health care rights (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010). Prior to 2004, the number of labour migrants from EU countries was relatively small. However, following the accession of several eastern European countries into the EU in 2004 labour migration to Norway has grown. Today, Polish labour migrants constitute one of the largest group of migrants to Norway (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2012; Friberg &Golden, 2014). The increasing migration to Norway following the EU accession, gave rise to renewed concern surrounding the question of the sustainability of the welfare state. Many raised concerns about so-called welfare tourism, meaning that migrants from Eastern Europe would come to Norway – not to work – but to take advantage of the welfare state benefits and services (NOU, 2011:7). Thus, from 2004-2008 an interim arrangement was introduced with demands of fulltime work with Norwegian work- and wage conditions (NOU 2011:7; Friberg & Eldring, 2011). Consequently, as we have seen, there is a strong resemblance between the debates about Polish migrants today and the debates about Pakistani migrants in the late 1970s (Meisingset, Kawecka & Czapka, 2011).

Today the Norwegian government assigns legal residence and access to welfare rights through the construction of categories. These categories are based on country of origin and reasons for migration (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010). Categories of migrants to Norway can be placed in a hierarchy according to the basis of legal residence and welfare rights in Norway. On top of this hierarchy, we find Nordic citizens who in practice have equal access to work, health care and welfare rights, with no limits on duration of stay in Norway. The second category consists of refugees, i.e. people who are recognized as in need of protection either through the UNHCR or on other grounds. In principle, the residence permits of refugees can be withdrawn. However, most refugees will be given legal permanent residence after three years of residence in Norway. Based on the Introductory act of 2004, refugees and their family members have the right to receive financial support and the right and duty to a qualification course aimed at labour market integration. The third category consists of EEA and EU citizens and their family members. They have equal rights in Norway provided they have paid work. Consequently, the welfare rights of EEA-citizens are premised upon employment, and their family members who do not have paid work get access to social rights based on their relation to the reference person. The fourth category are migrants from outside the EEA, so called third country citizens with work permits in Norway. The work permit provides the basis for legal residence and the duration of legal residence. However, after the duration of three years, there is a strong likelihood that legal permanent residence is granted. The fifth category are asylum seekers awaiting the processing of their application. They have rights to housing and a minimum level of support, but according to their own separate rules. If granted asylum, they will move to the second category and be granted rights accordingly. If the UDI denies their application, however, they will become a part of the category of irregular migrants, meaning they are considered illegal residents, and consequently lose most of their welfare rights in Norway. This is the situation for irregular migrants who form the last category in the hierarchy and who do not have permission to reside in Norway. Irregular migrants do not have any welfare rights, aside from emergency medical care and primary education for children. Persons granted residence permits based on family reunification are also at risk of becoming

part of the category of irregular migrants, particularly in the first three years of residence where their residence permit is dependent upon the spouse or person originally living in Norway. This means that if a spouse of a person living in Norway has gained legal residence based on their marriage to said person a divorce would lead to a dispossession of the residence permit (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010).

As we have seen in the above, concerns about the sustainability of the welfare state has been of major importance when it comes to how immigration policies in Norway have developed. As we shall see in the following, these concerns have also been important in the development of Norwegian integration policies.

2.2 The historical development of integration policies

The former section of this chapter has addressed the broad trends in the historical development of who is allowed access to and gain legal residence in Norway. In this subsection, I will look more closely at policies and measures aimed at integrating the migrants who have gained legal residence into the larger fabric of Norwegian society.

The integration policies that the Norwegian government has come to pursue may be divided into two; one preoccupied with the socioeconomic integration of immigrants, and one aimed at the cultural-religious integration of migrants.

As we have seen in the former section of this chapter the political debates about immigration in the 1970s and 80s centred on issues of living conditions, housing, and employment conditions. These concerns are reflected in the first attempts at a more holistic immigration and integration policy which was preoccupied with the short-term adjustment of migrants, such as: housing and employment conditions, language training, rights, and duties. In other words, the major concern of these policies were issues of socioeconomic integration, rather than the cultural-religious integration of migrants (Brochmann, 2003).

In the early 1970s the Norwegian approach to cultural-religious integration of immigrants may be described as pluralistic. Migrants were given considerable leeway in deciding their way of adjusting to Norway, and they were encouraged to maintain aspects of their culture and values if they wanted to (Hagelund, 2002; Brochmann,

2003). They should be provided with the opportunity to choose between integration and assimilation, and the task of the government was to ensure that people had a real choice between the two.[8]

The Norwegian state, however, did nothing to promote the rights of migrants to preserve their cultural heritage and identity. Rather they pursued a policy of benign neglect, where migrants could choose their practices in the private sphere without state interference (Brochmann & Djuve, 2013). At this time, integration was also regarded as a two-way process, where both migrants and Norwegian citizens should adjust their values and norms, according to changing and more complex circumstances (Brochmann, 2003).

The migrants should be positioned on equal terms with the majority and be given the same rights and duties. However, there was a tension between the idea of equality at the formal level and the real opportunities of migrants to participate at an equal level. Thus, based on an evaluation of the life situation of migrants, special measures were implemented to ensure equal status for the migrants (Brochmann, 2003, p.156). An example of special measures were the efforts aimed at integrating migrants in the housing market.

During the 1980s Norway continued to institutionalise a formalised framework for immigrant integration. In this period policies on immigrant integration became incorporated within the larger framework on Norwegian welfare policies. Migrants were no longer considered as external to the overall welfare policies, demanding differential treatment (Brochmann, 2003. p.196). Still, special arrangements were made in areas of housing, employment, and language training to combat the special problems that migrants faced. These special arrangements specifically targeted refugees, who were believed to face more problems with incorporation than labour migrants did.

---

[8] This needs to be regarded in light of the harsh assimilation demands Norway placed on the Sami and Kven population residing in the Northernmost parts of Norway (Tjelmeland,2003).

Special measures for immigrants continued to be considered a challenge and was attacked from different ends of the political spectrum. In the election of 1987, the new right-wing populist Progress party turned special rights for asylum seekers to a main issue. They argued that special rights for refugees and asylum seekers were prioritized at the expense of "Norwegian" tax paying citizens. Particularly cogent was the juxtaposition made between the needs of refugees and asylum seekers, on the one hand, and the needs of native Norwegian vulnerable persons such as disabled and older persons, on the other (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010). Here we see a shift in perspective on refugees, in particular, but also migrants in general. Earlier, migrants were regarded as worthy recipients of support and benefits, to the extent that these measures would aid their settlement process of settlement and incorporation in Norwegian society. However, in this new perspective migrants are regarded as unworthy recipients of support and benefits – as placing a burden on welfare budgets – at the cost of other groups of vulnerable people, who are considered worthy by virtue of being Norwegian (Gullestad, 2002a).

Policies developed during the 1980s also highlighted the importance of respecting Norwegian laws and basic Norwegian values. Basic Norwegian values were defined according to universal principles of democracy, gender equality and children`s rights. Furthermore, policies developed during the 1980s also placed a higher emphasis on the importance of learning the Norwegian language and of gaining knowledge of Norwegian society (Hagelund, 2002).

In the 1990s, following increased demands of labour combined with growing unease about potential escalation of welfare dependency, the Norwegian government strengthened the workfare policies for all persons receiving welfare benefits in Norway. This means that the welfare benefits were arranged in a way that supported an aim of paid work for all – not only emphasizing the right to work – but also an obligation to work (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010, p. 253). During this time, the Norwegian government also raised stronger demands in relation to the labour market participation of migrants (Brochmann & Djuve, 2010). In particular, the labour market participation of women in certain migrant groups was a topic of concern. The

concerns were specifically raised in relation to women from countries with patriarchal cultures whose ability to participate in the labour market and society was perceived to be restricted (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010: Hagelund, 2003).

Integration policies developed in the 1990s contained a strengthened emphasis on the tensions between migrants' rights to choose their way of adjustment, on the one hand, and the demand for support of – and adjustment to – Norwegian values, on the other. Policy documents underlined the importance of individual freedom. However, individual freedom should not be at the expense of adherence to laws and regulations and central values of the nation. What exactly constituted the common fundamental values of the nation – aside from democracy and gender equality – remained undefined (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010).

These developments also reflect a heightened awareness of the tension between recognizing the needs to protect the rights of migrant groups to maintain cultural practices, whilst at the same time protecting individuals from the demands of subgroup membership. Thus, a shift in emphasis has taken place from regarding culture as something that needs protection, to regarding it as "a more ambiguous concept with repressive potentials that must be tamed" (Hagelund, 2002, p. 408). The debates and policies surrounding these issues has particularly focused on protecting the rights of women and children against patriarchal cultural practices, such as forced marriages and gender mutilation. There is universal agreement that these practices are both illegitimate and illegal, and policy debates have thus been concerned with appropriate ways to combat them, with proposals ranging from encouraging dialogue to increased level of policing, prosecution and punishment (Hagelund, 2002).

With regards to marriage, the dilemma of protecting migrants' cultural practices, on the one hand, and combating repressive practices within certain immigrant communities, on the other, is particularly pronounced in relation to the distinction between forced and arranged marriage. Whereas forced marriages are considered

illegitimate and illegal, arranged marriages are by many politicians recognized as a legitimate – albeit unfamiliar – custom (Hagelund, 2002, p.411).[9]

Governments have tried to combat forced marriage in different ways. For instance, the Marriage Act has been amended, where both bride and groom have to explicitly declare that the marriage is entered into voluntarily, and that they acknowledge each other's right to divorce (Hagelund, 2008). However, perhaps the most striking attempt at combating forced marriage is through stricter regulation of marriage migration and family reunification. This is based on presumptions that transnational marriages in some migrant groups might entail an element of force. Moreover, politicians, activists and researchers have argued that such marriages may hamper integration and involve a maintenance of repressive cultural practices over time (cf. Wikan, 1995). The dilemma of recognizing the difference between the legitimate form of arranged marriage, and forced marriage is also reflected in policies regulating family migration and reunification. Thus, the challenge has been to strike a balance between the need to combat forced marriages, while at the same time recognizing the diverse ways in which decisions to marry are made (Hagelund, 2003). Consequently, there have been extensive debates on how to combat forced marriage through regulation on migration. The government eventually implemented a stronger maintenance requirement in the new Immigration Act, which was enacted in 2010. As we have seen earlier in this chapter, all migrants, including family migrants, are subject to a maintenance requirement such as an adequate source of income, and adequate housing. However, prior to the implementation of the new act, the joint income of both spouses was taken into consideration. In contrast, the new act demands that the maintenance requirement be met solely by the spouse who is settled in Norway (Eggebø. 2010). This is to ensure that the Norwegian spouse in a

---

[9] There is some disagreement on this distinction. For instance, Human rights service activist Hege Storhaug, and central progress party politicians argues that there is no distinction (Hagelund, 2008)

transnational marriage is financially independent from his or her family, and therefore less vulnerable to pressure (Hagelund, 2008; Eggebø, 2010)[10]

In 2004, a White paper to the Norwegian parliament was issued, which explicitly demanded that immigrants adapt to the founding values of the nation, such as human rights and gender equality (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010, p. 262). This paper also contained the Introduction Act, which is the first actual law on migrant integration in Norway. The Introduction Act applies mainly to refugees and provides them with a right and obligation to take part in a qualification program involving courses in Norwegian language and society[11]. In addition to learning Norwegian language skills, the topics discussed in these courses focus extensively on family issues, such as gender equality, child rearing, marriage, divorce, and gay rights (Hagelund, 2008)[12].

In an amendment to the Introduction Act in 2005, a requirement of 300 hours of Norwegian language training – or a documentation of Norwegian language skills equivalent to 300 hours of training – was introduced as a requirement for permanent legal residence for labour migrants from outside the EEA area and their family (Kavli,2006). The migrants themselves or their employers had to pay for these courses. Labour migrants from within the EEA area have neither a duty nor a right to attend these courses (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010).

Brochmann and Hagelund (2010, p. 272) question the practical effects of the language requirement to gain permanent residence or citizenship. They argue that in practice immigrants may reside legally in Norway, with approximately the same welfare rights as Norwegian citizens, but they must apply for a renewal of their residence permit on a yearly basis. This brings us to the questions of citizenship. Aside from the requirement of 300 hours of training, what other requirements are

---

[10] Eggebø (2010) identifies two main arguments for introducing the maintenance requirement – one being securing independence from family members, the other one being securing independence from welfare state support.

[11] Conditioned by the participation in the qualification program, refugees are entitled to a fixed benefit. In order to receive this benefit, participation must be full time. If a person does not attend the courses on a full-time basis, the benefits may be curtailed. Thus, aside from the actual courses, an implicit educating component – aimed at teaching refugees not to become passive recipients of benefits – is embedded in the program (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010).

[12] These courses are obligatory, but in line the hierarchy of migrants introduced earlier, only refugees have a right to, and get these courses funded (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010).

there for gaining Norwegian citizenship? I now turn to a brief overview of the development of policies on citizenship.

2.2.1 Citizenship laws and regulations

The concept of citizenship may be defined in at least two different ways. In the Norwegian language, a distinction is made between the concept of *statsborgerskap* and the concept of *medborgerskap*. Statsborgerskap denotes the legal commitment between individuals and the state, i.e. the rights and duties of citizenship, while the concept of medborgerskap denotes questions of social belonging, identity, trust, and participation (Midtbøen, 2009). In this subsection I will broadly describe the legal requirements for attaining Norwegian citizenship understood as *statsborgerskap.*

From the 1950s until the revision of the Norwegian Nationality Act in 2005 migrants were required to reside in Norway for a minimum of seven years before they could apply for and attain citizenship[13]. Children of non-Norwegian citizens, who were born and raised in Norway, were automatically granted citizenship, provided they themselves did not relinquish this right (Midtbøen, Birkvad & Erdal, 2018). Before the revision of the act in 2005 there was no explicit language requirement. Norwegian language skills were expected to be part of the discretionary evaluations in applications for naturalization. However, in practice these evaluations did not occur, with the consequence that only time residence time and criminal record constituted the basis for assessments of citizenship applications, not Norwegian language skills (Midtbøen, 2009).

This law did not become subject to extensive revision until the beginning of the millennium. At this time the Norwegian government, along with other European countries started to raise questions about social cohesion, and what defined the nation as a social, political, and cultural community (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2012; Lithman, 2010). In the wake of these debates, citizenship policies were regarded as part of the solutions to problems associated with integration and social cohesion in multicultural societies. In Norway, a law committee was appointed to draw up a new

---

[13] For Nordic Citizens, the residence requirement before attainment of citizenship was shorter (Midtbøen et al., 2018).

citizenship act, which was approved in 2005 (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2005). This new act on citizenship introduced a minimum requirement 300 hours of language training as a basis for naturalization. Dual citizenship was not allowed[14]. Moreover, naturalized citizens can also attend a voluntary citizenship ceremony containing an oath of allegiance (Midtbøen, 2009; Brochmann & Hagelund, 2012).

2.3 Key aspects of the immigration debate and discourse

According to anthropologist Marianne Gullestad (2002a), the nation as a context for immigration comprises more than regulations concerning who is allowed entry and legal residence, or formal policies concerning integration and citizenship. It also comprises dominant ideas, values, taken for granted assumptions and frames of interpretation regarding who "we" are as members of the nation, and in turn, who are regarded as not belonging to the nation. Gullestad conceptualises these taken for granted assumptions and frames of interpretation as "the national order" (Gullestad, 2002a, p. 16). This national order is located at the discursive level of society; in the categories used by politicians, researchers and the mass media; as well as among people in general, who draw on these categories in everyday life (Gullestad, 2002a, p.16; Gullestad, 2002b). Gullestad (2002a) argues that although the national order consists of a great number of disparate views and debates, some dominant features may be identified.

As reflected in the account of the historical development of immigration and integration policies, a concern about the cultural integration of migrants has become a more prominent topic since the 1980s. This is also reflected in the mass media news coverage of immigration. In the 1970s and 80s migration to Norway was predominantly conceived of as something positive. Migrants were described as resources, and diversity was conceptualized in a celebratory tone. To the extent that negative depictions existed, the focus was on migrants as victims of colonialism, racism, or exploitation in the labour market and in relation to housing (Gullestad,

---

[14] In December 2018, the Norwegian parliament voted for an amendment in this provision which allows for dual citizenship. The new rules were introduced January 2020.

2002a). Thus, a major concern of the debates related to migration in the 1960s and 70s was the welfare and well-being of the migrants coming to work in Norway.

The lack of focus on the negative aspects of migration became subject to criticism in the late 1980s and 90s. In 1991, sociologist Ottar Brox published a book where he criticized the academics and politicians – what he called the moral elite – for downplaying the negative aspects of migration. Also published in 1991, was the book "Snillisme på norsk"[15], by labour party politician Rune Gerhardsen. The book was a critique of how the welfare state had gone too far in supporting groups of people who could manage on their own. Whilst government policies towards migrants was one among many targets of criticism in the book, the criticism related to migration received most of the media attention (Gullestad, 2002a). Thus, a linkage between migration and welfare dependency became firmly established in the debate.

Both Brox's and Gerhardsen's book expressed a shift in the way in which migration was conceptualized and debated in Norway. They both called for more realism in the debate, that is realism understood in terms of a stronger focus on the negative aspects of immigration (Gullestad, 2002a). The call for more realism in the debates entailed paying more attention to oppressive aspects of certain migrant communities – particularly Muslim migrant communities – and migrants from patriarchal and collectively oriented cultures (Brochmann, 2003). These debates have been of central importance to shed light on certain oppressive practices such as female genital mutilation and forced marriages. However, the coverage of such cases in the media have been characterised by sensationalism, which has partly served to hamper the long-term work aimed at preventing these practices.

Thus, as we have seen in the above account, media coverage of immigration has shifted from an emphasis on work and civil rights related issues in the 1970s, to a more extensive focus on cultural issues such as cultural customs, familial organization and religion from the late 1980s onwards (Gullestad 2002a; 2002b; Lithman, 2010; Hovden & Mjelde, 2019). Gullestad (2002a) argues that this shift also

---

[15] The word "snillisme" may be translated into misguided kindness.

entails an emergent emphasis on common national cultural heritage in Norway, as a defining trait of "Norwegianness". Citizenship, she argues, no longer holds the same meaning because there are invisible barriers against inclusion in Norwegian society.

Gullestad (2000a/2002b) links these invisible barriers to a European egalitarian individualism, which she argues is particularly prominent in Norway and the other Nordic countries. One of the dominant characteristics of egalitarian individualism in Norway is the emphasis on equality as a positive value. The concept of equality signifies several different things. The emphasis on socioeconomic equality is but one of many meanings attached to this concept. The concept also implies a notion of sameness or similarity – to have something in common. According to Gullestad (2002a; 2002b) the high value placed on equality as sameness means that people need to regard themselves as similar to be of equal value. Consequently, people in Norway tend to emphasize their similarities and to downplay differences in interactional situations. She argues that by overemphasising sameness – and avoiding or downplaying differences – class-based divisions have become blurred, whilst the differences between Norwegian and migrants have become discursively salient (Gullestad, 2002a).

Moreover, in her studies Gullestad (2002a; 2002b) also finds racialising overtones both in connotation attached to the concept of immigrant, and in the usage of kinship metaphors in the description of who belongs to the Norwegian nation. She argues that the concept of immigrant has developed as a binary opposite to the concept of Norwegian in a way that constructs "Norwegianness" - and by extension "whiteness" - as an unthematized normative reference point (Gullestad, 2002a, p.91). Regarding the concept of immigrant, a distinction can be drawn between the broader lexical definition of the word and a narrower use. In the lexical definition, the concept denotes all people who cross the Norwegian national borders and settle in Norway. However, in the narrower usage the concept is used implicitly to refer to people from so-called third world countries, who are considered to be predominantly working class, and have values that is perceived to differ greatly from the majority society. Lithman (2010) detects a similar development in all Northern European countries

today, whereby the term migrant generally applies to people of non-European, non-white backgrounds (Lithman, 2010, p.489).

Furthermore, the concept of immigrant is not only used with reference to people who have migrated, but also the children of these migrants who are born in Norway who have been labelled second generation immigrants (Gullestad,2002b). According to Gullestad (2002a), this labelling process locks people who have migrated to Norway, and their children, in a permanent position of inferiority in relation to native Norwegians. This, she argues, is also visible in what she calls "the metaphor of the host-guest relationship" often applied to immigration in Norway (Gullestad, 2002b, p.54). Within this metaphor immigrants as guests should be grateful towards their hosts and conform to the rules laid out by the hosts. The hosts on the other hand are those who feel they naturally belong within the environment, and they should be able to define the rules of the visit and control the resources that guests are provided access to (Gullestad, 2002b, p.54).

In the processes of defining who holds a legitimate claim to "Norwegiannness" Gullestad (2002a) argues that a notion of symbolic kinship is often alluded to, thereby defining "Norwegianness" as an innate quality – something one is born into through generations of lineage. This attachment between "Norwegianness" and symbolic kinship is particularly evident in descriptions of the Norwegian society as a community of solidarity, with the welfare state being its manifestation. According to Gullestad (2002a), the construction of the welfare state in Norway post WW2 is often conceived of as a gigantic national project, which was achieved and completed before the new migrants arrived. Whereas young and middle-aged native Norwegians who have not taken part in this process are discursively included in the understandings of who took part in the construction of the welfare state, migrants are discursively excluded.

Within such an ethnic-national interpretative framework Muslims, in particular, are regarded as extrinsic and strange (Gullestad, 2002b). The mass media plays a central role in highlighting Muslim migrants as a group with practices that contrasts starkly with European and North American liberal values. The trope of the Muslim man as a

threat to women and gay rights is particularly cogent in Norway where promotion of gender equality, sexual liberty and gay rights is fundamental to the Norwegian self-understanding (Bangstad,2011). According to Bangstad (2011, p.7) this "has the practical effect of effacing 'native' Norwegian misogyny and homophobia". Consequently, the media discourse tends to homogenise both Muslim cultures, as well as Norwegian culture – constructing them as opposites – the liberal Norway versus the illiberal Muslims. Most of the migrants from Pakistan in Norway are Muslims, which makes Pakistani migrants in Norway particularly exposed to Norwegian othering discourses.

3. Pakistan and Poland – general characteristics

For the reader to get an understanding of the structural and institutional characteristics which have shaped the early life of the migrants in this study, this section provides a broad overview of historical developments in Pakistan and Poland. Such a description runs the risk of portraying the two nations as static, unchanging, and homogeneous. This is not the purpose of the following account. I recognize that the nations of Pakistan and Poland, as with any other nation state, are undergoing continuous developments and changes. However, for the purpose of this study the descriptions of the general characteristics of Pakistan and Poland will focus on characteristics and developments occurring at the time where the participants in this study lived there. Consequently, the description of Pakistan revolves around developments taking place after Pakistan became an independent nation in 1947 up until the early 1980s when most of the Pakistani participants in this study migrated to Norway. The description of Poland will centre on the developments taking place from 1945-1989, the period during which Poland was a socialist state. It was during this period that the Polish migrants in this study lived in Poland.

3.1 The Pakistani context – general characteristics

The area we now call Pakistan was originally part of India. After centuries of conflicts and oppression between the Hindus, Sikhs and Muslims, and conflicts with British colonists from the 16th century, an old idea of an independent nation based on

principles of the Muslim faith reemerged in the 1930s[16]. With this aim in mind Pakistan was established as dominion under British rule in 1947 (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018; Qadeer, 2006). In 1956, Pakistan was declared as an Islamic Republic[17]. Based on the building blocks of the already established provincial societies of Punjab, the Northwestern Frontier Province (NFWP), Balochistan and East Bengal, the new nation was to be formed based on Islamic principles (Qadeer, 2006). Laws and regulations, politics, education and family life were to be structured according to principles of the Muslim faith (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018, p. 52).

A central characteristic of Pakistan is that it constitutes a war torn and impoverished state, with difficulties in establishing a stable government (Qadeer, 2006; Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018). External conflicts, particularly with India, and internal divisions have contributed to huge investments in the military which have drained the country of resources. Moreover, by the time Pakistan was established as an independent nation, British and other colonists had already pillaged the entire Indian sub-continent of raw materials and semi-finished products (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018)

Since its establishment and through the 1970s the economy was mainly based on agriculture and it was estimated that 80 % of the working population were employed in agriculture. Industrial production was weakly developed. In the 1970s however, a small group of landowners owned most of the land. This small group of landowners controlled large parts of the land, and also controlled 60% of the industry, 80% of the banks, dominated universities and held important positions in government, public administration, and the military – institutions within which corruption and nepotism was, and still is, widespread (Qadeer, 2006; Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018). Much of the population were poor peasants who barely produced enough to support themselves (Qadeer, 2006; Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018). Although poverty levels have steadily

---

[16] According to Korbøl & Midtbøen (2018), the idea of an independent nation for Muslims stems from the 16th century, which may be described as a golden age for Muslims in the Indian subcontinent.

[17] Originally, Pakistan was split in two territories – East and West Pakistan. East Pakistan, consisting of East Bengal and Assam, was geographically separated from West Pakistan, and was established as the independent nation of Bangladesh, following the Bangladeshi Liberation war in 1971 (Qadeer,2006).

decreased since independence, one third of the Pakistani population still live in poverty. Thus, by the turn of the century "mass poverty in Pakistan coexists with the affluence and even opulence of landowners, businessmen, professionals, and the political and bureaucratic elite" (Qadeer, 2006, p. 8).

Pakistan has undergone a massive population growth, with numbers rising from 60 million people in 1970 (Korbøl, 2018), to 132.35 million in 1998 (Qadeer, 2006). In the 1970s, much of the population resided in rural areas, and villages, the most populous provinces being the Punjab[18] and Sindh province (Qadeer, 2006). However, in recent decades, Pakistan has undergone a massive urbanization due to, amongst other things, governmental investments in manufacturing industries, the rise of commercial and service industries, as well as population growth (Qadeer, 2006).

The education system of Pakistan is inherited from British colonial rule, with strong emphasis placed on a theoretical education (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018). Historically speaking, resources have predominantly been invested in higher education. Education is costly in Pakistan, and having an education provides no guarantee for employment. Consequently, education is a privilege which few can afford (Korbøl & Midtbøen,2018). According to Korbøl & Midtbøen (2018, p. 58) a large share of the Pakistani migrants in Norway are representative of this "unemployed elite". Although education is still considered a privilege in Pakistan, there have also been steady progress with increased numbers of primary and secondary schools, and universities, professional colleges, and technical institutes. These institutions are primarily for men but there have also been increases in educational institutions for women, although this development is slower than the development of institutions for men (Qadeer, 2006). Moreover, advances have also been made in relation to literacy with the proportion of literate men above the age of ten, rising from 16 % in the 1960s to 57 %[19] by the turn of the century (Qadeer, 2006).

---

[18] Most of the Pakistani migrants in Norway have emigrated from the Punjab province.

[19] The proportion of the female population who are able to read with understanding was 33 % (Qadeer, 2006)

Pakistan ranks low in the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) human development index, and the public provision of education, health and welfare services is very low (Qadeer, 2006). However, in the 1980s the practice of *Zakat* – a religious obligation to donate to charity, was institutionalized and legally enforced (Qadeer, 2006). Before the 1980s, the Zakat was disbursed individually. During the rule of General Ziaul Haq the responsibility of collecting and distributing the Zakat became a state responsibility. The Zakat tax was distributed for the purpose of providing a minimum of assistance to persons in need, particularly widows, orphans, disabled and poor persons. The funds were also used to assist religious schools and other educational institutions, mosques, public hospitals, clinics, dispensaries, and health laboratories (Rehmatullah, 2002).

Aside from the distribution of the Zakat tax, the welfare of Pakistani citizens is in large part provided for by the major civil society institutions – the family, clans and kinship groups in particular – but also religious organizations and communities (Rehmatullah, 2002; Qadeer, 2006).

According to Qadeer (2006, p.190) there is a distinction between the ideal and the reality of family life in Pakistan. The ideal family is surrounded by ideologies and values envisioning what it should be. The ideal form of family life is one of a:

> (…) joint family, where a patriarch or the oldest male heads not only his own conjugal family, consisting of wife and unmarried sons/daughters, but also those of his married son's/ younger brother's households. This social unit purportedly functions as one family with a single kitchen, sharing incomes and properties, and raising children together. (Qadeer, 2006, p.190)

The reality is, however, that there are multiple variations in terms of way of living, ranging from the one described above, to more independent conjugal households tied together by some common areas, or even more independent conjugal households (nuclear families). Nevertheless, the attachment to the husband's parental household remains strong.

Ideally, the family is organized into a formal hierarchy whereby each family member has a clearly defined role according to age and gender (Shaw, 2000). Traditionally the oldest male constitutes the head of the household and is also the main financial

provider. When the oldest male is too old and thereby unable to work, it is usually the son (s) who takes on this responsibility. Hence, there is a clear gendered division of labour in the household where women are responsible for caregiving and household tasks, whereas men have the financial responsibility (Shaw, 2000; Qureshi, 2012).

The gendered organization of the family is in line with the custom of *purdah*, which stems from the idea that women are responsible for the family's honour (*izzat*). The custom of purdah manifests itself in the practice of various forms of veiling, ranging from a complete veil and coverall (*burqa*), to covering the head and hair (*hijab*), and in the practice of gender segregation (Qadeer, 2006). The practice of gender segregation means that women are not given responsibilities outside of the household and should not interact with men who are not kin (Qadeer, 2006). Generally, women have more authority and freedom within the confines of the household but are more restricted by patriarchal and religious norms in public (Qadeer, 2006). It is within this context that ageing in Pakistan needs to be understood. I will return to this topic in section 4.1 of this chapter.

3.2 The Polish context – general characteristics

The following description will center on the characteristics which I consider to be the most central in contextualizing the life courses of the Polish migrants in this study. One of these characteristics is that Poland is a post-socialist country, which Stenning (2005) conceptualises as constituting a combination of a distinctive legacy of socialism, followed by transition to capitalism, characterized by neoliberal economic restructuring.

From 1945 until 1989, Poland was under rule by Soviet Russia, as the People's Republic of Poland. Although Poland was officially independent, the Soviet Republic controlled both internal and international policies (Mayblin, Piekut & Valentine, 2014). The post-war years in Poland were turbulent times, characterized by wartime destruction, shifting borders, internal and international migration, and the establishment of Soviet state socialism (Stenning, 2005).

In 1945, the number of inhabitants in Poland had fallen from 34 million in 1939, to just under 24 million in 1939. Most of the Polish population adhered to the Roman Catholic faith. During WW2 Poland lost two fifths of its material productive capacities and thereby constituted one of the most devastated countries of Europe, comparable only to Belarus, and Ukraine (Lukowski & Zawadski,2006).

Based on socialist principles a nationally homogenous state was to be built. A Soviet style planned economy was imposed, and in the 1950s, a six-year plan of heavy and rapid industrialization was introduced. In consequence, large masses of people moved from rural areas and villages in order to work in the industrial plants developed in the larger cities, with the prime and triumphant showcase being the Lenin steel mills of Nowa Huta (Lukowski & Zawadski, 2006). In the period between 1945-1989 the Polish economy was characterised by either a lack of long term planning, or poor planning, with small periods of growth and frequent periods of stagnation – leading, amongst other things, to a shortage of food, inflation, rise in food prices and scarcity of other daily necessities. These recurrent crises reached their peak in the 1980s. With yet another rise in food prices, people organised strikes across the country in an unprecedented manner. In 1980 the national trade union "Solidarity", was established, which gradually turned into a population-wide social movement. In November 1981, Solidarity announced a mass social demonstration to take place December 17th, which in turn led to the institution of martial law in 1981 (Lukowski and Zawadski, 2006).

One of the methods of social engineering in the socialist era was through education and the creation of a new intelligentsia. Particularly children and young people of peasant or working-class backgrounds were encouraged to enter higher education through positive discrimination, whilst people recognized as bourgeois or reactionary were discouraged from higher education (Lukowski & Zawadski, 2006). Moreover, culture was made available to the masses through the construction of concert halls and opera houses and through the arrangements of cultural performances in industrial factories. However, the contents of these cultural performances were strictly

controlled, and anything interpreted as religious, anti-Russian or decadent was banned (Lukowski & Zawadski, 2006).

The strict regulation of Polish cultural life is in line with the overwhelmingly repressive political climate, involving restrictions on freedom of speech and freedom of organization. Labour unions were allowed, but only in so far as they served as a channel for governmental policies, and control. However, when it came to freedom of organization the Catholic Church held a unique position in Poland. The relationship between the government and the Church during socialism in Poland was an ambivalent one. With the exception of the Stalinist period in Poland from 1949-1956 whereby the Soviet government tightened its grip on every sphere of Polish economic, social and political life – including the Church – the government's overall interference with the Church has been one of caution. The Polish population cherished and supported the Church, and the authorities were dependent on a certain degree of loyalty from the church to maintain a semblance of legitimacy among the people (Lukowski & Zawadski, 2006). In the wake of the establishment of solidarity[20] in September 1980 – and the institution of martial law in 1981 – the church, being the only publicly active autonomous institution, served as a hub for the solidarity movement and the overall political opposition against the regime (Lukowski & Zawadski, 2006)

The regime was also repressive in relation to foreign travel. People leaving the country were deprived of their Polish citizenship. However, after the Stalinist period from 1947-1956, policies towards foreign travel and emigration were gradually liberalized, during which many sought to leave Poland in search of better opportunities in the West (Godzimirski, 2011). Moreover, due to growing disillusion with the social, political, and economic prospects in Poland it is estimated that 166 630 persons left Poland between 1980 and 1985. This wave of emigrants mostly consisted of young professionals and – according to Iglicka (2019, p. 44) –up to 15

---

[20] Solidarity was a national trade union led by Lech Walesa, which attracted a great number of different protest groups, who were instrumental in the overturn of the regime in 1989. Solidarity gradually turned into a mass social movement, committed to democratisation, the development of autonomous production units and against the total governmental control of the economy (Lukowski & Zawadski,2006).

percent all Polish scholars, computer scientists, physicists and biologists either permanently emigrated or left the country on long term work contracts. Some of the participants in this study are part of this group.

During the period in which Poland was a socialist state a basic welfare system was in place. However, this system favoured industrial workers, at the expense of other social groups such as older people and people living in rural areas (Lukowski & Zawadski, 2006, p.288). The combination of traditional values – highly informed by the Catholic faith – and welfare provision being tightly attached to industrial work meant that the importance of the family heightened under State Socialism. In other words, the political and economic disturbances under State Socialism seems to have strengthened the importance of family unity and intergenerational support (Synak, 1990). At the time, the family served as a protective sphere against external structural forces. In the words of Watson, the family acted as "the safety net with the social and economic support of kin being an indispensable resource" (1993, p.141). It is within this context, that the mode of care provision in Poland needs to be understood.

4. Ageing migrants in the intersection between modes of care provision

4.1 Ageing and the total organization of care in Pakistan

In Pakistan family care remains the dominant mode of provision of care for older people (Majid & Memon, 2018). Care responsibilities for both children and older people are generally allocated to the family or household (Qureshi, 2012). This mode of provision is premised upon joint family living. Ideally two or three generations of blood relatives live together, sharing property, child rearing and the care of older people.

As already mentioned in section 3.1, living arrangements in Pakistan are subject to extensive variation. However, even if living arrangements may vary, the way in which the family is organized is rooted in strong values of kinship solidarity and mutual care (Qadeer, 2006). This also entails that family members are responsible to provide for both the emotional and physical needs of their older family members, and

there is a strong expectation that adult children should provide their older family members with love, respect and admiration (Cassum et al., 2020).

Mutual responsibilities within the family are based on norms of reciprocity, whereby children, in return for being provided for in young age, are expected to care and provide for their parents when they grow old. Caring for a family member is thus conceived as a form of reciprocity enacted across the life course, and children are socialized into these expectations from a very early age (Qureshi, 2012).

Family as the main provider of care for older people is also premised upon a gendered division of labour in which men and women have complementary tasks. As already mentioned, women are expected to perform unpaid work in the household such as cooking, cleaning, caring for children and older family members, while men have the financial responsibility (Qadeer, 2006). In traditional Pakistani custom, the oldest son lives with his parents, and upon marriage, the daughter-in-law moves in with them (Donnan, 1998). This means that usually the daughter-in-law is considered responsible for caring for her parents-in- law. Moreover, the family is hierarchically organized according to age. This means that older women have authority over younger women, but they are both subordinate to male authority (Shaw, 2000).

Although care provided by the family still constitutes the dominant mode of care provision for older people, this system is gradually changing due to recent demographic developments, such as declining birth rates and rising life expectancy (Cassum et al, 2020;Majid & Memon, 2018). These trends mean that the share of older people – including older people dependent on care in daily life – is steadily growing. At the same time urbanisation, the rise in more career oriented younger people, and a growing numbers of women entering paid work is gradually leading to an erosion of traditional family norms, including the provision of care and support by family members (Cassum et al, 2020). Combined these trends create demands for new societal responses in Pakistan. One of these societal responses is the establishment of so-called shelter homes, i.e. residential facilities for older people who – for different reasons – do not have family members, or other people available to provide care for them. These shelter homes are run by Non-Governmental

Organisations (NGOs) or faith based organisations and paid for by the older person him or herself. Or – if the older person cannot afford it – by benefactors in the religious community (Cassum et al, 2020).

Applying the descriptive framework of Lyon & Glucksmann (2006;2008) to Pakistan implies that family care remains the dominant mode of care provision. Furthermore, caregiving is seen as a moral obligation, not something that should done in exchange for payment. This mode of provision has not been subject to much change. However, today we see a gradual trend towards the voluntary sector providing care for older people, who do not have family members available to provide care.

4.2 Ageing and the total organization of care in Poland

As already mentioned in section 3.2, the Polish Socialist State was responsible for securing just the necessities. This means that the main provider of care for older dependent persons was the family. According to Perek-Bialas and Slany (2016), these expectations emanate from tradition, religion, and values, whereby caring for ageing parents is considered a natural responsibility of adult children. During the socialist regime in Poland, children were left with the duty of caring based on the idea that children inherited the parent's wealth and should thereby be in charge of caring for dependent parents (Perek-Bialas & Slany, 2016).

The Socialist State, however, did construct an infrastructure for the social care of older people. Social care included providing basic care in the sphere of hygiene and sanitation, nursing help and home-helpers assisting with cleaning, laundry, and taking care of various day-to-day matters. These provisions were also informed by the sociopolitical idea of ageing in place, and the services that were provided in people`s homes were aimed at providing older people with the means to stay in their homes and their communities for as long as possible. This means that institutional care was only provided to those who, for different reasons, were not capable of living on their own (Synak, 1990).

Despite this infrastructure, the strong culturally embedded ideals and patterns of family care prevailed, based on a premise of family members' duties to ensure care and a proper standard of living for the old and dependent. Thus, older people in

Poland usually received – and still receive – considerable care from their family members, based on ideals of mutual intergenerational help and an ethos of family solidarity. This means that formal care services are in many cases only provided to older people who do not have family, or in situations where care has become a source of conflict within the family (Synak,1990).

The Soviet socialist policy challenged the traditional male breadwinner model, where men were financial providers and women oversaw reproductive and caring tasks within the family. Women were encouraged to work outside the home because paid work was considered key to their liberation and because women's labour market participation was essential for economic development. Labour market participation was ensured through workplace social provisions, parental leave arrangements and benefits, day-care centres and nurseries (Pascall & Lewis, 2004). Although the Socialist state implemented equal and individual rights to women in the public sphere, traditional norms prevailed in the private sphere (Watson, 1993; Ferge, 1998). This means that women were generally regarded as responsible for caring for children and older family members (Synak, 1990).

After the economic and social restructuring of Poland after 1989, social policies toward care for older people have also changed. Today, family members are still considered to be responsible for providing care for their relatives, but they now have the option of purchasing private care services, including home care and institutional care. These private arrangements are expensive and very few people can afford these options (Pierek-Bialas & Slany, 2016). Poland is undergoing similar demographic changes as in other Western European countries, such as decreased fertility levels and postponement of family establishment. At the same time, Polish women are more economically active than previous generations. Moreover, in the wake of Poland's accession to the EU, many young people are migrating to Northern Europe. Because of these developments the number of family members that are willing or able to care for older dependent family members is decreasing. Many are now opting to purchase care services, either through officially registered private companies, or through employment of "informal carers" in the "shadow economy" without paying social

security taxes and insurance. (Pierek-Bialas & Slany, 2016, p. 31). Many of these informal carers are migrant workers from poorer European countries, such as the Ukraine Thus, recruitment of migrant care workers – most notably from the Ukraine and Belarus – has become a strategy to solve the shortage of care providers (Golinowska & Sowa-Kofta, 2018). Another strategy is the development of transnational family caregiving arrangements (Krzyzowski & Mucha, 2014).

In sum, the specific configuration of care for older people in Poland has been centred on the family. During State Socialism family care – as the dominant mode of provision – was combined with public care services acting as a safety net for older persons who did not have family members available (Synak, 1990). Family care remains the dominant mode of provision today, but it is combined with reliance on individual market-based solutions, paid for by older people themselves or their families.

4.3 Ageing and the total organization of care in Norway

As already mentioned, Norway is characterized by a high degree of state involvement in providing welfare for its citizens and legal residents, both through financial transfers and through service provision. A key feature characterizing the Norwegian welfare state is that rights are accorded to the individual, rather than the family or household. In the widely used typology of Esping-Andersen (1999) Norway is placed in the Scandinavian welfare regime, which is characterised, among other things, by a relative degree of universal provision of benefits and services aimed at alleviating people's dependence on markets and their families (Esping-Andersen, 1999; Christensen & Wærness, 2018).

The concept of universal in this context, means that services and benefits, such as health care, social care services for older people, unemployment benefits and similar are available for the entire population of legal residents, not just especially vulnerable groups (Brochmann & Grødem, 2017). This is based on an idea that risks such as illness or unemployment constitutes a public responsibility, and thereby a matter of individual social rights. "From cradle to grave" is a widely used metaphor on the welfare state, indicating the state provision of services and benefits in relation to all

life course phases and transitions, including childbirth, childcare, unemployment, disability, retirement and social care services for older people (Kildal & Kunhle, 2005; Brochmann & Grødem, 2017). In practice however, there is also a strong degree of selectivism involved in the provision of services. Social rights are attributed through membership in population categories such as "under or above a certain age", "sick or disabled", "unemployed"[21], which are in turn politically defined as in need. The provisions of services and benefits are also based on strict eligibility criteria (Kildal & Kunhle, 2005). Moreover, the allocation of services is often practiced through the exercise of professional discretion. Consequently, the provisions of these services are often in the hands of gatekeepers, who are required to make priorities, often through non-standardized eligibility criteria (Kildal & Kunhle, 2005). The exercise of professional discretion is particularly extensive when it comes to the allocation of social care services (Kildal & Kunhle 2005; Christensen & Wærness, 2018; Øydgard, 2018).

In the framework of Lyon and Glucksmann (2008) publicly provided care constitutes the dominant mode of care provision in Norway, with informal family care playing a supporting role. However, as we shall see below, the system of care for older people is gradually changing towards more reliance on family and markets.

The Norwegian welfare state is based on relatively high levels of taxation on paid work, which in turn entitles individuals to social protection and provision. The high levels of taxation partly explain the strong commitment to employment and labour market participation in Norway (Esping-Andersen, 1990). Since the 1970s, there has been a steady increase in women's labour market participation, spurred by an interplay of feminist grassroots initiatives and initiatives by the political elite. In the late 1970s and throughout the 1980s political measures to alleviate some of women`s care responsibilities in the household – by establishing and expanding public

---

[21] Benefits such as unemployment benefits and retirement pensions, and health care services are provided through membership in «Folketrygden», a national social insurance program. The level of unemployment benefits and retirement pensions are based on former income. In addition, a minimum amount of state pension is available. Norway also has benefits targeting the economically weakest part of the population. These are, however, subject to extensive means testing (Kildal & Kunhle, 2005).

institutions for child and social care for older people – were implemented (Christensen & Wærness, 2018; Kjelstad, 2001). An important aim of welfare provision is also to promote a so-called dual-earner, dual-carer model (Ellingsæter, 2018).

In line with the other Scandinavian countries, Norway has been conceptualized as a service intensive welfare state, whereby publicly provided services for children, disabled and older people are widely available and used by all socio-economic groups (Wærness, 1998). Norwegian health care services are regulated by the Norwegian Public Health Act (Ministry of Health and Care services, 2011), which states that services of good quality should be available to everyone in need, regardless of financial situation, social status, age, gender, or ethnic background. The services are needs-tested, not means-tested (Vabø, 2011).The services are based on 90/10 public-private share funding, which means that onherly a small part of the services is paid for privately out of pocket (Christensen & Wærness, 2018). In theory, migrants with legal permanent residency have the same rights to care services, as do Norwegian citizens (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010), although, the access to these services may be unequally distributed.

Based on the socio-political idea of ageing in place, services delivered to people`s homes have become a high priority since the 1980s. In consequence, institutional care is only provided to persons who have care needs that are so extensive that they cannot stay in their own homes (Christensen, 2005).This is also in line with a principle of the lowest effective level of care, whereby services demanding the lowest amount of resources – and that are least comprehensive – are tested first, before gradually moving towards institutional care, which is the most comprehensive and resource demanding service (Øydgard, 2018).

The present study is concerned with the experiences of ageing in place among migrants. Moreover, a mapping study conducted by Ingebretsen (2010) has shown that persons of ethnic minority backgrounds generally request home based care services. Thus, the remainder of this section will be limited to a description of these services.

The home-based care services are divided into two branches: home nursing and home help. Home nursing includes a trained nurse coming to one's house to provide medical assistance such as insulin injection, distribution of medicine, bandage change and similar. Home help includes a person coming to one's house to provide domestic assistance, such as cleaning, grocery shopping and similar. In addition to these core services, several extra services – which include meals-on-wheels, physical therapy, and a personal safety alarm – are available (Christensen, 2012a).

In the 1990s, the care services went through a bureaucratization process. Services are now allocated through a careful needs-assessment process, where a caseworker from the municipality assess what an elderly person can manage to do on their own and what they need help with. The assessment process results in formal requisition detailing exactly how much help the recipient will receive, and for how long (Christensen, 2005, p 38; Christensen & Wærness, 2018).

As a part of this bureaucratization process and as informed by principles of New Public Management, a purchaser-provider model was introduced in the early 2000s. This purchaser-provider model separated the responsibility for assigning services, access to these services, and their quality (purchasing) from the actual production of the services (Christensen,2012a, p. 582-583).The grounds for introducing this purchaser-provider model was a belief that services would become more efficient, whilst maintaining equal rights to services for individual citizens. It was also believed that the user's right to complain about the requisition would be better attended to (Deloitte, 2012).

In the purchaser-provider model the actual provider of home-based care service is no longer in charge of assessing if a person is entitled to a care service, what kind of service he/she should receive, and how much. In this model, a request of assistance must be sent to an allocation division of the municipality. The person requiring assistance can only report having an assistance need and is not required to specify what kind of assistance or amount of assistance. Next, there is a careful assessment process whereby a caseworker charts if the applicant has the right to services, and if so, what kinds of services he or she should receive. This is done through home visits

and in dialogue with the applicants, relatives, and other health care providers that the applicant is in contact with. After this assessment process, the applicant fills out a more detailed application form, often in cooperation with a caseworker. In line with the principle of the lowest effective level of care, the caseworker charts how care can be provided on the lowest possible level. The information about available care services is limited to information about the least comprehensive services. Thus, through this needs-assessment process the caseworker controls information about services available. Although information about other services are available on the internet and through brochures, it is made practically unavailable in the needs-assessment process (Øydgard, 2018). This serves to illustrate a tension between the ideal and practice. Ideally, everyone should have equal rights to services according to need. However, given the limited amount of information the applicants and their relatives are provided about available services, it can be assumed that people who are resourceful enough to navigate the bureaucratic system, and acquire information about available services through other means than through the allocation department, may also receive more help than people who are less resourceful (Øydgard, 2018).

The purchase-provider model has also paved the way for commercial providers, through the so-called free-choice-of-provider arrangement, which has been implemented in several Norwegian municipalities (Christensen & Wærness, 2018). This means that once the recipient has received their requisition, they are able to choose, between different commercial providers in addition to the public providers, who should perform the care. This reflects a new perception of service recipients as resourceful enough to exert influence and make choices in relation to care (Christensen, 2012a; Christensen & Wærness, 2018).

Although Norway has an extensive delivery of formal care services, the informal care, provided – mainly by the family – amounts to approximately the same amount as the amount of formal care (Berge et al. 2014, p. 9). Ageing in place policies combined with increased bureaucratization of services and pressures to keep care services at the lowest effective level has created new implicit demands on family

members to provide more care for dependent older people [22] (Christensen & Wærness, 2018; Øydgard, 2018). The informal care provision is mainly of a practical nature, while public providers of welfare perform more demanding and medical care tasks (Berge & al, 2014, p.9).Women – mostly daughters – perform the main part of the informal care work (Christensen, 2012). If informal care work is particularly burdensome informal care providers may receive a care-wage. This care-wage is usually limited to 10,5 hours a week on average, which means that only a small amount of the care work is accepted as work (Christensen, 2012a, p. 14).

A recent development in the provision of care services is the trend towards "younger care"- This means that persons below the age of 67 are increasingly becoming users of long-term care services. A case study of how care services are allocated indicate that the assessment of care needs is different for the two groups of users. Persons below the age of 67 are assessed according to standards of non-disabled persons and are thereby provided services aimed at achieving this "normal" standard. People above the age of 67 are not assessed according to similar standards and, consequently, may receive services at a lower level. The trend towards "younger care" means that care services are becoming more thinly spread, and that older people are gradually receiving a smaller share of the care services (Christensen & Wærness, 2018).

In sum, the combination of ageing in place policies, increasing bureaucratization and marketization of care services reflect a new view of older people, premised on activity theory (Christensen & Wærness, 2018). In relation to care this new view of older people is visible in, amongst other things, the replacement of the concepts "patient" and "client", with the concept of "user", which denotes that older people should no longer be passive recipients of care, but be actively involved in matters regarding their own care (Christensen & Wærness, 2018). This active involvement includes engaging in health promoting activities and self-care, as well as exerting

---

[22] These demands are further underscored by the amount of online activities required in everyday life, such as filling out online application forms for care services and banking. For many older people these online activities are difficult to manage on their own (Christensen & Wærness, 2018).

influence on care provided by others, through choosing between public and private providers, or through purchasing additional services. As summarized by Christensen & Wærness (2018, p. 23); "the ideology now is home as long as possible with self-care, implying an 'active' user and/or a user with family/network available for help, or a user with resources to buy private help".

4.3.1 Adaptation of care services to a more diverse ageing population

The recognition that many migrants in Norway were not returning to their country of origin after retirement has also manifested itself in social policies concerning care services for older people.

The circumstances and care needs of older immigrants has been a topic of policy documents since the late 1990s. The overall focus in these documents is the adaptation and accommodation of care services to individual needs of users. White paper to the Storting number 29, entitled "Future Care" clearly pronounces this aim:

> The care services of tomorrow must be based on an individual approach and adaptation of the care services to a person's background, whether this concerns their language, culture, faith, or worldview; their age, gender, and sexual orientation; or their diagnosis, reduced functionality or problem. (Norwegian Ministry of Health and Care services, 2013, p. 8)

Consequently, accommodation of social care services to a more ethnic and culturally diverse group of older people is encompassed by an overall aim of differentiation of care services according each individual person's need, and not through special measures targeting immigrants. However, the policy documents do specify a need for some special measures targeting older immigrants, particularly the importance of making information about public care services available in different languages (Ingebretsen & Nergård, 2007). This needs to be understood in relation to the aim of user participation – that decisions regarding care services should be made in dialogue between the user and the provider of the service, and users should be given the opportunity to make informed choices regarding their services (Askheim et al, 2017). User participation is presented as one of the ways in which services can be adapted to everyone according to their specific needs. Thus, ideally information provided about care services to migrants should be provided in a way that ensures the right of the

user to be involved in matters regarding his or her own care (Ingebretsen & Nergård, 2007).

Chapter 3. Theoretical frameworks

1. Introduction

To analyse the experiences of ageing in place among migrants from Pakistan and Poland in Norway, I draw from and combine three different theoretical perspectives – the life course perspective, transnational perspective, and the intersectionality perspective.

These perspectives serve as "sensitizing" (Blumer, 1954, p.7). Blumer (1954) distinguishes between definitive and sensitizing concepts. Definitive concepts specify exactly what to find in each empirical instance, while sensitizing concepts on the other hand provide a frame of reference which guides an approach to empirical instances. Put more clearly in Blumer's (1954, p.7) own words; "Whereas definitive concepts provide prescriptions of what to see, sensitizing concepts merely suggest directions along which to look".

The use of the perspectives as sensitizing in this study means that they serve as guide for my approach by raising awareness of particular dimensions and topics which are considered to be important for ageing in contexts of migration based on existing knowledge of the topic, while at the same time being open towards what emerges from the empirical material.

In this chapter I discuss the central characteristics of the three perspectives, and how I use them in my study. I start with describing central principles of the life course approach, and how ageing can be understood as a life course phase. The topic of care, and the related topics of dependence and independence are central to how we understand old age as a life course phase. However, these concepts are highly problematic, and invested with meanings which are culturally specific – thus the section on the life course perspective is concluded by discussing some of the meanings invested in these concepts. After this, I describe the central principles of the transnational perspective, and the concepts of transnationalism as a mode of consciousness and a mode of cultural reproduction – concepts which are particularly

important in this study. Moving on, I discuss the intersectionality perspective, and how this perspective has guided my analytical approach. I conclude the chapter by discussing how the three perspectives are fruitfully combined in my study of ageing in place in a transnational migratory context.

2. The life course approach[23]

2.1 Theoretical foundation– Mead's concept of the reflexive self

The life course approach is inspired by the pragmatist social thinker George Herbert Mead and his understanding of the reflexive self. According to this understanding what characterises human beings, and in turn distinguishes them from other animal forms, is reflexivity, meaning the ability to take the attitude of other people toward themselves. This ability is developed through the process of communicating and interpreting "significant symbols", i.e. words and gestures that have the same meaning for all those involved in a social act (Mead, 1934, p. 284).

The ability to internalise and make the attitude of others the basis of our actions is developed through the process of socialisation. It is through this process that the self develops. The concept of the self, as Mead accounts for it, involves "the I" and the "me" (Mead, 1934, p.292). The *I* comprise the spontaneous and impulsive ability to act. The *I* account for "the pre-linguistic actions existing outside the confines of social dictates" (Elder & Hitlin, 2007, p. 174). The *me* on the other hand is socially mediated. It represents an individual's capacity to take in and interpret the responses to her in each social situation – to become an object to herself. This in turn becomes the basis of further actions. However, according to Mead (1934) the action is a result of the dynamic and ongoing dialogue between the I and the Me. The action responding to the presumed demands of participants in a social situation thus represent the responses of the I to the Me. Thus, in this perspective people's actions

---

[23] Wingens et al. (2011) distinguishes between an object and a paradigm view on life course research. The object view on life course research treats the life course as the "constitutive subject matter of research" (p.4). This research is devoted to the study of age graded trajectories, and transitions. A paradigm view of the life course consists of the integration of life course perspective with other theoretical perspectives, in examining a large variety of social phenomena. Although using the concept of life course perspective and paradigm interchangeably, this study is informed by a paradigm view of the life course.

are inherently social. They are aimed at fulfilling the conditions of social life, without being fully determined by these conditions (Elder & Hitlin, 2007). Through the socialisation process individuals gradually learn to interpret the social norms and expectations at different levels of abstraction. The expectations and norms of *the generalized other* represent the highest level of abstraction, whereby individuals have become able to act according to norms and expectations existing within a larger social collective or group (Mead, 1934, p.289-291).

Mead's perspective on the self is fundamental to how the actor is understood in the life course perspective. In this study Mead's concept of the self also underpins the way in which concepts such as belonging, role and identity are understood. As already described in the introduction of the thesis, the concept of belonging refers to people's identification with relational, material, and cultural surroundings (May & Muir, 2015). Such an identification would not be possible without the capacity for reflexivity. Moreover, according to Mead, all meaningful human behavior emerges through social relationships with other people, and our material and cultural surroundings (Hochschild, 2010).

The expression of self and identity takes place through role enactment in specific social relationships. Roles associated with the self and identity provide guiding principles about what one should do, and how one should behave in certain situations. As such, they represent "the normative expectation of situationally specific meaningful behavior" (Joas, 1993, p. 226).

The concept of identity is an inherently difficult and slippery concept to define. In its broadest sense, identity refers to the categories people use to categorize themselves and present themselves to the world (Owens, 2006). In this study identity is understood as relational, based on both individual identification and based on ascription by others. This perspective applies both to the concept of personal identity or identification – who I am as a person and what distinguishes me from others, and collective identity – who I identify myself to be based on perceived similarities with others based on a repertoire of collectively shared practices (Jenkins, 2008). Identity

inherently entails the identification of similarities and difference in relation to others (Jenkins, 2008). Thus, constructions of identities may be understood in relation to Lamont's (1992, p. 9) concept of "symbolic boundarries". Symbolic boundaries are based on conceptual distinctions made about objects, persons, people, practices, or places. However, Lamont uses the concept of symbolic boundaries in a more specific way in relation to the subjective boundaries which we draw between ourselves and others (Lamont, 1992, p. 9). Boundary work is done through membership in professional groups, social classes, and ethnic groups or through residence in a specific residential community. She argues that we all participate in the production and reenactment of competing boundaries, both in the process of labelling others and by participating in communities and taking part in the intersubjective definition of reality within these communities (Lamont, 1992). Thus, symbolic boundaries are central to identity, as they emerge when we try to define who we are, and in this process drawing inferences about differences and similarities with others. By generating and drawing upon distinctions we also signal our identity, and as Lamont (1992, p. 11) argues, we gain a sense of dignity, security and honour. Boundaries, she argues, are often constructed based on available cultural resources, and oftentimes boundaries are drawn from public evaluations of behaviour and behavioural norms. By drawing on the concept of boundary work, the distinctions that the participants in this study make – for instance when they differentiate themselves from what they identify as being taking advantage on welfare state benefits and services – may be understood as engaging in the construction of, enactment and negotiating of identities.

2.2 Central principles of the life course approach

The life course approach is later inspired by C. Wright Mills and his concept of "the sociological imagination". He defines sociological imagination as the ability to locate the lives of individuals within the historical context in which he or she lives. The sociological imagination thus enables us to look at how individual biographies are linked to historical contexts (Mills, 1959). According to Mills (1939, p. 672) it is through the generalized other that social processes enter people's reflections, and thereby constitutes the basis for their actions.

Further developed by Elder (1994), the life course approach involves the study of the linkages between lives and changing historical conditions. According to Elder (1994) four interrelated themes are central in the life course paradigm: the interplay of human lives and historical times, the timing of lives, the concept of linked or interdependent lives and the concept of human agency.

Perhaps the most important theme in the life course perspective is its focus on the interplay between human lives and historical times. This highlights how individual`s life courses are placed within and shaped by historically particular economic, political, and sociocultural circumstances (Wingens et al., 2011). The focus on the interplay between historical conditions and individual biographies involves two different and overlapping dimensions: great events, and institutional change. Great events constitute important historical and political ruptures, such as wars, economic depression, and the fall of the Berlin wall or the political development of the welfare state after WW2. These events have far reaching consequences for the developments of people's lives (Silverstein & Giarrusso, 2011).

Institutional regulation and institutional change are also important for understanding the interplay of biography and history. Major institutions of society, such as for instance the workplace, the educational system and the family create collective expectations and institutional age markers for when a life course transition (such as child birth or retirement) should occur (Silverstein & Giarusso, 2011). Institutions interact with one another. For instance, the time one has for family life, care and support depends in large part on the demands of paid work. Thus, as Silverstein and Giarusso (2011, p. 40-41) argue "the institutions of family and work, for instance, mutually interact but also compete with each other for the time and energy of their constituent members".

The sometimes competitive interactions between the institutions of family and paid work is particularly important in relation to care as it illustrates how the development of caregiving arrangements – not only take place within the context of public provisions and allocations of care services, or in relation to culturally conceived

normative obligations to care – but they also develop within the context of paid work and the way in which the demands of paid work impact on the time available for care (Kilkey & Merla, 2013). This is of particular importance to the discussions in chapter 6, where older migrant's negotiations of family care are explored.

Related to the interplay of human lives and historical and geographical context, is the question of how welfare is organized, in terms of the relative importance and interconnectedness of markets, family, and the state in the production of welfare. This is important in structuring the timing in which a transition, such as for instance retirement from paid work, might occur. The demands placed on family members in relation to caregiving and support is also structured by the provisions of benefits and services by the welfare state – for instance acting to obligate or release the filial duties of adult children towards their ageing parents. Thus, the way in which welfare is allocated between the state, market and the family may influence the intergenerational helping behaviours, emotional quality, interaction, and co-residence within families (Mayer, 2004; Silverstein et. al, 2010; Silverstein & Giarusso, 2011).

The second principle in the life course perspective, which Elder (1994) identifies, is the timing of lives. This refers to the age in which expected life course transitions, such as graduating from school, entering paid employment, starting a family, or retiring from paid work takes place. It also refers to the roles in which people are expected to have or take on at different ages, and in different stages of their lives. Moreover, the principle of timing of lives refers to an individual's life stage at the point of social change (Elder, 1994).

The principle of linked lives refers to how individuals are embedded in social relationships with kin, friends and colleagues across the life course, and how decision-making, social regulation and support occur through these relationships. This principle serves to highlight how individual choices among available options in a given context does not happen in a vacuum but are shaped by and made with reference to significant others in their lives – be it immediate or extended family members, workplace colleagues or the ethnic community. Structures and institutions

as well as changes in structures and institutions are mediated by and experienced through people's immediate social relationships, their obligations towards others and their incorporation in formal and informal support systems (Elder, 1994; Wingens et al., 2011).

From the above account, it may seem like the life course perspective places its main emphasis on the impacts of social structure on individuals. However, according to Elder (1994) the actor and human agency is central. People do not simply blindly follow a series of institutionally scheduled pathways, but rather they evaluate opportunities and constraints, and within these opportunities and constrains they construct their life courses (Elder, 1994).

Based on Mead's understanding of the self, Elder and Hitlin (2007) have developed a typology of different forms of agency according to different temporal horizons. They distinguish between existential, pragmatic, identity, and life course agency – of which the latter two are most relevant to this study[24]. Identity agency refers to actions undertaken to fulfil a certain socially defined role or identity. It is the habitual actions that follow socially established ways of acting. These forms of actions are guided by norms and social expectations, yet individuals do not passively follow these norms. In the process of moving through life people choose to act in certain ways – and follow certain paths – which both shapes their identities as well as fulfill certain identity commitments. These identities are internalized and motivate people to act in a certain way to reinforce these identity commitments. In sum, identity agency refers to actions that are aimed at negotiating a certain socially defined role or identity, and these attempts may be successful or unsuccessful. A lack of success in acting in terms of a valued role or identity may manifest itself in a sense of shame or embarrassment, because it is threatening to our sense of self (Elder & Hitlin, 2007, p.179 -181).

---

[24] Existential agency refers to human beings' innate capacity to initiate action. Thus, existential agency underlies all actions, and all other forms for agency – including pragmatic, identity, and life course agency (Elder & Hitlin, 2007). Pragmatic agency refers to the ability to act in the present moment and according to immediate circumstances. This form of agency is mainly applied to situations where "habitual responses to patterned social actions break down" (Elder & Hitlin, 2007, p. 178). In these kinds of situations, the need to focus attention towards the present moment is heightened.

Whereas identity agency may be enacted in particular moments in time – that means in social situations which are temporally limited – the concept of life course agency refers to actions with a broader sense of our futures involved. Life course agency involves exercising actions with long-term implications and goals in mind, and confidence in our capacity to reach these goals (Elder & Hitlin, 2007, p. 182).These actions form a collection of different decisions and events in different spheres of life (for instance establishing a family, getting an education, migrating to a foreign country, to name a few), which often only get linked together retrospectively. This means that people think about the consequences of the entirety of their choices in life in hindsight. This is important to their sense of self because the choices they have made shapes their negotiations of, and fulfilment of valued identity commitments. This understanding of agency is particularly important for chapter 6 on negotiations of filial obligations. Moreover, this understanding of agency constitutes a fundamental basis for the choice of conducting biographical interviews – as this method enables an exploration of the participants own reflections about their life choices and experiences and the consequences of these – rather than being concerned with whether their reflections are factual or not.

Identity agency and life course agency are interrelated. Oftentimes, people make plans and life course transitions are conducted according to valued social roles and identities. Consequently, these future plans constitutes a cognitive representation of who they want to be and what they want to obtain, which acts as a foundation for actions and choices that are more limited in time (Elder & Hitlin, 2007).

The actions people choose to undertake, and their future plans are constrained by historical conditions and so-called opportunity structures, as well as individual beliefs in their capacities to obtain certain goals that they aspire to. Thus, actions undertaken with distal goals in mind are based on personal experiences of success or failure, which may shape orientations toward the future. These experiences are further shaped by structural positions in terms of gender, class, and ethnic background, and the opportunities provided in a given historical context (i.e. nation state policies surrounding education, ageing, migration, the labour market and so on), and

biological limitations (health situation, opportunities for childbearing and the like). Within these constraints however, people self-reflectively and retrospectively make choices and take actions that shape their life course (Elder & Hitlin, 2007). These choices are also related to and shaped by the stage or phase of life course, particularly in relation to the political, social, and institutional construction of life course phases according to age. I now turn to a discussion of later life and, more specifically, to the third age as a life course phase.

2.3 The third age as a life course phase

Central to the life course approach is the division of the life course into certain age graded stages or phases of life. This is closely associated with the works of Riley, Johnson & Foner (1972), and the works of Kohli and Meyer (1986). Both regard the life course as consisting of stages that are shaped by chronological age but also – more importantly – as the results of social and political constructions of age. How different life stages are divided and conceptualised varies considerably. Kohli (in Hagestad & Dykstra, 2016) operates with a tripartite division of the life course into childhood, adulthood, and old age, based on degrees of dependency and responsibilities associated with each life stage.

Advances in medical treatment – along with greater educational opportunities, and lifestyle changes in advanced capitalist states – have produced increases in longevity, and enabled people to stay healthy longer, or at least postponed the onset of debilitating illness. Consequently, old age is no longer considered only as a phase of dependency, decrepitude, and frailty – pending death (Laslett, 1991, Moen, 2011). These processes have raised the awareness of researchers of the need to differentiate the stages after retirement. Neugarten (1974), for instance, distinguishes between the "young old "and the "old old", whilst Laslett (1991) distinguishes between the "first," "second", "third" and "fourth age", emphasising the "third age" as a new, under-conceptualised stage of life (Laslett, 1991). He argues that as more and more people live well beyond their retirement years, and many are also healthy and relatively independent, there is a need for a more nuanced concept of old age – a concept that highlights the divisions and heterogeneity within groups constructed as old.

The distinction between the third age and fourth age has been subject to criticism. Firstly, scholars have been critical of what they define as dichotomous view of later life. In this view, the third age represents a time characterised by freedom from responsibilities, opportunities to pursue interests, choice, and self-expression. This is in turn juxtaposed with the fourth age, characterised as abjection and total dependence on others – a life phase where opportunities for autonomy, self-expression and pleasure is deprived (Gilleard & Higgs, 2010). This dichotomous understanding tends to gloss over how transitions between the early and later stages of later life are often gradual (Kafkova, 2016). Moreover, even though the human ageing process often brings about a decline in people's physical and mental functional ability, this does not necessarily entail a complete loss of autonomy and independence in all areas of life (Blaakilde, 2015). In relation to this, a dichotomous view of dependence and independence should also be problematised. These concepts should, in the words of Hockey and James (1995, p.11), be conceived of as "points at a fluctuating continuum". I shall return the concepts of dependence and independence in section 2.5 of this chapter.

Despite the criticism of the distinction between the third age and fourth age, I find the concept of the third age, as defined by Moen (2011), useful to describe the phase of life in which many of the study participants are. She defines the third age as; "a new phase of the life course – somewhere between the family- and career-building years and the frailer years of late adulthood" (Moen, 2011, p.13). However, in drawing on the concept of the third age in this study, I do not regard the third and fourth age as opposites. In the study, some of the participants have no health problems or long-term care needs, while others have some health problems and care needs, but they are also able to manage on their own in many areas of life. Consequently, I regard the transition between the third and fourth age as a gradual transition, related to a gradual health decline, and the gradual development of more extensive long-term care needs, often resulting from the ageing process.

The concept of the third age carries certain connotations for which it has been criticised. Therefore, I find it important to discuss how it has been used, and how I

make use of it in this study. Laslett (1991) who initially developed the concept, accounts for it as a life phase carrying various potentials of personal fulfilment and engagement in society. He describes his approach to the third age as aspirational – something which should be aspired to – but which has not yet been achieved (Laslett, 1991). In his view, the third age constituted an "emerging group of older individuals who, because of their health and employment status, possessed the unique capacity for engaging in society in ways not accessible to previous generations of older adults"(Carr & Komp, 2011, p.3). This view of the third age is informed by activity theory, which has become a dominant view on ageing. In activity theory, ageing is treated as something that people should adjust to, by maintaining the activity levels of mid-life. To cope with old age, people should engage in social, political, and physical activities in a similar fashion as in mid-life (Marshall & Bengtson, 2011). Laslett's account of the third age also entails an encouragement to engage in activities to postpone the onset of the fourth age (Gilleard & Higgs, 2010).This is also reflected in the encouragement of older people to be active participants in their own care, and the emphasis on their responsibilities to rehabilitate from needing a certain level of support, to needing less support (Christensen & Wærness, 2018).

Laslett's (1991) approach to the third age has been criticized, for treating purposeful living as synonymous with having an active life and financial planning, and thus ignoring how a sense of purpose may be invested with different meanings according to gender or ethnic background (Wray, 2003). Moreover, his usage of the concept has been criticised for ignoring the ways in which opportunities in the third age are shaped by class and gender as well as former life course experiences. For instance, his descriptions of the freedom and opportunities in the third age is culturally specific to western societies, and mostly applicable to the middle class (Wray, 2003). Moreover, the understanding of the third age as a phase of freedom from caregiving obligations towards children glosses over the fact that this stage of life may also entail new caregiving obligations – towards spouses or towards parents – who are also in the later stages of life (Wray, 2003). Caregiving obligations may also multiply, a process which is captured in the notion of "sandwich generation" –

whereby adults are sandwiched between attending to the needs of their maturing children and their ageing loved ones (be it spouses or parents) (Miller, 1981).

In this study, the concept of the third age is used in a more sensitising way. Inspired by Moen (2011)[25], I consider resources, roles, and relationships in the third age as something – which may vary considerably – according to gender, ethnic background, and class, in addition to other former life course experiences. Furthermore, the question of how the third age is experienced, the meanings attached to, and how it is lived is regarded to be an empirical question, rather than theoretically defined on the onset. The analysis thus centres on the distinctive experiences of – and the practices that the study participants engage in – in the third age. The comparison between migrants from a European country and migrants from a non-European country represents a fruitful starting point for examining the differentiation in the way in which the third age is experienced and lived.

Akin to the life course perspective in general, the third age is not to be associated with reaching a specific chronological age, but rather it is understood in relation to social and institutionally produced transitions in life. For instance, the transition from the second to the third age is usually associated with retirement from working life – which is institutionally defined by chronological age. This definition does not include people who have not been employed in the labour market or been employed on a part time or temporary basis. In this case, the transition from the second to the third age may be defined by a weakening of responsibilities associated with caring for children and other dependents but may also be defined by the development of new forms of caregiving obligations.

The transition to retirement – whether voluntary or forced – implies a shift in roles, and a loss of structure and routines associated with having a job and/or raising a

---

[25] Moen (2011) defines her approach to be a gendered life course approach, focusing specifically on how the third age experience, and resources, roles, and relationships in the third age will vary according to gender. I do recognize this point as important. However, the gendered shape of the life course, as well as its intersection with class and ethnicity will be discussed in a separate section of the chapter, under the heading of «the intersectionality perspective.

family. Thus, the third age constitutes a time where significant changes in routines, roles and relationships occurs, which influences people's self-perceptions and images, as well as construction of meaning in their lives (Moen,2011). Due to the inherent novelty of this new phase of life[26], Moen (2011,p.14) argues that the third age may be understood as a project, that lacks taken for granted blueprints, and where people must strategically select their own pathways. Nonetheless, she argues that the patterning of lives, such as employment trajectories, marriage trajectories, and health trajectories as well as historical, social and cultural context has significant bearings on resources and options available in the third age, and how people construct meaning in this phase of life (Moen, 2011).

Arguably, Laslett`s (1991) aspirational account of the third age, and the increasing emphasis upon active ageing, and what it means to age well or successfully may be considered a "cultural zeitgeist" (Krause, 2019). Understanding the aspirational account of the third age as a cultural zeitgeist, means viewing it as a pattern of meaningful practices – that links together different spheres of social life – and which may extend across geographical contexts (Krause, 2019, p.1). Consequently, a cultural zeitgeist may be regarded as providing a "cultural repertoire" (Swidler, 1986, p.277)[27] for the establishment of meaning, and practices in a particular time and place. It does not, however, necessarily constitute a unitary whole or encompass all social groups in a specific time. This means that the third age, understood as a cultural zeitgeist, merely serves as one – albeit dominant – cultural repertoire for organising life in the third age. Thus, the argument I am making here, is that understanding the third age as a period of individual self-realisation, personal fulfilment and achievement, does not entail understanding it as the only, or the best way of living life in the third age. Ageing migrants may draw upon different cultural repertoires that exists alongside the cultural zeitgeist of the third age. In a transnational perspective, which will be discussed below, the purpose of this study

---

[26] She regards it as emerging during the first decades of the 21st century.

[27] The concept of cultural repertoires is drawn from Swidler's (1986) toolkit approach to culture. I shall elaborate on how I make use of this approach in section 3.4 of this chapter.

has been to examine how they draw upon, negotiate, and combine these different – and sometimes opposing – cultural repertoires in their constructions of meaning and practices in old age.

2.4 Care in a life course perspective

In this study, care, dependence, and independence are central concepts. Most of the participants in the study may be characterized as third agers, who henceforth do not yet have any extensive, or long-term care needs. Still, given the understanding of dependence and independence "as points at a fluctuating continuum" (Hockey & James, 1995, p.11), and the fact that most of the participants are in the stage of life where questions regarding care – whether it is in the present moment – or reflections about potential future long-term care needs are gradually becoming more pertinent. What emerges in the interviews, however, is that their reflections about care centres on issues surrounding dependence and independence, and, the moralistic judgements underpinning the concept of dependence, not specifically related to dependence in old age. Thus, this section of the chapter starts by defining and discussing the concept of care, before discussing the discourses surrounding dependence and independence – and how migrants have been implicated in these discourses.

In a life course perspective dependence on care – as well as obligations to care for others – is regarded as a universal, common part of life. This is captured, in the aforementioned principle of linked or interdependent lives (Elder, 1994). Indeed, central scholarship on care defines care as central to the human condition – thereby recognizing this generalized social interdependence (Fine & Glendinning, 2005). For instance, Fisher and Tronto (1990; cited in Zechner, 2008, p.33) define care as "everything that is done to maintain, continue or repair our world so that we can live in it as well as possible" (Fisher and Tronto, 1990, cited in Zechner, 2008, p. 33). This definition subsumes different dimensions of care, such as the emotional/affective dimension of caring about, as well as the actual activity of caregiving. The definition does not, however, specify exactly what kinds of activities may be defined as care. Based on a study of negotiations of family responsibilities in a Northern region of the UK, Finch & Mason (1993, p.65) provide a useful

distinction of different kinds of care, including practical, financial, personal "hands on" care and emotional and moral support. Moreover, Finch and Mason (1993) argue that these family responsibilities emerge in the intersections between normative obligations, meaning hegemonic ideas about duties and relationships between family members, and negotiations within the family. These negotiations are based on the historical development of relationships within the family, and consider past, present, and future exchanges of care and support

As already mentioned, the above definitions illuminate the universal nature of care – also highlighted in the life course principle of linked or interdependent lives. These definitions are useful to this study – and to chapter 6 on negotiations of filial obligations in particular – because they highlight the reciprocal nature of caregiving and receiving. In this perspective, all individuals may be understood as in the giving and receiving end of some form of care at different points in time. The definitions are also useful because they allow for an accentuation of how older migrants are not simply receivers – or potential receivers of care – but that they also provide different forms of care. They thereby form part of reciprocal caregiving arrangements in the family. Moreover, considering the recent policy trends, the concept also serves to highlight the demands of older people to engage in self-care (Christensen & Wærness, 2018), which has been discussed in the chapter on contextual backgrounds.

However, the broad definitions of care proposed by Fisher & Tronto (1990, cited in Zechner, 2008) and by Finch & Mason (1993) neglects certain important features of care. Firstly, the definitions do not distinguish between varieties of care needs. Some people may have more extensive care needs than others, related to disability, or to different phases of the life course such as childhood or advanced old age. These care needs may require a different form of commitment – often long-term – than the more generalised informal exchanges of care and support. They also neglect the resources required in these latter forms of care – how care may be physically, emotionally and financially demanding (Fine & Glendinning, 2005).[28] Secondly, the definitions pay

---

[28] In relation to this it is also worth noting that care is deeply embedded within the gendered division of labour in society. This will be returned to in the chapter on contextual backgrounds.

little attention to power, and the inequality of power existing within the relation between care-provider and care receiver (Fine and Glendinning, 2005), nor do they pay attention to how these relationships are located within institutional or structural power relations (Christensen, 2005)[29]. Thirdly, the definitions seem to neglect the institutional embeddedness of caregiving – and more particularly the role of the state in "managing risks and regulating resources and behaviors" (Fine & Glendinning, 2005, p. 611) in relation to care.

The definition of care provided by Daly & Lewis (2000) provides a useful corrective to some of the shortcomings of the former definitions. They use the concept of social care, and define it as:

> the activities and relations involved in meeting the physical and emotional requirements of dependent adults and children, and the normative economic and social frameworks within which these are assigned and carried out. (Daly & Lewis, 2000, p.285)

They elaborate on this by identifying three key dimensions of care. The first dimension is the understanding of care as labour, something which enables an analysis of whether it is paid or unpaid, and under which conditions this type of work is carried out. The second dimension identifies the normative framework of obligations and responsibilities in which care is located – and the role in which states have in shaping norms about care. The third dimension involves the emotional and financial costs of caring, and how these costs are shared among family, state, and society at large. Thus, this definition locates care as something which takes place in the intersection between the family, state, markets, and the voluntary sector. In this study the configurations of care developing in different nation states is captured in the concept of the total organization of labour, developed by Glucksmann & Lyon (2006). As outlined in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, the concept of the total organization of labour is used as a descriptive concept in addressing the different modes of care provision, i.e. the relative importance of state, families, communities,

---

[29] For instance, in her study of public care services in Norway, Christensen (2005) looks at how shifts in the structural power relations surrounding care provision, also implied a shift in the power relations in the interactions between care provider and care receiver.

voluntary sectors and markets, in Pakistan, Poland and Norway respectively. The model of Glucksmann & Lyon (2006) is useful because it also looks at how the dimensions of paid and unpaid work maps onto these different modes of care provision. In addition, the model locates the total organization of care in relation to broader structural and cultural developments. For instance, they locate care in relation to developments in the labour market, the gendered division of labour and the competing demands of paid work and family life. Consequently, they recognize care as an activity which is both work and non-work – it can be undertaken for payment or because of love, duty, or obligations. Their analysis goes beyond looking at different institutional modes for provision of care and their structural and cultural embeddedness. They are also concerned with how these modes of provision, and the dimensions of paid and unpaid shapes – and is shaped by – the concrete relationships between care provider and care receiver. For instance, if family care is a dominant mode of provision, and care is undertaken by love or culturally conceived of as an obligation, the work dimension of care may become hidden or absorbed in other domestic activities (Glucksmann & Lyon, 2006,p.10). Moreover, when care is conducted informally the right to receive care may be understood as dependent upon goodwill, duty, or traditions of reciprocity. By contrast, state or public provision of care may be understood as a citizen or resident entitlement provided that formal eligibility criteria are fulfilled. Another example is when payments are involved. In such instances the caring relationship may be conceived of as a market transaction and subject to market logics (Glucksmann & Lyon, 2006). There are of course nuances to this and the above description is provided to exemplify how different modes of provision and the dimensions of paid and unpaid serves to shape the caregiving relationship, and how care as an activity may be understood and experienced.

2.5 Dependence and independence in a life course perspective

Care and dependence are concepts which contain significant parallels and overlaps. Whereas dependency, in common usage, points to the need of assistance, care points to the provision of that assistance (Fine & Glendinning, 2005). Thus, intuitively the concepts point to two sides of the same coin. Still, there are many ways of thinking of

the concepts of dependence, and different cultural contexts, disciplinary traditions and policy documents define dependence and independence differently (Hammarstrøm & Torres, 2008, p. 76). For instance, Fine & Glendinning (2005) distinguish between four different meanings of dependency: economic dependency, socio-legal dependency, moral-psychological dependency, and physical dependency. Cross-cutting these different meanings of dependency, is the understanding of dependency as welfare dependency, which came to dominate in U.S debates on welfare in the 1980s, and which later has been used to justify cuts in welfare in a range of different national contexts (Vogt,2018).

In this study, meanings invested in the concepts of dependence and independence are regarded as discourses which many – including ageing migrants in this study – draw upon in their processes of identification and disidentification. Consequently, some of the meanings imbued in these concepts needs to be discussed. The prime focus in the discussion to follow, is on the meanings of economic and welfare dependency. It will, however, be argued that the discussion of welfare dependency spills into how physical dependency in old age is understood – something which the older migrants in this study relate to by wishing to engage in health promoting activities to avoid becoming more dependent on care in everyday life.

According to Fraser & Gordon (1994), contemporary usage of the concepts of dependence and independence is tightly associated with the rise of industrial capitalism – combined with increased individualism and the rise of a protestant work ethic – during which the meanings of independence and dependence gradually shifted. Whereas in preindustrial society dependence was considered a feature of relationships of subordination, industrial dependence was associated with not having paid work. Independence now came to mean being employed and earning a wage that could support oneself and one's dependent family members. Wage labour became tied to independence, and those excluded from wage labour were dependents (Fraser & Gordon, 1994). The dichotomy of dependence and independence is rooted in individual liberalism and based on a normative ideal of the male worker as a rational

actor characterised by self-sufficiency and self-reliance (Fraser & Gordon, 1994; Hockey & James, 1995; Maynard et al, 2008).

Gradually dependency has become attached to individuals and invested with moral and psychological judgements. Thus, the state of being dependent has become a source of stigma. The stigmatising sense of dependency became even stronger with the development of public assistance – and the development of the concept of welfare dependency. This concept is applied to adult people who – for different reasons do not have paid work – and who because of this receives some form of public support. It contains strong moral, psychological and stigmatising overtones – one of these being that adult people who receives welfare support will eventually become addicted to this support, and lose their will to work (Vogt, 2018, p. 60). A historical distinction between the deserving and undeserving destitute has also strengthened, whereby some groups of welfare receivers – such as the poor – are considered poor due to personal and moral failings (Fraser & Gordon, 1994). Moreover, the stigma attached to receiving public support has been so great that people in need have been hesitant to make use of it and have done so with great shame (Fraser & Gordon,1994).

As numerous scholars have noted (cf. Fraser & Gordon, 1994; Wimmer & Schiller, 2003; Vogt, 2018) migrants, ethnic and racial minorities are strongly implicated in the debates on welfare dependency. Wimmer & Schiller (2003) relate this to an understanding of the nation state as a community of solidarity. According to such an understanding, migrants – as they come from outside – were not meant to be part of the welfare systems that were developed in the U.S, and in many of the Western European nation states after WW2. Consequently, the integration of migrants into the welfare system has been considered particularly problematic. As we have seen in chapter 2 on contextual backgrounds, this has also been central to debates in Norway. A statement from central researchers on the topic of welfare and migration, Grete Brochmann and Anniken Hagelund (2010), is illustrative of this point:

> The in principle generous welfare model, which is aimed at embracing everyone, but which is undermined if overburdened, necessitates selection and

delimitation in relation to potential new members from outside." (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010, p.16, *My translation*) [30]

As we have seen in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, this line of reasoning has also been central to the implementation of a ban on immigration in Norway, in 1975.

So far, I have only discussed meanings invested in concepts of dependency in relation to welfare dependency. Regarding later life, another form of dependency, namely physical dependency, or dependency related to ill health (Hammarström & Torres, 2008) may be added. Physical dependency is often associated with having to rely on others for domestic, physical, or personal care and support. However, because of the dichotomous understanding of independence as the norm and dependence as deviancy, any kind of dependency has come to be associated with an unwanted state, at least in Western Europe and the U.S. By extension, Maynard et al. (2008) identifies a shift – from understanding environment as a cause of ill health – to regarding health as an individual responsibility. This is particularly evident in the recent emphasis on health promotion. Consequently, ill health is now more likely to be related to a personal lack of health maintenance and self-care. This illustrates how even dependency due to ill health in later life may be subjected to moral judgements about the lifestyles of individuals (Maynard et al., 2008).

As is illustrated in the preceding discussion, concepts of independence and dependence cannot be understood as value neutral terms. The meanings embedded in the concepts are based on individualistic and liberalistic understandings of human beings, which neglects how people are always embedded in support systems – whether it be in relation to kin, friends or other types of networks – or be it in relation to welfare states (Vogt,2018).

In contexts of migration, the concepts may also contain different meanings than the ones found in the western European and American context (Wray, 2003). Based on

---

[30] «Den prinsipielt generøse velferdsmodellen, som skal favne alle, men som undermineres ved for sterk belastning, nødvendiggjør seleksjon og avgrensning i forhold til potensielt nye medlemmer utenfra» (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2010, p.16)

interview data with older women from different ethnic backgrounds, Wray (2003; 2004) describes how many of them gained a sense of independence and empowerment power through interdependency and reciprocal negotiations of responsibilities and roles within the family. Moreover, Torres (2002) has studied perceptions of successful ageing among older Iranian immigrants in Sweden. Based on the theoretical framework of cultural variation proposed by Kluckhohn (cited in Torres, 2002), she proposes that different cultural contexts have different value orientations. One of these is the relational value orientation. Within a relational value orientation, three alternative value orientations are identified: the collateral, lineal and individualistic alternative (Kluckhohn cited in Torres, 2002). Both the collateral and lineal alternative places its primary emphasis on collective goals. By contrast, the individualistic alternative places its main emphasis on individual goals. Applied to perceptions of what constitutes a good old age – or successful ageing as Torres (2002) examines – the collateral and lineal orientations would imply that dependence and not independence would be the mark of a good old age. One of the central findings of Torres' (2002) article is in that the older Iranian migrants associated successful ageing with the quality of relationships with family members – adult children in particular – and being able to depend upon their family in later life. Moen (2002) reports a similar finding in her study of older migrants from Pakistan and Denmark in Norway. The Pakistani migrants in her study emphasised interdependence and reciprocity in family life as key to their understandings of a good old age.

This serves to illustrate how understandings of dependence and independence in one cultural context, are not necessarily applicable in different cultural contexts. In this study, the meanings associated with independence and dependence should rather be regarded as one set of cultural repertoires which shapes the experiences, practices, and meanings of migrants in later life. In a transnational perspective where migrants are viewed as exposed to different values and norms from (at least) two different cultural contexts, the aim of the thesis is to look at how they draw on both – and in different ways – while ageing in place.

3. A transnational perspective on ageing in contexts of migration

3.1 Initial formulations – a critique of methodological nationalism

The transnational perspective was initially developed by Linda Basch, Nina Glick-Schiller, and Christina Szanton-Blanc, as editors of a collection of articles published in 1992, and in their seminal work, *Nations Unbound,* published in 1994. These works constitute part of an emerging critique of methodological nationalism in the social sciences, focusing particularly on the way in which it has shaped migration studies in the U.S.

Basch et al (1994) were critical of the so-called container theory of society (Wimmer & Schiller, 2003) which dominated the conceptual apparatus of the social sciences at the time. The container theory stems from the naturalisation of nationally bounded societies whereby nationally bounded societies – comprising a culture, an economy, a political unit and a bounded social group – were taken for granted as natural units of analysis, and anything extending across national borders was cut off analytically (Wimmer & Schiller, 2003, p. 579). Moreover, the social sciences of the time tended to treat socially constructed boundaries involving nations, ethnic groups or "races" as primordial, and fixed in time, and the cultures they "contained" were perceived as having a determinative impact on the behaviour of the people "within" it (Basch et al, 1994)

According to Basch et al (1994), the container theory of society was implicit in the dominant perspective on migration and migrant incorporation in the social sciences after WW2 – namely the assimilationist paradigm. This paradigm tended to conceptualise migrants' ties to their countries of origin as something that was temporary and transient. The belief was that once migrants had adapted to the new society; these ties would seize to exist. Consequently, continued ties to migrants' countries of origin and the implications of these continued ties for migrants' practices, experiences and identities were left unexplored (Basch et al, 1994). Basch et al (1994) argue that this did not fully elucidate the experiences of migrants, who "develop networks, activities, patterns of living, and ideologies that span their home and the host society" (Basch et al, 1994, p.4).

What does this mean for the way in which we conceptualise nation states? First, recognizing the socially constructed nature of nation states – or other concepts such as ethnic groups or communities – does not mean that they should be regarded insignificant once they are constructed. In the words of Basch et al (1994, p.33):

> Boundaries, whether legally created borders, as in the case of nation states (Sahlins,1989), or socially forged created boundaries, as in instances of group ethnicities, once conceptualized, are given meaning and sentiment by those who reside within them. They acquire a life of their own. Conceived as culturally distinct, these social constructions persist and therefore shape and influence people's behavior and daily practices.

Thus, the critique of methodological nationalism does not necessarily entail a denial of the significance of nation states or ethnic groups. Although socially constructed, they have meaning in relation to shared lifeways, experiences, and identities (Basch et al,1994). Moreover, both regulations surrounding entry to the nation, and differences in national social policies in relation to health and social care, shows the continued significance of nation states (Anthias, 2012). However, to avoid some of the pitfalls of methodological nationalism, one should start with recognising the socially constructed nature of boundaries, and how these boundaries may shift over time. According to Basch et al (1994) one has to locate the boundaries that have been constructed within the global context of power relations, and acknowledge the historical and processual nature of group formation.[31] Furthermore, one should recognise that within the constructed boundaries of nations, ethnic groups or "races", there is significant heterogeneity, for example according to gender, class or generation (Anthias, 2012). Thus, adopting an intersectional lens is of major importance. This perspective shall be returned to.

Since its initial development, the transnational perspective has advanced into a dominant paradigm for the study of migration. It does not constitute a coherent

---

[31] The processes surrounding the group formation of Pakistani and Polish migrants in Norway, and how these are linked to larger historical developments both in Norway, and globally, is discussed in the chapter on contextual backgrounds.

framework, but rather has developed in different directions, exploring different units and scales of analysis (Kivisto, 200; Portes, Guarnizo & Landolt, 1999). Different concepts – such as transnational social fields (Levitt & Schiller, 2004), transnational social spaces (Faist, 2000), transnational formations (Guarnizo, 1997) – have been developed in order to disentangle the concept of society, from the concept of the nation state (Levitt & Jaworsky, 2007).

Studies on transnationalism focus on variegated phenomena such as: transnational communities; capital flows and corporations; social movements; social networks; families; identities; public spaces and public cultures (cf. Boccagni, 2012; Levitt & Jaworsky, 2007; Vertovec, 1999,p. 2). What constitutes the essence of transnationalism, what is inherently novel about it, and how it is linked to other historical developments – such as technological developments and the advance of global capitalism – have been extensively debated. An exhaustive overview of competing definitions, existing debates and topics addressed in transnational studies, is beyond the scope and purpose of this chapter. Instead I argue – following the arguments of Levitt & Schiller (2004) – that the overall purpose of adopting a transnational lens in this study is that it enables an analysis of migrants' everyday lives that are not limited to what goes on within single nation state boundaries. As Levitt and Schiller argues migrants are often embedded within multi-layered, multi-sited transnational social fields[32], which has consequences for the way in which they practice and experience daily life. In this thesis, I will employ the broad definition of transnational ageing proposed by Horn & Schweppe (2017). They define transnational ageing as "the process of organizing, shaping, and coping with life in

---

[32] Inspired by the Manchester School of anthropology and Bourdieu's concept of social field Levitt & Schiller (2004) use the concept of transnational social fields. Their analysis thus becomes centered on the unequal power relations embedded within transnational social fields. Although acknowledging how ageing migrants are involved in unequal power relation, the focus of my study is not on unequal power relations per se, but rather how embeddedness in social contexts which stretches across national borders, shapes the experiences of aging in Norway. Thus, to avoid confusion, I shall refrain from using the concept of fields.

old age in contexts which are no longer limited to the frame of a single nation state." (Horn & Schweppe, 2017, p. 336)

This broad definition enables an analysis of various dimensions of ageing in transnational contexts, and at different levels of analysis. A study of transnational ageing at the micro level looks at everyday life experiences, individual and family histories and biographical projects and identities. At the meso level we find the dimensions of social security, social institutions, and services available for older people. The macro level locates transnational ageing directly within the process of welfare state development, global politics, and ideologies of ageing (Horn, Scwheppe & Um, 2013).

In sum, using this broad definition enables an exploration of the distinctive expressions of transnationalism as they emerge from the empirical material. Thus, the transnational perspective has raised awareness to the processes, practices and experiences of ageing migrants in this study that cannot be confined to a single nation state, but rather has to be understood as shaped by their ageing in a context comprising (at least) two nation states.

More specifically, using the transnational perspective as sensitising in this study means looking at tangible dimensions and expressions of transnationalism including – but not limited to – travels back and forth between the country of origin and the destination country of migration, sending money, and maintaining transnational social ties through using digital technology – such as telephone calls, email or Skype.

Moreover, using the transnational perspective as sensitising also means paying attention to what Lamb (2002) refers to as the less tangible expressions of transnationalism such as how everyday practices and experiences may be shaped by ageing migrants having experiences from their country of origin, and in the country where they now live – which are both important in shaping their overall experiences of ageing in place. Following Vertovec (1999, p. 450-451) these last two dimensions may be labelled "transnationalism as a type or mode of consciousness" and "transnationalism as a mode of cultural reproduction". In the process of analysing the

empirical material these two dimensions emerged as important and are therefore in need of further clarification.

3.2 Transnationalism as a mode of consciousness and cultural reproduction

Transnationalism as a mode of consciousness and cultural reproduction is inspired by Vertovec's (1999) concept of migrants being *in-between* – a concept which was later expanded upon and applied to the topic of transnational ageing by Torres (2013). A transnational mode of consciousness is characterised by holding attachments to two or more places at once – an awareness of being both here and there at the same time. It is inspired by the notion that people – and migrants in particular – have several identities that link them to more than one nation state at a time, and that these connections shapes their subjectivities (Vertovec, 1999,p.5), and their experiences of ageing in place (Lamb, 2002; Torres, 2013). Moreover, the transnational mode of consciousness may contain characteristics that are like Simmel's (1908) characteristic of "the stranger". Simmel (1908) was concerned with the inherent duality of social life, both inherent in interactions between individuals, and in the relation between individuals and larger groups. As such, the concept of the stranger highlights social relationships that are characterised by the duality of nearness and remoteness (Simmel, 1908). The stranger is defined as "the man who comes today and stays tomorrow" (Simmel, 1908, p.242). Thus, the stranger is perceived of as being within a group – or a fixed spatial circle – but not as initially belonging to this group, because he/ she originates from somewhere else. This means that the stranger is both inside the group, as well as outside and confronting it. According to Simmel (1908), this inherent duality of the stranger entails that he or she brings specific qualities to the group in question. One of these qualities is objectivity. Not initially belonging to the group the stranger is able to regard the group with a bird's eye view. By combining the concept of the stranger with the concept of transnationalism as a mode of consciousness, I argue that the combination of nearness and remoteness – of being both here and there – does not necessarily manifest itself in a bird's eye view, but rather in a double view. In such a double view, aspects of Norwegian society and the older migrant's respective countries of origin are continually assessed in relation to one another.

The inspiration drawn from the concept the stranger and transnationalism as a mode of consciousness gave rise to the construction of the concept *migratory insideness*, which I have developed and analysed in chapter 6. In the process of dealing with the apparent tension in my material, whereby the participants seemed to have developed a deep seated and intimate attachment to Norway – which in large part revolved around their familiarity with the welfare state – I came across the concept of insideness as described by Rowles (1983). He distinguishes between three forms of insideness, which he argues are overlapping and complementary aspects of people's attachment to place: physical insideness, characterized by an intimate familiarity with how the environment is physically configured; social insideness, which refers to the peoples localised social embeddedness and integration within a social support network; and autobiographical insideness stemming from life-long residence in a community. Autobiographical insideness refers to a taken for granted and rarely overtly communicated psychological attachment to place in a way where places serve as an essential of component of one's sense of self (Rowles, 1983). As is evident, the concept of insideness was developed in relation to people who have lived in their local environments their entire lives, and is therefore not immediately applicable to migrants, who have migrated to a new context in adulthood, and hold attachments "both here and there". However, rather than dismissing the concept of insideness offhand I have developed a new concept – namely migratory insideness – which is aimed at illuminating the duality of here and there characteristic of the transnational migrant experience. How this migratory insideness manifests itself in the way in which migrants perceive the Norwegian welfare state will be explored in chapter 6.

My understanding of transnationalism as a mode of cultural reproduction in this study is informed by Faist (2000) and his concept of *transnational syncretism*. This concept was developed as a critique of former conceptualizations of culture in relation to migration, more specifically assimilation theory and theories of cultural pluralism. He argues that both theories operate with a bounded conception of culture, where culture is regarded as a fixed essence which is neatly tied to territorial boundaries. Accordingly, he proposes a new concept – transnational syncretism – aimed at highlighting how new cultural practices and forms of meaning may develop. These

new practices and forms of meaning constitute a synthesis of those from the country of origin, as well as those from the destination and settlement country of migration.

Faist's (2000) definition of transnational syncretism is inspired by Swidler's (1986) tool kit approach to culture. In this understanding culture consists of "symbolic vehicles of meaning, including beliefs, ritual practices, art forms as well as informal cultural practices such as language, gossip stories, and rituals of daily life" (Swidler, 1986, p.273). Through these symbolic vehicles of meaning shared modes of behaviour within a community take place.

Swidler (1986) argues that these symbolic vehicles of meanings, rituals and habits should not be conceived as fixed essences determining people's actions, but rather as tools or repertoires which people draw upon in constructing strategies of action.[33] In this perspective cultural repertoires consist of publicly available meanings, which facilitate certain patterns of actions, while discouraging others. Thus, culture constitutes more or less taken for granted habits, norms, rituals and traditions, which people draw upon in in their daily life.

Cultural repertoires should not be conceived of as unified or internally consistent, but rather they should be understood as tool kits or repertoires in which people select different pieces for constructing different lines of action (Swidler,1986). In any given circumstance people may have cultural capacities which they rarely employ. People know more culture than they draw upon. In this perspective, culture shapes action because – although people may know several diverse cultural repertoires – these repertoires are still limited. Ritual traditions and norms act to define what constitutes common sense in a way that makes alternative ways of organizing action unimaginable or implausible (Swidler, 1986, p. 284).

Swidler (1986, p.278) distinguishes between the way in which culture shapes actions in what she calls "settled" and "unsettled lives". In unsettled lives – that is in periods

---

[33] Swidler (1986,p.277) uses the concept of strategies of action, not in the sense of a plan that is consciously conceived in order to obtain a specific goal, but rather as a general way of organizing action, which might enable us to reach several different life goals.

of social transformation such as large scale historical transformations or migration – cultural repertoires may become more visible and less taken for granted, as they come into direct contact and sometimes conflict with new ones. Thus, in unsettled lives – such as in contexts of migration – people may be confronted with new and unfamiliar cultural repertoires. This may sometimes imply new ways of organising action, which may have to be practiced until they become familiar. Swidler (1986, p.284) defines this process as a process of "cultural retoolin"g. Adopting the notion of culture as toolkits or repertoires which people draw upon in their daily practices and processes of meaning making, highlights the dynamic nature of culture which enables regarding cultural meanings and practices as products of transnational or translocal learning processes. In this understanding, practices and meanings can involve multiple cultural repertoires which transcend national contexts (Faist, 1999).

4.The intersectionality perspective

It can be argued that the life course perspective is an intersectional perspective as people's lives are shaped by gender, class, and ethnicity as well as by other forms of social differentiation such as sexuality and disability. However, there is still a need to discuss some basic principles of the perspective, and how I apply it in my study.

The intersectionality perspective was initially developed by black feminist scholars, as a critique both towards the women's movement and the civil rights movement in the U.S. Both had neglected to include the experiences of Black women. The women's movement had ignored the impact of racism, and how experiences with racism shaped the lives of minority women. The civil rights movement focused exclusively on the experiences of men, thereby neglecting the experiences of sexism and gender-based discrimination which women face (Orupabo, 2014). A main concern of the intersectionality perspective is to look at how people are embedded in different power structures simultaneously, and how these power structures combine to produce different living conditions, opportunity structures and experiences (Orupabo, 2014). Thus, in employing an intersectionality perspective, the main preoccupation is with examining how different dimensions of inequality – based for

instance on gender, ethnicity, and class – interact and shape the lives of individuals. This does not simply mean in terms of accumulation of (dis-) advantage across the life course – as is implied in the double or triple jeopardy perspective – but rather how these inequality dimensions operate in tandem, whereby each category influences and interacts with other forms of differentiation (Ajrouch & Abdulrahim, 2013). For instance, what it means to be a man, or a woman will vary according to ethnic background and class, and vice versa, what it means to be Pakistani or Polish will vary according to gender and class position. The image gets more complicated if we add age. The meaning of being old – and the roles one may take on – will vary depending on gender, ethnic and class background (Ajrouch & Abdulrahim, 2013). The image becomes even more complex when employing a transnational perspective, because of potentially competing status positions, and norms in country of origin and settlement country (Anthias, 2012)

Since its initial development, the intersectionality perspective has evolved in different directions, and has become extensively debated. Some of the debated topics revolve around the numbers of inequality dimensions that should be included in intersectional analysis, and questions about how dimensions of inequality are constructed, manifest themselves, and are reproduced in social life (Orupabo,2014). According to Orupabo (2014) these debates have mainly been based on a theoretical or socio-philosophical logic of reasoning, thereby failing to engage in dialogue with empirical data.

My approach to intersectionality in this study draws inspiration from the account of Breckner and Massari (2019), who combine an intersectionality perspective with biographical approaches of empirical investigation. They argue that:

> From a biographical perspective gender, age, class, race or ethnicity are not mere categories to be related in an abstract theoretical model, but rather as causing intertwined experiences and situations in which one experience may become more relevant than another or even recede into the background depending on the particular biographical context, period of time and social space. (Breckner & Massari, 2019, p.11).

This definition of intersectionality encompasses an understanding of how individual biographies in themselves are shaped by intersecting dimensions of inequality such as

class, ethnicity, and gender. However, how these intersecting dimensions shape experience is dependent on, and must be understood in relation to the contexts in which the dimensions of inequality are played out. This broad formulation also enables an exploration of how inequality dimensions act at different levels: at an institutional and organizational level involving state government, laws, regulations and policies in relation to immigration, the labour market, welfare and care; at a relational level focusing on relational power relations, for instance within the family or the community; and lastly, at a representational level – in relation to discourses and debates surrounding migration, gender and class (Yuval Davies cited in Christensen & Siim, 2006). Moreover, I draw upon Anthias (2012) argument that in an intersectional analysis of migration, the ascriptions and attributes given to specific migrants based on their country of origin should also be included.

Social life is inherently complex, meaning that the number of categories in intersectional analysis are potentially infinite (Jensen & Christensen, 2012).This means that researchers should ideally take into account a number of different forms of differentiation, including gender, ethnicity and class, but also age, sexuality religion, functional ability and generation and so on (Orupabo, 2014). However, to make a specific empirical analysis manageable, it is necessary to select a limited number of categories to serve as so called "anchor points" (Christensen & Jensen, 2012, p. 112). According to Christensen & Jensen (2012) these anchor points should be chosen in a strategic manner by focusing on categories that are deemed most appropriate for the research question at hand. Thus, although recognising that other forms of social differentiation and division might also be important in this study ethnicity – understood in terms of national background – and gender serve as anchor points. However, I have strived to gain variation along other dimensions of inequality, such as class – defined in terms of education and former occupation – and health situation. This is based on the argument proposed by Anthias (2001) that the differentiations based on gender, ethnicity and class are particularly salient constructions of difference and identity, and because these forms of differentiation are recognised as particularly important in shaping experiences of later life (cf. Moen, 2011). Using ethnicity and gender as anchor points has informed my selection of

participants for this study, a topic which will be returned to in chapter 4 on methods and methodology.

The intersectional lens in this study aims to examine both what McCall (2005) refers to as intracategorical as well as intercategorical complexity or – to be more specific – within and across group variation. Both intracategorical and the intercategorical approaches recognise that categories – although socially constructed – are reflections of relatively stable and durable social relationships (McCall, 2005). Drawing on both approaches means that I examine how experiences of ageing in Norway may vary in terms of gender and class between the two groups of older migrants, as well as within them. Combined with the life course perspective, the intersectionality lens in this study relates the intersections of different dimensions of inequality to context, both the Norwegian context, as well as the migrants' respective countries of origin.

Although using ethnicity and gender as anchor points for the analysis, the intersectionality perspective is used in a sensitising way. This has implications for my intersectional approach in three different ways. Firstly, it means that although using ethnicity and gender as anchor points, I have also remained open to other forms of differentiation – such as the ones based on health situation and generational location. Secondly, I regard the way in which the categories intersect and shape the experiences of the participants as contextually dependent, understood in relation to the Norwegian national context, in relation to transnational contexts, and in relation to each participant's individual life course experience. Thirdly, it means that I regard the way that different inequality dimensions intersect in shaping experiences of later life to be an empirical question rather than a theoretical one.

5. Combining the life course approach with perspectives on transnationalism and intersectionality

Combining a life course approach with a transnational and intersectional lens means looking at life courses as shaped by structures, institutions and norms surrounding gender, class, age and ethnicity from two different national contexts, which in contexts of transnational migration are drawn together into a singular transnational

social space. Within this space, migrants reflectively maintain, negotiate with, reproduce, or transform structures in their daily practices, and interactions within changing historical circumstances (Wingens et al., 2011)

More specifically, combining the life course perspective with a transnational perspective on ageing in contexts of migration, involves a recognition that migrants have spent parts of their lives in a different national context and bring these experiences with them when they move. Moreover, international migrants often move between the two different contexts, and are thus simultaneously exposed to the structural and cultural characteristics of both (De Valk et al., 2011). Thus, in a transnational life course perspective the emphasis on how structural and institutional contexts shapes personal biographies means also paying attention to migrants' contexts of origin, as well as the receiving context. Thus, in studying the life course of transnational migrants the context characteristics of countries of origin and settlement are important in understanding their experiences and practices in later life (De Valk et al., 2011, p. 287).

The principle of timing of lives in a transnational and intersectional perspective means analyzing how the timing of life course transitions – such as the timing of entry into education, the labour market, or marriage – vary according to ethnicity, gender and class. It also entails paying attention to the how the life stage at the time of migration influences people's incorporation in the settlement context of their migration (Wingens et al., 2011). Timing of migration – and the duration of residence in the destination country of migration – are important aspects shaping the migration experience. Learning a new language, getting used to new customs and norms and building new social relationships are processes that take time, and the time of residence captures the length that people are exposed to this new context (Schunck, 2011). In scholarship on ageing and migration it is well established that whether migration takes place in childhood, adulthood, or late in life has important implications for adapting to a new context, and for the way in which later life is experienced and practiced. For instance, Markides & Gerst (2011) find that people who have migrated late in life run a higher risk of becoming socially isolated in the

new context due to language barriers, and that this may also become a source of intergenerational tensions. All the migrants in this study have migrated to Norway in adulthood and are ageing in place in Norway. Thus, their perspectives and experiences are shaped by having spent childhood and young adulthood in Poland or Pakistan, and by having lived in Norway for a significant period of time.

In a transnational perspective the principle of linked lives means not only looking at the social relationships that are physically co-present, but to also be aware of people's social relationships to people that stretch across borders, and the obligations and support structures ingrained in these transnational social relationships (De Valk et al., 2011; Phillipson, 2015). Furthermore, in examining the embeddedness in of older migrants in support structures, their relations to a place based migrant community may be of importance in shaping their experiences of ageing in place (Wingens et al. 2011). Depending upon the institutionalised make up of these communities – as well as the nature of the relationships within the communities – they may provide different kinds of mutual social support (Grewal et al. 2004; Maynard et al. 2008). They may also constitute a place for negotiating identities and roles, which is the topic of chapter 7. At the same time, they may exhibit varying degrees of enforced conformity with norms, traditions, and values which members of the community are expected to uphold (Kivisto, 2003, 14). In an intersectional lens attention is also paid to unequal power relations and distributions both in relationships that are physically proximate and the ones that stretch across borders. In relation to care this means being attentive towards who is assigned responsibility of providing what kinds of care and support.

A combination of the transnational and intersectional perspective highlights how migrants who are simultaneously embedded in two different national contexts are often confronted with different and – sometimes competing – sets of cultural norms and expectations. This is particularly the case when it comes to norms relating to gender (Anthias, 2012). An important aim of the study is thus to explore how ageing migrants negotiate these norms in specific contexts.

 Moreover, the intersectional analyses in this study also looks to what Anthias (2012, p. 102) refers to as "contradictory locations", how people may occupy subordinate positions in certain times and places, and dominant positions in others.Thus, in the study I pay attention to contradictory locations in terms of the intersecting dimensions of ethnicity and class, but also in terms of other forms of social differentiation such as age and generation. Arguably, the concept of *contradictory locations* (Anthias, 2012, p.102) is particularly important for understanding class. As Parreñas (2001, p. 3)) has pointed out, "contradictory class mobility" may occur in the process of migration as migrants might experience an increase in social status in their country of origin due to migration, but at the same time they may experience a decline in status in the destination country of migration, because of the status of the jobs they have to take. Moreover, many migrants, despite being highly educated, might have to take low-skilled and low paying jobs in the destination country of their migration.

In sum, combining the three perspectives as sensitising heuristics in this study has served to raise my awareness of different dimensions of migrants' lives when ageing in place in Norway.

Chapter 4. Methods, methodology and empirical material

1. Introduction

This chapter provides a detailed overview of the study's research methods, methodological and ethical considerations, and the empirical material which I base my analysis on.

In comparison with quantitative methods, qualitative research projects are rarely characterised by a linear logic whereby the research is carried out in different separate stages. Rather, the research project is in a continuous process of being crafted through its implementation (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2011). This is the case with the present study. In order to provide transparency into the research, this chapter shall provide detailed information on each stage of the research process, beginning with the initial study design and how the study has changed along the way in response to different challenges. This transparency is important to enable the reader to assess the quality of the craft (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2011).

The chapter is divided into 6 sections. In the first section I discuss the study's overall design – placing the study as a comparative biographical case study. In this section I also discuss the rationale for the choice of methods, and sampling criteria. The second section describes the process of empirical data collection, including the recruitment process and how I conducted the interviews and participant observation. In the third section I provide an overview of the study participants and compare my sample of participants with characteristics of the ageing Polish and Pakistani migrant population in Norway. Moving on, the fourth section discusses the analytical approach, and the role of theory in the study. The fifth section discusses the quality of the study in terms of validity, reliability, and generalisability, before finally discussing some ethical challenges in the sixth section of the chapter.

2. Study design

2.1 Aims and rationale of the study – A comparative biographical case study

The present study may be described as a comparative biographical case study. A case study is defined as an in-depth investigation of a limited number of empirical units (Hammersley & Gomm, 2000). The background of the study was a desire to explore the experience of ageing in Norway among migrants who came to Norway in mid adulthood, and who are now ageing in place in Norway. I was particularly interested in how they go about getting the help that they need in everyday life – their experiences of – and relationship to the Norwegian welfare state, especially to public providers of social care services for older people.

As already described in the chapter on theoretical frameworks, the study is informed by a life course, a transnational and an intersectionality perspective. A central assumption in the study is that spending important parts of one's lives in a different national, institutional, cultural, and structural context than the country of settlement influences migrants' preferences, choices, and perceptions about care in old age. Hence, I wanted to explore how cultural practices developed in the migrant's country of origin and Norwegian cultural practices intersect in the everyday lives of older migrants, and how this intersection shapes their care preferences and practices.

Thus, the study may be conceived of broadly as a case study of experiences of ageing in place in Norway among postwar labour migrants and refugees. Furthermore, the study adopts a comparative approach. Ragin & Amoroso (2011) describe comparative research as examining similarities and differences across a moderate number of cases. In qualitative comparative research the number of cases must be limited to establish an intimate familiarity with each case included in the study (Ragin & Amoroso, 2011, p. 135). In comparative research cases are selected based on pre-established analytic frames, entailing a certain combination of characteristics, which are considered relevant for the topic of study. These analytic frames are usually based on theoretical ideas or former research and the purpose is to examine similarities and differences in combinations of characteristics across cases to identify patterns (Ragin & Amoroso, 2011). However, in line with the flexibility of qualitative research, the analytic frames, i.e. what constitutes the relevant characteristics and dimensions of the cases,

and how these characteristics are relevant, are continuously assessed and revised in dialogue with the field and empirical data (Ragin & Amoroso, 2011)

The overall aim of the comparative approach in this study was to compare the experiences of ageing in Norway among migrants from two different countries of origin – one within Europe and one from outside Europe. The aim of this comparison is to explore how differences in cultural and social background histories, differences in access criteria, as well as different experiences with prejudices, discrimination or racism in Norway might influence migrant's experiences of ageing in Norway. Thus, the choice was made to focus on Polish and Pakistani older migrants. The rationale for selecting to compare Pakistani and Polish migrants are multifold. As the initial aim was to focus particularly on the care needs of older migrants, and how they go about getting the care they need, I wanted to study the experience of migrants who come from a national context with a different welfare system and mode of care provision than the Norwegian. In Pakistan and Poland, family care constitutes the dominant mode of care provision, although as described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, there are variations in the way in which care is organized the two countries.

Moreover, both migrant groups may also be regarded as representative of two historically specific migratory flows – one from a former European, i.e. British colony, and one from a former socialist country under the Soviet sphere of influence. Thus, Pakistani, and Polish migrants are representative of the historical trends of south-north and east-west migration, respectively. These characteristics are important for understanding the institutional context in which the migrants have grown up in, for example the educational and welfare systems. Moreover, the migrants being representative of two historically specific migratory flows – also speaks to their position in a global hierarchy of power, which also shapes their position and statuses as migrants in Norway.

Many scholars have been critical of sampling based on migrants' national or ethnic origin, claiming that such a sampling strategy is an expression of methodological nationalism (cf. Amelina & Faist, 2012; Bloemraad, 2013; Martiniello, 2013;

Wimmer & Schiller, 2003). By selecting an ethnic or national group of migrants as the unit of analysis, researchers implicitly or explicitly take the nation state for granted as something which is natural and bounded (Wimmer & Schiller, 2003). Maritiniello (2013) also argues that it implies that national and ethnic groups are characterised by a distinctive bounded culture and identity – and that this is the defining characteristic for understanding other social processes, such as their integration process. Although partly concurring with this critique, I still argue that sampling based on migrant's country of origin, does not necessarily entail the assumption that findings can always be explained by reference to a distinctive nationally bounded culture and identity. As already described earlier in this chapter, what constitutes the relevant characteristics and dimensions of the cases are continuously assessed and revised in the analysis of empirical data (Ragin & Amoroso,2011). Consequently, there is a difference between sampling strategy and what dimensions emerge in the process of empirical analysis.

Moreover, the Norwegian National population register uses country of birth as a basis for registration of migrants in Norway. This forms the basis for the grouping of migrants by Statistics Norway, which is the central bureau to produce population statistics in Norway (Dzamarija, 2008). Thus, selecting migrants according to national background also ensures comparability of the sample with the data that exists about the population of Polish and Pakistani migrants in Norway.

In the study, national background serves as what Kohn (1987, p.714) refers to as "contexts of study". This concept was initially developed by Kohn (1987) in relation to comparative studies involving nation states where the primary aim is to examine how certain aspects of national institutions "impinge on personality" (Kohn, 1987, p. 714). Brannen & Nilsen (2011) develop this concept further and relate it to a life course approach. In their understanding the concept of context of study refers to the examination of the way in which people are embedded within certain social structures that shape their lives (Brannen & Nilsen, 2011). In this study, the assumption is that the migrants, although their primary place of residence is Norway, have been socialised in a different national institutional and structural context and that their

experience of ageing – including their relationship with their family, the welfare state and feelings of belonging and identifications are shaped by the interplay of these contexts in their lives. Moreover, the migrants in this study continue to nurture ties to their respective countries of origin, which means that the two national contexts are drawn together in a singular transnational social space.

The study may also be defined as an embedded case study (Yin, 2003), whereby the lives of ageing migrants are analysed in relation to different layers of context – the aim of which is to produce "thick descriptions". The concept of thick descriptions in sociological analyses is associated with the works of Clifford Geertz (1973). Geertz includes several definitions of thick descriptions (Hammersley, 2008). In this study the concept is applied to the process of locating the experiences of ageing in relation to multiple layers of context – from the micro context of individual life courses, the meso context of family relationships, former occupations and social relationships, and the macro level of national institutional structures. Within this approach national context of origin represents but one of many layers of context in which the lives and experiences of ageing migrants are analysed in relation to.

Drawing on the arguments of Breckner (2007), I would also argue that a biographical approach may serve to counteract some of the problems associated with sampling based on migrants' nation of origin. As has already been discussed in the chapter on theoretical frameworks, the life course approach locates both processes of migration and ageing in the context of each person's individual life course. By doing so these processes are linked to past experiences and decisions taking place within certain institutional, structural, and cultural confines. Consequently, this approach counteracts impressions of Pakistani and Polish migrants as constituting monolithic groups, who share a singular, uniform experience. It does so by exploring not only between group variations, but also within group variations according to specific structural features such as gender, class, health situation, as well as individual life course experience. To gain insights into how these different dimensions may have shaped the experiences of ageing in Norway, these variations were also built into the initial sampling criteria of the study. Thus, in addition to selecting migrants from

Pakistan and Poland, I also developed several other sampling criteria to attend to these variations. I shall return to these selection criteria in section 2.4. But first, I shall describe the rationale behind the choice of biographical interviews and participant observation in this study.

2.2 Research methods – biographical interviews and participant observation

A central assumption in the study is that spending important parts of one's lives in a different national institutional, cultural, and structural context than the country of settlement influences migrants' preferences, choices and perceptions about care in old age. Hence, I wanted to explore how the cultural practices developed in the migrant's country of origin and Norwegian cultural practices intersect in the everyday lives of older migrants and, in particular, how this intersection shapes their care preferences and practices. The combination of biographical interviews and participant observation is well suited to explore these questions. These methods provide insights into people's everyday lives from a bottom-up perspective, their subjective understandings of their everyday lives and the processes in which everyday lives and practices in old age stems from – their lived lives. Biographical interviews enable an exploration of the participant's own reflections about their life choices and experiences, and the consequences of these in later life. As Breckner (2007, p.113) argues biographical approaches provide insights into how people interpret and understand their past, present and future in constantly changing contexts. These processes of making sense, she argues, are particularly pronounced in periods of social transformation. This includes contexts of migration, whereby institutionalised ways of acting become questioned and new ones are built. In conducting biographical interviews, the researcher takes part in the participant's process of making sense of their lives, including their understandings of how the process of migration has influenced their ways of thinking and behaving. Consequently, this approach is well suited to explore the circumstances under which migrants maintain, negotiate, and/or transform cultural expectations and practices in a transnational context (Breckner, 2007; Levitt & Schiller, 2004).

Moreover, Levitt & Schiller argues that (2004), in particular, the combination of participant observation and interviews provides insights into " how persons simultaneously maintain and shed cultural repertoires and identities, interact within a location and across its boundaries, and act in ways that are in concert with or contradict their values over time" (Levitt & Schiller,2004, p.1013).

I now turn to discuss some central features of biographical interviews and how this method is used in this study.

2.2.1 Biographical interviews

Biographical interviews can be described as asking research participants to reflect on their past, present and their expectations for the future (Nilsen, 2008). A central aim of this method is to explore how individuals' lives are shaped by institutional, structural, and cultural contexts. In this study biographical interviews give insights into older migrants' present understanding of their life situation and their practices in the context of their life course, including their experiences before migration, the migration process, their encounters with Norwegian society and their family situation. It thereby provides insights into the background for the transnational practices they have today from the point of view of the participants at the time of the interviews.

Nilsen (2008) distinguishes between what she refers to as the contextual approach to biographical material on one hand, and the interpretive approach on the other hand. The differences between them relates to their views on the epistemological and ontological status of biographies. Inspired by the linguistic turn of the 1970s, proponents of the latter perspective regards reality as constituted through language, and sees biographical material as providing insights into cultural norms through narratives – the ways in which lives are told. By contrast, the contextual approach to biographical material regards social reality as created by human beings through collective activity, but when created takes on a form which exists independently of individuals. Because this perspective highlights the creation of reality through collective activities, reality is also regarded as changing according to time and place, and the main concern of when applying the perspective is the way in which lives are

shaped by different historical socioeconomic, structural and cultural contexts (Nilsen, 2008; Nilsen & Brannen, 2010).[34]

In this study I adopt a contextual approach to biographical material, and I shall therefore describe the central premises of this approach in more detail. This approach regards empirical material collected through biographical interviews as "interpretations set within a context of factual events" (Nilsen & Brannen, 2010, p. 685). Thus, in the contextual approach interviewees are regarded as informants about the various contexts that have shaped their lives (Bertaux & Thompson, 1997, p. 13).This approach aims at getting both factual and interpretive information by asking interviewees about events in their life, and their interpretations of and feelings about these events. Biographical interviews take centre stage, but other types of data and sources of information are used to provide contextual information necessary for the analysis (Nilsen & Brannen, 2010, p. 684). In the present study other sources are used to gain insights into institutional structures and cultural characteristics of Pakistan and Poland, focusing particularly on the time where the participants in this study lived there. Additional sources have also been used for describing the Norwegian immigration, integration, and welfare policies. These sources of information have provided the basis for chapter 2, on contextual backgrounds.

In addition, I chose to combine biographical interviews with participant observation to attain a deeper understanding of how they organised their lives in practice. Initially, I wanted to explore how the older migrants interacted with both professional care service providers and family members. Thus, I decided I wanted to conduct participant observation to observe these encounters and interactions. I now turn to discuss central principles in participant observation, and how I planned to conduct participant observation in my study.

2.2.2 Participant observation
Participant observation can be defined as:

---

[34] A complete review of the debate, and the arguments advocating both perspectives, is beyond the scope and purpose of this chapter.

a method in which a researcher takes part in the daily activities, rituals, interactions, and events of a group of people as one of the means of learning the explicit and tacit aspects of their life routines and their culture" (DeWalt and DeWalt 2002, p. 1)

In sociology participant observation is associated with the Chicago School of Sociology and their concern with the study of everyday face-to-face interactions in specific locations with the aim of studying the social worlds of individuals and groups (Deegan, 2001). The method is especially well suited to study how social practices are produced, maintained, negotiated, or transformed through social interactions in specific social settings (Buscatto, 2018; Deegan, 2001). One particularly important reason for choosing to conduct participant observation in this study is that it carries the potential to provide insights into what Polanyi (1966) refers to as "the tacit dimension", and which can be summarized as "those 'natural', hidden, taboos or difficult to express practices which people have trouble describing (or would not like to describe even if they were aware of them)" (Buscatto, 2018, p.3).

I wanted to use participant observation as a supplement to the interviews, to gain insight into the way in which older migrants organised their lives in practice. Initially I wanted to explore the encounters and interactions between the ageing migrants and the formal care provider (home based nurse, nurse assistant or home helper), and informal care providers (family members). I also wanted to explore how the caregiving encounter figured into the participant's daily routines. The setting I wanted to observe – people's homes – constitutes a private sphere, which may pose challenges in terms of gaining access (Fangen, 2010). Oftentimes it takes a lot of time and effort to develop the kind of trust needed to gain access to these kinds of private spheres (Fangen, 2010). Not only did I want to observe the private settings of the household, but also the interactions between care provider and receiver, which may be described as particularly intimate situations involving personal bodily care[35].

On the onset, I was aware of the potential challenges of gaining access, and I was also concerned that presenting the aim of participant observation in the information letter,

---

[35] As Isaksen (1994) points out the body constitutes a particularly tabooed subject.

could potentially also hamper recruitment for interviews. I resolved this issue by presenting participant observation as something which was open to negotiation. Consequently, the participants were provided with the opportunity to choose if they wanted to participate in observation– and if so – in which situations they would allow me to take part.

The concerns around the difficulties in gaining access turned out to be correct. For different reasons, which will be elaborated upon in the next section of the chapter, the participants were reluctant to be observed in the private spheres of their homes for time periods reaching beyond the specific situation of the interview. However, they did invite me to join them when they were in the public sphere. Consequently, although the participant observation did not proceed according to the initial plan, it did provide some valuable insights particularly into the social lives outside of the private household, I shall return to these insights in the following discussion on the research process.

2.3 Case selection and sampling

In case studies comparing national groups, case selection occurs on at least two general levels, selecting countries and selecting individual participants (Barglowski, 2018). Having already discussed the former I now describe the latter.

The overall sampling approach in this study may be described as purposive – meaning that cases are selected because they illustrate some features or processes which we are interested in (Silverman, 2011).

In line with the life course perspective's understanding of old age as not relating to reaching a specific chronological age – but rather in relation to a series of life course transitions – I did not indicate a specific age limit. Rather, I included the criterion that participants should be retired, and/or have assistance needs. I also wanted to interview people who had experiences with the formal care services in Norway, preferably in combination with informal care.

In lieu of findings from former studies mapping the usage of formal care services among older migrants in Norway which indicate that home based care services are

the services that are most commonly used (Ingebretsen, 2010), I decided I wanted to limit the focus to experiences with home based care services. Moreover, informed by an intersectional perspective, I wanted to explore how gender intersected with national background in shaping the experiences of ageing in Norway in different ways. Thus, I wanted to have an equal number of participants from each gender from Poland and Pakistan, respectively. Within this sample I also planned to gain variation in the sample in terms of education, family, and health situation, as well as the types of care they received, formally or informally. Thus, I planned to conduct a total number of 24 interviews, 6 for each gender from Poland and Pakistan, respectively. Given the detailed insights provided by combining biographical interviews and participant observation, I considered the number of 24 interviews – 6 for each gender – to be sufficient. At the same time, this number was a tentative one, and I remained open and flexible in the recruitment process.

As already stated in section 2.2.2, I wanted to observe the participant's daily routines, how care entered into these daily routines, as well as their encounters and interactions with care providers. The plan for the participant observation was that I would select two of the participants, from each gender, from each national background – to partake in their daily lives for two days. The traditional understanding of participant observation is that it is characterised by participation in a social setting for an extended period of time (Hammersley & Atkinson, 1995), the purpose of which is to "gain firsthand knowledge of the setting" (Glaser & Strauss as cited in Morrill & Fine, 1997, p. 425) With regards to this understanding, the participant observation which I planned to conduct may be described as fairly short. However, I would argue that the length of the fieldwork is both dependent upon the research question, as well as informed by practical and pragmatic considerations (Fangen, 2010), and that it is possible to gain valuable insights into a social phenomenon through participating in a setting in shorter periods of time.

There are several reasons for why I decided to conduct participant observation for the duration of two days. Firstly, I estimated that the duration of two days would provide ample insights into the everyday lives and routines of the participants. On that note I

decided that two days would be better than one day to gain insights into how everyday life and routines could also be subject to variation. Moreover, I planned to conduct some of the observations strategically – at days where a formal care provider was there, or at times when the study participants had visits from family. Ethical considerations also constituted a basis for the time limit. I surmised that longer periods of observation could be considered much too intrusive in the older migrants' lives. As already mentioned, I also presented the duration of the observation, and what kinds of situation I would take part in, as open to negotiation with each individual participant.

Table 1 below is a numeric overview of the initial plan for the interviews and participant observation.

Table 1 Initial plan

	Pakistani women	Pakistani men	Polish women	Polish men	Total number
Interviews	6	6	6	6	24
Participant observation	2*2 days	2*2days	2*2days	2*2days	8*2days

Although having established some clear and theoretically informed sampling criteria, I was also aware that some pragmatism was necessary. As Brannen and Nilsen (2011, 607) aptly state; "(…) at the fieldwork stage practical and other circumstances may lead to changes where 'second best' alternatives are chosen without altering the overall design". I will argue that practical issues and challenges with the recruitment lead to a sample of informants, which differed from the initial plan. Consequently, I had to adjust some of the research questions. However, before discussing what can actually be said based on the sample and the findings in this study, I now turn to the discussion of the research process where recruitment challenges particularly led to a different sample than was originally planned.

3. The research process

3.1 Recruitment

The recruitment and empirical data collection took place between fall of 2013 and spring of 2015. I began by contacting the municipalities of two large cities in Norway. I wanted to recruit in these cities because I knew that many Pakistani and Polish migrants had settled there. Moreover, as already described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, one major development in the area of home based care services is the soft marketization of services, marked by the implementation of a free-choice-of-provider model in several Norwegian municipalities (Christensen & Wærness, 2018). The two municipalities I contacted had implemented the free-choice-of-provider arrangement, whereby users can choose between public provider and a range of private providers contracted by the municipality (Christensen & Wærness, 2018). Given that this is one of the most recent trends, and that increasing numbers of municipalities are introducing the arrangement, I also wanted to explore how the older migrants related to and their experiences of this arrangement.

I sent the municipality an information letter containing information about the study and an outline of criteria for participants I wanted to recruit[36]. I also wrote an information letter that the municipality could give to potential participants, outlining the topic of the study, and what taking part in the study involved[37]. These information letters were translated into Polish and Urdu – and I offered to bring an interpreter if desirable. Potential participants were invited to contact me by telephone and email if they were interested in participating. I also informed the participant that their participation would be rewarded with a gift card in the symbolic sum of 100 NOK[38].

---

[36] See Attachment 1

[37] See Attachment 2

[38] The decision to give a gift card of 100 NOK as a reward for participating in the study was made after a researcher on polish migrants in Norway suggested that it would be difficult to recruit Polish participants without some sort of reward or payment for their time. This researcher was researching polish labour migrants in Norway, who would potentially have to set aside time, which could have been used doing paid work, to partake in research and therefore needed an extra incentive to agree to participate. It occurred to me that the participants that I had recruited were different from these labour migrants. I still maintained that a gift card as a reward functioned as a way of saying thank you to my participants for their time and effort. Nevertheless, the ethical implications of paying informants is debated. Some find it imperative to reward participants, as this payment entails a recognition of the time and effort involved in participating. Others argue that paying

The reason for recruiting through the municipality was that I wanted to make sure that study participants had experiences with long-term care. This channel of recruitment gave only a few participants for the study. There are different reasons for why recruitment through this channel turned out to be difficult. The first reason is simply that there aren`t that many persons of Pakistani and Polish background who are users of social care services for older people yet (Ingebretsen, 2010). Another reason relates to a reluctance to assist among some of the care managers and providers. Some felt they did not have the time, or sufficient authority to assist. Furthermore, based on a principle equitable treatment of users, the home-based care services do not register users' national backgrounds (Ministry of Health and Care Services, 2013). In addition, some of the home care providers expressed reluctance to ask their users where they came from because they feared that this would lead to feelings of stigmatisation among the users[39]. The health situation of the users is a third reason why recruitment through the home-based care services was difficult. Many of the people who initially showed an interest in participating later declined to give an interview simply because they felt that the interview situation would be too straining given their current health situation

Because of these recruitment difficulties, I decided to attempt recruitment through other channels. This included contacting two ethnic associations, The Polish Club in Norway, and the Norwegian Pakistani association for older people – both of which are known to have a large membership of older people. Through contacting and attending events organised by the associations I met people who were not only interested in participating but who were also eager to assist me in the process of finding other participants. Thus, this recruitment strategy may be considered a

---

participants may constitute a form of coercion, especially if the level of rewards of is too high to refuse. This may be particularly problematic in research on poverty and welfare issues (Head, 2009). Given that 100 NOK is not that high an amount, and that the participants in the study did not seem motivated to participate by the gift card alone, in fact, quite the contrary, I do not believe that rewarding participants in this study entails an element of coercion.

[39] This is interesting, because I believe it says something about the relation between formal care providers and users, and the differentiation and personalization of care services to each individual user. At an overall level it says something about the Norwegian approach to adapting care services to an ethnically diverse group of users, and perhaps also about the insecurities home based nurses, nurse assistants and home helpers experiences when performing care tasks in the homes of users with a migrant or ethnic minority background (Debesay et al, 2014). This does not constitute an overall topic of this thesis, but I believe more research, preferably comparative, needs to be conducted on the topic of how care managers and providers relate to the overall aim of adapting care services to more culturally diverse user groups.

combination of recruitment through gatekeepers, and snowball sampling – whereby already recruited participants aided in finding new participants. In the Pakistani case, one of the participants, Navid, took it upon himself to contact other people he knew and inviting them to participate. In this process I shared my sampling criteria, and he took it upon himself to contact persons in his network he considered eligible. Sometimes he provided information about persons who had agreed to participate, whom I contacted personally through telephone calls. Other times he even set up meetings for me himself and provided me with the information on when and where I should meet up. Consequently, Navid served as an important and valuable gatekeeper into the Pakistani migrant community in Norway. In one of our conversations, he stated that as a social scientist himself he felt it was an honour for him to assist with my research. In return for his aid, he only requested I come to visit him and his family for dinner, a request I was happy to oblige.

 In the Polish club, the leader of the club at the time was – for a small fee – willing to contact people in her network that she considered eligible for participation. She also provided valuable information about the dynamics of the polish community in Norway.

Recruitment through gatekeepers and snowball recruitment, has its advantages, but can also be somewhat problematic. It is often easier to gain access to hard-to-reach groups if someone, who is known in the community, introduces the researcher (Fangen, 2010). However, this way of recruiting participants may lead to the researcher losing control of the recruitment process and may therefore get participants who do not fit the original criteria. Furthermore, there is a risk of only finding participants that are members of a specific network (Atkinson & Flint, 2001). For instance, as I will describe in fuller detail in the description of the empirical material, in this study most of the participants may be described as very resourceful, particularly in terms of educational level and proficiency in the Norwegian language. Hence, I did not recruit the diverse sample that I initially wanted, and it is likely that some kinds of experiences have been excluded from the study.

To diversify my sample of Polish informants I also posted an ad to a Polish Catholic Church magazine, with a wide distribution throughout Norway.

Table 2 Overview of participants recruited through different channels

	Pakistani men	Pakistani women	Polish men	Polish women
Muncipality	1			
Personal attendance at meetings organized by NPEF ?	2			
Personal attendance in the Catholic Church				1
Personal attendance in the mosque	1			
Through gatekeepers	4	3	3	2
Through ad in Polish Church Magazine			1	3

There are different reasons why the recruitment turned out to be such a challenging process which are related to migrants representing hard-to-reach groups (Chamberlain & Hodgetts, 2018). There is a variety of different reasons why the older migrants may be considered hard-to-reach – one of the most important being that they represent minority groups, in which I, as a researcher, may be conceived of as an outsider (Chamberlain & Hodgetts, 2018; Wigfall et al, 2013). In relation to this, two interrelated issues deserve special mention. The first issue relates to gaining trust. It is a well-established fact that there is a certain skepticism among different ethnic minority communities when it comes to taking part in research (Chamberlain & Hodgetts, 2018). Mainly, this skepticism has to do with insecurities regarding the

role of the researcher, and an unease about the purpose of the interview. Some fear that the information provided in the interview might "fall into the wrong hands" – whether it be in the hands of governmental authorities, the media, or other members of the ethnic community (Carling, Erdal & Ezzati, 2014; Moen, 2002). Consequently, much effort must be made to gain their trust and to ensure them of their anonymity. Although this assurance was given in the information letter, I found it to be much easier to gain their trust and agreement to participate in face-to-face encounters in mosques, churches, and meetings in ethnic community associations. This also relates to the nature of recruitment, where receiving a written information letter may be perceived as more formal and official (Zubair & Victor, 2015), than being approached directly in an informal setting and invited to participate. The low number of participants recruited through the municipality (See table 2 above), versus the other recruitment channels such as personal attendance, or through gatekeepers suggests that this has also been the case in this study. Some of the participants, who had not been recruited through face-to-face encounters, also partly confirmed this by stating that they were on the onset skeptical but felt more at ease once they met me.

3.2 The interview process

The interviews I conducted were semi-structured. Prior to interviewing I had designed an interview guide[40] consisting of different themes and topics which I wanted the participants to talk about during the interviews. In line with the life course approach, the topics centred on different stages and important events in the interviewee`s life course. Although I had a main emphasis on their experiences after retirement and their present life situation, I also asked them questions about life before migration, such as where they lived, what kinds of education and work experiences they had and relations to family members. I also asked them about memories from Poland and Pakistan, which they felt were important. Moreover, I asked them questions about the migration process itself and of their experiences of life in Norway prior to retirement.

---

[40] See Attachment 3

 The interview guide served as a useful checkpoint list, to see if there were important topics that had been left out in the interviews, and to ensure comparability in the interview material. However, I remained open to issues that the participants brought up during the interviews. This was important to reduce the experience of formality in the interview, thereby developing what Spradley (1979, p.49) refers to as "rapport" – characterised by a basic sense of trust, and positive reciprocal feelings between researcher and participant. Moreover, by being open and flexible during the interview, I also gained insights into issues that I had not planned on asking about, but that the participants described as important to them. For instance, in the first interviews I conducted, the participants brought up what religion meant to them in later life, and they also talked about their former experiences with health care providers and the welfare state more broadly. Thus, I included some questions about this in a revised interview guide.

All the interviews except one were tape-recorded and transcribed verbatim. The one exception was Ibrahim, a Pakistani man who did not feel comfortable being tape-recorded. I also brought a notebook for each interview session. Shortly after each interview I wrote down central impressions, and a summary of the interview – also pointing out interesting issues, which were not covered by the interview guide, or topics that seemed to be phrased in a problematic fashion, and which I should consider rephrasing in proceeding interviews. For instance, also in one of my first interviews with a Pakistani man, I asked him if he considered himself to be old. He seemed to become a bit offended by this question[41]. Thus, in the subsequent interviews I took care not to ask this question directly, but rather to ease into it by way of asking a "descriptive question" first. According to Spradley (1979) descriptive questions are used to elicit a large sample of utterances about a particular time, space, event, person, or object, in the research participants own words. Spradley (1979) identifies different types of descriptive questions, of which I primarily used so called

---

[41] This is interesting data in itself because it says something about the attitudes towards old age among the participants, which is informed by perceptions that old age constitutes something negative (Bakken,2018). However, in the initial phrasing of the question, I did not get insights into why the participants seemed to become offended – i.e. what they associated with old age. By asking them to provide an example of what they considered old provided insights into the question of what they considered to be old, without themselves having to locate themselves in the category of "old".

"typical grand tour" questions and "example" questions (Spradley, 1979, p.50-51). In situations where I sensed that the participants became somewhat offended by my phrasing of the questions, I would rephrase the question as an example question. For instance, this was the case when I asked the participants if they felt old. However, when phrased as an example question such as "could you give an example of a person you would characterise as old" before asking the question of whether they themselves felt old. I found that the participants seemed less offended, and that as a result their answers became lengthier.

In many of the interviews the participants were more eager to talk about their past, than their present life after retirement. When the latter topic came up the participants would sometimes only give brief responses such as "very boring". Thus, in order to encourage more extensive responses, I decided to phrase my questions in terms of a typical grand tour question, asking the participant to give me "the grand tour" of a typical day in their lives. For instance, I would ask: "could you describe a typical day in your life, such as what do you do between getting out of bed in the morning and going to bed at nighttime?" By phrasing the question this way, I urged the participants to provide fuller descriptions of their daily lives.

The interviews were conducted either in the participants' homes or in a different setting selected by the participant, usually the mosque, in a separate room at the ethnic community association or in a café. The purpose of asking the participants to choose the location of the interviews was to make sure that they were comfortable with the setting of the interview, and thereby to even out some of the power imbalances between participant and researcher. As Elwood & Martin (2000) point out, power relations between the researcher and the participant are partially shaped by the setting in which the research is carried out. Consequently, asking participants to choose the setting of the interview encouraged them to invite me into their settings – a setting in which I, as a researcher, was unfamiliar with.

Interviews lasted between one and four hours, with an average of 1.5 hours. The interviews lasting around 4 hours were the interviews conducted in the participant's homes, which often involved sharing a meal which the participants had prepared. The

interviews conducted in the participants' home were very fruitful as they gave – not only rich interviews – but also insights into the participant's households, and a sense of the nature of their relationship with other members of the family/household. As Elwood & Martin (2000) observe, having research participants select the settings of the interviews, may also provide additional information about the topic being researched. Whether it is the home of the participant, or any other public or semi-public setting, people engage in social relationships with others, and engage in negotiations of different roles and identities in different social settings (Elwood & Martin, 2000). Thus, documentation of and reflections about the details of the settings, may serve to provide important contextual information of the social relationships of the participants in a particular setting, and of the roles and identities participants took on or identified with in a specific interview setting (Elwood & Martin, 2000; Kvale & Brinkmann,2011).Thus, immediately after having conducted the interview, I made sure to write extensive notes containing descriptions of the settings. In the mosque and ethnic community organisation, I also wrote down information about other people who were present, and I noted the interactions between them and the participant. These field notes provided important contextual information about the interviews, and about the participants.

As already stated, the interviews conducted in the interviewee's home were the richest interviews – in part due to the relaxing atmosphere and lack of interruptions or time limits. However, the richness of the interview was also dependent on interviewees willingness and ability to provide intimate and detailed accounts of their lives (Nilsen, 1994, p.143-144). This in turn depends on several factors, including the social setting of the interview, the relation developed between interviewer and interview participant, and the participant's individual experiences (Nilsen,1994). Consequently, whereas some of the interviews went on without much interruptions or probing by the researcher, others demanded more probing and questioning – and participants provided only short and compressed answers.

All the interviews, with one exception, were conducted in Norwegian. The one exception was the interview with a Pakistani man who preferred the interview be

done in English as he felt he could express himself more clearly. To ensure accuracy in the account of the interviews, they were all tape recorded, transcribed and translated into English by me.

3.3 Participant observation

As already stated, the plan was to follow four of the interview participants for two days to gain insight into how they organized their daily life. However, I was on the onset aware that this would become difficult to carry out for several reasons, which I have described earlier in this chapter. Thus. I presented participant observation as something that was optional and open to negotiation both in the information letter, and towards the end of the interview. Understandably, the interviewees were reluctant to allow for my presence in the private settings of their home, beyond being there during the interviews. Some of them did however invite me to join them when they were in the public sphere. Specifically, I was invited to "tag along" with them as they were attending gatherings in their faith communities, and other nationally based community events. This included attending prayers or other events in the mosque, attending church mass and informal church coffee meetings. In these settings, the participants often showed me around and introduced me to other potential new participants.

I also contacted two ethnic associations for recruitment. These associations hosted events and meetings, which I attended – both for the sake of recruitment as well as for observing what was going on there. In the Pakistani case, meetings in the Norwegian Pakistani association for older people was a regular event taking place almost every weeknight from 4pm to 9pm. Whereas in the Polish club events were more irregular, and often consisted of focused information meetings or dance parties. When doing the observation, I usually spent 3 or 4 hours each time. How I divided my time depended on practical circumstances, such as when meetings were organised. For instance, women usually gathered in the mosque Sunday afternoons, so I attended then. Furthermore, I could attend the Polish Sunday mass and the ensuing Church coffee after attending Sunday meetings in the mosque. I also spent a

few hours in the mosque weekdays and particularly on Fridays in relation to Friday prayer.

Thus, the mosque and the church as important social sites for the participants emerged empirically as participants invited me to join them as they attended these sites as a part of their weekly routine. The participant observation in these settings may therefore be described as field driven, whereby participant observation in these settings is situated in the natural everyday contexts of the participants (Kusenbach, 2018). The ethnic community associations on the other hand, were chosen as sites by me – based partly on the participant's descriptions of attending these settings – and partly based on former research, which identify the importance of these sites for migrants in later life (cf. Næss & Vabø, 2014). Combined with the interview, participant observations in these settings provided insights into the meanings the settings are bestowed with among the participants in the study, as well as the collective social practices the participants engaged in within these settings (Kusenbach, 2018)

It is important to reflect on the participatory role the researcher develops in relation to the persons and activities in question, and how this may influence the empirical data, and the kinds of analysis possible (Boccagni & Schrooten, 2018; Hammersley & Atkinson, 2005). It is possible to engage in several different participatory roles, ranging on a continuum from non-participant observer to fully participating observer (Boccagni & Schrooten, 2018; Fangen, 2010; Hammersley & Atkinson, 2005). These participatory roles should not be understood as static, but as shifting in relation to different situations. Moreover, what role the researcher engages in is also dependent on the role in which participants in the field entrusts the researcher with, and this is strongly tied to the question of the positionality of the researcher in relation to the field (Dewalt & Dewalt, 2002; Fangen, 2010). I shall return to the question of positionality in the next subsection of the chapter.

My role in the research field may be described in terms of what Dewalt & Dewalt (2002, p.29) label *"moderate participation"*, characterised by being present and identifiable as a researcher in the setting, and shifting between purely observing and

occasionally interacting with the persons present in the setting. Consequently, in the process of my fieldwork, my role would vary from being a partly participating observer, to non-participating observer. The role of moderate participant may be defined as engaging in social interactions, making small-talk and following the implicit social rules of the situation, whilst not engaging directly in activities that are characteristic of the communities (Dewalt & Dewalt, 2002). For instance, when observing in faith communities and the social gatherings in relation to the faith communities I engaged in conversations with the people who were there. However, I did not join them in prayer or other related activities. During my conversations in the field, I strived to be polite, and to not ask too many probing questions – thereby gaining trust from the participants. I also strived to follow the social and moral codes in the way I dressed and acted. For instance, I always wore loose-fitting suit pants and a loose-fitting blouse or sweater. Moreover, when attending the mosque, I also covered my hair – not with a headscarf – but with a hat in order to show my respect. Navid, one of my gatekeepers, told me that he appreciated this gesture, although he did not consider it necessary, as I was not a Muslim[42].

Reflections on the likely consequences of my participatory roles for the kinds of data gathered, and how they can be analyzed can only be speculative (Hammersley & Atkinson, 2005). It is possible that I would have gained deeper understandings of what was going on in the setting had I strived towards and attained a more active participatory role. However, combined with the interviews, I would argue that the participant observation I conducted did provide valuable insights into these settings, the role of older migrants in the settings and how these role varied in terms of gender, and the meanings they attached to participation in these settings. Consequently, I considered the data gathered through participant observation as crucial for rendering visible one aspect of the experience of ageing in Norway, namely the centrality of

---

[42] This in turn suggests that I was conceived of as an outsider, particularly in the setting of the mosque. It also serves to suggest that Navid's perception of me as an outsider also entails that I was not considered subject to the same moral codes as were women recognised as Muslims.

faith communities and ethnic community organizations for the experiences of ageing in place among migrants in Norway.

Like the interviews, I also brought a notebook, where I wrote down shorthand notes when I had the opportunity to do so. These notes were expanded upon shortly after exiting the setting, usually on the train or bus on my way home, and these notes were typewritten in the evenings. My fieldnotes had the character of what Wolfinger (2002, p. 90) labels "comprehensive note taking", with the aim of describing everything that happens in the setting, in as much detail as possible. The comprehensive notes included descriptions of the physical make-up of the setting, the actors present, and the actions, interactions, and conversation they engage in. I organised the notes temporally, describing what happened in the settings from beginning to end. According to Wolfinger (2002) this form of note taking serves to highlight the rhythms of the persons engaging in the setting and is thereby more attentive to the participants in the settings and their construction of meaning.

Hammersley & Atkinson (2005, p. 142) argue that "fieldnotes are always selective: it is not possible to capture everything", and what is recorded will depend upon our general understandings of what is relevant to the research questions, as well as on our own background expectations. In other words, writing field notes is very much part of the analysis. Still, I would argue that taking comprehensive field notes allows interpretations to be kept in abeyance, until a later stage of the research process – something which is important for many reasons. First of all it is important because features of the setting which on the onset may have seemed insignificant, may take on a new meaning once the researcher gets a more in-depth understanding of the setting (Hammersley & Atkinson, 2005). Secondly, and perhaps more importantly to this study, comprehensive field notes may be considered particularly useful when doing comparisons across different settings where context (such as how the setting is organised, the participants present, the actions they engage in, and how they interact) is crucial.

In addition to these field notes I also kept a separate document consisting of analytical reflections, some initial interpretations, and methodological reflections.

These notes provided a basis for the gradual focusing of my research towards particular topics, and thereby guided my further inquiry, and the process of analysis.

In sum, although the participant observation did not turn out the way that was originally planned, it gave important insights into different social arenas for older migrants ageing in place – which is a central topic in chapter 7 on migratory social embeddedness.

4. Empirical material and description of participants

As I have already described in detail, I have departed somewhat from the initial study design. As the reader may recall, I had plans on conducting 24 interviews, with 6 men and women from Pakistan and Poland, respectively. What I ended up with was a total number of 21 interviewees consisting of: 9 Pakistani men;3 Pakistani women; 3 Polish men; and 6 Polish women. Table 3 below provides an overview of the participants, and characteristics of these participants.

Table 3 Overview of participants

	Age	Years of residence in Norway	Education	Occupation in Norway	Health condition	Formal care	Informal Care
Pakistani men							
Akbar	67	44	Bachelor's degree from Pakistan	Several manual low-skilled occupations, before landing a job as an office clerk	Diabetes and visual impairments	Home based nurse twice a week	Wife that cooks and cleans

Name			Education	Occupation	Health	Care	Household
Navid	68	43	Master's degree from Pakistan. Teacher training in Norway.	Student, Social worker, and primary teacher	Good, no health problems	None	Shares household tasks with his wife and children
Khalid	73	45	Two master's degrees from Pakistan	Several manual occupations, before finding a job as a first language teacher	Good, occasional headaches	None	Wife performs household tasks
Abid	67	45	Bachelor's degree from Pakistan	Established a successful business	Good	None	Wife and daughter in law performs household tasks
Tariq	78	43	Primary School	Several different manual occupations	Angina, Diabetes and high blood pressure	None, except regular hospital checkups	Lives with his wife and four children and they share household tasks
Fehrooz	71	44	Master`s degree from Pakistan, Vocational education in Norway	Several different manual occupations, before landing a job as an office clerk	Good	None	Cares for his wife. Occasionally his children help out with household tasks
Noman	70	46	Primary School	Several different manual	Problems with heart	None	Cared for by his son and

Name	Age		Education	Occupation	Health	Treatment	Care
				occupations	and kidney, visual impairment and general old age frailty		daughter in law
Ibrahim	70	45	Elementary school	Several different manual occupations, before establishing s small grocery shop	Severe heart problems,poor eyesight and has trouble walking		
Shahrukh	66	43	Occupational training from Pakistan	Different manual occupations before landing a job as an office clerk	Good	None	Shares household tasks with his wife
Pakistani Women							
Ashwariya	65	41	Primary School	Recurring periods of temporary employment in different kindergartens	Arthritis, heart problems. Has had cancer.	Physical Therapy, Regular hospital checkups	Her daughter in law helps her get out of bed, and assist with household tasks
Roobio	69	42	Bachelor's degree from Pakistan	First language substitute teacher	Good	None	None

Shamina	64	40	Primary School	Has worked in a kindergarten, but has mostly been non-employed	Arthritis, has had a stroke	None	Her husband helps her with household tasks, occasionally children come and assist with cleaning
Polish men							
Lukasz	68	48	Master's degree from Poland	Managed a construction business	Heart problems	None	Shares household tasks with his wife
Piotr	67	27	Master's degree from Poland	Engineer in the oil industry	None	None	Shares household tasks with his wife
Andrzei	72	30	Master's degree from Poland	Worked in ship management	None	None	Shares household tasks with his wife
Polish women							
Magdalena	73	28	Master's degree from Poland	Kindergarten teacher and classroom assistant	Arthritis, has had cancer	A home helper twice a week	None
Jelena	71	38	Master's degree from Poland	Musician	Arthritis, recovering from a stroke	Physical therapy	Occasionally neighbors assist with

							household tasks
Linda	65	28	Bachelor's degree from Poland	Assistant in a women's refuge	Asthma, Overweight	Occasional stays at treatment center	His son lives with her and they share household tasks
Justyna	67	27	Master's degree from Poland	Engineer in the oil industry	Arthritis	None	Shares household tasks with her husband
Maria	66	27	Master's degree from Poland	Mechanical engineer	Good	None	Occasionally pays a private company to clean her apartment
Krysztyna	67	26	Master's degree from Poland	Artist	Good	None	None

There is a significant gender imbalance among the participants – an imbalance which is directly related to recruitment challenges. Among the Pakistani participants, the discrepancy between the numbers of men and women may have to do with both the recruitment process in itself, and with characteristics of the Pakistani community in Norway. The Pakistani community in Norway – particularly among those who have themselves migrated to Norway – is gender segregated. Women are expected to stay inside and to maintain the private sphere, while men occupy the public sphere (Predelli, 2008; Moen 2009). This means that persons who regularly attended the arenas where I recruited participants were, for the most part, men. Moreover, the employment rate among Pakistani women from the specific age groups have been

very low compared to other migrant groups and the population at large, resulting in poorer skills in the Norwegian language (Henriksen, 2007). This may also be a reason why Pakistani women were difficult to recruit for the study.

How does the sample compare to the population of ageing Pakistani migrants who have had a long residence time in Norway?[43] Firstly, although there is some variation in the educational level of the Pakistani participants in this study, the educational level of the Pakistani participants, particularly the men, can be regarded as high compared to the population of ageing Pakistani migrants in Norway, where on average the educational level is found to be low (15 percent have higher education) (Henriksen, 2007). The average employment rate for the population of Pakistani migrants has been relatively low, particularly among the Pakistani women (Henriksen, 2007), and the Pakistani migrants have mainly been employed in manual occupations, hotel- and service industry and transport and communication (Henriksen, 2007). This is reflected in the sample of participants in this study. However, the three Pakistani women in this study have been employed in the Norwegian labour market, albeit mostly on a temporary basis. They had also obtained relatively good skills in the Norwegian language. Hence, they may be described as relatively resourceful compared to the majority of the women in their age group.

When it comes to the health situation of the population of older Pakistani migrants in Norway, I find this to be reflected in the sample of participants. This also serves to illustrate and explain the relatively high reception of disability benefits and pensions in this group (Henriksen, 2007).

To sum up, the sample of Pakistani participants does represent some of the variation in the population of ageing Pakistani migrants in Norway, particularly in relation to occupation and health situation. However, overall, the sample of participants may be described as relatively resourceful in terms of educational level, and Norwegian language skills. This is particularly so when it comes to the Pakistani women in this

---

[43] This comparison does not consider all persons with a Pakistani background in Norway, but persons who my participants are regarded as cases of – that is persons who have migrated to Norway in mid adulthood, and have had a long residence time in Norway.

sample. This means that the experiences of ageing in Norway among Pakistani women who have not participated in the labour market and have a lower mastery of the Norwegian language have been excluded from the sample.

When it comes to the Polish older migrants, information about the specific age group I am studying is scarce[44]. What is known is that in the age group of 40-74 years of age, the majority of migrants from Poland are women due to the fact that many women came to Norway because they had met and married Norwegian men (Henriksen, 2007; Godzimirski, 2011). Furthermore, regardless of migration status, Polish migrants in this age group are described as relatively resourceful. Their educational level is relatively high, with a majority having completed higher technical or university education, and they have been relatively well integrated in the Norwegian labour market (Szelagowska, 2011). Considering that my sample consists both of these well-educated migrants, who have arrived either by obtaining a status as political refugees, or on expert visas, and of women who have come to Norway because of marriage to a Norwegian man, the sample clearly reflects the variation in the population of ageing Polish migrants in Norway. However, the sample contains only three men.

The low number of Polish men in the sample is not easy to explain. Based on their research experiences, Wigfall et al (2013) have identified Polish men as a challenging group in terms of gaining access and trust. This can also be related to their experiences from the socialist regime in Poland, and researchers may often experience being suspected of being an instrument for state surveillance (Szelagowska, 2011). Although there were few interviews with Pakistani women and Polish men, when combined with ethnography, the interviews yielded insights into some gendered aspects for migrants

---

[44] The low numbers of Polish persons migrating to Norway before the EU accession, and the overall description of Polish migrants as well adapted to Norwegian society (Friberg & Golden,2014), may serve to explain the lack of information about this specific group.

In sum, the sample of participants may be described as relatively resourceful in terms of education and occupations in Norway. In contexts of migration skills in the destination language of the destination country constitutes an important resource and given that all of the interviews – except one – were conducted in Norwegian illustrates that the participants in this study are in possession of this resource.

5. Analytical approaches and the relation between theory and data

As described earlier in this chapter, the analysis cannot be separated from the process of empirical investigation. Rather, it has been ongoing throughout the process of interviewing and participant observation. However, I also find it important to describe the analytical approach proceeding the completion of the empirical investigation.

The process of analysis of the empirical material can best be described as a *bricolage*, consisting of free movement between different procedures, strategies, and concepts (Kvale & Brinkman, 2009), with an overall aim of producing thick descriptions, which have been defined in subsection 2.1 of this chapter.

The first step in the analysis consisted of listening through and transcribing all the interviews. Although I transcribed some of the interviews while still doing the fieldwork, the major part of the transcriptions was conducted after the empirical investigation had been completed. The process of listening to, transcribing, and reading the interview transcripts and field notes gave a general overview of emerging issues and topics in the material.

The second step in the analysis involved summarizing the life stories of each participant. This analytical approach carries similarities with the construction of lifelines, which is a much-used technique in life course research (cf. Brannen & Nilsen, 2013). The construction of lifelines consists of mapping key phases and events of a person's life course chronologically and examining how these phases and events are linked to historical circumstances (Brannen & Nilsen, 2011; Brannen & Nilsen, 2013). However, lifelines consist of a graphic depiction of timing, sequencing

and length of key phases and events in the life course. This is done for the purpose of identifying and graphically visualising patterns of linearity and non-linearity of different trajectories (Brannen & Nilsen, 2013, p. 35). My approach differs from this approach, as I did not produce a graphic depiction, but rather a textual summary of key phases, trajectories, and events in the participant's life course. The aim of these textual summaries was to get an overview of each participant's individual life course for the purpose of comparing each life course against each other. This in turn constitutes a useful strategy for contextualising each life course within their historical and social contexts (Brannen & Nilsen, 2013). For instance, in this study key events included educational trajectories, the timing of migration, family establishment, employment trajectories, transition to retirement, and the development of assistance needs. The summaries were essential to identify patterns and divergences among the informants, and to get an idea of how these were linked to different layers of context. For instance, through writing these summaries I discovered that whereas most of the Polish participants entered into retirement at the age of 67, which is the traditional norm for retirement age, most of the Pakistani participants entered into retirement earlier, often because of health problems. This pattern in turn can be linked to these migrant groups' different employment trajectories in Norway, which have been described in chapter 1.

I also analysed central themes in the interviews and the fieldnotes by drawing inspiration from Glaser & Strauss' (1967, p.106) principles of constant comparisons, whereby an incident in the data is coded and continuously compared with other similar and different incidents grouped in the same category. I began the analysis by coding the data in categories. The initial stages of this process consisted of open coding, where I coded the data into broad descriptive categories describing what the text segments are about. This was done for the purpose of grouping together statements and descriptions of different topics and compare them with each other to identify similarities and differences (Corbin & Strauss, 1990). For instance, one category assigned to the data in this initial stage was care needs, and how these care needs are met. Statements about care needs and how these are met were grouped together and compared against one another and. based on these comparisons I

assigned subcategories. Thus, I assigned the subcategories of "informal family care", "combining informal family care with formal publicly provided care services" and "formal care".

In the analysis of fieldnotes different analytical approaches were also employed based on the status of the field notes as empirical data. For instance, the field notes describing the setting of the interviews such as how the homes were organised, and relations between household members are treated as contextual information for the interviews. This contextual information encompassed such things as the size and composition of the household, and the social relationships with family members if they were present.

The field notes from public settings has also been analysed based on the central principles of comparative analysis (Fangen, 2010) – meaning they were organized according to differences and similarities in terms of organisational structure (specifically how the settings were organized according to gender and age), and according to differences and similarities in the activities in the different settings. The findings of this process of analysis figures prominently in chapter 7, where the topic of the older migrant`s social embeddedness is analysed.

The next step in this process of analysis may be described as axial coding, whereby the relationships between categories and their subcategories are identified (Corbin & Strauss, 1990). In my study this process consisted of attempting to identify the context and conditions by which differences and similarities in relation to a specific topic in the empirical material occurs. At this stage, the analysis of different topics in the interviews and field notes were examined in relation to the life story summaries, in order contextualise the differences in similarities in the data, in relation to macro, meso and micro contexts.

I also reread the entire material at different points in the process of analysis to reevaluate my initial interpretations. According to Timmermans & Tavory (2012) this way of revisiting the empirical material is fruitful – topics which initially seem mundane or irrelevant, may take on a new meaning as the process of analysis develops. Moreover, as Christensen (1994) points out, some themes are difficult to

understand the meanings of without a holistic understanding of the empirical material – something – which I would argue, emerges gradually from the process of analytical engagement with the empirical material.

Although the analysis draws inspiration from a grounded theory approach, the study departs from the grounded theory approach with regards to the role of theory. Glaser & Strauss (1967), who initially developed the methodology grounded theory, emphasised that each step of the research process should be driven forward by empirical data – entailing that ideally the researcher should start a study without a theory, or a clearly stated research question in order to allow for this to be derived from the analysis of the empirical material (Christensen,1994). By contrast, and as described in chapter 2, my study has been theoretically informed by different theoretical perspectives, which have guided my approach to sampling and data collection, and the analytical approach, for example. However, I have also strived keep theory in abeyance and to remain open to what emerged in the field.

In discussing the role of theory in my study I find Christensen's (1994) distinction between theory charged and theory driven research useful. The concept of theory charged research implies that our observations are informed by our knowledge – meaning that it is not possible to observe without any prior knowledge of what we see. By contrast, theory driven research implies that we select certain theories which form the content of what we see (Christensen, 1994). The concept of theory driven may be used to describe deductive approaches, in which the purpose of research is to verify, falsify or modify existing theories – still finding only what we expect to find (Timmermans & Tavory, 2012, p. 173). Consequently, I would describe my study as theory charged. As already discussed in chapter 3, theory in this study served as sensitizing – raising awareness and directing attention to some processes and dimensions in the material, while "not determining the scope of perceivable findings" (Blumer, cited in Timmermans & Tavory, 2012,p.163)

6. The quality of the study in terms of validity, reliability, and generalisability

In the former sections of this chapter, I have described the study in terms of aims, rationale for use of methods, the research process, empirical material, and analysis. I now turn to an assessment of the quality of the study – in terms of validity, reliability and generalisability.

The concepts of validity, reliability and generalisability originally stems from a quantitative research tradition (Hammersley, 2012). In the quantitative research tradition, the concept of validity refers to whether you are actually exploring the phenomena in which you intend to explore, and whether or not the findings in the study are transferrable to other circumstances similar to the topics and circumstances explored in the given study (Fangen, 2010). Reliability on the other hand is commonly defined in terms of "the degree to which the study's methodology is well defined so that others could, in principle repeat the study and arrive at the same results" (Justesten & Mik-Meyer, 2012,p. 38).

The applicability of these quality criteria – as defined above – in qualitative research, have been extensively debated. The concepts stem from positivist ideals of objectivity, which implies that high quality research is influenced as little as possible by contextual factors such as the researcher and his or her own subjective understandings and experiences (Justesen & Mik-Meyer, 2012,p. 201). This has led some researchers to opt for the development of new quality criteria which are more attentive to the specificities of qualitative approaches (cf. Bertaux,1981; Corbin & Strauss, 2008), while others dismiss scientific quality criteria altogether (cf. Denzin & Lincoln,2005).

Rather than dismissing the concepts of validity, reliability and generalisability as criteria for evaluating the quality of the current study, I hold that my study should be assessed through these criteria, but that the concept should be defined more broadly – in a manner that is attentive to the characteristic traits of qualitative methods (Hammersley, 2012). This means considering the flexibility embedded in qualitative research designs, the importance of interpersonal relationships developed between

researcher and research participants, and the specific context in which research is undertaken. Thus, in qualitative approaches the validity, reliability and generalisability should be assessed based on questions of the quality of the craft, and not necessarily based on questions of valid measurements, and replicability (Kvale & Brinkman, 2009). I now move on to assess the quality of the present study. Although the concepts of validity and reliability are strongly tied to the question of generalisability, generalisability is discussed in a separate subsection of the chapter.

6.1 Validity and reliability

Drawing inspiration from Syltevik's (1996) assessment of the quality of her doctoral thesis on lone motherhood in Norway, validity and reliability in this study is assessed by reflecting on potential sources of bias in different stages of the research process. Syltevik (1996) develops three questions, which can be used in assessing the validity and reliability of the study. The first question relates to the methods chosen, and whether the methods and the resulting empirical material is suited to answer the research questions the researcher has set out to examine. In section 2.2 of this chapter I have argued that the combination of biographical interviews and participant observation is well suited to explore the experiences of ageing amongst migrants from a bottom-up perspective and the processes which this stems from, i.e. their lived lives. The aim of the project has from the onset been to examine the subjective experiences of ageing amongst migrants, while at the same time locating this within objective (external) conditions (Wingens et al, 2011)[45].

A central debate in relation to reliability of interviews concerns whether interview participants are telling the truth (Hammersley, 2013). Due to the retrospective character of biographical interviews questions have also been raised about whether people's recollections of past events are accurate enough for data from such interviews to qualify as scientific (Nilsen, 2008, p.88). Bertaux & Kohli (1984, p.219) argue that the questions of validity and reliability of retrospective data are more important if the aim is to study objective historical patterns and socio-structural

---

[45] As already stated in section 2.2.1, I have made use of different sources in order to describe the relevant contextual conditions for migrant ageing in Norway.

relations, than if the aim is to study people's subjective perceptions, experiences and definitions of situations. In this understanding, if a participant in this study were to recount an experience of having been discriminated against in the labour market, due to his or her migratory background, the question of whether or not this represents an accurate portrayal of the situation at hand is not really important. What is more important is that the participant perceives this to have happened, and the consequences of this experience for his overall perceptions, attitudes, and relation to ageing in Norway.

The second question which needs to be assessed according to Syltevik (1996) regards whether the analysis adequately covers the empirical material which it is built upon. I find this question to contain two underlying questions. The first underlying question relates to whether the entire scope of the empirical material has been covered in the analysis, or whether the empirical material presented in the analysis is used in a selective and partial manner. The second underlying question relates to the question of saturation; whether the interpretations of the empirical material gets to the bottom of the processes analysed, or whether further data collection, and analysis would provide insights into additional dimensions of the empirical material (Christensen, 1998). In the following these questions shall be discussed separately.

I start with the first question, whether the empirical material covers the entirety of the empirical material which it is built upon. In the analysis I have strived towards providing thick descriptions of the accounts of individual participants, with the aim of highlighting the nuances and variations embedded in the empirical material. Thus, the participants I have chosen to present in the analyses have been chosen because they serve to illustrate some specific features and dimensions of the empirical material. At the same time, I have strived to describe how representative these accounts are for the empirical material in its entirety. Moreover, by constantly comparing the study's research findings with the findings of other studies on the same subject strengthens the validity and reliability of interpretations made (Fangen, 2011; Tjora, 2012).

The second underlying question concerning saturation is more difficult to assess. As Christensen (1998) argues – one of the problems associated with assessing saturation

is that this is subjectively defined. This means that it is entirely dependent upon the interpretations made by the researcher during the process of analysis. As already described in section 6 of this chapter, I have made use of different analytical techniques in the process of analysing my material, and I revisited the material at several times during the analysis, in order to make sure that all significant dimensions were covered in the analysis. I have also discussed my interpretations with other members of the academic community, rendering them subject to scrutiny. It is possible that by use of different theoretical frameworks, and theoretical concepts, other dimensions would also come to the fore. However, I argue that given the thoroughness and the depth of the analysis and considering the theoretical frameworks utilised I have achieved a form of saturation in the analysis.

The third question which Syltevik (1996) introduces to assess validity and reliability concerns the degree of openness and transparency into the research process; to what extent does the thesis enable the reader to assess the empirical material and the analytical arguments based on this empirical material. As Silverman (2014) argues, the reliability of qualitative research projects is strengthened through providing transparency in two ways. Firstly, one should present the research process, including the strategies of empirical investigation and analysis in a detailed manner in the research report. Secondly, one should make the theoretical grounds for interpretations visible, and show how these inform the interpretations and inferences made in the study. A major aim of this chapter has been to ensure transparency by providing detailed and thick descriptions of the research process in its entirety – from the initial study design, changes made along the way, and analytical approach, including the role of theory for the design and the process of analysis.

Aside from providing transparency into the theoretical foundations and methodological approach, validity can be obtained through engaging in dialogue with the disciplinary community in which the study takes place, by for instance disseminating papers in seminars and conferences, discussing the validity of interpretations with peers and by making articles subject to peer view (Fangen, 2010).

I have rendered findings from this study subject to scrutiny in seminars at the Department of Sociology, University of Bergen, and in international conferences[46].

6.2 The positionality of the researcher

Also related to the topic of reliability is the identity and position of the researcher vis-à-vis the participants. The question of positionality relates to questions of power asymmetries, which I have discussed earlier in this chapter. In migration scholarship, positionality also relates to the question of whether the researcher shares membership of the same social group of the research participants, and how this positionality influences the knowledge produced in the research encounter (Boccagni & Schrooten, 2018).

Along ethno-national lines, I am an outsider to both the Polish and Pakistani older migrants in this study being both a member of the majority population in Norway. This may have influenced the accounts I was given during the interviews. For instance, when describing care in old age, most of the Pakistani participants usually described the norm of intergenerational living, and family care, regardless of their actual caregiving arrangements. Thus, this account may be regarded as expressions of norms and values which many of the Pakistani participants share in common, and which they feel the need to explain explicitly to me, whom they perceive not to share these values and norms. In the general literature on ethnographic practice this is presented as one of the advantages of having an outsider position. The outsider position may serve to encourage participants to be more explicit about and explain aspects often taken for granted within the group (Boccagni & Schrooten, 2018; Carling et al., 2014; Merriam et al, 2001).

However, the distinction between being an outsider and an insider is far from clear cut. For instance, Merriam et al (2001) argue that the simple dichotomy between an insider and outsider position entails the assumption that culture constitutes a monolithic entity – an entity which one either belongs to or not. This an assumption

---

[46] Among the international conferences I have presented my findings are the Nordic Migration Research conference in Copenhagen in 2014, a symposium on Transnational ageing at the Johannes Gutenberg University of Mainz in 2015, and an ESA conference in Prague in 2015.

which glosses over multiple points of variation, such as gender, class, age, religion and so on. Boccagni & Schrooten (2018) argue that the position the researcher takes on and is attributed in the research encounter is ultimately a product of ongoing processes of negotiations of proximity and distance in the context of the encounter. In essence these negotiations have to do with issues of trust – whereby both symbolic markers of identity and positionality, such as ethnic background, class position, age, gender and religion as well as the personal qualities of the researcher enter into negotiations of access and trust in any given research setting (Boccagni & Schrooten,2019; Carling et al, 2014).

During the interviews I had the experience that both the Pakistani and Polish older migrants, were more preoccupied with my age, rather than my ethno-national background. Many of the Pakistanis stated that, because of my young age, they ascribed me with the role of a granddaughter[47], and therefore they wanted to help. My young age also came up in the interviews with the Polish participants. Some of them stated that they had been skeptical of the interview at first, but when they met me – and saw how young I was – they became more at ease. Moreover, most of the participants perceived of me as a student rather than as a doctoral researcher. This may have served to even out the power imbalance embedded in the encounter between me as a researcher, and the participants, which I have also discussed in previous sections of the chapter. This is also illustrated through the emphasis many of them (both the polish and the Pakistanis) placed on the importance of helping me, and on the importance of teaching me something through telling their stories. This indicates that my relatively young age, combined with the student status attributed to me in many of the encounters, contributed to building trust and to creating reciprocal relationships between me and the participants.

Although, as already stated, my positionality in relation to the participants would vary from person to person, depending on the quality of the interpersonal relationship developed, I believe to have obtained the trust of most of the participants. This was

---

[47] This may also relate to the strict role ascription based on age and the extensive use of kinship metaphors among Pakistanis (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018; Shaw, 2000)

obtained through showing a deep interest in what the participants were saying and doing, by sharing some information about myself and my background, and by showing respect for the cultural codes of the encounters, both by way of dress and way of conduct. This has also been discussed in section 3.3 of this chapter.

One aspect relating to my position as an outsider, which could potentially reduce the reliability of the empirical material, is language. Although all the participants in this study were able to express themselves relatively clearly, there was some variation among the participants when it comes to their fluency in Norwegian. Moreover, some of them stated that it was difficult for them to understand my South West Norwegian regional dialect. Thus, there is a possibility that misunderstandings may have occurred during the interview. Nonetheless, I do perceive that they were all able to comprehend most of my questions, and that they could also express themselves in a certain degree of clarity in the interviews. I would rephrase the questions they did not understand. Another way of strengthening the reliability of the interview in these kinds of interview situations is to engage in a process of verifying interpretations with the participants (Kvale & Brinkman, 2009; Merriam et al, 2001). In my interviews, I continuously engaged in such a practice, by asking the participants about different topics in different ways, to check for inconsistencies, as well as verifying that my understandings and interpretations were accurate. I also, as mentioned earlier, transcribed all the interviews myself, and listened through the tape recordings of my interviews several times to make sure that my transcriptions were accurate.

6.3 Generalisability[48]

The question of generalisation in qualitative research is a much-debated issue (see for example Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Payne & Williams, 2005; Gobo, 2008). If we apply the standards of quantitative methods – with the aim of statistical generalisation based on probability sampling – findings from qualitative studies cannot be generalised. According to Flybjerg (2006) this constitutes the source of the conventional wisdom about qualitative research and case studies in particular. According to this

---

[48] I use the concept of generalisability and generalisation interchangeably.

conventional wisdom, case studies are useful – not for the production of general knowledge, but rather as pilot studies to produce hypotheses to be tested through quantitative approaches (Flyvbjerg, 2006).

Flyvbjerg (2006) dismisses this conventional wisdom, arguing that a great deal of general knowledge and many scientific advancements have been made through single case studies, both in the social sciences and the natural sciences. He uses the example of Galileo's rejection of Aristotle's law of gravity of to prove his point. Galileo's rejection of Aristotle's law of gravity has been a great scientific advancement – but his proposition was not verified through a number of random samples – rather it was verified through a single case study, adopting a strategic selection of cases (Flyvbjerg, 2006). Thus, based on this example Flybjerg (2006) argues that it is highly possible to generalise on the basis of single case studies, but what can be generalised from the case study depends on the strategic selection of case and how these cases are delineated throughout the process of the study.

There are still strong disagreements about the generalisability of, and how one should generalise from, qualitative studies. For instance, Lincoln & Guba (1985) argue that since generalisation rests on the premise that findings are universal, and enduring, rather than situational and contextual, qualitative studies should not be conducted with the aim of generalisation. Instead, they propose that the concept of transferability should replace the concept of generalisation. Through providing thick contextual descriptions of a phenomenon in question, the reader becomes equipped to assess whether the contextual description is transferrable to a different context (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 39).

According to Gobo (2012, p.9), the position taken by Lincoln & Guba lowers the ambition for qualitative research and runs the risk of reinforcing the understanding that qualitative studies can produce interesting results, but that these results are limited in scope. He goes on to argue that most qualitative and case study research makes some sort of claim of generalisability, either purposefully or unknowingly. Regarding the case study he draws upon the argument made by Gomm, Hammersley & Foster (2000, p. 104) that "cases must be cases of something" – meaning that the

case always refers to some general category or group. They argue that the uniqueness of the case is defined based on notions of what is common to, or representative of a more general phenomenon, group, or population. Thus, both empirical generalisation and theoretical inferences can – and should be – made in qualitative case studies (Gobo, 2012; Gomm et al., 2000). However, how these generalisations are made – and to what populations, situations or events – findings from one case study can be generalised depends upon case selection, and the ongoing process of casing throughout the research process (Gobo, 2012; Gomm et al, 2000). Consequently, generalisation from qualitative case study research applies an analytical rather than a statistical logic – thereby it is often referred to as analytical generalisation (Flyvbjerg, 2006; Halkier, 2011) I now turn to the question of generalisation in this study.

As already established, the possibilities of generalisation from case studies depends upon the strategic and systematic selection of cases (Flyvbjerg,2006; Gobo, 2008; Gomm et al,2000). Moreover, as Gomm et al (2000) argue, the case selection should be conducted based on knowledge about the case and of the population from which the case has been selected. Researchers should account for the range of heterogeneity in the population and account for what the cases in the particular study stand for in relation to this population. As already been described in previous sections of this chapter the case selection of this study has been based both on contextual knowledge of the cases. This contextual knowledge encompasses the available knowledge of the population of ageing migrants in Norway in general, including their education, occupations, health situation and utilisation of social care services – and, in particular, the available knowledge of Pakistani and Polish migrants. Thus, my sampling criteria have been developed aimed at taking account of the heterogeneity of the population of ageing migrants in the study. Moreover, particular dimensions such as gender, health situation and resources available were embedded in the selection criteria, both in order to account for this heterogeneity, and also based on knowledge that these dimensions are particularly important for the experiences of ageing (Moen, 2011). However, as has also been described in detail in this chapter, recruitment issues lead to quite a different sample of participants than what was originally planned. This means that the focus of study has shifted slightly, for

instance from experiences with home-based care services being the prime focus – to focusing on experiences with the welfare state more broadly. Moreover, the unevenness of the sample in terms of gender, and the relative resourcefulness of the participants in this study means that the heterogeneity of the population from which this case study focusses on is not fully accounted for. Does this mean that this study does not have value beyond producing knowledge about the experience of ageing among the persons that have participated in this study?

I would argue that the findings from this study are generalisable – if we apply the logics of analytical generalisation Firstly because, as Gomm et al (2000) argue, in populations with substantial heterogeneity, the cases selected can never preserve all the features of the whole. Consequently, the case is a "(…) fragment with a distinctive location that shapes its character" (Gomm et al, 2000, p.108). Consequently, the population that this case study can say something general about is not necessarily the entire population of ageing migrants in Norway, or the population of Polish and Pakistani older migrants, but rather about ageing migrants who are relatively resourceful.

I would argue that the study contains characteristics of what Flyvbjerg (2006, p. 230) describes as a "critical case", and what Gobo (2008, p. 9) characterises as "emblematic cases". Arguably, the resourcefulness of the ageing migrants in this study means that it can be regarded as a critical case (Flybjerg, 2006) particularly related to exploring the vulnerabilities of ageing migrants. Flyvbjerg (2006, p. 230) defines a critical case as a case that has strategic importance for the general problem, because they allow for logical deduction such as "if this is valid for this case than it is valid for all or most of the cases". Applied to the aforementioned vulnerabilities of ageing migrants, the assumption can be made that if a person who possessed good competence in the Norwegian language, who has close ties to family members, and a strong social ties to other social networks describes strong feelings of loneliness, or other types of disadvantage, there is a strong likelihood that this is also the case for ageing migrants who are not in possession of these resources.

More importantly, I believe that the findings in this study produces general knowledge also in a different manner than only representing a critical case for exploring vulnerabilities of ageing migrants. The cases chosen for comparison have been chosen because they are considered to represent some significant features of the phenomenon in question. Thus, I argue that the cases in this study represent emblematic cases (Gobo, 2008). In the words of Gobo (2008, p.9) generalisation based on emblematic cases:

> (…) concerns more general structures and is detached from individual social practices, of which they are only an instance. In other words, the scholar does not generalize the individual case or event, which as Weber stressed is unrepeatable, but the key structural features of which it is made up of, and which are to be found in other cases belonging to the same species or class

In this sense, it is not the individual cases that are generalised; rather it is the theoretical inferences drawn from these individual cases, which represents more than just the case or cases in question, because they are able to illuminate some key features of the experiences of ageing in place in a transnational context. By extension, each chapter of analysis illustrates some key dimensions of these experiences. In the first chapter of analysis the key feature that is explored is how expectations and practices in relation to family obligations – caregiving in particular – are negotiated in a transnational context. This transnational context comprises – on the one hand, a context where caregiving for older people is normatively framed as a family issue – to a context where the state takes on a large part of the responsibility of providing care for older people, on the other. The second chapter of analysis explores the key structural feature of ageing migrants and their relation to the welfare state, and the ambivalences embedded in these relationships. The third, and last chapter of analysis, examines the key feature of ageing migrants' social embeddedness, and the meanings of this social embeddedness for their roles and identifications in later life. Placing the experience of ageing in the context of the migrant's individual life course also provides general knowledge of how dimensions such as gender, class, as well as

former life experiences may influence the experiences of transnational ageing in place.

7. Ethical considerations

In research involving direct contact with the people who are studied ethical reflections must be done in every stage of the research project – from the initial study design to writing the research report. The study has been reported to the Norwegian center of research data (NSD) and adheres to the formal demands of research ethics. This includes obtaining the participant's free and informed consent and providing them with information that the consent can be withdrawn from the study.

In the process of participant observation, the issue of consent was slightly more difficult. As stated earlier, the participant observation took place in public or semipublic settings. In these situations, it would be impossible for me provide information about the study to everyone present – and thereby gaining consent to be there. In these situations, however, I did not get any information about the people present, which could be considered sensitive. Rather the purpose of these observations was to gain insights into the rhythm of daily life – and the nature of the activities and interactions amongst older migrants. In situations where I took part in or observed people`s conversations, they were informed orally about the purpose of my presence – and that they were free to ask me to leave if they were not comfortable with me being there. Although the participants were informed about this, I was never asked to leave the settings in which I observed.

Ability to give informed consent is often a topic when researching older and potentially vulnerable people (Kenyon, 1996). This issue relates to whether the research subject can be perceived as vulnerable or not. In this study the informants are not perceived of as particularly vulnerable. Most of them are highly educated and are considered very resourceful along other dimensions.

It is also necessary to consider ethical issues in relation to the recruitment process, particularly when recruitment has taken place through gatekeepers or through existing

participants suggesting other participants. The issue of informed consent is also relevant here. If one participant gives information about a third person considered to be eligible for participation, this information may often be given without the consent of the third person (Andrews & Vassenden, 2007). In my study, the recruitment did not occur in this way. Rather, the participants who were eager to assist me in finding other participants took it upon themselves to contact these people on my behalf – thereby acting more as a research assistants – taking the time to reflect on which people could be interested in participating, contacting them and asking them if they were interested in participating. Thus, I was only given information about new potential participants after they had agreed to take part in the study.

The other challenge related to this form of recruitment concerns the issue of ensuring anonymity. As some of the participants in the study were nominated by others, and hence part of each other's network, the risk of them being recognisable to one another in the publication of results may be great. The employment of different recruitment strategies and aiming to recruit from different channels at different points in time potentially reduces the risk of the identity of the participants being revealed.

There are also other challenges relating to the issue of anonymity in qualitative research, such as this study. The balance between providing rich and contextual descriptions of the participants and ensuring their anonymity is a fine one (Alver & Øyen, 1997). Sometimes the researcher should alter the information of participants to ensure their anonymity. However, as a general guideline, information that has importance for the interpretations of the findings should not be omitted or altered (Alver & Øyen, 1997). In this study, I have altered or omitted some information about the participants, which were not relevant for the analysis. The names of the participants are given in pseudonyms and the exact age of the participants and information about where they live have been omitted. Details about the participants' education and employment trajectories have also been omitted. However, I have given information about their level of education and information about what types of employment they have had in Norway in general terms.

 In the interview situation it is important to treat the interviewees with politeness and respect. An important principle is to avoid inflicting harm on the interviewee by probing them about issues that are sensitive and emotionally challenging, without then being able to aid in therapeutic processing of these subjects (Tjora, 2012). During the interviews, I sometimes experienced that interviewees brought up topics that were sensitive and emotionally challenging for them. Some of the interviewees used the interview as part of their reflection and processing of their lives, including events that have been challenging, and decisions made which they have come to question later. What the researcher can do in these situations may vary and is often a question of discretion. I was careful to ask the interviewee if he or she wanted to end the interview. However, none of the participants wanted that. Rather, we took breaks when topics that were difficult were brought up – and they were given the opportunity to decide for themselves when they were ready to continue the interview. I also told them that they did not have to tell me anything they were not comfortable with sharing. Towards the end of the interview, I also asked them how they felt about the interview, and most of them stated they considered it a positive experience. In fact, one of the interviewees conveyed that she had been skeptical towards participation in the study because she was afraid it would be too tiresome, and that she was surprised that the interview had been such a pleasant experience.

7.1 Responsibility

Bikova (2017) lists some questions that are important throughout the research process, which relate to the issue of the researcher's responsibility towards participants, towards the research community, and to society. The questions involve the potential outcome of the research, who might be interested in research findings, who would benefit from the research and whether the research can potentially harm anyone.

Objections have been raised regarding the issue of researching ethnic minority groups and immigrants, arguing that this type of research often runs the risk of stigmatising and essentialising the minority groups in question (Alver & Øyen, 1997). In relation to ageing migrants, Torres (2006) has argued that the research on older migrants and

social care in Sweden has been involved in constructing these older migrants as homogenous, vulnerable, having special needs, and thus as being a problem for care practitioners. She characterises these constructions as a process of othering – emphasising the older migrant's differences from the (often-invisible) Swedish majority.

As I have argued elsewhere, I have attempted to counter such a stereotypical othering depiction of the migrants in several different ways. First of all, the combination of an intersectional perspective and a biographical approach serves to challenge assumptions of a uniform experience of ageing as a migrant, by locating the experiences and practices in relation to the migrants individual life courses (which are shaped by the intersection of national background, class and gender to name a few). Moreover, throughout the analysis I have focused on presenting variations in the empirical material – and how this is illustrative of ongoing processes of negotiations of norms, practices, and identities in a transnational social context. By doing so, I have strived to avoid a depiction of migrants as containers of a static culture which is transported from their respective countries of origin[49]. Lastly, the fact that the ageing migrants in this study may be considered to be relatively resourceful along several dimensions, may serve to challenge and nuance the overall impression of vulnerabilities, while at the same time highlighting in what ways and under what circumstances resourceful ageing migrants may also have had experiences with vulnerabilities and marginalisation.

In sum, a central aim of this study has been to gain insight into the experiences of an under researched group in society – from their own perspective. This can then potentially inform policy makers and practitioners in the field. Thus, a central aim and idea underpinning the study was that it might benefit participants of the study by

---

[49] This has also been the purpose of the contextual descriptions of Pakistan and Poland in chapter 2, where I have described how Pakistani and Polish societies are continuously changing.

enabling their voices to be heard, and that insights from the study furthers our understanding of the ageing experiences of migrants in Norway.

Chapter 5. Migratory Family care

1. Introduction

The aim of this chapter is to explore how older migrants negotiate cultural expectations of family care and support while ageing in place in Norway.

As already described in Chapter 2 on contextual backgrounds, although there are significant variations between how care is organised, the shared common feature between Pakistan and Poland is that family care represents the dominant mode for provision of care for older people. In Norway, state provided care for older people constitutes the dominant mode of provision, and family members play a supporting role, albeit a significant one. In Norway state provision of care for older people is based on an aim of securing people's independence from both market forces and family members (Christensen & Wærness, 2018).

In light of the concept of transnationalism as a mode of cultural reproduction these modes of provision are regarded as parts of the cultural repertoires which the migrants draw upon while negotiating family care and support in Norway. This understanding thus accentuates how cultural expectations of family care, as well as actual care practices develop through a combination of values and traditions (whether real or imagined) from Poland and Pakistan on the one hand, and the Norwegian values, traditions and official policies in relation to ageing on the other hand. Thus, the chapter looks at how older migrants from Poland and Pakistan draw from and combine cultural repertoires surrounding family care from both their countries of origin and Norway, as their place of settlement. Moreover, the practices of care and support are regarded as the results of negotiations within the family – negotiations which are shaped by broader social and economic forces.

In a life course perspective, the negotiations of care and support within the family are regarded as contextually located in the migrants' personal life courses and shaped by broader cultural, social, and economic forces. The life course principle of linked lives is particularly important here – whereby older migrants' expectations and practices with regards to family care is regarded as interlinked with the life courses of family

members, and with the life courses of adult children in particular. This means that the care practices which emerge are not only a result of older migrant's expectations of family care, but is also based on feelings of moral obligations to care among adult children, and internal family negotiations about what kinds of care and support should be provided, and who should provide it. Finch and Mason (1993) argue that these negotiations are based upon the historical development of interpersonal relationships within the family – negotiations that consider past, present, and anticipated future exchanges of care and support. In this chapter, the negotiations as a concept is used to highlight the intergenerational negotiations of family arrangements and provisions of care and support as they are described by the ageing migrants in this study. Moreover, provisions of care and support within the family also depends upon opportunities to provide care – opportunities which are shaped by a number of different institutional and organisational structures, in particular the demands of the labour market and the gendered division of labour.

As described in chapter 2, on contextual backgrounds, the ideal form of family life in Pakistan involves a patriarchal extended household with complementary roles assigned to each family member. Pakistani society is highly gender segregated, where women have important roles in the private sphere, while men constitute the financial provider of the family. The extended family household is often organised according to principles of patrilocality, entailing that upon a son's marriage the daughter-in-law moves into the household of her husband's parents and provides care for dependent older people and children (Shaw,2000; Qadeer,2006).

During State Socialism in Poland, women were expected to undertake paid work outside of the household. Public arrangements in relation to childcare were organised, but not in relation to care for older people. The expectation of female participation in the labour market existed alongside the continued prevalence of traditional gender norms within the household and family. Thus, women experienced a double burden, where they continued to perform most of the domestic tasks, and care for children and older people (Stenning, 2005). The strong influence of the Catholic Church combined with the neoliberal economic restructuring taking place in Poland after

1989 has brought about a strengthening of the male breadwinner model (Pascall & Lewis, 2004).

The occupational structure and gendered division of labour in Norway, is of special importance in shaping the life courses of ageing migrants' adult children, including their opportunity to provide intergenerational care and support (Wingens et al, 2011). As described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, public provision of care for older people in Norway has been developed partly in order to alleviate both men and women from caregiving responsibilities within the family, and thus facilitate their participation in the labour market. This is important because paid work is regarded as the pillar of the Norwegian welfare state (Kildal & Kunhle, 2005). However, there is a gendered division in relation to who performs the informal unpaid caregiving tasks in the family, whereby women are still performing most of the unpaid care work for children and older people (Berge, Øien & Jakobsson, 2014;Ellingsæter, 2006).

In the chapter, these institutional structures are regarded as important in shaping how older migrants' expectations and practices of family care are negotiated. This entails not only negotiations of who should provide care, but also negotiations of what kinds of – and the amounts of – care and support that should be provided. The chapter thus explores the following researching questions: How do older migrants' expectations for care and support in later life develop at the intersection between norms and customs from their countries of origin, and Norway, as their country of residence? What care practices – i.e. what forms of care and support – are exchanged within the family? How do expectations and practices in relation to family care influence the older migrants' overall subjective experience of ageing in Norway?

Based on biographical interview material, I present a selection of cases. Each case illustrates different forms of family arrangements and family care practices. The aim of the case presentation is to contextualise the older migrants' expectations and experiences of family care in terms of their relationships with family members, and in terms of gender and class. In addition, I find it important to contextualise their expectations in relation to their overall of experience of being a migrant in Norway.

Given that there is significant complementarity between formal and informal care, the chapter inevitably touches upon the topic of formal care services. However, an in-depth analysis of the uses and experiences of formal care services will be provided in chapter 6.

The chapter starts by describing expectations and practices of family care and support among the Pakistani participants, before describing expectations and experiences of family care and support among the Polish participants in the study.

2. The Pakistani older migrants

2.1 Strategies for maintaining tradition

As described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, Qadeer (2006, p.190) distinguishes between the ideal form of family life, and the reality of family life in Pakistani. The ideal of family life consists of joint family living comprising the conjugal households of older family members, as well as sons and daughters and their spouses – all living under the same roof, sharing incomes, property, and household tasks. The Pakistani participants in this study seems to relate to a modified form of this ideal by expressing a strong appreciation of and adherence to the tradition of joint residence, where three generations live together in the same household and where adult children care for them in times of need. In fact, intergenerational family living – combined with reciprocal exchanges of care and support – seems to be an agreed upon ideal, of which most of the older migrants from Pakistan refers to. However, maintaining the ideal of family life comprising joint living arrangements, and reciprocal exchanges of care and support, in Norway can be a challenge. The following case, the case of Ashwariya, serves to illustrate some of the struggles and strategies involved in maintaining the tradition of family care among the older Pakistani migrants in Norway.

Ashwariya is a 65-year-old woman, whom I interviewed in her home. Ashwariya came to Norway at the age of 23, in 1976. She came through the Norwegian family reunification scheme, to reunite with her husband who had migrated to Norway a few years before she came. When Ashwariya came to Norway, she entered Norwegian

classes and quickly after got a job in a local shop. Upon the birth of her son, she decided to quit her job because she wanted to concentrate on raising him. During the interview, she said that she could never get back the time when her son was a child, emphasising how important the decision to be at home with him has been for her. During this time, her husband had established a small business, which turned out to be very lucrative. Thus, their economic situation enabled Ashwariya to quit her job, and concentrate on caring. When her son started school, she got a new job part-time, which she had to leave because her mother became diagnosed with dementia. Her mother lived in Pakistan at the time, but they applied for family reunification and her mother moved to Norway to live with Ashwariya and her family. Because of the severity of the mother's dementia Ashwariya and her family decided to apply for a place in a care institution. However, Ashwariya felt very guilty for not caring for her herself, so she eventually decided that her mother should move back in with them. At the time, her mother needed care around the clock. Ashwariya organised for home nursing once a day, to assist with her mother's personal hygiene. In addition, her friends and extended kin tried to help as much as they could. Still Ashwariya had the main responsibility. Her son was doing military service at the time and was unable to help. However, he did help when he was on military leave. He would sleep on a sofa outside of his grandmother's room so that he could assist her if she needed help through the night. This provided Ashwariya with opportunities to get a good night's sleep. Her mother died in 1999. Although the care she provided for her mother was toilsome for her and her family, Ashwariya described it as having been part of her family obligation, and states that she can now live her life without having a guilty conscience.

At the time of the interview, Ashwariya shared a house with her husband, adult son, and his wife, who is also from Pakistan. Thus, they have maintained a joint family living arrangement in Norway. Ashwariya and her husband lived at the top floor, while her son and daughter in law lived at the ground floor. Large houses near a city centre are rather expensive. Thus, Ashwariya and her family's opportunity to maintain this living arrangement means they have the financial resources to do so, which stems from owning a relatively successful business in Norway.

Before marrying his current wife, Ashwariya's son was married to a native Norwegian woman. According to Ashwariya this marriage did not work out because the Norwegian wife was not willing to assume the responsibilities involved in being part of a Pakistani family – including the maintenance of joint living arrangements and a strong sense of family unity:

> Ashwariya: "There was a tragedy in our family that my son has been married twice. He married a Norwegian girl and the first six months it went okay but she was a bit more preoccupied with our traditions and stuff and clothes and stuff. Although I talked with her before they got married and told her that it is not only clothes and things you wear – marriage is – you have to understand each other and if you are to marry my son than you have to take some responsibility. It is your life and we do not want to interfere but still in our society because we often live together especially if you are an only child. I even told my son that he is free and 'if you want to you can live alone', but he said 'no mum, now it is my turn, and if we live in the first floor and you in the second you won't disturb us. But I cannot – I want to see you every day and if she wants to cook herself and everything then she can but what I can't do is think of you sitting alone evenings in winter and looking at each other – that I can't. I want to be with you'. Even if we did not disturb them and told them it was their decision it did not go so well - and after a year and half they were divorced. Now he got married in Pakistan and she has a master's degree in English and is a very nice girl. We take good care of her and she has freedom to do what she wants".

This excerpt illustrates how maintenance of the ideal family, and cultural expectations of family care depends upon negotiations between generations in the family. The above account illustrates some of the tensions involved in such negotiations – as different parties have different opinions regarding what family commitments to take on, and what constitutes the boundaries of family unity. In this case the woman whom Ashwariya's son was to marry was, according to Ashwariya, only interested in their cultural customs in terms of food and clothes – customs that are often celebrated, and considered positive aspects of diversity (Hagelund, 2002). However, she did not understand what kinds of responsibilities being a member of a Pakistani family entails. Ashwariya does not specify what kinds of responsibilities being a member of a Pakistani family are entailed for her son and her daughter-in-law, other than the importance of living under the same roof and maintaining a certain level of family unity. Thus, care in this regard involve emotional and social

support, which is provided through living under the same roof, and making sure Ashwariya and her husband would not feel lonely. According to Ashwariya, her son was very devoted to maintaining this arrangement. His statement of "no mum, now it's my turn", indicates an awareness of the normative ideal of reciprocity – the notion that adult children should be there and provide care and support for their ageing parents in return for the care that they have received in earlier stages of their life course. The first daughter-in-law, Ashwariya supposed, was unwilling to adopt such a tradition and, in her eyes, this was the reason for their divorce[50].

In the Pakistani migrant community, divorce is viewed negatively, and is often a source of shame and stigma for the entire family (Shaw, 2000; Charsley & Liversage, 2013). In the interview with Ashwariya this is illustrated by her referral to her son's divorce as "a great tragedy", even though it eventually turned out well. Her son recently got married in Pakistan to a Pakistani girl, who came to Norway as a family migrant. She has grown up in Pakistan, and she is therefore presumed to be more committed to the Pakistani traditions of family life. This marriage was possible due to continued transnational ties to Pakistan, and these transnational ties, thus facilitated the maintenance of tradition – in terms of both joint living arrangements, and mutual assistance.

Ashwariya has arthritis and asthma. Other than calling upon her general practitioner as required, regular hospital checkups, and physical therapy, she does not receive any form of long-term care in her day-to-day life. When questioned about the possibility of applying for long-term care services, she states that she does not want to, because she does not want to be a burden to the Norwegian state. At the time of the interview, both Ashwariya's husband and her son, had paid work. Her daughter-in-law did not have paid work in Norway, but was in enrolled in a Norwegian language course, and had plans to continue her studies at a Norwegian university.

---

[50] The actual reasons and circumstances leading to Ashwariya's son's divorce cannot be answered through the empirical material in this study, nor is it an aim. The importance is not the actual reasons for divorce, but how Ashwariya understands and accounts for the reasons as a reluctance to comply with Pakistani family values.

Ashwariya relies on her daughter-in-law for support. For instance, she assists her with getting out of bed on days when her arthritis is particularly painful. Her daughter in law also assists around the house with tasks such as cooking and cleaning. Consequently, the gendered division of labour which is common in Pakistan – where men are responsible for matters outside the household, while women are responsible for household tasks – is maintained, at least for the time being.

Ashwariya describes the relationship with her daughter-in-law as a reciprocal care relationship. In return for her help at home, Ashwariya and her husband help their daughter-in-law adjust to life in Norway, such as helping her with her Norwegian language training. She describes the relationship as very loving, and to illustrate this she says that her daughter in law refers to her as "mum".

Ashwariya's description of her relationships and position within her family highlights how transnational migration can be regarded as a way of maintaining Pakistani traditions of family care and support. While ageing in place in Norway, she is embedded in a transnational context, involving an intergenerational circle of reciprocal care within the family. In Ashwariya's case, the cultural expectations of family care have been maintained through transnational migration, first by her mother migrating to Norway to be cared for by her daughter, and then through the marriage migration of her daughter-in-law.

Throughout her adult life, Ashwariya seems to have had a strong sense-of-self associated with caregiving, both for her son and for her mother. This in turn constitutes a reflection of gender roles and gendered life courses – which for Ashwariya has revolved around care. This interpretation is in line with findings from Gardner's (2002) study of ageing migrants from Bangladesh in London. Gardner (2002) finds that while the male interviewees in her study tended to accentuate their lives as workers, the women tended to highlight their roles as providers of care for children, ageing parents, and spouses. Utilising a narrative analytical approach, Gardner (2002) interprets these differences in relation to different gendered life course experiences, but also as attempts at constructing specific masculine and feminine identities. In this understanding, Ashwariya's description of her role in her

son's upbringing, her care for her mother, and also her role in relation to her son's first marriage serves to accentuate her role as a cultural transmitter, while at the same time enabling her to assert a feminine identity couched in ideals of nurture and caring.

The case of Ashwariya illustrates several different dimensions involved in maintaining Pakistani traditions and customs in in a Norwegian context. Firstly, it illustrates – in line with research on older Turkish migrants in Denmark (Liversage, 2016) – how transnational ties may be used as a resource for maintaining the Pakistani practice of joint living and family care in Norway. While being physically located in Norway, Ashwariya is embedded in a transnational social space where care needs are met and managed, amongst other things, through the physical relocation of people. First through her mother's migration to Norway to receive care, and later through her son's marriage to a girl from Pakistan – who has moved to Norway to live with her husband and parents-in-law. Ashwariya's involvement in her son's choice of marriage partner – may also be understood in terms of gender roles. Women are often assigned the social role of intergenerational transmitters of cultural traditions, customs, songs, and language (mother tongue) (Yuyal-Davis, 1998). In Pakistani migrant communities, many women are in charge of securing a marriage partner for their children that will enable the maintenance of family caregiving arrangements (Moen, 2002; Shaw, 2004). Finding a marriage partner from Pakistan, who has been socialised into Pakistani values and customs is one way to ensure this. Secondly, the quality of the interpersonal relationship, particularly between Ashwariya and her son may have contributed to her son's sense of moral obligation to his parents. However, the gendered division of labour is striking here. Ashwariya points to her son's sense of obligation and commitment to her and her husband. However, in practice it is the daughter-in-law who engages in actual caregiving, through helping Ashwariya get out of bed, and assisting with cooking and cleaning.

According to Glucksmann & Lyon (2006) the labour of care may sometimes become hidden when it is absorbed within the normal day-to-day domestic activities. This may particularly be the case when care work is performed within the confines of joint

living arrangements, whereby the care provider forms part of the household. Ashwariya states that she does not want to apply for any formal care services, because she does not want to be a burden on the state but does not perceive herself as a burden to her daughter-in-law. This illustrates that the care she receives from her daughter in law, is not perceived as work in the same manner as formal care would have been, but rather as a natural part of everyday life, and something which is undertaken based on reciprocal ties of love and affection.

Thirdly, the economic situation of the family has enabled them to buy a house which is big enough for intergenerational living, meet the maintenance requirement which serves as precondition for family reunification, and be economically self-sufficient through the income of the men in the family.

Although the road towards Ashwariya's current life situation has been fraught with tensions, Ashwariya is very content with the way it eventually turned out. However, as the next section will show, in some situations trying to maintain traditions of family care may come into conflict with the way of life of adult children, something that in turn may manifest itself in psychological distress.

2.2 Conflicting traditions and practices

Noman is a 75-year-old man, he came to Norway from a rural area of Punjab in 1972. He was 33 years old when he came. Before retiring he had several manual occupations, but he had to retire early due to health problems. Today, he has heart problems, visual impairments, and general old age-related health problems.

Noman has three sons. One of them is living and working in Canada, whilst another of his sons lives in a different city in Norway. He lives with his wife, oldest son, daughter-in-law and two grandsons. His son and daughter in law have demanding jobs and work long hours.

Noman describes an ordinary day in his life as one of waking up early, having breakfast prepared by his daughter-in-law. Then he watches television until his son and daughter-in-law come back from work after about nine-ten hours. A few days a

week, he attends meetings in the Norwegian Pakistani association for older people. I shall return to the meanings of such meeting places for older migrants in chapter 7.

His wife also has health problems and does not want to go outside out of fear of slipping and falling. In the interview, he describes feeling like a caged bird always watching over his family members and their different activities. He also expresses concerns about what would happen if he and his wife were to collapse or die, while their son and daughter-in-law are at work. His wife has poor Norwegian language skills and would have difficulties with, among other things, calling an ambulance. Noman has experienced this firsthand. A few years prior to the interview, he collapsed due to acute renal failure. His wife had to call their daughter-in-law and ask her to call an ambulance. The situation which Noman described can also be found among other older migrants – and especially among older women who come from a cultural context characterised by traditional gender norms. They often have poor skills in the language of the new country and must rely on language support to interact with health care services in the new country (Liversage, 2016). This means that the informal care needs of older migrants ageing in place, may sometimes include an added dimension of language support, in relation to health care providers and other public agencies (Liversage, 2016).

Like Ashwariya, Noman and his wife also adhere to the Pakistani tradition of extended family living and receiving care and support from family members. As with Ashwariya, he describes his daughter-in-law as the one responsible for providing him and his wife with care and support. However, unlike Ashwariya, Noman does not express a notion that this constitutes the ideal way of family life, or the ideal way of organising care and support in later life explicitly. In his account this seems more taken for granted – a result of habit – rather than something which is consciously reflected upon. This may also indicate a difference in gender roles, whereby Ashwariya as a woman has a role of being a cultural transmitter, thereby also being responsible for the maintenance of cultural practices in situations where these cultural practices come into contact with new ones. Noman does not have this responsibility, and the practices of family care thereby takes on a natural or taken for granted form.

Noman's life situation is also different from that of Ashwariya on other accounts. Both his son and daughter-in-law were born in Norway and are incorporated into Norwegian mainstream society. Both have paid jobs, and their children are involved in different leisure time activities, which take up much of their time. This reflects a common pattern among descendants of immigrants of Pakistani origin, whereby increased labour market participation – particularly among women means they are subject to the competing demands of family and paid work (Nadim, 2017). This shapes their ability to provide care for old and dependent family members according to tradition (Ingebretsen, 2010). Consequently, the state of ageing migrants as in-between – being located between two sociocultural contexts and lifeways – is particularly salient in the case of Noman. He is located between a tradition of intergenerational living and dependence on family care, and the lifestyles of his son and daughter-in-law, who have to juggle the demands of their workplace, raising their children, and providing for the needs of Noman and his wife. Thus, the life situation of Noman demonstrates the potential outcome of a conflict between maintaining a Pakistani tradition of family care and the everyday lives of their adult children who were born in Norway. Noman's adult children – whilst they attend to traditional Pakistani care and family duties – also must juggle the demands of working life, and the care responsibilities for their own children. Although his son and daughter in law are doing their best, their employment situation and bringing their children to and from various leisure time activities leaves Noman and his wife alone for most of the day.

During the interview Noman also vocalised concerns about his own and his wife's personal safety:

> Noman: "Yes, they, she [the daughter-in-law] does the best she can, but still – from 8am to 6pm and that's ten hours then nobody can help us, and we are left alone if anything should happen. And if I were to go outside and for example and go back after two or three hours and my wife is dead, and I call the police. You know what will happen they will ask if I killed her. And she is old as old as me and has problems with her chest and knees, and I am also weak. If something happens and I am not home than it is an extra problem you know for us –our family – that`s something we learn from our, or we read in the newspaper that it is often like that"

Being alone for most of the day is quite common amongst older people in Norway. Statistics show that the degree of social contact in old age diminishes due to widowhood and poor health. Many older people in Norway also live alone (Eurostat, 2015), and only have weekly contact with family and friends (Thorsen & Clausen, 2009). What is special about Noman's situation is that he and his wife are alone most parts of the day even though they live with their adult son, daughter-in-law, and grandchildren. This indicates that intergenerational living and family care – what is perceived by many of the older Pakistani migrants as the ideal – does not necessarily provide a buffer for feelings of social isolation and loneliness. This all depends upon the capacity of family members to provide the care that is required.

Moreover, Noman mentions that he is anxious about being rendered suspect if anything were to happen to his wife. These fears may relate to a general stigmatisation process – whereby so-called non-western and Muslim men are portrayed as criminals, violent, and largely oppressive towards women. These gendered ethnic stereotypes are quantitatively dominating in Norwegian public discourse – and figures as prominent themes in Norwegian mainstream media (Hagelund, 2002). Noman is concerned that he might become subject to this stigma if his wife were to collapse and die. This finding is in line with findings from a study of Somali refugees' relation to the Norwegian Labour and Welfare Administration (Nav). In this study Friberg & Elgvin (2016) finds that the general stigmatisation that the Somalis were subject to in mainstream media made them insecure about whether Nav employees would treat their cases differently due to prejudice. Thus, Noman's statements in the excerpt above demonstrates how experiences of stigma may manifest itself in mistrust of public institutions.

In the interview, I asked Noman about applying for any formal state provided support or services, and he responded:

> Noman: Well help from public places it is a bit slow.
>
> Interviewer: it is a bit slow, in what way?
>
> Noman: It is slow everywhere, ehm, hospitals or other agencies. For example, if I need help, I have a poor eyesight and hearing, and a bad knee. I have

transplanted a kidney and had heart surgery and I cannot even get a parking permit for disabled people, or if I need a man to take me places, again and again there is a rejection. Again, and again it is the same, also in other agencies. So, if I need help it is not so easy.

The experiences that Noman recounts of his encounter with the Norwegian welfare state is that the process of applying has been slow and inefficient, ultimately leading the rejection of his application time and again. Given his and his wife's health and family situation Noman would possibly be eligible for a safety alarm against an income-based patient's charge. However, the fact that he has not applied might suggest a lack of knowledge of the kinds of services that are available to him, or an impression that he might not get it anyways. This interpretation is consistent with the finding of Giuntoli & Cattan (2012) that older migrants assistance expectations and the way they go about solving practical problems are based upon their knowledge and information of available services. Living with adult children and expecting them to provide them with care and support, may also thwart Noman and his wife's inclination to explore their options for receiving any public assistance in daily life. This interpretation is in line with findings presented by Shaw (2004). She argues that cultural expectations of family care, means that some older migrants do not explore other options, and therefore possess a lack of information about available formal care services.

In their study of the disadvantages faced by female informal care providers from Bangladesh, Ahmed & Jones (2008) find that their experience of disadvantage is shaped by the intersection of cultural and structural factors. They find that the women held strong feelings of duty and obligation derived from religious and, more specifically, Islamic beliefs. However, these caregiving obligations were also shaped by the women's encounters with welfare providers. In encounters with welfare providers these women lacked resources in terms of language skills, but also know-how in relation to the tacit and informal rules of welfare provision.

Drawing inspiration from these findings, Noman's current situation may be understood as shaped by several different interacting dimensions. Firstly, the tradition of intergenerational living and family care, in a situation where adult children lack the

opportunity to provide care according to the needs and desires of their older parents. Secondly, perceived negative experiences of welfare providers, leading to assumptions that welfare benefits and services are hard – perhaps even impossible – to get. Thirdly, a reliance on misleading information from the sensational press. To Noman, this combination creates a situation of feelings of loneliness, boredom, and anxiety.

So far, we have seen that the ideal of the Pakistani family, including joint living arrangements and family care remains strong among families from Pakistan in Norway. We have also seen how this is organised as a form of negotiation within family members, and some of the tensions involved in both negotiations of – as well as– actual practices of family care. The following case – the case of Akbar – serves to illustrate the force of this ideal in shaping the Pakistani migrants' expectations for later life, even in situations where this ideal is practically unattainable. It also serves to illustrate how older Pakistani migrants often compare these ideal practices, with what they assume to be "the Norwegian way of doing things"- thus becoming even more appreciative of the value of these traditions

2.3 Becoming aware of the value of one's own traditions

Akbar is a 65-year-old Pakistani man. He came to Norway when he was 24 in 1973 as a labour migrant. His father was already in Norway, and his mother and younger brother had decided to travel to Norway, to reunite with his father. They gained legal residence through applying for family reunification. Akbar was too old to come to Norway as a family migrant, so he had to apply for a work permit to attain legal residence. In Norway Akbar has worked a great deal, sometimes taking on double shifts, and holding several different jobs simultaneously. Although he holds a bachelor's degree from Pakistan, he has mainly worked in manual occupations in Norway. During the interview, he also recounts several instances of what he perceives as prejudiced treatment and discrimination in encounters with native Norwegians.

When Akbar came to Norway, he initially shared an apartment with his parents and his younger brother. His mother had a bad eyesight caused by diabetes. During the

interview, he describes in detail his efforts to help his mother in daily life. For instance, in case his mother would need to use the bathroom at night, Akbar would make sure that all the doors in the apartment were open at so that she would not walk into them and injure herself. He particularly recalls one incident that made him aware of the importance of "collective living arrangements". At the time of the incident, his mother was in hospital and she shared a room with a native Norwegian woman:

> Akbar: I used to visit her both morning and evening and there was one day, one morning I was there and there was another patient in the room – a Norwegian woman and she was a very kind and nice woman you know. And yes, so my mother said that the doctor had come by and she [the Norwegian woman] had started crying and my mother could not ask her why she was crying. So, I went and asked her, and she told me that she had diabetes and her doctors had told her that she would lose her eyesight because of the diabetes. I told her that my mother has been visually impaired for several years. Then the woman started crying again and said that she knew my mother was visually impaired but she gets visits two-three people in the morning and two- three people in the evening and her [the Norwegian woman] son lived in Sweden and she had no one to visit her. And then I thought how important our collective living arrangements are.

In the interview excerpt above, an image of older Norwegian people as having to deal with their health difficulties alone and detached from family, serves to strengthen Akbar's belief in the importance of collective arrangements. Consequently, the excerpt illustrates how encounters with native Norwegians, and hearing about their experiences may sometimes serve as a frame of comparison that strengthen older Pakistani migrants' appreciation of their traditions from Pakistan.

Akbar's description of collective family arrangements is reiterated in many of the other interviews with older Pakistani migrants. Like Akbar's account, these traditions are phrased in collective terms, using words such as "our", "the Pakistani", or "we have these traditions". This indicates that the practices of joint family living, and family care is something that takes the form of what Finch and Mason (1993) conceptualise as normative obligations. Finch and Mason (1993) define normative obligations as cultural expectations and obligations which are collectively shared and upheld in a specific community – and as something which define the moral fabric of the community.

The finding that cultural expectations, joint family living, and care represents a normative obligation is consistent with findings from Næss & Vabø (2014). Based on focus groups and individual interviews, they find that the cultural expectations of family care are strong in the Pakistani migrant community. During the focus group interviews, the older Pakistani men were reluctant to disclose information about having to make use of formal care services. Having to make use of formal care services is often interpreted as being a result of not having raised their children properly. In the personal interviews, however, many expressed the need to be pragmatic about family obligations, as they might not have family members willing or able to provide for them in old age. Based on these findings, they suggest that family care is part of what defines the Pakistani migrant identity and community in Norway. Not having children available to care for them, and having to make use of formal care services, was not a topic of conversation. In consequence, not having children to care for them in line with tradition, may be considered a taboo subject, and a source of stigma within the community (Næss & Vabø, 2014, p.26).

In 1977, Akbar got married. At the time, Akbar was very much concerned with his career – as he had managed to find a job where he could use his education from Pakistan. Therefore, he and his wife wanted to postpone having children – and this postponement lasted until they no longer had the option of having children. Akbar describes not having children as a great source of sorrow and shame. When approaching the topic of children during the interview, he asks; "Have you ever heard of a Pakistani family who do not have any children?" The posing of this question during the interview may be understood in relation to the actual composition of Pakistani families, implying that not having children is uncommon and hence a kind of noncompliance with Pakistani family norms. Akbar's expression of shame and embarrassment of not having children may be understood in light of the life course concept of identity agency, which has been discussed in the chapter on theoretical frameworks. As already described, this concept refers to actions undertaken to fulfill a socially defined role or identity and attempts at fulfilling these roles and identities may be successful or unsuccessful (Elder & Hitlin, 2007). In the case of Akbar, not having children means that he is unable to fulfill the commitment to the socially

defined identity of a Pakistani older person. According to Elder and Hitlin (2007) this inability may manifest itself in shame because it becomes threatening to our sense of self. To Akbar, the failure to fulfill this identity commitment not only manifests itself in shame and embarrassment but also in a great sense of sorrow.

Akbar finds comfort in having a good and affectionate relationship with his nieces and nephews who live in Norway with his brother and he hopes that they will at least provide him with a good funeral when the time comes. However, he returns to the subject of not having children of his own several times in the interview – particularly when he talks about worries about future care needs. In their study of the well-being of older migrants in England, Grewal et. al. (2004, p. 747) came upon similar experiences as the one Akbar describes having. Being married and not having children means not having anyone who has a sense of duty and obligation to provide for them when they need care and is therefore conceived of with great sorrow and sadness. For Akbar, the fact of not having children to care for him has manifested itself in recurring periods of depression, sleeplessness, and anxiety. Moreover, because of not having children, and therefore not being able to stick to the traditional of family care and intergenerational living, Akbar must make use of formal care services. I shall return to his experiences with these formal care services in chapter 6.

In sum, Akbar's account serves to illustrate how practices of family care are changing. In Akbar's case these changes owe to practical circumstances – not having children makes it impossible to maintain the ideal of the Pakistani family, including joint living arrangements and family care. Although this ideal is practically unavailable for Akbar, he still values it highly, particularly when compared to the assumed Norwegian family values. In this comparison the contrast between what he assumes to be the Norwegian way of life – whereby later life is spent isolated from families, in cold and uncaring social settings, on the one hand – and the ideal of Pakistani family, on the other – comes to the fore, serving to further strengthen his idealisation of the Pakistani family. In the next section of this chapter I shall present a case – the case of Navid – which serves to illustrate how changes in cultural expectations of family care occurs – not only due to practical circumstances – but

also because migration brings about a new way of thinking about family life and exchanges of care and support within the family.

2.4 Cultural expectations of family care in flux

Although this study finds that norms of extended family living and family care is resilient among older Pakistani migrants in Norway, there are also cases where they are quite pragmatic about the organisation of family life. 6 of the Pakistani interviewees in this study, lives in nuclear households, and gets by with only receiving occasional assistance from their children, such as assistance with cleaning ahead of a social gathering in their home. Hence, although they are keenly aware of Pakistani norms and customs, they are also open to changes in these customs according to their children's life situations and preferences – which have simultaneously been shaped by their parent's values and traditions, and the mainstream Norwegian way of life.

 One example of this is Navid. Navid is a 68-year-old Pakistani man, who came to Norway in 1971 to study. He was 25 years old at the time. He had already attained a master's degree in social sciences in Pakistan and wanted to pursue further education in social work. One of the reasons why he decided to go to Norway was that he had gained knowledge about the organisation of welfare services and he was interested in learning more. After completing his education in social work, he also acquired pedagogical training, and went on to work as a teacher. He continued to work as a teacher until he was offered the opportunity for contractual early retirement pension (AFP), [51] which he took. Except for occasionally having been passed over in relation to jobs that he felt he was clearly more qualified for, Navid describes his experiences in Norway as very positive.

---

[51] Contractual early leave pension was introduced in 1988. The arrangement enables people to enter retirement before the age of 67, which is the official retirement age of Norway. Since its introduction, it has been subject to several revisions, among them reducing the age in which one is eligible from 66 in 1989, to 62 in 1998. To be eligible for Contractual early leave pension the workplace must be involved in the arrangement, and the employee must have been employed in the workplace for three years. Moreover, the employee must have accumulated pension for at least 10 years after reaching the age of 50. Thus, to be eligible for contractual early leave, one must document stable ties to the labour market (Vignes, 2011).

Navid has a wife and three sons. When Navid came to Norway, his wife and children were still in Pakistan. They came to Norway in 1990. Two of his sons are married to women born in Norway but with a Pakistani family background. The oldest son lives in Qatar. The youngest son is unmarried, and lives with Navid and his wife. At the time of the interview, Navid, his wife and youngest son were in the process of moving into a large house that he had bought together with his middle son, daughter-in-law, and their children. He states that this decision was based on his son's wishes, as his son felt living together would generate better opportunities for mutual assistance in everyday life. Navid anticipates this living arrangement to be temporary and related to his son's need of assistance with raising his children. For the time being, he and his wife are still in good health, and it would be practical for them and their son to live together under the same roof and help each other out in daily life. Thus, for the time being they share household tasks. He states that his wife and daughter-in-law are very good at cooking, so they mostly do the cooking, and that he or his daughter-in-law usually share the task of grocery shopping. He also says that he anticipates that they might not want to maintain this arrangement in the future, as their family grows. He does not conceive of this potential change as something negative, just a normal part of life – a natural product of shifting needs according to different life circumstances. He states that he is happy about his children's choices, and that he would be happy just to have a place to visit them.

Consequently, in the case of Navid, we see a shift in perspective, whereby joint living arrangements are maintained – not in order to maintain an idealised version of the family, or because he expects his children to care for him – rather it is because of the needs of his adult children – needs which are subject to change according to changing life circumstances.

When asked about the potential use of formal care services in the future Navid responds:

> Navid: "For now, things are ok, we are not physically dependent yet. You never know what is going to happen in the future but for now we are ok".

> Interviewer: "but if you were to become physically dependent in the future would you consider using public services?"

Navid: "I would use it. I am open for that."

Interviewer: "You are open for it…"

Navid: "yes, our children have their responsibilities and their western lifestyle. We cannot decide much over our children. They must work. They have their own lives, their own children so we cannot demand or force them to anything so for me – and I think also for my wife it is fine. We are positive."

Interviewer: "towards…"

Navid: "to using public services if we become physically dependent."

Navid recognises that their children have grown up in a different social context than he and his wife have. His son and daughter-in-law have to deal with the competing demands of paid work and family life, and therefore might not have the opportunity to take on extensive responsibilities for Navid and his wife, should they become more dependent on care in day-to-day life. Consequently, his situation can be compared to the situation of Noman. As you may recall, Noman lives in an extended household, and seems to expect his daughter-in-law to provide him and his wife with the care and support they need. However, the life situation of his son and daughter in law is characterised by a so-called time-squeeze, having to juggle the demands of their paid work, care for children and their ageing parents (in law). Consequently, Noman and his wife are left alone for most parts of the day. Thus, the situation of Noman and Navid's adult children are similar. However, Navid seems to have come to terms with this situation in a different manner than Noman. He accepts that his adult children might not be able to provide him and his wife with care and seems to conceive of formal state provided care as a good alternative. Nonetheless, neither Navid nor his wife are in the situation that they need personal long-term care, and his attitudes and perceptions might change if they were to develop more extensive care needs. However, results from former studies on cultural expectations of family care indicate that there is little significant connection between having a care needs and strengthened expectations of family care (cf. De Valk & Schans, 2008).

Thus, Navid's case indicates that ideals of family and cultural expectations can be subject to change not only in relation to practical circumstances, but also through

adopting new ways of thinking, when facing new opportunities and constrains in a migratory context. Thus, when compared to the other participants who adhere strongly to the ideal of the Pakistani family, although practices may vary according to different circumstances – the case of Navid illustrates that the ideal in itself may become subject to negotiations. This is in line with Torres' (2002) findings on Iranian late in life migrants in Sweden and their orientations regarding successful ageing. She finds that in the process of migration, the value orientations of the older Iranian migrants also shifted from considering dependence on family members as key to successful ageing, to emphasising the importance of self-sufficiency and independence from family members. She distinguishes between two different reasons for this change in orientations; the practically based and the ideological change in orientation. Whereas the practically based indicates a shift in value orientation because receiving care by family members is for different reasons unattainable, the ideological change reflects a complete shift in ways of thinking about successful ageing. The change in family care practices in Akbar's case, who was described in section 2.3, may be described as a practically based decision. He still idealises the Pakistani joint living arrangements and family care, although this ideal is practically unattainable for him. For Navid on the other hand, it seems that the shift in orientation is ideological, it is based on a new way of thinking about old age and family life, in the face of new sociocultural and economic circumstances, in turn creating new ways of organising family life as a Pakistani migrant in Norway.

Still, what is particularly interesting about Navid's account is that while he expresses being open towards new – in his own words – more "westernised" ways of organising family life – in practice his family life is organised according to the Pakistani tradition of joint family living. Thus, he differs from the other Pakistani interviewees presented in this chapter, who are mostly concerned with maintaining tradition, while practices may vary. By contrast, Navid does not regard intergenerational living as an ideal – nor as an arrangement that is fixed permanently in time – but rather as subject to continuous negotiations and change according to his family's circumstances. He emphasises that the reason for joining his household with that of his adult son is his son's family's needs of support in day-to-day life.

Although there is a reciprocal element to this, whereby the family – according to Navid – are planning to pool their resources and share household tasks, the main reason for the arrangement seems to be the provision of support from Navid and his wife to his adult son, daughter-in-law and grandchildren. This indicates a shift in the way of thinking about intergenerational support – from reciprocal care and support across the life course – to a more unidirectional form of support from him and his wife to his adult children and grandchildren across the life course.

The case of Navid may also be understood in relation to recent demographic developments, whereby increases in longevity and better health conditions, contribute to the diversity in the way in which later life is experienced and lived. As described in chapter 3 on theoretical frameworks, these developments have spurred researchers to differentiate old age as a life course phase into the third and fourth age. In this conceptual distinction the third age constitutes the period after retirement, but before the onset of health problems and increasing long-term care dependency, and the fourth age constitutes the phase of health decline, and extensive long-term care needs. As also described in chapter 3, experiences, and lifeways in the third age may vary considerably. In this understanding, Navid may be described as a third ager in Laslett's (1991) original sense of the concept, that is; an older person, who because of his health and employment has the opportunity to engage in society in new ways (Carr & Komp, p.3)

Applied to the case of Navid, this understanding highlights his and his wife's capacity to engage in support of their children for longer as part of a recent population trend. This opportunity may also be understood in light of his rather privileged class and health situation. This interpretation is supported by research on intergenerational forms of care and support between people who are in the third age and their adult children in the UK (Grundy, 2005). Their findings indicate a new pattern of increased intergenerational support – both in terms of financial support, and in terms of practical support – from ageing parents to children and grandchildren well into later life. There is a significant class dimension to this. As already described in chapter 3, people's health situation, and thereby capacity to engage in support, is shaped by

their education and former occupations. Moreover, Grundy (2005) finds there is a positive correlation between ageing parents' income and homeownership and their engagement in both practical and financial support of adult children.

Navid is highly educated in social sciences, and he has had occupations that are related to his field of education in Norway. This might explain why he is so open towards new values and practices in the Norwegian context. This interpretation is supported by former studies on older migrants (cf. De Valk & Schans, 2008; Karl et. al, 2017; Næss & Vabø, 2014). Findings from these studies indicate that attaining a high education level leads to more reflection and diversification of values and opinions.

Moreover, most of his working life, Navid has worked with public services either as a social worker or as a teacher and he has good knowledge about the welfare system in Norway. As already mentioned, his interest in the welfare system was a primary reason for why he wanted to come to Norway in the first place. Thus, he possesses some knowledge about how the system works. This might contribute to his sense of ease regarding the use of formal care services. Findings from Nergård's (2009) qualitative study of older migrants from Vietnam, Sri Lanka and Pakistan living in Norway supports this interpretation. She finds that older migrants who possess some knowledge about care services, or how the system works are less anxious about potentially having to make use of formal care services in the future.

Navid also recounts good experiences with Norwegian mainstream society. This might be a reason the cultural expectations of family care are not so important to him, as it may be for others. It is not an important part of his identity. This interpretation is substantiated if we contrast the experiences of Navid with the experiences of Akbar, who was presented earlier in the chapter. Whereas Navid expresses overwhelmingly positive experiences of encounters with native Norwegians, Akbar recalls situations where he has received prejudiced treatment, and being exploited in the labour market. Thus, Akbar's concerns with normative obligations of family care may be considered a strategy where he accentuates what he perceives as positive aspects of his Pakistani

cultural heritage and identity. Navid, who does not share similar experiences, might not feel the need to accentuate and maintain these traditions in the same way.

In sum, the positive attitudes that Navid has towards using formal care services – rather than expecting that his adult children should provide for him – may be related to his largely positive perceptions and experiences in Norway. As such, the experiences that Navid recounts may be described as experiences of a rather successful trajectory of migration to, and incorporation in, Norwegian society, and this may have informed his view on utilising formal care services. This interpretation is supported by findings from Naldemirci's (2013) study of older Turkish migrants in Sweden. He finds that the participants who positioned themselves as successful in their integration and inclusion in Swedish society – as well as having successful children – are more positive towards the idea of having formal care in later life. This is also connected to class position (Naldemirci, 2013; Liversage & Mirdal, 2017). Moreover, as Navid describes it, the provision of care and support in the family is largely based on the needs that his adult children have for support in daily life, indicating a shift in orientations where the needs of adult children are placed centre stage. In this sense, Navid's description resembles that of the Polish older migrants in this study. I shall now turn to how the Polish older migrants negotiate care and support in later life.

3. The Polish older migrants

3.1 Supporting adult children
Most of the Polish older migrants in this study were in good health at the time of the interviews and did not seem to reflect much on what they would do if they would find themselves in need of care in the future. Moreover, in contrast to many of the Pakistani older migrants, they did not seem to adhere to any collectively shared notions of the ideal family life, or a collectively shared expectations that adult children should provide care for them in later life. The Polish older migrants expressed a preference for living alone or with a spouse.

Often their children live far way and are preoccupied with education or demanding jobs. The Polish interviewees talked warmly about their children's achievements and were very much engaged in supporting their ambitions. Many of them have a financial situation, which enable them to support their children economically while they are completing their education. This is illustrated through the interview with Lukasz, a 68-year-old Polish man. He came to Norway at the age of 23 on a tourist visa in 1969. After a long process, he eventually got a residence permit in Norway. He is educated as a construction engineer but has had to work several menial jobs in Norway before he finally got a job in a construction business. He is now retired. When he came to Norway, his wife and son were still in Poland, but after getting a residence permit, he could apply for family reunification, and they came to Norway. At the time of the interview, Lukasz lived with his wife. His son lived nearby, and they had a lot of contact. When asked about commitments in the family he responds:

> Lukasz: "well, when my son needed help, I helped him, I helped him out financially, but now I cannot help (laughs). It is supposed to be the other way around you know, but I manage, I have a good pension so you know I cannot complain".

This excerpt illustrates that, although Lukasz seems to be of the opinion that it should be adult children supporting their parents, and not parents supporting their children, he has no problem with supporting his son financially, as long as he is able to provide for himself and his wife at the same time. He does not state any expectations that he wants his son to reciprocate for the support he has received, by caring for him in case he would become more dependent on care in day-to-day life.

In sum, the case of Lukasz illustrates a recurring theme in the interviews with the Polish older migrants in this study. They do not express any expectations that adult children should care for them in old age – and the practice they have developed seems to be one of supporting their children in their studies, career, and other life pursuits. This pattern resembles the one of Navid – which has been described in section 3.4 in this chapter – whereby parents have become more active providers of practical and financial support well into later life. However, not all the Polish

participants in this study are in the situation where they can support their children financially. Some of them opt for different solutions. This is the case with Linda, one of the polish participants, whom I interviewed in her home. Linda is 65-years old. She came to Norway in 1981 because she had met a Norwegian man and wanted to live closer to him. Although the relationship lasted for 10 years, she described the relationship as very violent and exploitative – and after ten years she finally managed to break out. Linda has no education, but she managed to get a job part time at a women's refuge. However, due to health problems she had to retire early from this job.

At the time of the interview – Linda was living with her 36-year-old son temporarily until he could find his own place to live. Their relationship is one of mutual assistance. She mostly cooks and cleans, while he takes care of the shopping and other kinds of errands outside of the house. This way of dividing domestic chores resembles that of Ashwariya and her family. However, in the case of Linda, the reason for this division seems to be her health – which makes it difficult for her to do the shopping and errands outside of the house – not cultural norms of gender segregation and gendered divisions of labour. This also indicates that Linda's adult son does provide his mother with care, by shopping and running daily and weekly errands. However, this arrangement takes the form of mutual assistance and support. Consequently, like Ashwariya, the work of care in this situation is not recognised because it is subsumed within the sphere of domestic activity.

Although Linda and her son has a relationship of mutual assistance, Linda describes wanting him to move out, and establish a life of his own, and she is worried that living with his mother would potentially damage his opportunities of marrying and establishing a family of his own.

When asked about her anticipations for care in the future, Linda responded that her son will probably do what they do in Poland these days – that is, hire a Ukrainian live-in care worker to look out for her. As already described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, the practice of paying a migrant care worker, most notably from Ukraine, to care for ageing parents has become widespread in Poland

(Golinowska & Sowa-Kofta, 2018). Consequently, Linda's response to my question may be understood in terms of the concept of transnational mode of consciousness, whereby her knowledge of the Polish practices of care for older people constitutes the reference point for Linda's reflections on future care needs when ageing in place in Norway. This indicates that she expects her son to provide her with care, although indirectly through the hiring of a migrant care worker from Ukraine. It may also indicate that she does not possess much knowledge of available options of formal care in Norway.

3.2 The importance of protecting the family and avoid being a burden

As already mentioned, the lack of expectation of family care exhibited by the Polish older migrants, may reflect that most of them do not have long-term care needs. However, as we shall see in the following, the Polish older migrants who do have health problems and long-term care needs, do not express expectations that adult children should provide them with extensive care. This is illustrated in the case of Magdalena, a 75-year-old Polish woman.

Magdalena came to Norway at the age of 45 in 1986, because she met and married a Norwegian man. Before she came to Norway, she attained a master's degree qualifying her to teach in upper secondary school. She was married and had two children, but tension in the marriage lead to a divorce. Because of scarcity of dwellings in Poland, and a need for assistance with looking after her daughter, Magdalena shared a small apartment with her mother. Thus, her mother had a place to live, and she looked after Magdalena's children while she was at work. At the time, her brother lived in Norway, and she went to visit him in 1985. While visiting, she met a man whom she ended up marrying, and in 1986 she travelled to Norway to be with him. Her marriage to the Norwegian man did not work out, and they ended up getting a divorce. Her oldest daughter was adult and married at the time of her mother's migration, so she stayed in Poland, while her youngest daughter joined Magdalena. Her youngest daughter did not like it in Norway, and returned to Poland after a year, when she was 18. After the EU expansion in 2004, both her daughters came to Norway. They are both care workers.

Magdalena describes the time before her two daughters came to Norway as very painful, causing strain on her relationship with her husband who stated that "though her body was here, her heart was there". Although they do not have daily contact, the knowledge that her children are nearby and that they can be there at a moment's notice is a source of comfort for Magdalena. This is consistent with Baldassar's (2008) findings that although transnational families create different forms of co-presence, amongst other things, through using communications technology to overcome geographical separation, these types of co-presence only partly replace actual physical co-presence. During her time in Norway, Magdalena has worked several jobs, mostly in kindergarten or as a teacher's assistant. However, she had to retire early and attain a disability pension because of arthritis.

She describes the relationship with her two daughters as very loving and affectionate, but states that she does not want them to live too close because that would lead to a stronger sense of obligation to visit her. The following excerpt illustrates the reasoning behind Magdalena's wish not to live close to her daughters:

> Interviewer: "Do your daughters live close by?"
>
> Magdalena: "They live close to each other, and they wanted me to move closer to them as well but I didn't want to live close to them because then they might feel obligated to visit and send their children to visit and I didn't want that"
>
> Interviewer: "So you didn't want them to feel obligated… "
>
> Magdalena: "No they wanted me to move but I am for the time being doing very well on my own, so I don't want to"

The above excerpt illustrates how, according to Magdalena, her two daughters wanted her to live closer to them, but she does not want that as she fears that this would make them feel pressured to visit her more often. Because she feels that she is doing quite well on her own, she does not seem to feel the need to introduce such pressures on their relationship. In the following she elaborates on the nature of their relationship:

> Magdalena: "Now my grandchild is visiting me once a week with his friend and I help them with their homework. That is kind of a visit you know. And my oldest grandson plays sports nearby, and my oldest daughter usually drives him, and then she stops by to ask if there is anything I need and stuff like that. I have a very good relationship with my girls, and we think the same ways and we have a very warm relationship, but we don't have to be together all the time".

This excerpt illustrates how Magdalena perceives her relationship to her daughters as very warm and affectionate. And although they do not live in the same area, they still call upon her regularly, and provide their mother with practical support. At the same time, Magdalena assists her grandson with his homework. Thus, the excerpt is in line with the overall pattern of the exchanges of care and support in the family reiterated by the Polish older migrants in this study. However, the exchanges of care and support in Magdalena's family is not one of unidirectional support from her to her children and grandchildren, but rather characterised by reciprocal exchanges of care and support – she provides her grandson with homework support, and her daughter occasionally assists with practical tasks that Magdalena needs help with.

The excerpt also illustrates something more about her reasons for not wanting to live closer to her two daughters. As already mentioned, her reasons for not wanting to live closer to her daughters is a fear that this might make them feel obligated to visit her more frequently, therefore placing undue pressure on their relationship. In the above excerpt another reason for not wanting to live close to them comes to the fore – namely the boundaries of intimacy. This is expressed in her statement "but we don't have to be together all the time", suggesting that she herself does not want to be around her children all the time. Thus, Magdalena's reason for not wanting to live in the vicinity of her two daughters may be understood as twofold – firstly not wanting to be a burden on her daughters by obligating them to visit her – secondly a desire to maintain some form of privacy and independence from them.

Although Magdalena does not want her daughters to feel obligated to visit her and provide her with care, she talks with great pride about her daughter's willingness to help her. She particularly recalls an incident when she was admitted to hospital:

> Magdalena: "When I was – once I was very sick and I called them [her two daughters] and at once they came to the hospital where I was, and they were there all the time. Even in the papers [hospital medical files] – it says – 'good relations between mother and child. They took such good care of me. Once, which is very funny, they wanted me to feel better so each of them took one of my feet massaging them, filing my nails and stuff".

As already mentioned, this excerpt serves to illustrate her daughter's engagement with caring for her mother, particularly in emergency situations. Magdalena also seems to express great sense of joy and pride in the way in which her daughters cared for her when she was in hospital, and the great deal of affection involved in their acts. This indicates that she cherishes the care and support provided by her two daughters, but she does not want them to feel obligated to care for her. As already described in the chapter on theoretical frameworks, Glucksmann & Lyon (2006) distinguish between informal caregiving provided out of obligation and informal caregiving provided out of affection. This distinction is clear in Magdalena's description of her relationship with her two daughters. She does not want her daughters to feel obligated to visit or care for her, but rather, on their own volition and initiative, provide care and support based on the love and affection of their relationship.

The difference between the Polish and the Pakistani older migrants is also illustrated if we contrast Ashwariya's situation, the Pakistani woman presented in the beginning of the chapter, and the account of Magdalena. Ashwariya, who has been described in section 2.1 of this chapter, and Magdalena have similar health problems and care needs. However, whereas Ashwariya lives with her husband, son and daughter in law – and relies on them, mostly her daughter-in-law, for assistance in day-to day-life – Magdalena lives alone and receives a publicly provided home-helper once a week to

assist with cleaning or grocery shopping. In addition, she receives several aids such as an accommodated residence, an adjustable hospital bed so that she can get out of bed in mornings when her arthritis is particularly painful. She also has a wheelchair and a walker. Without this assistance in daily life, she would have to rely more heavily on her two daughters.

To Magdalena, it is important to be independent from family members. She feels that depending too much on them might cause a strain on the loving and affectionate relationship they have. Magdalena's preference for formal, publicly provided care to protect the family relationships is in line with findings on the native Norwegian population of older people. These findings highlight how older people in Norway make use of available formal care services for long term care needs, to avoid being a burden on family members, and to maintain a sense of privacy. They tend to rely on family members for less demanding tasks, such as practical assistance, social interaction, and in emergencies (Herlofson & Daatland, 2016)[52]. This is also the case with Magdalena, who receives some practical assistance from her two daughters, although she is not dependent on it. As the story of her hospital stay makes clear, her daughters are also there to care for her in emergency situations.

Ashwariya on the other hand considers the care she receives from her family as part of a reciprocal care relationship with her daughter-in-law. Her main priority is to be independent within the confines of family life and to avoid being a burden on the state. In both the cases of Magdalena and Ashwariya the dimension of not wanting to be a burden is apparent, albeit in different ways. Magdalena does not want to be a burden on her daughters and grandchildren, whereas Ashwariya does not want to be a burden on the state.

---

[52] This trend is slowly changing. While provision of informal care has historically speaking been important, it has gained further importance in recent years. This is mainly because of the growing numbers of seniors worldwide; the formal care services are facing growing pressures. In consequence, the provision of formal care services has been cut back. According to Øydgard (2018), this has led to a process where informal care is not only considered a moral family obligation dependent upon interpersonal relations within the family, but it has become something that the formal care services relies upon in the needs assessment process. Thus, Øydgard (2018: p.11) argues that informal care has become "a pawn within the framework of public care services".

However, among the polish participants there are also other reasons for not wanting to apply for formal long-term care services which are related to the challenging process of applying for these services, and risking getting very little in return. This is the case of Jelena. The case of Jelena also illustrates how migrants ageing in place in Norway sometimes must balance their own care needs and caregiving obligations towards their family back in Poland.

3.3 Balancing care needs and transnational caregiving obligations

One of the Polish participants in this study, Jelena, is reluctant to apply for formal care services. Jelena is 68 years old. She came to Norway at the age of 33, in 1979 to work as a musician. Before coming to Norway, Jelena lived and worked for many years in Poland. She was married for some time in Poland but is now divorced. She has a son who is now in his 40s. When she came to Norway in 1979 her son stayed in Poland and was looked after by his grandparents until he had finished primary school. He came to live with his mother in 1982. He now lives in California with his wife and children.

Jelena has arthritis. A few years prior to the interview, she had a stroke. This has put limits on her ability to travel long distance, and she is unable to visit her son as frequently as she wants to. Her mother is still alive and of bad health. Thus, Jelena travels to Poland at least once a year and usually stays there for a duration of three weeks.

As already described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, care for older people in Poland is considered a family responsibility, but the family has the option of purchasing private care services. These private care services are expensive, and many families cannot afford this option (Pierek-Bialas & Slany, 2016). This however is not the case with Jelena and her family. Some time prior to the interview, her brother had arranged for a place for their mother in a private institution – the costs of which Jelena and her brother were planning to share. However, her mother was very reluctant to leave her home. Consequently, they decided to hire a live-in care provider in her home instead – also paid for by Jelena and her brother.

When Jelena is in Poland, she helps her mother out with practical tasks around the house, as much as her health allows her to. Still, the main form of care she provides her mother with is emotional and social care and support. Besides visits to Poland, she describes having daily contact with both her mother and son through Skype or telephone calls. She describes this contact as an important obligation towards her mother. She also states that she considers moving to Poland, to be closer to her mother and other family members in Poland, and that her mother has pleaded with her to do so.

When asked about what she does to get the support that she needs, Jelena responds that she gets a lot of help from her friends. For instance, she has a friend who comes around to help her around the house, with vacuum cleaning and simple cleaning tasks. Beyond this assistance, she tries to manage on her own, but she describes the act of cleaning the house as awful because she is in a lot of pain after having done it. I asked her about applying for public assistance. She responds that she did receive assistance from a home-helper a few years ago, because she had fallen and broken her leg. For two months, a home-helper came to her house once a week or once every ten days to vacuum clean. In addition, her friends assisted her with grocery shopping. She has not considered applying for more assistance, because she does not know much about what she could get, and she has heard from a neighbour – who is in her 80s and who has extensive long-term care needs – that there is a long wait and that she gets next to nothing. Thus, given the application process, and the impression that the opportunities for receiving any help is meagre, Jelena does not conceive of applying for any formal care as a realistic option. Her relation to the formal care services is like the one of Noman, described earlier in this chapter. They both seem to have ruled out formal care as an option. However, contrary to Noman, who lives with his wife, adult son, daughter in law and grandchildren, Jelena lives alone. Still, although describing everyday life as toilsome, at least in times where her joints are aching due to her arthritis, she describes being happy with the help she receives from her friends, and does not feel the need to apply for formal care services, unless she, for some reason, becomes completely bedridden.

Moreover, Jelena is involved in transnational caregiving, providing her mother with financial, emotional, and social support from a distance, and practical support at times when she is at home visiting her. She describes these caring obligations as challenging because of her own health difficulties, particularly the practical support she provides her with when she is visiting. Thus, the situation of Jelena, may be described as a balancing act – between on the one hand having health problems and being in need of some assistance herself – and, on the other hand, feeling a sense of obligation to care for her mother in Poland in any way she can. This sense of obligation towards her mother may be understood in relation to her parents caring for her son in the years before he could come to stay with Jelena in Norway. It may also be understood in relation to the sociocultural system of care in Poland, whereby adult children especially daughters, are regarded as morally obliged to care for their ageing parents (Krzyzowski and Mucha, 2014). Thus, there is an indication that cultural expectations of family care for older people in Poland is a product of necessity based on a lack of available options of state provision.

4. Concluding discussion

The aim of this chapter has been to explore the cultural expectations and practices of family care and support among older migrants from Pakistan and Poland ageing in place in Norway. Both these migrant groups come from a sociocultural context where family care for older people is considered an important moral obligation, and where these moral obligations are underpinned by a weak provision of care for older people. Norway on the other hand constitutes a context with large infrastructure of formal care services for older people, and where adult children tend to play a complimentary role in provisions of care for older family members. Adopting a transnational perspective on older migrants' expectations of care from family members, as well as caregiving arrangements within the family, enables an exploration of how values, customs and traditions from the migrant's countries of origin, are negotiated and combined with values, customs and traditions in the new context. Thus, an important question this chapter has intended to answer is in what ways expectations and practices of family care amongst older migrants from two largely familistic national

contexts, are maintained, negotiated, or transformed in a social democratic welfare context.

The biographical interview material has enabled an exploration of variations in cultural expectations and practices of care and support according to different dimensions such as national background, family situation, gender, class, and overall experiences of being a migrant in Norway.

The chapter has identified differences among the Polish and Pakistani older migrants when it comes to expectations of family care and support in later life, whereby expectations of care from adult children are more strongly pronounced among the Pakistani participants than among the Polish.. For many of the Pakistani participants, the expectations of family care are couched in terms of an ideal of joint family living, strong family unity and ideals of mutual exchanges of care and support. This way of organising family life seems to exist as an ideal in the consciousness of many of the Pakistani interviewees, although actual family arrangements and care practices exhibits significant variations. Thus, intergenerational living and family care takes the form of normative obligation, understood as a collectively shared and "typical" Pakistani way of doing things. This is sometimes also juxtaposed with the supposed individualism of the native Norwegians – an individualism which serves to isolate older native Norwegian people from their families and societies at large. This finding is consistent with findings from former research on South Asian and Muslim older people (cf. Ingebretsen, 2010; Moen, 2002; Naldemirci,2013; Næss & Vabø, 2014, Victor et al, 2012). Thus, the ideal or imagined form of family life consisting of intergenerational living, family unity and solidarity, and reciprocal exchanges of care and support, may be interpreted as a positive symbolic marker of Pakistani ethnic identity and group belonging in Norway.

Although there is a strong consensus among older Pakistani that family care constitutes an ideal, I also find that there is some evidence of a shift in orientations to this. In line with Torres (1992) this shift in orientation is either practically based or ideologically based. Practical shifts in orientations occur in situations where the options of family care, for different reasons, are not available. The ideological shift in

orientation is related to changing ways of thinking about practices of family care when these are confronted with new ones in a transnational migratory context. In this study, the ideological shift in orientation seems to be class related as well as related to positive experiences of being a migrant in Norway. This interpretation is consistent with former studies (Naldemirci, 2017; Liversage & Mirdal, 2017). Thus, by adopting a life course approach, this study has been able to identify both between group variation, and within group variation in experiences, linking these variations to the lived lives of older migrants.

Although the Polish older migrants in this study talked much about their families, both the ones living here in Norway, as well the family members they had back in Poland, they did not state explicitly during the interview that they expected their adult children to care for them in later life. This may of course reflect their life stage at the point of the interview. They may be described as in the third age, retired but not (yet) care dependent. Thus, they may not have reflected that much on what to do in case their health situation would worsen in the future. However, even the ones who are dependent upon care – Magdalena and Jelena – do not explicitly express any expectation or preference that their adult children should care for them. In fact – as the case of Magdalena illustrates – the use of formal care services is perceived as way to avoid having to rely too much on adult children. Thereby, utilising formal care services is – at least in the case of Magdalena – a way of protecting what she described as the loving and affectionate relationship she has with her daughters. Thus, in contrast to the Pakistani older migrants, the Polish older migrants do not seem to be concerned with ideal notions of family organisation or family care, nor are there any indications that such ideals are collectively shared and upheld in the Polish migrant community in Norway. They seem to relate more pragmatically to the question of family care and support. Rather than being considered in relation to a specific normative ideal of "the Polish family", care and different forms of support for different family members are be exchanged in specific situations and life phases and therefore also fluctuate across their own as well as their children's life courses.

The different migration experiences and trajectories of the two migrant groups may serve to contextualise the differences in expectations of family care between Pakistani and Polish older migrants. As already mentioned in the introductory chapter, the Pakistani migrants in this study has come as a part of a chain migration – whereby informal transnational networks between migrants, and people in Pakistan facilitated more migration (Castles & Miller, 2003; Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2019). In consequence, many Pakistani migrants have settled close to another. By contrast, the Polish older migrants had a more individualised migration trajectory. Their settlement patterns were more scattered than for the Pakistani migrants. Thus, the capacity to form networks of groups where values circulate and are reproduced is greater among the Pakistani migrants than among the Polish migrants, who has not had a similar community formation in Norway. This interpretation is akin to the analysis made by Moen (2002) in her study of older Danish and Pakistani migrants in Norway. She distinguishes between what she describes as different forms of ethno-cultural belonging. The Pakistani older migrants, she argues, have an ethno-cultural group belonging in Norway, due to their tight knit networks and extensive contact with their places of origin. The older Danish migrants on the other hand have an individual ethno-cultural belonging, characterised by a lack of Danish group belonging or network in Norway. Moreover, I have argued that the experience of discrimination and prejudicial treatment among the Pakistanis may reinforce their emphasis on cultural markers, which they regard as positive. This can be understood in relation to the concept of boundary work, which was accounted for in chapter 2. This concept refers to the subjective boundaries which people draw between themselves and others in processes of identity formation and enactment. Lamont (1992; 2000) argues, that the act of accentuating individual or group qualities perceived as positive – in comparisons with other persons or groups – may contribute to a sense of dignity and self-worth, particularly for persons or groups who perceive themselves as subordinated both in terms of class, and in terms of ethnic background. Thus, the contrast that the Pakistanis make between the collective family arrangements, and the individualistic Norwegian family may be understood as a form of boundary work, which is reinforced when having faced prejudiced treatment in Norwegian society.

This interpretation is strengthened if we contrast the accounts of Akbar and Navid. As we have seen, Akbar describes experiences with prejudiced treatment and discrimination in Norway, while Navid mostly depicts experiences in Norway as positive. While Akbar is entirely convinced that joint family living and family care constitutes the ideal, Navid's way of thinking about these questions has changed in the face of new opportunities and constrains in the Norwegian context. This suggests that older migrants might emphasise what they perceive of as positive aspects of Pakistani practices and identity, when having faced prejudiced or discriminating treatment in the country of settlement. These aspects might not be so important if one has had predominantly positive experiences. This interpretation is a cautious one, and more comparative research on different migrant groups, positioned differently in the destination country of migration, as well as in different receiving contexts is needed to substantiate such an interpretation.

So far, I have only discussed differences between the Polish and Pakistani older migrants when it comes to the existence of an ideal form of family life, which also informs their expectations of care in later life. However, there are also significant variations when it comes to arrangements of care and support, and what types of care and support are exchanged both within, and between each group. These differences mostly related to the life situation of their adult children. For the Pakistani older migrants, maintaining what they perceive to be the ideal form of family life depends upon having adult children who are able to provide care. The Norwegian welfare state has invested in promoting an ideal of the dual-earner, dual carer-model, whereby both men and women are expected to participate in the labour market and engage in care work in the family (Kitterød & Lappegård, 2012:Ellingsæter,2018). The older migrant's adult children actively participate in the labour market, and often have demanding jobs. This means that they are subject to the competing demands of paid work and family caregiving obligations, which in turn shaped their ability to provide care. Thus, the Pakistani older migrants' position of being in-between in relation to family care, is manifested in having cultural expectations of family care, on the one hand, and having adult children who are unwilling or unable to provide extensive care for their ageing parents, on the other. This means that upholding the practice of joint

family living and care in some cases requires strategic investments and is not without tensions. One of these strategic investments are transnational marriages. The analysis in this chapter, and particularly the case of Ashwariya illustrates how transnational marriages may constitute a way of maintaining the ideal form of family life, and the Pakistani gendered division of labour in the family. The finding that transnational marriages, and marriage migration may be considered a strategy for maintaining the tradition of family care, is consistent with findings from former studies (cf. Liversage, 2016; Moen, 2002).

Among the Polish older migrants, it seems as though the direction of support, at least for the time being, is from the older generation towards their children and grandchildren. This is illustrated in the case of Lukasz, who has supported his son financially through medical school. Given that Lukasz has had a successful business he has had the financial means to do so. However, the case of Linda also illustrates how the older migrants engage in supporting their adult children, despite having limited financial means. Linda and her son share an apartment, at least for the time being until he can find a place to live on his own. The case of Linda can also be regarded as an arrangement which facilitates the sharing of household tasks between her and her son.

One of the Polish participants, Jelena, engages in transnational caregiving for her mother who lives in Poland. Jelena is the only one in this study whose mother is still alive, and Jelena engages in different forms of transnational caregiving, such as financial support so that her family can pay someone to care for her mother, emotional and social care through daily Skype calls, and practical support at times when she is visiting Poland. Thus, Jelena's transnational caregiving is like the transnational caregiving practices which younger Polish migrants tend to engage in (cf. Kzyzowski & Mucha, 2014). This needs to be understood in relation to the system of care for older people in Poland, where the main responsibility for making sure that ageing parents are provided for is placed on the family – either by caring for them themselves – or by paying private care providers. Thus, one of the ways in which Polish migrants care for their ageing parents is through financial remittances

either directly to their parents or to their siblings in Poland, or through paying a person who is not a member of the family to care for their parents. According to Krzyzowski & Mucha (2014) these remittances gain a new meaning in a transnational social space, becoming a symbol of the emotional attachments embedded in the family relationship. Jelena's transnational provision of care for her mother in Poland, may be understood as a reciprocal caregiving arrangement, whereby she reciprocates for her parents caring for her son in an earlier stage of her life course, when she was working to establish herself in Norway.

Krzyzowski & Mucha (2014) identify the tensions involved in engaging in such forms of transnational caregiving. In their study the tensions related to the migrants' experiences of a double burden, having to care for their own children as well as for their ageing parents at a distance. In the case of Jelena, the tension mainly relates to feeling an obligation to care for her mother, while at the same time having her own health problems.

In sum, the chapter has illustrated how both older migrants from Pakistan and from Poland enact agency in the sense that they evaluate the opportunities and constrains, operating at a meso and macro level, and within these opportunities and constraints they make choices about how to arrange for their care needs in the Norwegian context. However, they do so in different ways. In the Pakistani case, the agency is enacted in their attempts and strategies to find ways to reconcile the cultural practice of joint living arrangements, and family care with the opportunities and constraints of the Norwegian context. Among the Polish, the agency is revealed in their evaluations of the opportunities of formal care in Norway, and their decision to make use of these services in order to maintain their independence from – and avoid being a burden to – family members. Although many of the Pakistani older migrants can maintain joint living arrangements in a somewhat modified form, and their adult children seem to be very much willing to provide them with care, tensions do occur. This means that the Pakistani older migrants are at a greater risk of becoming vulnerable, than the Polish older migrants are. This is particularly so, in situations where reliance on family care exists alongside marginalisation in relation to the formal support system.

The chapter has mainly focused on experiences and practices of family care. However, as the analysis of Akbar, Ashwariya, Noman and Jelena have shown, expectations and practices of family care also needs to be understood in relation to older migrants' perceptions of formal care services. Moreover, as the following chapter will demonstrate, the perceptions of formal care services are also related to migrants' overall impression of, and their experiences of encounters with the welfare system in Norway.

Chapter 6. Migratory Insideness – ageing migrants and the welfare state

1. Introduction

The former chapter explored how older migrants negotiate family care when ageing in place in Norway. In this chapter, I investigate older migrants' relation to the Norwegian welfare state and the meanings of the welfare state for their experiences of ageing in place in Norway.

As already discussed in the introductory chapter, this thesis adopts a multidimensional approach to ageing in place. In such an approach, older people's sense of belonging is regarded as shaped by forces operating at different levels. This includes their relations to the physical and social surroundings, their relations to family, as well as their incorporation in a formal support system in their place of residence. Former studies show that incorporation in a formal support system, and particularly the access to health care, become increasingly important in old age, as people may experience physical and mental health decline due to old age (Blaakilde, 2015; Huber & O'Reilly, 2004). As mentioned in the introduction, studies on older labour migrants ageing in place have tended to focus on their disadvantages in the destination country of migration. One of these disadvantages stems from being marginalised in relation to a formal support system in the destination country of migration. This is particularly the case when it comes to non-European labour migrants (Warnes et al. 2004). The studies identify several different factors shaping the marginalisation of older migrants. Among these are: lack of knowledge of available benefits and services; language barriers; lack of adaptation of care services to the needs of older migrants; and strong cultural expectations of family care (cf. Ahmed & Jones, 2008; Bolzman et al., 2004; Hansen, 2014; Hjelm & Albin, 2014; Victor et al., 2011: Warnes et al. 2004).

By contrast, studies focusing on migrants' attachment to multiple places – most notably their countries of origin and their country of settlement – address the importance of incorporation into a welfare system for these place attachments. These studies find that the welfare system in both country of origin and the country of

settlement constitutes a major factor shaping both the geographical mobility patterns of older migrants, as well as their decision-making processes regarding where to spend old age (Baykara-Krumme, 2013; Bolzman, Fibbi & Vial, 2006; Amman & Holten, 2013). These studies thus broaden the focus from a simple understanding of migrants' vulnerabilities in terms of marginalisation in relation to a formal support system, to look at how migrants ageing in a transnational social space – comprising two different sociopolitical systems – can also relate to and utilise the advantages in both.

To my knowledge, except for Naldemirci's (2014) study on ageing Turkish migrants in Sweden, few of these studies adopt a life course perspective on older migrants' relations to – and experience of – the welfare state in the destination country of migration. Although studies recognise that duration of residence has implications for the vulnerabilities of ageing migrants, few studies directly explore older migrants' relationship to the welfare state as this relationship has developed over time. This chapter thus contributes to the literature, by exploring how older migrants relate to the welfare state in a life course perspective, and how their state of being in-between – having experiences with two different welfare systems – influences how they perceive of, and relate to, the Norwegian welfare state.

As already described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, Norway is characterised by a relatively universal provision of welfare benefits and services. This means that services and benefits – such as health care, social care services for older people, unemployment benefits etc. – are available for the entire population of legal residents, not just particularly vulnerable groups (Brochmann & Grødem, 2017).This is based on an idea that risks – such as illness or unemployment – constitute a public responsibility, and thereby a matter of individual social rights. "From cradle to grave" is a widely used metaphor on the welfare state, highlighting state provision of services and benefits in relation to all life course phases and transitions, including childbirth, childcare arrangements, unemployment, disability and pensions and social care services for older people (Kildal & Kunhle, 2005; Brochmann & Grødem,2017). In practice however, there is also a strong degree of selectivism involved in the

provision of services. Social rights are attributed through membership in a population category such as "under or above a certain age", "sick or disabled", "unemployed". The provisions of services and benefits are also based on strict eligibility criteria (Kildal & Kunhle, 2005). Moreover, the allocation of most services is practiced through the exercise of professional discretion. Consequently, the provisions of these services are often in the hands of gatekeepers, who are required to make major priorities, often through non-standardised eligibility criteria (Kildal & Kunhle, 2005). As we have seen in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, this exercise of professional discretion is particularly extensive when it comes to the allocation of social care services for older people (Kildal & Kunhle, 2005; Christensen & Wærness, 2018; Øydgard, 2018).

In Norway, the sociopolitical idea of ageing in place has been dominant in shaping the development of social care policies for older people since the 1980s. In the Norwegian context this means that provisions of home-based care services have grown. In consequence, institutional care is only provided to older people who are no longer able to live in their own homes (Christensen, 2011; Christensen & Wærness, 2018). As already described in chapter 2, ageing in place-based policies are also informed by activity theory placing new demands on care recipients to take on a more active role in the organisation of their own care (Christensen & Wærness, 2016). This new perspective on older people places a high demand on their ability to exert influence on and make choices regarding their own care (Askheim et al., 2017). It also involves stronger demands that older people should provide for themselves by engaging in self-care and health promoting activities, as well as a strengthened focus on rehabilitation. The aims of these mechanisms are to decrease the level of support needed on an individual basis (Christensen & Wærness, 2018).

Thus, based on the discussion above, this chapter focuses specifically on how migrants from Poland and Pakistan who are ageing in place in Norway relate to the Norwegian welfare state. How do former experiences – both with the welfare system in their countries of origin, and the Norwegian welfare system – shape how they perceive of the Norwegian welfare state in later life? What role does access to welfare

state benefits and services play in their decision-making process regarding where to spend their old age, and in shaping their geographic mobility patterns? Towards the end of the chapter I take a closer look at the older migrants' experiences of one of the major results of ageing in place policies in Norway, namely the home-based care services. How do older migrants relate to these home-based care services, and the demands of activity, rehabilitation and user involvement which accompanies the provision of these services?

In analysing the relationship between the older migrants and the welfare state I draw inspiration from Rowles' (1983) concept of "insideness". Writing from a phenomenological perspective, Rowles (1983) coined the term "autobiographical insideness", which may be defined as attachment to a place (be it local community, neighbourhood, or a town) based on lifelong or long-term residence in that place. As already described in the chapter on theoretical frameworks, autobiographical insideness comprises two underlying forms of insideness: physical and social insideness. Physical insideness is characterised by a general knowledge of the physical environment – a knowledge that may increase in importance in cases of physical and sensory decline, which older people may experience. Social insideness refers to an integration within the social fabric of a community. The concept of social insideness also refers to having sources of social and practical support stemming from integration within a community (Rowles, 1983). According to Rowles (1983), both physical and social insideness derives from autobiographical insideness – meaning it has been developed over time through life long or long-time residence within a community. He also describes autobiographical insideness as a "generally taken for granted and rarely overtly communicated attachment to a place" (Rowles, 1983, p. 304).

Although Rowles' concept of insideness primarily relates to people's attachment to their immediate physical and social surroundings, I find the concept to be applicable in an analysis of the older migrants' relation to the welfare state. This is in line with the multidimensional approach to ageing in place, where older migrant's experiences

of ageing in place are regarded as shaped by their overall incorporation in a formal support system.

The empirical findings in this chapter suggests that some of the characteristics of Rowles' term autobiographical insideness is applicable to the migrants in this study, and their experiences and relations to the welfare state. However, there are some characteristics that are specific to ageing in a migratory context. Thus, drawing inspiration from Rowles' concept of insideness I propose a different concept, namely the concept of migratory insideness. I propose that like the concept of autobiographical insideness, migratory insideness is also articulated biographically, through long-time residence in a specific context. However, unlike the concept of autobiographical insideness, migratory insideness is characterised by a transnational mode of consciousness – a sense of being in-between. Inspired by Simmel's (1908) concept of "the stranger", I propose that migratory insideness is expressed through the process of being simultaneously inside and outside in relation to the Norwegian welfare state. Rather than regarding this position exclusively in terms of marginalisation, I will argue – in line with the arguments of Bygnes (2012) and Christensen (2013) – that this position of inside and outside simultaneously, manifests itself in ambivalence. In this chapter this ambivalence is examined in relation to the welfare state.

The chapter examines how this migratory insideness is expressed in several different ways. In the first section I explore how migratory insideness is expressed in the participant's assessment of the Norwegian welfare system through comparisons with the welfare system in Poland and Pakistan. I also explore how the fact of being "incorporated in the system" influences their decision making regarding where to spend old age, and their transnational mobility patterns. Moving on, I describe how former experiences with the welfare system influences their current perceptions of – as well as their future expectations of – care and support from the welfare state. Moreover, I discuss how the older migrants relate to discourses on welfare dependency and the implication of migrants in these discourses. Lastly, I explore how their migratory insideness is expressed through their relations to formal long term

care providers –how they find ways to adapt to the system, while at the same time being able to voice their dissatisfaction in different ways.

2. Ageing migrants and the welfare state in a transnational perspective[53]

Older migrants are simultaneously situated in two or more national contexts, which they draw upon when deciding where to spend their old age (Kilkey & Merla, 2014). The welfare arrangements – including organisation of care in the country of destination compared with the country of origin – thus constitute an important context for understanding their perception of the welfare state while ageing in place in Norway, as well as their geographical mobility trajectories. This is also the case with the participants in my study. In the following section I shall firstly explore how they assess the Norwegian welfare state by comparing it to the opportunities for care and support in their respective countries of origin, before exploring how incorporation in the welfare state shapes mobility trajectories – not only in terms of where to spend their old age, but also in terms of when to travel and for how long.

2.1 Approaching the welfare state through a transnational lens

The contrasting of opportunities of care and support in Norway – compared with what they would get in their countries of origin – was most visible in the interview with Akbar and Magdalena.

As already described in chapter 5, Akbar is struggling with recurrent periods of anxiety and depression. At one point he was considering moving back to Pakistan, hoping that this would improve his mental condition. When describing his decision regarding not to move back permanently the topic of the welfare state came up:

> Akbar: "I do not know like at one point we went to Pakistan several times a year, to see our families and friends there. We hoped that this would make us feel better. But there are so many examples you know, when comparing our situation to people in Pakistan. And you know, people in Pakistan those who

---

[53] Parts of this section have been published in an article from 2016 entitled "Bodily attachment to place – the case of elderly migrants from Poland and Pakistan in Norway", in the journal "Transnational Social Review".

work in the state they have benefits, they are very well paid, and they have a pension. But those who have worked in private you know these private sectors they do not get – they only get paid for the day they are at work and after that nothing.

But we have worked here and have a good pension and not that much debt, right? And there are other facilities for example free or almost free doctors. You have your deductibles and after that the doctor is free, medication is free, so right. These facilities – we do not have them in Pakistan – so when comparing our situation with that of people living in Pakistan, I have to say that we have been lucky".

The excerpt above illustrates how Akbar compares the welfare system in Pakistan, to that in Norway. This comparison is based on his former experiences with living in Pakistan, and his continued ties to people in Pakistan through regular return visits. As we see, what emerges is the strong selectivism of the Pakistani welfare state support system, compared to the relative degree of universalism in the Norwegian system. Moreover, the facilities such as cheap and accessible health care makes him feel lucky that he lives in Norway, compared to the situation in Pakistan. The excerpt also illustrates how Akbar's experiences with the health care system in Norway also manifests itself in intimate and detailed knowledge of the way in which the Norwegian welfare system works. As already described in the introduction to this chapter – an intimate familiarity and knowledge of the physical surroundings developed through life long or long-term residence in a place – constitutes a key feature of insideness. In the excerpt above, this intimate familiarity is not related to the physical surroundings, as in the original meaning of the term, but rather to the overall welfare system. This indicates that a sense of belonging can be obtained, not only through identification with the physical surroundings, but also through intimate knowledge of the welfare system. Although Akbar expresses a detailed knowledge of the Norwegian health care system, his insideness also stems from coming from outside, and having experiences with a different system. This illustrates a central dimension of migratory insideness. The transnational mode of consciousness – a sense of being both here and there – developed through experiences with both the Pakistani welfare system and the Norwegian system manifests itself in a double view

where Akbar is able to consider what he perceives as the strengths and weaknesses in both.

As you may recall, Akbar very much adheres to an ideal of Pakistani family life consisting of joint living arrangements, with several generations living together under the same roof, despite this arrangement being practically unavailable to him. As described in chapter 5, he contrasts ageing within a Pakistani family – characterised by strong degree of solidarity and family unity – with what he perceives to be the Norwegian way of ageing, characterised by isolation and detachment from adult children. Consequently, the strengths of the Norwegian system as compared to the Pakistani in this case, is the availability and accessibility of benefits and services for all legal residents. These benefits and services are not available in Pakistan, or at least only available to a select few. These differences make life in Norway attractive for Akbar, and he feels like he has been lucky. The weaknesses of this system, however, compared to the Pakistani system is what he perceives to be a lack of solidarity and family care.

Akbar receives home based care from a nurse every evening. The nurse assists him with injecting the insulin he needs. This form of care requires physical co-presence between caregiver and care receiver. Akbar states that if he were to live in Pakistan, he would not get this kind of care, and he would become dependent on his extended kin. He does not want to rely on extended kin for care, as would be the common practice if he were to live in Pakistan. This suggests that – not only is his way of thinking about the Norwegian system shaped by his experiences of the system in Pakistan – but his way of thinking about the system in Pakistan is shaped by his experiences with the Norwegian system. Whereby, reliance on kin in emergencies would be considered a viable, perhaps even natural option in Pakistan (Qureshi,2012), this is not something which Akbar considers to be desirable, having the opportunities to be relatively independent from extended kin in Norway.

The entitlement to welfare state services and benefits in Norway also seems to contribute to a sense of belonging for Magdalena who was introduced in chapter 5. Because of arthritis, Magdalena receives assistance with cleaning and grocery shopping from a home helper twice a week. Magdalena lives in sheltered housing. This sheltered housing is an apartment partly financed by the municipality and which has facilities to make living at home with a disability easier. This apartment is an important source of her well-being and feelings of independence from her two daughters which she describes as important to her. She spends most of her time in her hospital bed, which she received from the Norwegian Labour and Welfare administration (Nav). This bed is adjusted so that she does not need help to get out of bed in the mornings when her arthritis is particularly painful. She has also developed a routine primarily attached to this hospital bed where – unless preoccupied elsewhere – she spends most of her days listening to the radio and solving crossword puzzles. The aid that Magdalena receives from the welfare state is crucial for her well-being. Prior to receiving this aid, she had difficulty getting out of bed in the morning, and she became more dependent on help from her daughters, which as has already been described in chapter 5, she does not want to, because she wants to preserve their loving relationship.

When asked about entitlements and aid in Poland, Magdalena replies that although medical treatment is free or cheap in Poland, it is often of poor quality, and that she would not gain access to the same aid as she has in Norway. This makes life in Norway attractive for her and constitutes a major reason why she does not consider going back, although she remains in contact with friends and family in Poland.

Both Akbar's and Magdalena's way of comparing of the Norwegian welfare state with the opportunities of care and support in their respective countries of origin may be analysed in terms of a transnational mode of consciousness. In the above, this transnational mode of consciousness consists of having former experiences with both the system in their country of origin, and experiences with the Norwegian welfare system. However, it is also important to point out that their perceptions of

opportunities for care and support in their countries of origin are shaped by their lived experiences of the Norwegian welfare context. This is particularly reflected in Akbar's expression of not wanting to rely on extended kin for care and support. Thus, Akbar and Magdalena's comparison may be understood in terms of migratory insideness. Having experiences with a different system of care and support than the Norwegian one enables them to assess the Norwegian welfare state from the perspective of an outsider. On the other hand, they have spent important parts of their lives in Norway. This means that it is not only the Norwegian welfare state that is compared to how they subjectively perceive the welfare system to be in their country of origin, but their perception of the system in their country of origin is also shaped by their experiences in the Norwegian context. Thus, from the position of *in-between*, Magdalena and Akbar assess both support systems from the perspective of both an insider and an outsider. They can look at both the Norwegian welfare system and the system in their countries of origin from the perspective of an outsider, while at the same time possessing an insideness in relation to both places.

2.2 Combining ageing in place with pendular migration

Although Norway constitutes the formal and primary place of residence for the older migrants in this study, most of them travel extensively both to Pakistan and Poland, but also to other countries. Thus, they maintained so called "pendular migration*"*[54] (Fokkema, Cela & Witter, 2015). This pendular migration reflects the life stage that the older migrants are in. They are retired, but they are still in the active period of life because they do not have any serious health problems which could potentially hamper their opportunities to travel. This finding is in line with findings from former studies on older migrants and their transnational mobility patterns (Amman & Holten, 2013).

---

[54] The concept of pendular migration contains similarities with Parreñas' (2010) concept of circular migration. This concept refers to short term migration, where migrants move back and forth between a sending and receiving country. According to Parreñas (2010) this circular migration is distinct from transnational migration. Transnational migration maintains that there is a balance between migrant's allegiances to the sending and receiving society, whereas the framework of circular migration as proposed by Parreñas (2010) places the sending country as the main point of allegiance and belonging. The literature on ageing and migration primarily identifies migrants back and forth movement as pendular migration. Given that the migrants in this study have their formal place of residence in Norway and, and that the focus of the chapter is to show how they have developed balanced and multiple place attachments, I find the concept of pendular migration to be more applicable in the analysis in this chapter.

However, access to health care and incorporation in the Norwegian welfare state seems to have a role to play regarding the duration of their stays abroad. This is particularly the case for the Pakistani older migrants in this study. This is illustrated through the interview with Ashwariya. When asked about her life after retirement, and what constitutes a good old age to her she responds:

> Ashwariya: "Oh well I am not really sure (laughs) it is hard to know how life goes but I will try my best because as I told you before I am a bit stubborn so I would prefer to manage on my own if I can. If I need help I cannot but that's destiny and I cannot do anything about that but we have planned that we want to spend some time in Pakistan, India and Dubai too for two or three months because that is good for our health. At the same time, I am in the system now and I have yearly checkups because of my illnesses and my son and daughter in law my family they live here. But now we are free and can spend some time abroad and that way not be a strain on our society and Norwegian people because they are really nice people and they have helped us a lot and we must not take advantage and I do not want to be a person who just gets and gets (…) And I have to be content I have a good husband, I have a son, a house in peaceful Norway the best country in the world I have been to the US but I still think this is the best country in the world it is the best to live here and we are lucky"

This excerpt illustrates two dimensions of migratory insideness in relation to the welfare state. Firstly, it illustrates how ageing migrants seems to distance themselves from being a burden on the welfare state, or in Ashwariya's words; "strain on our society and Norwegian people", and the emphasis placed on managing on one's own for as long as possible. Secondly, it illustrates how being in the system influences the transnational mobility patterns of some Pakistani older migrants. I shall return to the former in a separate section of this chapter, and in the following I concentrate on the latter.

As we see in the excerpt, Ashwariya spends a few months a year in Pakistan or a different country that is close to Pakistan. The good climate in these areas are beneficial to Ashwariya's health. Thus, the travels of Ashwariya and her husband bares resemblance to the travels of so-called "sunbelt migrants" (Warnes et al., 2004), or "snowbirds" (Williams, King & Warnes, 1997), i.e. northern Europeans migrating to areas where the climate is good for their health – either permanently or during seasons when the climate in Northern Europe is particularly cold or harsh. However, the checkups that Ashwariya has in Norway shapes when and for how long she and her husband can travel. Ashwariya could probably get check-ups in Pakistan as well. However, the very fact of what she refers to as "being in the system" in Norway seems to constitute an important factor in her decision making and planning. This finding is supported by Hunter (2018) and Schaeffer (2001). In Hunter's study of retired labour migrants from Morocco in France he finds that the availability of accessible and affordable health care services, shapes older migrants' mobility patterns. While preferring to stay in Morocco and considering Morocco to be their home, these migrants travel back and forth to utilise the health care system in France. This is linked to the availability of free health care, and to "having a well-established medical relationship in Francse" (Schaeffer, cited in Hunter, 2018, p. 89). Moreover, Hunter identifies that having a chronic illness or a disease requires regular monitoring by doctors or other health care personnel, which in turn serves to shape the timing and duration of the migrants' back and forth movement.

There is a difference between the Polish and Pakistani older migrants when it comes to how access to health care shapes their mobility patterns. As I have already mentioned, Magdalena states that medical services are free or cheap in Poland. The same cannot be said about medical services in Pakistan. This relates to Polish membership in the EU. This means that migrants legally residing in any EU or EEA member state are covered by a sickness insurance and have access to Polish public health care, and the costs of this is recoverable by their country of residence (Ackers, 2004; Coldron & Ackers, 2007).Thus, Polish residents in Norway may experience that they have free access to health care in Poland, regardless of their citizenship

status. This means the Polish older migrants have the same right to health care in Poland as they have in Norway regardless of whether they have maintained their Polish citizenship, although the quality of services may differ. The Pakistanis, being legal residents or having attained citizenship status in Norway, also have this right within the EU. However, they do not have the same rights in Pakistan. The difference in how this shapes mobility is best illustrated in the case of Jelena, who was introduced in chapter 5.

Because of her mother still being alive in Poland, Jelena travels to Poland quite frequently, also to care for her mother. During one of these travels Jelena had a stroke and was hospitalised. During the interview she does not say much about her experiences when she was in hospital. However, she does state that she was able to access the health care system, because of her European health insurance card. Thus, Jelena can travel freely back and forth between Poland and Norway, without having to worry about what would happen if she got sick. Even though Jelena also has arthritis, which is a chronic illness, it does not seem to make a difference to her if she gets treatment in Poland or in Norway. However, the entitlement to free or cheap health care does not involve entitlement to long-term care for older people. Due to her mother being sick, and her father having had Alzheimer Jelena has also had experiences with long term care for older people in Poland. During the interview she discusses this:

> Jelena: "my father he was in a you know this kind of old age home his last years, but he had Alzheimer and we could not help him much. And that was very hard on my mother. Everything is private and but if you are in an institution it costs a lot of money just like here right. And in Poland pensions are not that great and you have to spend almost everything on the institution".

This excerpt illustrates that to Jelena, incorporation in the Norwegian welfare state is not as important for her decisions regarding when to travel and for how long. Consequently, her incorporation in the Norwegian welfare and health care system is

not as important to her as it is for Ashwariya. However, despite this difference between Ashwariya and Jelena there is one major similarity which deserves mention.

Even though incorporation in the welfare state shapes Ashwariya's transnational mobility patterns, another important reason for Norway being her main place of residence is the presence of her son and daughter in law in Norway. Jelena on the other hand, does not have any close kin in Norway, and considers returning to Poland to be close to her mother, and thereby be able to provide her with more hands-on care and support. The caregiving responsibilities Jelena has towards her mother seems to be the most important factor in her consideration of return. When asked about her future plans she mentions returning to Poland as an option, which would enable her to provide more personal hands-on care for her mother. Thus, these findings illustrate the complexities of older migrants' decision-making processes regarding staying in the destination country of migration, returning to their country of origin, or travelling back and forth between the two. Although incorporation in the welfare and health care system in Norway is of importance, at least to Ashwariya, the whereabouts of family members seems to be of equal – or even of higher importance. This finding is also supported by former research on factors shaping the transnational movements of older migrants, and their decision-making processes regarding return. Several different factors shape this decision. The research into this area specifically highlights both the place of residence of family members as well availability of health care as important factors, particularly for older migrants experiencing a decline in their health (cf. Bolzman, Fibbi & Vial,2006; Ganga, 2006; Liversage & Mirdal, 2017; Razum, Sahin-Hodoglugil & Polit, 2005)

The excerpt from the interview with Jelena illustrates another dimension of migratory insideness in relation to the Norwegian welfare system. Although Jelena's experiences with the private institutions in Poland were not that good as she found them to be too expensive, Jelena equates these experiences with institutional care in Norway – which she also finds to be too expensive. There is a major difference between the Polish system of long-term care for older people and the Norwegian system. As already mentioned in chapter 2, family members are the primary

caregivers for care dependent older people in Poland. This means that provision of public long-term care is limited – paving the way for private for-profit services, paid though private out of pocket payments. Thus, in Poland, formal care in private institutions is only available for people who have the financial means to pay for these services (Golinowska, 2010; Golinowska & Sowa-Kofta, 2018). By contrast, Norway has an income-based system. Recipients of institutional care pay a fee for care, room, and board, which is deducted from their pension, while keeping a small amount of their income for personal expenses (Otnes, 2015). Thus, the statement of Jelena reflects a lack of knowledge of the intimate details of the system, which manifests itself in the perception that the Norwegian and Polish system are very similar. In the chapter on contextual backgrounds, I have described how there has historically speaking been a system of formal state provided care for older people in Poland, but that this has mostly been available for older people who do not have the opportunity of family care. Nonetheless, the fact that there has been a formal system in place makes the Polish system appear more like the Norwegian system than it is. This apparent similarity seems to be particularly strong in situations where there is a lack of intimate knowledge about how the system works. Thus, Jelena's account indicates that migratory insideness, is not necessarily based on knowledge of the system, but it can sometimes also be based on assumptions and preconceived notions of the welfare system in Norway.

3. Ambivalent welfare state relations

As we have seen so far, migratory insideness is expressed through a transnational mode of consciousness. In relation to the welfare state this transnational mode of consciousness entails being both inside and outside in relation to two different welfare systems simultaneously. In the former sections of this chapter I have argued that this process of being both inside and outside in relation to two different welfare systems enables older migrants to assess both systems through a double view. This double view is particularly visible in the case of Akbar, who, based on experiences with the welfare system in Norway and Pakistan, can assess what he perceives to be the strengths and weaknesses of both. This process may be described through the

concept of *ambivalence*. In the following I shall discuss further aspects of how ambivalence in relation to the welfare state is expressed through accounts from the participants in the study.

3.1 Trust based on experiences with the system

Most of the participants in this study talked about welfare provisions and services in general terms and often talked about welfare and health care institutions, such as Nav hospitals, general practitioners interchangeably. This is particularly the case for the participants in the study who are not yet in need of long-term care services, but who have had some experiences with welfare institutions in relation to important life course transitions such as having children, retirement, or sickness. This suggests that, rather than possessing detailed knowledge of the different institutions and bureaucratic aspects of the welfare state, many of them have internalised a notion of the welfare state as an abstract entity that will be there in times of need The form of trust which the older migrants exhibit bares similarities to what Giddens (1990, p. 80) defines as "trust in abstract systems" – meaning trust which is not necessarily established in face-to-face interactions but rather through faith in symbolic tokens or expert systems. This trust in abstract systems – such as the Norwegian welfare state exists independently of having experiences of direct encounters with individuals or groups who are responsible for these abstract systems. However, as we shall see trust in abstract systems – such as the welfare system – may become reinforced or weakened through such encounters.

When asked to reflect upon life after retirement in Norway, as compared to what they think life would be like in Poland or Pakistan, the topic of the welfare state as a sociopolitical system came up. This is illustrated in the interview with Abid, a 73-year-old Pakistani man, interviewed in his home. Abid came to Norway in 1969 and had been living in Norway for 45 years at the time of the interview. He holds two master's degrees from Pakistan in humanities subjects, and he came to Norway to work. In Norway, he got employment first in a factory, then as native language instructor in a local school. He received a disability benefit at the age of 54 and retired from his job permanently at the age of 60 due to health issues. He has two

children who live nearby. At the time of the interview, he lived with his wife. When asked about retirement in Norway, compared to what he thinks retirement life would be like in Pakistan, he responds:

> Abid: "It is very clear that life here is very easy and controlled no problem – no disease problem, no problems at work, or with income or problems like that. But you feel lonely and sometimes when you are out there, people all around they do not care about me and I do not care about them so only doing our own things and thinking our own way. Luckily, you do not need to beg any help from them, from the government and the department. They are ready to help you just ring them and they will give guidance that you get, or banking and health care assistance like that"

The sentiment expressed by Abid in this excerpt can be described as a feeling of being safe and secure – which is provided by having a safety net through relatively stable institutions such as the welfare state, labour unions and health care institutions. Thus, his description of life in Norway after retirement may be described as an enactment of trust in welfare state institutions, manifested in the expectation that if you are in need there is always someone you can contact that will assist you. Given the phrasing of the question, there is also an implicit comparison to what life would be like in Pakistan. As already described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, Pakistan has experienced massive political tensions, upheavals, and conflicts since its establishment in 1947. This has hampered – amongst other things – the development of stable governmental institutions, including welfare state development (Memon et al, 2011). Thus, compared to Pakistan, Abid perceives of Norway as being a safe and secure place to spend his retirement. This perception may have been strengthened by the fact that his former experiences with the welfare system – for instance when applying for a disability benefit and in relation to retirement – has gone smoothly without any great difficulties. This may have shaped his future expectations that should he need help and assistance he would get it. This interpretation is supported by findings from former research on trust and welfare state institutions (cf. Friberg & Elgvin, 2016; Vrålstad, 2012). These studies suggest that trust in welfare state

institutions is achieved in situations where a person has not faced any great barriers in accessing welfare state benefits and services. The interpretation is also supported by Naldemirci's (2013) study on older Turkish migrants in Sweden. He finds that older Turkish women in Sweden placed a great deal of trust in Swedish welfare and health care institutions based on their recollection of former positive experiences with these institutions.

However, despite his positive assessment of the Norwegian welfare state as a sociopolitical system, Abid does not want to stay in Norway, and states that he does not want to die here. One of the reasons for this is his feelings of loneliness and detachment from other people in Norway. The ambivalence expressed in Abid's answer is not directly related to his perception of the Norwegian welfare state, although the welfare state does have a role to play. Rather, Abid is ambivalent about life in Norway in general terms. His feelings of ambivalence may therefore be described in terms of feeling safe but lonely. Positive experiences of receiving benefits and services in times of need in Norway, makes him feel safe. However, he still feels detached both from native Norwegians and other Pakistani migrants in Norway, and this sense of detachment strengthens his desire to return to Pakistan. I shall return to Abid's sense of isolation and detachment in chapter 7, on migratory social embeddedness.

The Polish older migrants in this study also share the feeling of safety and security due to the support of the Norwegian welfare state. Most of the Polish older migrants, however, are more concerned with the idea of maintaining their independence for as long as possible and not becoming dependent on any benefits and services from the state. This emphasis on independence shall be returned to in the next subsection of the chapter. When it comes to questions about health, and what they would do if they were in bad health, they only gave brief responses, indicating that they had not given it much thought. This may reflect the fact that most of them do not have any severe physical health problems and have therefore not reflected on what would happen in their health situation would become worse, but it could also relate to a feeling of safety emanating from being covered by the collective safety net of the Norwegian

welfare state. Thus, like Abid, many of the Polish older migrants seem to have internalised a notion of the welfare state as something that is there in times of crisis. As such, the welfare state has become something which many of the older migrants take for granted, contributing to their feelings of safety. As already stated in the introduction of this chapter, autobiographical insideness denotes an attachment to place which is generally taken for granted and rarely overtly communicated. Thus, the fact that the Polish and the Pakistani older migrants seem to take the support system in Norway for granted indicates the insideness that they have developed in Norway. However, this insideness does not stem from a lifelong socialisation into a society – rather it has developed in adulthood – through their former life course experiences of the Norwegian welfare state during the duration of 20+ years that they have been in Norway.

However, feeling safe and trusting the welfare system is something which can easily be challenged by negative experiences and encounters with the system. This is illustrated if we contrast Abid's description to that of Noman, who was introduced in chapter 5. As you may recall, Noman fears for his personal safety in Norway, and these fears are partly related to his feelings of not being treated fair and reasonably by welfare providers. He mentions having applied for financial assistance several times. One time he also applied for a parking permit for disabled persons. Because he had written that he was able to walk for 300 meters rather than 100 meters – which according to him was the cutoff point – his application was denied. In the interview, he relates this to narrow and bureaucratic standards, rules, and regulations. The problems that Noman has faced when it comes to getting a parking permit for disabled people relates to this being a legal right. In a study of the historical development of user controlled personal assistance scheme (BPA) in Norway, Christensen (2016) finds that before the BPA was established as a legal right, the arrangement was available to a relatively broad group of users. However, when it was formalised as a legal right it became subject to several eligibility criteria, drawing clear cut boundaries as to who is eligible and who is excluded from this right. Thus, in practice, establishing a legal right to BPA weakened the arrangement because fewer people were given access to the arrangement. The case of BPA illustrates that

the establishment of a service, entitlement, or benefit as a legal right also entails the development of clearly defined eligibility criteria. Noman is not familiar with these formal and informal rules of the system and is left with the impression that benefits and services are impossible to get.

Consequently, Noman' encounters with the system, manifests itself in a mistrust of the Norwegian welfare system in general. Thus, as Friberg & Elgvin (2016) point out, perceived negative encounters with the welfare system might lead to distrust of the system. As was already mentioned in chapter 5, Noman also expresses fears of being treated with suspicion by health care providers, and the police if anything would happen to his wife – which contributes to feelings of insecurity and anxiety.

3.2 Avoiding being a burden on the Norwegian welfare state

As already described, many of the Polish older migrants are mostly content with the welfare state safety net in Norway, and if they do have any complains they are mostly preoccupied with getting information on preventative measures to stay healthy longer. This suggests that they have internalised a central idea of the activity theory, namely the idea of individual responsibility to – as far as possible – take control of the ageing process through a series of preventative measures such as maintaining an active and healthy lifestyle (Bakken, 2016). This emphasis may also relate to another major concern for the older Polish migrants, namely a concern with being portrayed as a burden to the Norwegian welfare state. This is visible not only in their focus on preventative measures, but also on their emphasis on how much they have actively contributed to the Norwegian welfare state, by having worked and paid taxes in Norway for over 20 years. In fact, some of the Polish older migrants distanced themselves from the question of how they get help and assistance in daily lives, and instead encouraged me to ask them about how much they have contributed to Norwegian society. Moreover, when I called upon them for an interview many of them asked what the purpose of the study was and expressed difficulties in understanding why I was interviewing them and Pakistani older migrants, as if they were somehow the same. This may be understood considering the concept of dependence and independence, and the meanings attributed to these concepts.

As already described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, worries about welfare dependency gained pace during the 1990s onwards, due to increased concerns about welfare budgets and growth in public spending in Norway. Concerns were raised that generous benefits and services would act as an incentive not to seek paid employment. As reiterated in chapter 2, migrants have been strongly implicated in these debates – and integration policies have historically speaking concentrated on the integration of migrants into the labour market to prevent long-lasting welfare dependency (Brochmann & Hagelund, 2012)

Thus, the emphasis that the Polish older migrants place on having contributed through having worked and paid taxes – rather than merely receiving benefits – can be understood as a way of avoiding being placed in the stigmatised category of dependents. Moreover, their emphasis on the dissimilarity between themselves and the Pakistani migrants may be interpreted as a form of boundary work. As already discussed in the chapter on theoretical frameworks, the concept of boundary work refers to the subjective boundaries that are drawn between oneself and others (Lamont, 1992, p. 9). This form of boundary work emerges when we try to define who we are by distinguishing ourselves from others. By asking me what it is that I think the Polish older migrants have in common with the Pakistani older migrants, while at the same time arguing that they have contributed – unlike what they perceive the Pakistani older migrants to have done – they distinguish themselves from other migrants who they perceive as taking advantage of welfare state benefits and services.

Some of the Pakistani older migrants also distanced themselves from a notion of being burdens on the welfare state. This can be seen in the excerpt presented from the interview with Ashwariya, in section 2.2 of this chapter. In this excerpt Ashwariya clearly distances herself from being a burden on the welfare state by stating that she would like to manage on her own for as long as possible. She also expresses a great sense of gratitude from what she has received in Norway. This expression of gratitude can also be found among native Norwegian older people, although there are indications that this expression of gratitude is gradually becoming of replaced by a

more demanding attitude in relation to welfare state services (Christensen, 2012, p.586). However, Ashwariya's expression of gratitude may also be understood in terms of Gullestad's (2002a) metaphor of the host-guest relationship between migrants and native Norwegians. As described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, the host-guest metaphor forms part of the dominant ideas, values and taken for granted assumptions surrounding membership in the nation. In the host-guest metaphor migrants – regardless of their length of residence in Norway – are regarded as guests who should be grateful towards the hospitality exhibited by native Norwegian people. In light of the host-guest metaphor Ashwariya's statement "Norwegian people are nice people and they have helped us a lot and we mustn't take advantage and I don't want to be a person who just gets and gets", may be interpreted as her having internalised this image. Consequently, in this interpretation her expression of gratitude – and of not wanting to be a burden – is directly related to her position as being both inside and outside in relation to Norwegian society and the Norwegian community of solidarity.

Among the Pakistani migrants there is also a sense of stigma concerning receiving welfare state benefits and services. This stigma is related to two different aspects. Firstly, it is tied to strong norms of family care within the Pakistani community in Norway. As discussed in chapter 5, this stigma predominantly applies to situations where older Pakistani migrants have to make use of formal care services. The second source of stigma is – similar to the Polish older migrants – the association of receiving welfare benefits and services with pejorative moral characteristics.

The association of receiving welfare state benefits and services with stigma emerged in the interview with Fehrooz and Shamina, an older Pakistani couple. At the time of the interview Fehrooz was 68 years old, and had been in Norway since 1973, that is for 41 years. Initially when he came to Norway, he had several different temporary manual jobs – before eventually landing a permanent job as an office clerk – a job he describes as very good and comfortable. He had this job until his retirement at the age of 67. His wife Shamina, was 61 years old at the time of the interview. She came to Norway along with her four children, to reunify with her husband in 1977. She

wanted to stay at home and care for her children when they were small, but once they were older and more independent, she decided to apply for a job. She got a part time job in a local nursery school. However, she has arthritis and chronic headaches, which made the job very demanding for her. In consequence, she applied for a disability benefit. At the time of the interview, their youngest daughter had just moved back to Norway from London where she was studying for her master's degree, and she lived with Fehrooz and Shamina. They describe this as a temporary arrangement. At the time of the interview, their three other children lived a few hours' drive away from where Shamina and Fehrooz lived. All their children had busy schedules, but they still managed to call and visit on a regular basis – sometimes assisting their parents with practical tasks around the house such as vacuum cleaning.

Shamina describes the time before her husband's retirement as difficult. She would have great difficulty getting things done around the house and this made her very sad. When asked about applying for any type of assistance Shamina responds that she would like to have some assistance. Fehrooz agrees with Shamina that it would be nice to have some assistance around the house when he is not there, and she is not feeling well. However, he was adamant that they could manage on their own, and he did not believe that they would get any assistance anyway.

During the interview, Fehrooz also shared some reflections about the use of public benefits and services in general:

> Fehrooz: "It is like I would say it is a fantastic system this social system here in Norway. It is very fantastic for those who need it, but there is a high abuse of the system which I am against. According to my experience from around and I have learned from my job about people you know. And if someone needs help in a positive way that I do not mind, but it is a misuse you know getting money from Nav, bought some alcohol and lie down on the street. And these sorts of things we discuss amongst colleagues you know. And that's why you have to make sure that people are actually in need of help"

In the excerpt above Fehrooz expresses concern that welfare services and benefits should only be for people in need, and he is critical of what he perceives as being

misuse of the system. Thus, he draws on a distinction between the deserving and the undeserving recipients of welfare benefits and services. At the same time, he has already described that he and his wife might need care services in the future. Thus, drawing on an established distinction between the deserving and the undeserving recipient, may also, as was the case with the Polish older migrants, be understood as a form of boundary work.

In her study of working-class men in the US and France, Lamont (2000) argues that members of the working class draw moral boundaries between themselves and others to preserve a sense of dignity. These boundaries are drawn towards people who are above them in the socioeconomic hierarchy, as well as to those who are below them – such as the poor, so called "welfare dependents" and part-time workers. Considering this concept of boundary work, Fehrooz' statement may be understood as a reaction to finding himself in – and attempting to – negotiate a quite ambiguous position. On the one hand, he is afraid of being regarded as someone who takes advantage of welfare benefits and services, and on the other hand, he is afraid of potentially becoming in need of such benefits and services in the future. One way to handle this ambiguous position is to draw on a distinction between the deserving and the undeserving. It may be argued that by making this distinction Fehrooz is also able to set himself apart from the stigmatised category of welfare dependents. By placing himself in the category of persons who would apply for benefits and services only if he and his wife are really in need, Fehrooz sets himself and his wife up as being the deserving recipients of benefits and services.

This way of drawing moral boundaries was not only present in the interview with Shamina and Fehrooz but was also present in the interviews with many of the other Pakistani participants in this study. They would oftentimes emphasise that Pakistanis have come to Norway and built the country, which not only signals a strong work ethic, but also set them apart from the more newly arrived refugees, who some of the Pakistanis see as receiving too much support from the welfare state. Thus, in this interpretation, this may be understood as a way of drawing moral boundaries to

preserve dignity, particularly in the face of being subjects to stigmatising descriptions in Norwegian mainstream media.

I will argue that the emphasis placed on their contributions to the welfare state by both the Pakistanis and the Polish older migrants also relates to migratory insideness – characterised by being simultaneously inside and outside of the nation as a community of solidarity. As already described in the chapter on theoretical frameworks, the nation may be understood as among other things a community of solidarity. Migrants, as they are considered outsiders coming into the community of solidarity, they are not seen as part of the social security net which have been developed by the national community. Consequently, integration of migrants into the welfare state has had a touch of illegitimacy and abuse (Wimmer & Schiller, 2003, p.84). The migrants in this study are incorporated in the broader welfare state system through having lived in Norway for significant parts of their adult and working lives – both being at the receiving end of welfare state benefits and services – as well as contributing to the welfare state through having worked and paid taxes. At the same time, they have been perceived of as being outside of the Norwegian welfare state, conceived of as a community of solidarity. As described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, since the 1980s migrants have to an increasing extent come to be regarded as unworthy recipients of support and benefits. They are regarded as placing a burden on welfare budgets, at the expense of the needs of native Norwegian people – who are in this juxtaposition – considered more worthy by virtue of being Norwegian (Gullestad, 2002a). Older migrants seems to be in a situation where they have to negotiate this tension, between being perceived as an outsider to the community of solidarity, while at the same time recognizing themselves as having been largely involved in the process of developing this community of solidarity – through having worked and paid taxes, or – as the Pakistani migrants emphasised – through having "built the country".

4. Adaptation and opposition in the long-term care services

Only three of the interviewees Ibrahim, Akbar, and Magdalena, have experiences with the formal long-term care services.

Ibrahim is a 70-year-old man who migrated to Norway from a rural area in Pakistan in 1969. At the time of the interview he had been living in Norway for 45 years. Besides primary school he has no formal education from Pakistan. After having worked for several years in different manual occupations in Norway, he had saved up enough money to establish a small grocery shop, which is now run by one of his two sons. He lives with his wife and one of his sons, his daughter-in-law, and grandchildren. His daughter-in-law takes care of practical tasks around the house. Ibrahim has severe heart problems, bad eyesight, and general old age-related physical disability. He receives assistance from a home-based nurse twice a week to distribute medicine. Thus, Ibrahim receives both formal long-term care, and informal care by his daughter in law. This way of managing ones care needs between formal and informal care is quite common in Norway – both among migrants (cf. Ingebretsen,2011; Nergård, 2009) – as well as among the majority population (Berge et al., 2014; NOU, 2011:17). Whereas formal care providers provide medical assistance, informal caregivers aid with lighter care tasks, for instance with practical tasks such as cooking and cleaning (Otnes, 2015). What sets Ibrahim apart from most native older Norwegian people is that he lives with his son and daughter-in-law. This creates better opportunities for care and assistance round the clock but may in turn also place greater demands on his daughter-in-law to provide for him. By maintaining this arrangement, Ibrahim is also able to maintain the Pakistani tradition of joint living, and family care, whilst he is also assisted with medical needs that his daughter-in-law is unable to do. Consequently, Ibrahim and his family have found a way to maintain the Pakistani tradition of family care in Norway, while at the same time being able to take advantage of the opportunities of social care services in Norway.

Ibrahim seems to be content with the service he receives from the home-based nurse. During the interview he says that he has complied with the medical advice that the

nurse has provided him with, and that he agrees with whatever she thinks is best for him. For instance, the nurse has advised him not to eat that much Pakistani food because it is bad for his health. According to Ibrahim he has been advised to eat "Norwegian" food such as sandwiches made of wholegrain bread, instead of Pakistani food. Thus, in the interview with Ibrahim, it seems as he has been presented with a dichotomous image of ethnic patterns of food consumption by his home based care provider – whereby Pakistani food habits are considered to be unhealthy – and Norwegian food habits are considered to be healthy.[55] It seems that Ibrahim has passively and uncritically accepted this view, and states that he now tries to eat mostly Norwegian foods.

Ibrahim also tells me that a few days prior to the interview the home nurse had stated that he
could probably make do with only one visit from the care services a week. I asked him if he agreed with this assessment, and his response was that if the nurse thought so, he would agree. Thus, Ibrahim seems to take on a patient role in encounters with formal care service providers where he passively accepts what the care provider advises him to do and decides on his behalf.

This way of relating to the care service provider contrasts somewhat with the way in which Akbar relates to the care service provider. Akbar has diabetes 2. A common complication of the disease is a loss of eyesight – also referred to as retinitis pigmentosa. This loss of eyesight may occur gradually or – as in Akbars' case – suddenly. A few years prior to the interview, he had been for an evening walk with his wife, when suddenly, he had problems seeing. Today he has lost 80 % of his eyesight. Due to his loss of eyesight Akbar had to retire early. He also needs help with injecting insulin. His wife has cataracts, so she is unable to help him. After being diagnosed in the hospital he was advised to contact what was then called a school for blind people, where he was informed about opportunities for getting assistance from home-based care services. At the time of the interview, he received assistance by a

---

[55] I do not possess detailed knowledge of the nature of the advice given to Ibrahim by the nurse, just his description and interpretation of the advice.

nurse or nurse assistant with injecting his insulin once every evening. On the whole Akbar is satisfied with the assistance he receives.

However, he does mention two things that he finds problematic – the timing of the arrival of the nurse, and the sex of the caretaker, given the intimate nature of the tasks at hand. When it comes to the time of the arrival of the nurse, he responds:

> Akbar: "I have experienced that sometimes they come at eight o' clock and other times they come at eleven"
>
> Interviewer: "In the evening?"
>
> Akbar: "yes and then I don't get good blood values right, if you have to do one day at eight and another day at eleven and then you must not eat after eleven you have to wait and that does not work. So, then I suggested that they come at a fixed time, but they have problems too. Sometimes they must stay later with another patient. But I asked them to come between eight and nine, because we eat sometime between five and six and then I need to measure after two hours. And that is why I asked them to come at eight, but it still happens that they call me at half past ten, right" (laughs)
>
> Interviewer: "That late? How is…"
>
> Akbar: "Right, even if they or she had been here before nine but would be late that is a problem and often I get low blood sugar at night, and when the blood sugar drops than you get shivers and it has happened that I wake up at night shivering. At present I manage tolerably without any help, but then suddenly, I start thinking that the day might come when I am completely blind, and how do I measure my blood sugar then? These thoughts they make you depressed right"

The dissatisfaction that Akbar expresses relates to a systemic problem in the organisation of care services today. As mentioned in chapter 3, the home-based care services have, from the 1980s, been facing growing pressures. This is due to, among other things, an increased differentiation of service users, while simultaneously undergoing an increased bureaucratisation and standardisation of services (Christensen, 2012). Consequently, providers of care services have become subject to a governing logic characterised by two conflicting demands; one demand that limits and standardises their time frame for conducting each individual service; and another demand for flexibility in order to accommodate each individual user's need (Førland et al., 2017). These conflicting demands means that service providers' time is strictly

controlled, while users become subject to a looser – and more flexible time frame (Førland et al. 2017; Thorsen, 2001, Vabø, 2011). This has severe consequences for Akbar because he needs to measure his blood sugar levels, and inject insulin within a fixed number of hours, to avoid hypoglycemia. His experiences with waking up at night shivering from hypoglycemia leads to psychological distress and anxieties about the future.

Although Akbar describes this as a problem, he seems sympathetic towards the care providers stating "but they have problems too. Sometimes they must stay late with another patient", and he has tried to be considerate by suggesting a flexible period of two hours directly to the nurse or nurse assistant when they have been late.

The second thing Akbar finds somewhat problematic is the sex of the care provider. This has to do with Islamic prescription regarding relations and interactions between men and women:

> Akbar: "The only thing I, maybe, I don`t know how this is like with other patients but eh I get both male and female home helpers. And according to my religion I have to show respect, and when they have to inject my insulin in my thigh, I only remove a small part, maybe four-five centimeters squared right so that they can inject. This is because of the cultural right that you yes"

What Akbar describes in the excerpt is a perceived lack of cultural sensitivity in service provision. As mentioned in the chapter 3 on contextual backgrounds, many Pakistani Muslims adhere to a strict set of norms regulating interactions and relations between members of the opposite sex. The norms are meant to secure and maintain modesty, and safeguard honour and dignity. Relevant to Akbar's situation are dress codes and norms about the level of intimacy between men and women who are not married or related to each other by blood. The dress codes are different for men and women, but for men the dress code involves covering the area from the navel to the knees (Padela & del Pozo, 2011). Thus, having to uncover your thigh for inserting a needle or to do a blood test, by a stranger of the opposite sex, might be considered in violation of these norms – and potentially harmful to the preservation of dignity. According to Victor et al. (2012) fears about violating these norms constitutes one of

the reasons why older people in South Asian communities prefer care by a family member and are reluctant to seek formal care.

Akbar does not have any children, and his wife is unable to inject him with insulin because of her cataracts. Thus, receiving this service is his only option. To cope with this issue, Akbar has developed a strategy consisting of wearing trousers where he can remove only a small piece of clothing at the place where the insulin is to be injected. This means that Akbar has adapted to a situation where his need of home-based nursing – mostly conducted by women in Norway – can be met in a way that is not in violation with the Muslim norms regulating interactions and intimacy between members of the opposite sex. Because of this adaptation, having a female nurse or nurse assistant is relatively unproblematic to Akbar. However, he does state that the gender of the caretaker might be more problematic for women, where norms regulating dress codes and modes of intimacy are more extensive.

The other person using formal long-term care services is Magdalena, who was introduced at length in chapter 5. As already stated, she receives assistance from a home helper with cleaning and grocery shopping once a week. Like Akbar she was advised to apply for these services, including an accommodated residence, after she had been hospitalised for a heart attack. She received assistance from a social worker in filling out the application form. At first Magdalena was not content with the residence which the municipality offered her because it was too cold. They were planning on installing heating cables under the floor, but it turned out that this was too expensive – so they offered her another apartment. At first Magdalena was not interested, but she decided to check it out and then to accept the apartment because it had a balcony and a view of a nice park.

Magdalena had some complaints about the quality of the help she gets. The source of her dissatisfaction is the varying quality of the cleaning.

> Magdalena: "yes mostly they do vacuum cleaning or wash the floor. The problem is that each time there is a new person. And the one is very good at cleaning but the other one is not so good, and there are new people coming each time and it is I do not know random. One of them is very good at

polishing mirrors, and when she dustwipes the chest-of-drawers she removes things that are on top of it to dust wipe underneath. Others, well I do not think they have any specialties. So, it is very different, and there is one that you know, I complained about. This one lady she was finished doing everything she said that she had vacuumed under the sofa, cleaned and everything just in half an hour – and I do not control you know when they are cleaning in my bedroom I go to the living room. I do not want to go around and look at them – but really in this one case I should have. And then I asked her if she had done everything already and she said she did. And I sit down and see there is a pen underneath the sofa where she said that she had been vacuum cleaning. And now I am switching to a private provider"

She recounts several similar episodes where she has felt that the home helper has not done a proper job. She also states that she does not want to monitor the providers when they are doing their job and complain to them when she is dissatisfied. She expresses dissatisfaction by switching to a private provider, which one of her friends has recommended. When asked about what she expects from a private provider she explains that she has had one positive experience with one woman cleaning her apartment. This woman was described as having worked fast and managed to complete all the cleaning thoroughly. She expects the same kind of efficiency from the private provider.

The problem that Magdalena points out is also reflected in research on experiences of home-based care services among native Norwegian users (cf. Førland & Folkestad, 2016; Thorsen, 2001). As with the experiences of Akbar, these problems are related to the way in which services are organised. The implementation of normative time frames for the delivery of services means that the service provider has less time to use for each user. For the service providers this means that they must focus on the aspects of the job that they find to be least meaningful – cleaning – at the expense of social contact which they consider the most meaningful part of the job. The work is also physically and psychologically demanding, which leads to a high degree of sickness absence (Førland et al., 2017; Munkejord, Eggebø & Schönfelder, 2017; Thorsen,

2001). In consequence, recruitment for these jobs are low – and the job is often perceived as temporary on the way to a more challenging and meaningful job. This means that motivations for providing a good service may also be low (Førland et al., 2017; Thorsen, 2001). For care users, this may be perceived as a lack of respect that the household must be maintained to a certain a standard, and a neglect to understand how important this standard is for the users' presentation of self (Thorsen, 2001).

Magdalena also mentions that she does not "want to go around at look at them". This is also something that Thorsen (2001) touches upon in her study. The care user does not want to be perceived as troublesome, by monitoring and pointing out the mistakes of the care provider. According to Thorsen (2001), this illustrates how the care user is subordinate and at the care provider's mercy. However, Magdalena has the ability to take advantage of the way the system is organised by complaining directly to the municipality – and by switching to a private provider.

Both Magdalena and Akbar come across as resourceful when it comes to voicing their discontent with the services that they use. Thus, they can be described as fitting well within the new perspective on older people as representing active consumers, who are able to exert influence and make choices in relation to the care that they receive (Christensen, 2012; Christensen & Wærness, 2018). However, they do so in different ways. Their different ways of expressing their dissatisfaction can be understood in terms of Hirschman's (1970) concepts of exit and voice. Akbar's way of expressing dissatisfaction is akin to voice, where he complains directly to the service providers, rather than switching providers. Magdalena on the other hand, chooses the strategy of exit, where she switches to a different provider which he hopes will provide a better service. However, as Egger de Campo (2007, p.64-65) argues, the exit option is only possible if alternative sources of care provision – such as family members, or private providers – are available. Thus, Magdalena's way of expressing dissatisfaction is only possible because she lives in a municipality that offers alternative service providers. Both Akbar and Magdalena's way of expressing dissatisfaction may be contrasted with Ibrahim who does not express any dissatisfaction and seems to passively accept both the nurse's advice and his or her

decisions regarding how much care he should receive. This illustrates how older migrants' ability to exert influence in their own care is shaped by their resources, such as knowledge of the system and bureaucratic competence.

On an overall level, the experiences and relations of Ibrahim, Akbar and Magdalena with the social care provision serves to illustrate how migratory insideness may take on different forms, e.g. depending on cultural backgrounds. In Magdalena's case, her insideness is reflected in her intimate familiarity with the way in which the system is organised, which makes her able to exert influence and make choices regarding this care provision. Her dissatisfaction is related to the way in which the care provision is structurally organised. In Ibrahim and Akbar's case however, the position of being in-between two sociocultural contexts is more pronounced. This is mostly due to the Pakistani cultural norms and practices coming into conflict with the structural organization of the care services in Norway. In Ibrahim's case this conflict is expressed through the nutritional advise given to him by his home-based nurse or nurse assistant. In Akbar's case it is expressed through the sex of the care providers and the intimate nature of the care provided – combined this would potentially be in direct violation of Islamic prescriptions regarding interactions between men and women. Nonetheless, both Ibrahim and Akbar have found ways to reconcile their cultural norms and practices with the way in which the system of social care for older people is organised in Norway. These reconciliations enable them to receive formal care, without being in violation of Pakistani norms and prescriptions.

5. Concluding discussion

This chapter has explored how older migrants experience and relate to the Norwegian welfare state, while ageing in place in Norway. In a life course perspective, older migrants' current perceptions of the welfare state are regarded as shaped by former experiences with the welfare state, which in turn serves to shape their future expectations of care and support. Adopting a transnational perspective in this study, I have also paid attention to the older migrant's former and prevailing experiences from the welfare system in their countries of origin. Thus, through the concept of

"transnational mode of consciousness", I have explored how older migrants' position of being in-between two different welfare state systems simultaneously shape how they relate to the Norwegian welfare state.

The chapter has discussed the following questions; How do former experiences – both with the welfare system in their countries of origin, and the Norwegian welfare system – shape how they perceive of the Norwegian welfare state in later life? What role does access to welfare state benefits and services play in their decision-making process regarding where to spend their old age, and in shaping their geographic mobility patterns? How do they relate to the home-based care services, and its related demands of activity, rehabilitation, and user involvement?

The findings presented in this chapter suggest that – rather than being marginal to the welfare state in Norway – older migrants have developed an intimate familiarity with the Norwegian welfare system. In this chapter, this is analysed through the concept of "insideness". Initially developed by Rowles (1983), the concept of insideness refers to how older people develop a deep seated and intimate familiarity with their physical and social surroundings, through life long or long-term residence within the same place. In the chapter, this concept of insideness has been stretched and applied to the older migrant's relation to the welfare state, as this relationship has developed over time. However, unlike the concept insideness, as it is defined by Rowles (1983), the process of migration has shaped and continues to shape the insideness exhibited by the older migrants in this study. Consequently, I have developed the concept of migratory insideness. Like the original concept, migratory insideness is biographically articulated, albeit through experiences with two different socio-political systems. Migratory insideness is thus characterised by being in between – by balancing between two different socio-political systems simultaneously. Inspired by Simmel's (1908) concept of the stranger, I propose that migratory insideness is expressed through the process of being simultaneously inside and outside in relation to the Norwegian welfare state. This process manifests itself both in ambivalent

relationships with the welfare state, and ambivalence towards life in Norway in general.

In the chapter I argue that on the one hand, migratory insideness is exhibited in the older migrant's intimate familiarity with the welfare system. Sometimes this intimate familiarity is expressed through a detailed knowledge of how the welfare system works, but this is not necessarily always the case. Sometimes it is not based on detailed knowledge of the system, but rather through an abstract conception of the welfare state, and a trust that they will receive help if they are ever in need. Consequently, most of the older migrants expressed what Giddens (1990, p. 80) refers to as trust in abstract systems. Both the Pakistani and Polish older migrants expressed this sentiment – a sentiment that contributed to a sense of safety and security for both groups. These feelings of safety and security increases the older migrants' sense of belonging in Norway, and constitutes an important, though not the only, factor in their decision to stay in Norway after retirement. Incorporation within the Norwegian welfare system also serves to shape their mobility patterns, particularly the length of cross-border travels. These findings are in line with findings in the literature on older migrants. Migrants experiencing increasing health problems in old age contrast and compare their access with informal and formal health and social care services for older people in at least two nation-state contexts, and those who can, utilise the advantages in both (Ammann & Holten, 2013; Gardner, 2002; Hunter, 2018). The extensive delivery of formal care services by the Norwegian welfare state, which assists with independence from private arrangements such as family or market forces serves to increase older migrants' attachment to Norway. This attachment is strengthened through their comparisons with the system in their respective countries of origin, which they perceive to be lacking in several respects. However, the findings presented in this chapter indicate that the importance of access to health care services and incorporation within the Norwegian health care system is more important to the Pakistani older migrants and their mobility patterns than it is to the Polish older migrants. This is because Poland is a member of the European Union,

and therefore Polish migrants in Norway have the right to the same level, if not quality, of health care in Poland as they do in Norway.

However, there are significant ambivalences in the older migrants' relation to the welfare state. For the Pakistani migrants, ambivalence is particularly visible in how they assess the strengths and weaknesses of both the Norwegian sociopolitical system as well as the Pakistani one. The strengths of the Norwegian system are the affordable and accessible benefits and services, which in Pakistan are only available to a select few. However, the weaknesses in the Norwegian context, is what the Pakistani older migrants perceive as a lack of family solidarity. Moreover, although most of the older migrants enact a great deal of trust in the welfare state, some also describe negative experiences with the system, which manifests itself in distrust.

In the chapter, I have also discussed how older migrants relate to dominant representations of welfare dependency in Norway, and how they are implicated in these representations. This illustrates another dimension of migratory insideness. Through having lived in Norway for significant parts of their adult and working lives, the older migrants have been integrated in the welfare state, both being at the receiving end of welfare state benefits and services, as well as contributing to the welfare state through having worked and paid taxes. At the same time, they have been perceived of as being outside of the Norwegian welfare state, as it is conceived of as a community of solidarity. This is also captured in the concept of migratory insideness, whereby older migrants may be understood as both inside and outside in relation to the Norwegian welfare state. The findings in this chapter illustrates how ageing migrants relate to and draw on these dominant representations of welfare dependency, by emphasizing that they are not solely receivers of benefits and support but have also contributed to the welfare state in different ways. The findings also indicate that both the Polish and the Pakistani migrants draw on these representations by engaging in boundary work, in order to distinguish themselves from other groups who they perceive of as exploiting the generous benefits and services in the Norwegian society.

Finally, the chapter has looked at how older migrants relate to the home-based care services. In examining this relation, I find that both the Pakistani and Polish older migrants enact a strong sense of agency in different ways and according to the specific circumstances they find themselves in. One of the ways in which this is done is through engaging in self-care based on the advice from their home-based nurse or nurse assistant. Another way is through expressing their dissatisfaction with the system, and through actively making choices about the provision of care. However, while the Polish older migrant expresses dissatisfaction with the structural organisation of care services, the Pakistani older migrants are dissatisfied with both the structural and the cultural adaptation of the care services. For instance, many older Pakistani migrants adhere to Islamic prescriptions of interactions between the sexes. This means that having a care provider of the opposite sex performing care tasks of an intimate nature is perceived as problematic for many Pakistani older migrants. However, in this study, I find that the Pakistani older migrants attempted to find ways, often creative, to adapt to the way in which the system is organised – not through abandoning their own norms and customs – but by finding ways to reconcile Islamic normative behaviours with the demands of the situation in which they are in. This in turn serves to illustrate how a lack of cultural adaptation does not necessarily express itself in a complete marginalisation of older migrants in relation to these care services. Rather, the findings indicate that they sometimes find ways to reconcile the normative behaviours prescribed by their religion, with the demands of the system, without defying their own beliefs.

Chapter 7. Migratory Social Embeddedness

1. Introduction

In the previous chapters I have explored how older migrants go about getting the care and assistance that they need in everyday life. In chapter 5 I have traced this through exploring the participants' negotiations of family care and support, and in chapter 6 through exploring their relation to the welfare state. This chapter explores a different dimension of the lives of older migrants, namely their social embeddedness after retirement.

In the early literature the concept of social embeddedness is used broadly, referring to the "social relationships and institutional structures in which persons are embedded (in origin or destination communities)" (Brown, 2002, p. 7). Thus, this early scholarship used the concept of social embeddedness in a way which was similar to the life course concept of "linked lives" – concerned with how individual life courses were shaped by social relationships and networks, ranging from the household level, to community level, to larger institutional systems and structures (Brown, 2002; Portes & Sensenbrenner, 1993). This chapter takes a narrower approach to the concept, inspired by the work of Korinek, Entwistle & Jampaklay (2005) and the work of Palmberger (2017). Korinek et al (2005, p.780) define social embeddedness as "the social relationships that foster a sense of rootedness and integration in local surroundings", while Palmberger (2017, p.237) defines the concept as "social relations that foster a sense of rootedness, not in a geographically binding way but more in the form of social ties". Whereas Korinek et al (1998) link the concept directly to social relationships in a migrant's destination context, Palmberger's (2017) definition does not delimit social ties to local contexts, but remains sensitive to, and places transnational social ties on an equal footing with geographically bound relationships. While recognising the importance of networks and ties to the migrants' country of origin, the main focus in this chapter will be on the different social contexts in which older migrants are embedded in Norwegian society. As Korinek et al (1998) argue, social embeddedness in the local destination context influences

whether migrants develop a sense of belonging to that place. Consequently, in the study I consider localised social embeddedness as central to migrants' experiences of ageing in place in Norway.

The transition from working life to retirement means having to negotiate new identities according to socially constructed cultural ideals and roles surrounding that specific life stage (Moen, 2011). In line with Mead's (1934) understanding of the reflexive self – which has been discussed in the chapter on theoretical frameworks – people's identities, values, norms and sense of belonging are regarded shaped through interactions with others in specific social contexts (May & Muir, 2015). In a transnational perspective, migrants are regarded as exposed to different sets of norms and expectations from their country of origin, and the Norwegian context, and these norms and expectations are negotiated through interactions with others (Levitt & Schiller, 2006). Moreover, in an intersectional perspective, ageing experiences are crosscut in various ways by other social dimensions such as gender, class, ethnic background, and generation (May & Muir. 2015; Maynard et al, 2008; Walsh & Näre, 2016). Thus, the chapter explores how Polish and Pakistani older migrants negotiate different aspects of their identities and ageing roles in terms of ethnicity, class, and gender through social embeddedness in different social contexts.

Palmberger (2017) places her main emphasis on social activities that are part of her participants' daily routines. However, in this chapter I shall use the concept of social embeddedness more broadly, also referring to social ties and activities that occur less frequently. I find this to be important to gain a clear understanding of the multiple and overlapping contexts of social embeddedness of older migrants. Focusing only on social practices that occur on a daily and weekly basis risks reproducing an image that ethnic and religious communities represent the only context of social embeddedness in the lives of older migrants. By also presenting empirical material on the social activities of older migrants which occur less frequently the chapter presents a broader picture of older migrants' social embeddedness in Norway – linking this to former phases of the life course.

Based on biographical interviews and ethnographic field notes the aim of the chapter is twofold. Firstly, I explore the different forms of social embeddedness among older migrants from Poland and Pakistan in Norway. Secondly, I explore how identities and roles, in terms of ageing, gender, and class, are negotiated through their social embeddedness.

The chapter starts by describing the various sources of social embeddedness that the older migrants described having in Norway, such as family, retirement groups and the local community. In this section I argue that sources of social embeddedness among older migrants are linked to earlier phases of the life course, placing emphasis on the migration and occupational trajectories of each group.

As already described in the chapter on methods and methodology, part of my participant observation consisted of following the participants around in their daily errands in the public sphere. From this fieldwork attending meetings in faith communities appeared as an important part of their routines. Moreover, the participants also talked about attending these meeting during the interviews. Thus, gatherings in relation to ethnic community organisations and faith communities emerged empirically as an important part of their lives after retirement. I also arranged to attend meetings in the Norwegian Pakistani Association for Older People (NPEF), as well as the Polish Club. I found this to be important in understanding the experiences of ageing in place, because the participants described these settings as important to them, and these associations have also been found to be important for older migrants in former research (Buffel & Phillipson, 2016; Grewal et al., 2004; Næss & Vabø, 2014; Palmberger, 2017). Consequently, the next section is devoted to an analysis of the meanings and social activities in relation to these communities. Given that these gathering points are based on a common national origin, they can be understood as habitual spaces. In contexts of migration habitual spaces may be understood as localised settings, where allegiance to a place of origin is reproduced (Fortier, 2000; Ganga, 2005, p.147). In the analysis of these habitual spaces I utilise ethnographic field notes as well as interview material describing the meanings that

the older migrants attach to participating in these spaces, as well as the different roles they occupy within them.

2. Earlier life course phases shaping social embeddedness

2.1 Social embeddedness revolving around family and the ethnic community

As we have seen in chapter 5, many of the Pakistani older migrants live with their adult children. In addition, the nature of Pakistani migration and settlement patterns in Norway means that they often have their extended family and kin living in proximity. Most of the Pakistani older migrants in this study live in the same city – not necessarily in the same neighbourhood or areas – but close enough to facilitate frequent visits. This residential pattern has also facilitated the construction of several meeting places in public, which revolve around their ethnic identifications – such as the mosque and other ethnic community organisations. I shall return to the meanings of these in section 3 of this chapter.

Thus, for most of the Pakistani older migrants in this study, family and other Pakistani migrants in Norway constitute an important context for social embeddedness in Norwegian society. The Pakistani older migrants often visit family members in Norway or gather for events in the Pakistani migrant community. However, some of the Pakistani men interviewed mentioned that over time visits from family members, particularly by their adult children has decreased – as their children have established families of their own and are preoccupied with work, friends, and hobbies. Some of them worry that in the long run this will lead to older Pakistani migrants becoming socially isolated in Norway. Thus, here we see that the passing of time might lead to an emerging generational divide between the older migrants and their adult children and grandchildren. Adult children and grandchildren have developed new ways of life, and are busy with activities and routines, which sometimes does not encompass their ageing parents and grandparents. Grewal et al. (2004) find similar worries in their study on quality of life among ageing people from different ethnic groups. They find that the Pakistani migrants interviewed are concerned that their current family life will become more challenging with the

passing of time, and particularly with respect to intergenerational ties. What seems to be at stake here is a worry that their children have grown up in a context involving a high degree of individualism, and that this individualism will replace the Pakistani sense of collectivism (Grewal et al, 2004).

As has already been mentioned in the introduction, the migration pattern of the Polish older migrants has been more individualised than the Pakistani older migrants. Consequently, the Polish older migrants in this study do not have extended kin in Norway. However, they do maintain contact with their children on a daily or weekly basis and know they can rely on their children in times of crisis. Many of the older Polish migrants, who live in the larger cities, talked about the Polish department of the Catholic Church as an important part of their weekly routines, and as an important social setting. Moreover, some also talked about organising and participating in informal breakfasts and lunches with other people from Poland who had come to Norway around the same time as they themselves did. These meetings took place either in people's homes or in local restaurants.

2.2 Social embeddedness related to former occupation

Some of the Polish older migrants talked about having maintained social ties to their former workplace after retirement. This was mainly gatherings organised by their former workplace. Piotr and Justina a recently retired Polish couple, whom I interviewed in their home, described attending these types of gatherings when these were organised, which were once every six months or so. They both came to Norway in 1987 to work as engineers in the oil industry. Given the nature of their work, the retirement group consists of many people from across the world and they interact in English.

One of the other interviewees, Lukasz who was described in Chapter 5 talked about having organised a trip to Poland for his former colleagues who are now retired, and receiving occasional visits form former colleagues. Only two of the Pakistani interviewees described having similar ties to their former workplace. One of them is Navid – who was introduced in chapter 5 – and the other one is Roobio.

When asked about his present life circumstances Navid talked about his continued involvement with his labour union, where he remained active after retirement. This organisational involvement is a source for gaining a sense of purpose by doing something which Navid finds meaningful, while at the same time maintaining contact with people outside of his family or ethnic community after retirement.

Roobio comes from a middle-class background in Pakistan. She has a bachelor's degree from Pakistan. She came to Norway in 1969, reuniting with her husband who had been living in Norway for a few years. At the time of her migration to Norway, she and her husband did not have any children yet. Roobio found the first years in Norway to be very difficult. Her husband was always working, and she felt lonely and isolated. After a while, she decided to do something about this and started to look for a job. She eventually got a job as a first language teacher. She retired from that job at the age of 63. Although she had been retired for a while at the time of interview, she still described maintaining contact with her former colleagues, who she described as her close friends. Usually this contact consists of informal home-visits for coffee or dinner. At the time of the interview, she had recently hosted such a dinner herself – serving pizza which she describes having received much praise for. She also takes weekly walks with one of her former colleagues who is also retired. Roobio's contact and conversations with her former colleagues has led her to rethink some aspects of the culturally informed roles and expectations as an ageing Pakistani woman. I shall return to this in the next section of the chapter.

There is a significant class component to the older migrants' ties to their former workplaces. The overall pattern suggests that the older migrants who have been employed in occupations that matches their education also have a stronger sense of fellowship and identity tied to their former workplace. As described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, migrants from Pakistan have mainly occupied low skilled occupations in Norway, regardless of their educational level or field. Most of the Polish older migrants, on the other hand, have mostly had occupations relating to their field of education, some have even come on professional, expert visas. Thus, their former occupation may be regarded as a source of self-realisation and meaning,

not only as a source of income. This finding is supported by studies of work orientations in low-skilled and high-skilled occupations. Studies find that high-skilled occupations offer more intrinsic rewards, such as autonomy and opportunities to make use of initiative and skills, which leads to a high degree of personal identification with that specific occupation (cf. Svalfors, Halvorsen & Andersen, 2001; Gallie, Felstead & Green, 2012). The two exceptions among the Pakistani older migrants strengthens this interpretation, especially Navid who has had employment within the field of his education in Norway, which promotes his sense of identity and belonging to his former profession.

2.3 Neighbourhood social embeddedness

Both the Polish and Pakistani older migrants describe having a good relationship with their neighbours in their local communities. However, the degree – and intensity – of these relationships varies according to where they live. For the older migrants living in one of the larger cities, this contact does not amount to anything more than polite greetings and small talk in the hallway. May & Muir (2015) present similar findings in their study on older persons in the UK and their sense of belonging to – amongst other things – their neighbourhood. They find that people described their relationship with their neighbours as good, although these neighbourhood relationships often involved maintaining a *friendly distance* (May & Muir, 2015, p.5). This is the case with both the Pakistani and the Polish older migrants who live in larger cities in Norway.

The scattered residential patterns of the Polish older migrants mean that they have settled down in both urban and rural areas. Some of the Polish older migrants who live in rural areas described having extensive social contact with their neighbours. An example of this is Krysztyna, a 67-year-old Polish woman, who lives in an apartment block in a rural area of Norway. She came to Norway in 1988 because she had met a Norwegian man – with whom she has a daughter. The relationship with the Norwegian man did not work and they split up in 1995. Following the divorce, she moved to the place where she now lives. At the time of the interview, Krysztyna lived alone. Krysztyna's daughter lives in a city which is quite far away. Beyond visits on

holidays and other special occasions, she maintains weekly contact with her daughter on skype or through telephone calls. Unlike many of the other Polish interviewees in this study, Krysztyna does not maintain much contact with other Polish migrants in Norway – nor does she feel a need for such contact. She does, however, describe having good ties to her neighbours who are close to her age. They regularly stop by each other's apartments for coffee and informal conversation. A few months prior to the interview, she also entered a romantic relationship with one of her neighbours. Thus, in her situation the neighbourhood serves as an important context for her social embeddedness in Norway. Beyond spending almost every evening with her new partner – Krysztyna also talked about having daily contact with her sister who lives in Poland, by telephone or Skype. They also share a house together in Poland, where Krysztyna lives when she is visiting Poland.

Studies on neighbourhood contact in rural and urban settings support these findings (Haugen & Villa, 2005; Lima & Slagsvold, 2009). Haugen & Villa (2005) suggest that rural neighbourhoods are more transparent and this, therefore, makes it easier to find people who have something in common with you. The above example suggests that this applies to persons with a migrant background too.

Although there are differences between the Pakistani and Polish older migrants relating to the sources of social embeddedness – differences which can at least partly be understood in relation to previous phases of the life course – ethnic and religious settings appear to be part of the daily or weekly routines for both groups of ageing migrants. I now turn to an in-depth analysis of these settings as contexts of social embeddedness for older migrants in Norway. I start with the faith communities before looking more closely at the ethnic community associations.

3. Faith communities as habitual spaces

Before analysing the meanings of faith communities for the older migrants after retirement, I find it important to describe the organisational structure of these communities. The organisational structure is important as it shapes access to different

settings, different roles that older migrants occupy in these settings, and the characteristics of interactions taking place within them.

There are important differences between the structural organisation of the mosque and the Catholic Church. Whereas formal organisation in the mosque appear quite controlled – particularly in terms of religious obligations (such as prayer five times a day), and the practice of gender segregation, the social gatherings in the church appear to be more loosely and informally organised. I will now describe the organisational structure of these settings in detail, before analysing the meanings of these for the older migrants.

3.1 The organisational structure of the faith communities

Both the mosque and the Catholic Church may be described as "*multipurpose socioreligious centres",* meaning they are not only arenas for religious rituals but also for other types of community rituals and events (Mazumdar & Mazumdar,2008, p. 324).

Depending on practical issues such as available space, and financial resources the mosques in Norway perform many different functions, in which the overall purpose is to be a ritual gathering place for Muslims. In other words, it constitutes an Islamic space where people may experience a sense of belonging by performing Islamic rituals in fellowship with other Muslims. However, the mosque also fulfils a several other social and welfare functions (Vogt, 2008). In line with the traditional Islamic faith and religious practice, mosques in Norway are open to anyone who wants to practice their religion. However, the mosque, which I attended, primarily has Pakistani members, and the social functions of the mosque cater to members of the community who have a Pakistani background. The following field note excerpt illustrates the various usages of the mosque in which I conducted participant observation:

> It is Friday and I am meeting Akbar, one of the interview participants, in the mosque where he attends prayers. The mosque is quite large in an orange-yellowish colour. The entrance is attached to grand pillars in white. In the entrance, Akbar comes to greet me and says that he wants to show me around before the traditional Friday prayer starts. We start at the top floor of the

mosque, which is the women's department. Here there is a small kitchen area and rooms for the women to gather in addition to the prayer room.

On the top floor of the mosque, there are several rooms – among them a teaching room – which, as Akbar says, is used for a homework help service for younger members of the community. (...) On the second floor of the mosque, outside one of the prayer rooms reserved for men, there is a small sitting area where brown couches are placed against the wall in the entire room. Two older men are sitting there discussing something in Urdu. Akbar explains that this is the area where the older men usually sit, relax, and talk to other men. (Excerpt field note, mosque visit)

As illustrated in the excerpt the mosque serves as a community for various activities and for members of all age groups. They have rooms for prayer, socializing and community support work. Some also have libraries and reading rooms with the aim of teaching religious scriptures to all members of the faith community.

Due to norms of gender segregation, there is a clear division based on gender in the mosque. Consequently, women are not obliged to attend the mosque for prayers. However, due to Pakistani women challenging these norms, some Norwegian mosques have established separate spaces for women so that they are able to attend the mosque without breaking the rules of gender segregation (Vogt, 2008). According to Akbar, the gender segregation is upheld based on the notion that women need a space to practice their religion where they are exempt from male sexual desire.

There is also a division based on age in the usage of space in the mosque, particularly in the male spaces. This is particularly evident by the couches in the male section of the mosque, which is reserved for older Pakistani men. This division may have different reasons. For instance, increasing physical health problems caused by old age may lead to a need for comfortable seating arrangements. It may also be because retired Pakistani men attend the mosque more often than younger men do and women do, because they are not restricted by the demands of paid work.

The Polish Catholic faith community in Norway is part of the Catholic Church in Norway (DKKN). DKKN pursues a multicultural agenda, which means that catholic migrants of diverse nationalities are encouraged to preserve their original language and culture through the establishment of nationally based congregations, such as the Polish congregation (Mæland, 2015).

In contrast to the mosque, the Catholic church building is not in itself an arena for different activities, but several different events and social gatherings are organised in relation to the church mass on Sundays. This includes a church coffee after mass each Sunday, and the organisation of national day celebrations in May and November[56]. One of the churches where I conducted participant observation had also developed a small library where people can borrow books in the Polish language.

After the EU accession in 2004, the masses in the Polish language are crowded. The days where I attended the mass to observe, people were standing along the aisles of the church, in the church porch and even outside on the street. It is particularly crowded on the national days when celebrations take place after mass.

People of all ages come to church on Sundays and there is no formal spatial segregation based on either gender or age. When attending church ceremonies, I did notice some differences between the Polish older migrants, and the younger generation of labour migrants. The older migrants spent more time talking and socialising with each other before and after the ceremony than the younger Polish migrants, particularly the younger men who often came alone shortly before mass started. This may reflect that the younger group of migrants are labour migrants who may not have the time or feel the need to interact socially with others in relation to their church visit. This interpretation is supported by findings from a comparative study of post-war and post accession migrants in the UK, conducted by Brown (2011). Brown (2011) finds that for the generation of post-accession labour migrants, attending church services represented a solitary spiritual connection. Moreover, the primary motivation for travelling to the UK for the post-accession migrants is economic gain – to be able to support their families – who often still live in Poland. This means that many have little time for social interaction in the UK. By contrast, the older generation consisting of postwar migrants, regard attending church on Sundays to represent both a religious and a social event (Brown, 2011, p. 234). Brown (2011) concludes that these differences in orientations towards church

---

[56] Poland has two national days – one on the 3rd of May celebrating the constitution, and one in November celebrating independence.

activities reflects and reinforces a sociocultural divide between the two generations of Polish migrants.

Although my study also finds indications of a similar geographical separation and orientations towards church attendance, I also find the church to represent an important channel where the older and more established Polish migrants could reach out and assist the recently arrived migrants in their adjustment to life in Norway. However, the empirical material in my study indicates a rather ambivalent relationship between the two generations. This shall be returned to in the next section of the chapter.

Unlike in the mosque, the Polish Catholic church does not have spatial gender segregation. However, there are some rules and norms regarding which positions women and men can inhabit in its social hierarchy (Mæland, 2016). Historically speaking this has entailed that women could not occupy positions such as priesthood, or any position related to the liturgical aspects of the church services[57] (Mæland, 2016). However – as we shall see – they may have many roles and positions related to organisation and administration of activities that are more indirectly related to the actual church service. This has implications for the meanings attending the church has for Polish men and women, as well the roles they may occupy. I now turn to discuss these topics.

3.2 Meanings attributed to attending activities in faith communities

The hierarchical structure and the nature of activities that people engage in within faith communities is highly gendered, which means that attending activities in faith communities have different meanings for men and women – a point which will be elaborated in the succeeding analysis. Because of the gender segregated nature of the mosque, the meanings attributed to attending the mosque among Pakistani women in this study will be explored sin a separate subsection.

---

[57] However, DKKN has opened for women to become ministrants, i.e. assistants to the priest during the mass ceremonies. Thus, gender roles in the church is in movement (Mæland, 2016).

For older Pakistani men, the mosque serves as an important source of remaining socially active after retirement. This is illustrated in the interview with Shahrukh, a 66-year-old Pakistani man, who was interviewed in the mosque. Shahrukh came to Norway in 1971. He had occupational training in Pakistan, and like many of the other Pakistani migrants in this study, he has had several low-skilled manual jobs. In 1995 he got a job as an office clerk, which he recently retired from. When asked about his life after retirement he responds:

> Interviewer: "so can we talk about how life is today, you have recently retired?"
>
> Shahrukh: "Yes I think but eh I was a bit afraid the advantage is that there is no longer stress – work stress – no worries about being late, or not getting things done in time. But then I was afraid what am I going to do all day – but for the time being I do not have the time. I am very busy"
>
> Interviewer: "you are very busy?"
>
> Shahrukh: "I do not go to the gym or anything. Recently I have started to – not regularly – but I take walks and other stuff. I do not have a beard or anything but still I belong to the mosque and we pray five times a day. So yes, I have an activity that keeps me busy – to me personally – and all of those who have this type of affiliation with the mosque. Before when I was working I did not have the time to go to the mosque only one or two times a week but now I have the time and I do not feel bored or anything and I have a lot of free time and starting to get bored but I have not"

Prayer five times a day between sunrise and sunset constitutes one of the pillars of Islam. For men there is an obligation – unless otherwise obtained – to attend prayer in the mosque. In Norway – particularly during winter – the number of hours between sunrise and sunset are short, meaning that the time intervals between each prayer are also short. Thus, retired Pakistani men often attend the midday prayer in the mosque and stay until the last prayer of the day. Between prayers, they come together, sit in the couches, drink tea, eat dates or – other food brought from home – and talk about their lives, and significant events in Pakistan and so on. Sometimes the imam joins them. Thus, because they are following the Norwegian sunrise and sunset, the practice of praying takes a locally specific form – which renders the development of a space for older Pakistani men to socialise with each other possible. For Shahrukh, the duty of attending prayers in the mosque provides him with something to do every

day, as well as adding structure to the day. Shahrukh says that he does not "have a beard or anything", which may indicate a lack of identification with the more religious members of the community. Having a beard may be understood as a bodily marker of being a devout Muslim man (Hopkins, 2004) – and this is something that Shahrukh seems to distance himself from. However, although he does not have a beard, he still feels that he belongs to the mosque and the mosque community, and this constitutes an important context for his social embeddedness after retirement.

The Polish older migrants also found attending religious ceremonies to be important. Lukasz described his life after retirement in these terms:

> Lukasz: "It is boring you know. I am used to being very busy with work and there was a lot of stress and suddenly you do not have the stress anymore. You know for about 20 years now I have had a lot of responsibility and an enormous workload and then suddenly I do not have that anymore and I miss it you know the stress and the work, but I try to be social as much as I can so I should not complain".

> Interviewer: "so what kinds of social things do you do?"

> Lukasz: "Well we usually come here (a local restaurant) and drink coffee. Also, we have a gathering point for us Poles at least many of us and that is the catholic church. There is a person who organises different events and she is our representative in the Polish group of the church and she organises coffee after the meeting in the church crypt where we meet and you know chat and talk and things like that, so then you can say that we are social outside of the religious at these gatherings".

This excerpt illustrates the points made earlier. Many of the older Polish migrants tend to have informal meetings in local cafés and restaurants. In addition, it illustrates how attending mass in the catholic church on Sundays represents a religious, as well as a social event, to the Polish older migrants. Thus, meetings in faith communities constitutes an important arena for remaining social after retirement for both the Pakistani and the Polish older migrants. However, if we contrast Lukasz's description of his life today with Shahrukh's description we find one major difference. Whereas Shahrukh states that he hasn't had the time to get bored, Lukasz states that most of the time life after retirement is boring and that he misses his job, which may be attributed to having had an occupation with more intrinsic rewards than Shahrukh has. The different meanings that faith communities have in Lukasz's and Shahrukh's

life after retirement may relate to differences in religious practice and rules of worship. Shahrukh has – unless otherwise obtained – a duty to attend the mosque for prayers four times a day. Lukasz on the other hand, only has church mass to go to on Sundays, and attending mass is a choice rather than a religious obligation and duty.

Most of the Polish participants prefers to attend masses that cater specifically to Polish migrants. Piotr and Justyna – who were introduced earlier in this chapter – gave two reasons for this. One reason was that they preferred a space where they could talk to people in Polish, and who shared similar experiences with migration from Poland to Norway. The second reason they gave was that they perceived masses in Norwegian to be too noisy. They also described having attended a multicultural mass which they did not enjoy at all. In particular, they criticised Latin American migrants for treating mass as a festive occasion – something which they found to interrupt the ceremonial and more sacral aspects of the mass.

Many of the older Polish women in this study are actively involved with organising different social activities in relation to the church. These activities include the church coffee and national day celebrations, Easter celebration and pilgrimages. In the church – where my participant observation took place – church coffee is organised in a house adjacent to the actual church, and the national day and Easter celebrations are organised in a dayroom owned by DKKN. Magdalena, who has been introduced in former chapters, is very active in organising these types of events and she is also actively involved in administrating the library. She describes this type of work as – although sometimes toilsome – giving her a sense of purpose after retirement. Involvement in these activities can also be understood as a signal of strong religiousness and piety which in turn provides status within the community. Moreover, organising these activities puts women in direct contact with clergy members such as the priest. This is also the case with Magdalena. The priest in her congregation has come to Norway quite recently. This means that he also needs language support and other types of help dealing with the tacit norms of Norwegian social life. Magdalena provides him with assistance in these matters, and during the interview, she talked with great pride about the contact she has with the priest, and

how he called her several times a week to ask her for assistance in different matters. She even wanted me to come to visit her at a later time so that she could introduce me to him. This indicates – in line with former studies – that the extent of her direct contact with the priest – serves as a source of social status for her, and for catholic women in general (Brown, 2011; Mæland, 2016).

Many of the Polish participants also mentioned volunteering to help the more recently arrived Polish migrants with things such as filling out a tax return, finding employment or learning Norwegian. Both men and women are involved with this type of volunteering, and Sunday masses represent an important channel through which such support is provided. Grewal et al. (2004) present a similar finding. They find that for older people in different minority groups volunteering through the church to help other members of their own ethnic community contributed to their sense of life quality by enabling them to have an active role in their communities and thus feel useful in later life.

Although this kind of work may be understood as a sort of charitable behaviour which expresses intergenerational solidarity among Polish migrants in Norway, some of the participants also talked about instances where the older Polish migrants use these activities as alternative sources of income, and about instances where more established Polish migrants exploited the more recently arrived. This illustrates the ambivalent relations between the Polish older migrants, and the younger migrants who have come to Norway after the EU accession in 2004.

3.3 Contested spaces – female spaces in the mosque

Unlike the men, Muslim women are not obliged to attend the mosque for prayers. This practice is justified with reference to the gendered division of labour. According to Islamic prescriptions men and women have complementary roles, but they are of equal value. Men provide for the family financially, while women have responsibilities of housekeeping and of caring for and bringing up children. The belief is that if women are obliged to attend the mosque for prayers, this will interfere with their ability to fulfil their important duties and obligations in the household. Historically, this has meant that women were barred from attending the mosque.

However, in many Muslim countries – and Muslim migrant communities like the Pakistani migrant community in Norway – women have challenged this practice and have gained separate rooms for praying in the mosque (Predelli, 2008). This is the case in the mosques where I visited. Still, women are confined to rooms that are smaller than the main prayer rooms. They do not have direct access to the main prayer room, and they must listen to the imam through loudspeakers. Thus, although the Islamic family law assigns equal value to men and women, in practice they do not have equal rights and duties in the mosque (Predelli, 2008).

As already described earlier in this chapter, the Pakistani women in this study are not obligated to attend the mosque during weekdays. However, they often spend Sunday afternoons there. These Sunday meetings are primarily reserved for reading and discussing the Quran, and Islamic rules of conduct, in addition to prayer. In the Sunday meetings, there is no segregation based on age, and the younger women often bring their children with them when attending the meetings. This reflects the traditional gender norms where women's main obligation is to care for children (Moen, 2009). To fulfil their obligations, and at the same time be able to attend meetings in the mosque, many women bring their children along.

Ashwariya, who was introduced in chapter 5, has – as already described – faced many challenges relating to her own and her mother's health. To her, attending the mosque on Sundays represents a good opportunity to take her mind off things. After retired early due to illness, she also found life to be boring, and attending meetings in the mosque represented a place for her to learn a new language, and discuss different interpretations of the Quran:

> Ashwariya: "(…) I learn Arabic in the mosque, once a week I am there. And there is a large gathering, a social get-together one might say and that is very nice. And we learn a little bit more Arabic and sometimes a woman teaches us the Quran you know the holy Quran so then we can learn what Islam is for real. Even though I know a little from before I feel that I get more knowledge on a lot of things. (…) Every Sunday we gather there and get an hour with the imam. He has very good competence from Pakistan and he speaks good English. He is very ready for new times. So, he reads the Quran first and then he translates and explains what it says there in the Quran"

This excerpt illustrates that to Ashwariya the mosque both serves as an important gathering point and as a place to learn more about Islam by reading and interpreting the Quran. She states that sometimes the imam, who is himself from Pakistan, comes to discuss the Quran with them. Her statement that "he is very ready for new times" seems to indicate that the imam is also open to women taking on new roles in the mosque, and his act of visiting their prayer room in the mosque and discussing the Quran with the women is an expression of this.

The Sundays when I was visiting the female sections of the mosque, the imam was not there and the women would sit on the floor, grouped together in smaller groups, with one woman in the middle leading the discussions that they had. Consequently, the female spaces in the mosque take the form of what Predelli (2008, p. 245) describes as "contested spaces", meaning that they are spaces that are shaped by a patriarchal Islamic value system, and at the same time, by women's practical acts to contest this system in different ways, for instance by demanding a female space for prayers in the mosque. In Predelli's (2008) study the focus is predominantly on younger women, who have grown up in Norway but who have parents who have migrated to Norway. The findings in the present study indicates that it is not only younger women who are born and have grown up in Norway who engage in such acts to contest patriarchal norms, but that this can also be done by older women. The fact that spaces for prayers and other sorts of gatherings in the mosque are gender segregated means that a space is created for Pakistani women to negotiate values, roles and identities – both in terms of ethnicity and gender – and in terms of culturally constructed roles and identities in old age. This emerged most clearly in Roobio's account of her role in the mosque.

Roobio is very active in the mosque and describes herself as having taken on a guiding role for other Pakistani women in the faith community – providing women with advice on different matters relating to life for Pakistani women in Norway. As already mentioned earlier in this chapter, Roobio has had paid employment in Norway and still maintains contact with her former colleagues. The extensive contact with native Norwegian colleagues and friends enables Roobio to reflect on basic

values and norms in Pakistan and in Norway. She shares these reflections with other female members of the mosque during their Sunday meetings. For instance, she has shared her opinions on the importance of taking walks, getting a driver's license and other things she considers important for women to achieve greater independence from their husbands. She has also made some reflections on her role in the family in old age. In Pakistan, grandparents hold a high status as knowledgeable transmitters of important values and norms to their grandchildren (Moen, 2002; Grewal et al., 2004). However, her son and daughter in law are reluctant to involve her in her grandchildren's upbringing as much as she wants to be involved. She states that this initially made her very sad. However, her conversation with former colleagues has made her rethink and negotiate her role and identity in old age. She now thinks about life after retirement as a time of self-realisation through travels and activities that make her happy. In other words, through her conversations with former colleagues and friends she gets access to a different way of thinking about her role in old age, which may be understood as a "cultural zeitgeist"(Krause, 2019) in relation to the third age.

As already discussed in chapter 2, this zeitgeist needs to be understood as informed by predominantly "western" discourses on ageing which has developed historically from the 1950s onwards. Here ageing is couched in terms of nurturing one's individual interests, and goals of self-realisation and fulfilment (Laslett, 1991). This is not to say that the cultural zeitgeist of the third age is better or worse than the zeitgeists informing ageing roles in Pakistan. However, in the perspective of Holstein & Gubrium (2007, p. 344) this cultural zeitgeist may be regarded as part of the culturally shared common-sense categories and ideas pertaining to a specific geographical and historical context. These culturally shared common-sense categories and ideas become resources for interpretation and the construction of situated meaning. To Roobio, being exposed to a different norm of ageing has expanded her cultural repertoire of ageing in a way that enables her to make sense of her role and life situation even though this role is not in line with the customary ageing role in Pakistan. Thus, learning this new zeitgeist seems to have provided her with solace and comfort in a situation where a Pakistani ageing role as (she understands it) is

unavailable to her. This finding is in line with findings from Torres' (2002; 2004) study of older Iranian immigrants in Sweden. She finds that exposure to different norms and understandings of successful ageing in a migratory context may challenge their initial understandings and may sometimes lead to new perspectives on what it means to age well.

Roobio shares these reflections with the other women attending the Sunday gatherings in the mosque, creating new reflections and negotiations of both ageing roles, as well as gender roles and identities in old age.

This finding is in line with Moen`s (2009) findings about female communities among Pakistani migrants in Norway- She finds that meeting places for women serve both as important spaces for maintenance and reproduction of values for the women, as well as constituting spaces where they discuss and sometimes challenge traditional gender roles and their position within the family (Moen, 2009, p. 251).

4. Ethnic community organizations as habitual spaces

4.1 Voicing frustrations in a male space - the NPEF

In addition to attending the mosque regularly, many of the Pakistani men also attend other social gatherings. As we have seen, the practice of gender segregation has been maintained – although in a slightly modified form – something which is illustrated by the female attendance in the mosque. Although Pakistani women have become allowed to attend the mosque, older Pakistani men do have greater opportunities for creating social gathering points in the public sphere than women do. This means that Pakistani older men often get-together in the public sphere, while the women organise get-togethers in the private spheres of their homes.

One of the social gathering points that is part of the weekly routine for many of the older Pakistani men in this study is the NPEF. This association is a local section of the Norwegian pensioners association, and it hosts gatherings several evenings a week for their Pakistani members. The gatherings take place in a multicultural day care centre owned by the municipality, which the older Pakistani men rent after four o' clock when the centre is closed. They meet here to drink coffee and tea, play cards,

and talk about significant events in Norway and Pakistan and their lives in general. According to the leader there is no specific age limit, and they allow younger men to attend, although the people who attend are mostly older men. Moreover, the younger men who can attend often perform specific tasks, such as making coffee and running for errands, for instance getting fruit or other food. In their study of narratives on care for older people among older Pakistani men in Norway, Næss and Vabø (2014) find that gatherings in such pensioners associations perform several alleviating functions, among them reducing stress and conflicts in the family. This is certainly an important function of these gatherings. In addition, the present study finds that the meetings represent important sources of emotional support among the men. Wahid, one of the leaders of this association describes how many of those who attend have psychological and other health problems and that the gatherings provides a place where they can talk about these issues with other people who have similar experiences.

Examples of the problems they discuss are feelings of loss, missing their place of origin and family and friends there, and conflicts and tensions with their children in Norway. When ageing in a transnational context some may experience what is commonly referred to as "contradictory locations", meaning that they occupy contradictory positions and statuses simultaneously (Anthias, 2012, p.131). For many of the older Pakistani men in this study migration to Norway has given them a high social status in Pakistan. However, being a migrant in Norway has also led to a loss of status in the form of having to undertake precarious work that they are overqualified for (Korbøl & Midtbøen, 2018). Thus, their experience may be understood as an experience of what Parreñas (2001, p. 3) refers to as "contradictory class mobility".

Moreover, many of the men are facing challenges to their traditional authority within the family. In one of the meetings I talked to one of the men about some of his frustration about conflicts he had with his son. During the conversation he described feeling that he was not being treated with the respect and the corresponding obedience from his son that he deserved. He related this to the way in which children

are not taught to respect their parents in Norway. Intergenerational tensions and conflicts are not uncommon among non-migrants and migrants alike. However, as explained by Foner & Dreby (2011) these conflicts may become intensified in situations where there are major differences in values and norms between the parents' country of origin and the context in which their children have been raised. Thus, the expression of frustration may also relate to the older Pakistani men's decline of status and authority in the Norwegian context. In the Pakistani context, older men constitute the heads of the household, and they expect to be revered and honoured (Shaw, 2000). Thus, this patriarchal system of authority is challenged in Norway, where women's rights and gender equality is placed high on the political agenda (Borchorst & Siim, 2008), and where children, to an increasing extent, are taught to challenge authority structures and make their voices heard (Frønes & Brusdahl, 2000). The gatherings at the NPEF thus serves as place where they can voice their frustrations and get these frustrations validated, among other men with similar experiences and frustrations.

Noman one of my interviewees, who was introduced in chapter 5, attends almost all the gatherings, and describes the gatherings as arenas for the voicing of frustrations associated with being a migrant. He specifically mentions nostalgia and longing for Pakistan and people there, including the sorrows they feel when hearing about family or friends in Pakistan having died:

> Interviewer: "Do you travel to Pakistan often?"
>
> Noman: "No, we think, and we cry when we hear about our family and friends in our place – they die, and we cannot visit. It is not that easy. Our children do not notice anything, but for us who are first generation it is double trouble. We are bitter, and yes here and there it can be like that; yes, it is like that."

Due to health issues, Noman is unable to travel to Pakistan often and he describes feeling sad that he is unable to visit family and friends when they die. In section 2.1 of this chapter, I mentioned an emerging generational divide between the Pakistani older men and their adult children who have grown up in Norway. This divide is also visible in the excerpt above. Noman states that he feels his children do not understand or do not notice his grievances, as they have not had the same experiences. This

indicates that the emerging generational divide is also linked to the fact that their adult children do not have similar experiences with migration as the older migrants have. Therefore, they have a hard time understanding the challenges associated with migration. The meetings in the NPEF thus becomes a place where the older Pakistani men can share these experiences, and thereby gain a sense of recognition and fellowship with other Pakistani men who have similar experiences and grievances.

In her case study of older Somali migrants in Norway, Markussen (2020) presents a similar finding. Markussen (2020) finds that Somali associations present one of the spaces where older male refugees can gain recognition from others in the same situation. The Somali associations represent a place where the Somali men gain recognition for skills that are valuable in a Somali context but are not recognised as valuable in mainstream Norwegian society – such as their storytelling abilities. Although acknowledging the importance of Markussen's (2020) findings, in my I also find that the gatherings in the NPEF are important – not only as a space for gaining recognition for a specific ability or competence – but also as a space for voicing and sharing experiences and frustrations. In this sense, meetings in the NPEF represents what Milligan, Bingley & Gatrell (2007) refer to as intersubjective spaces where emotions can be collectively shared and validated, and thereby act to cushion the negative emotional experiences associated with ageing and migration.

Noman also says that representatives of the municipality have wanted to come and give information on health and social care services but that there is no interest in that among the people attending the meetings. As was shown in chapter 5 and 6 this does not necessarily imply that the Pakistani migrants are, or feel that they are, well informed about formal services, rather it seems as though these meetings are simply arenas to relax and enjoy each other's company.

4.2 Attending high cultural events – the Polish Club

As already mentioned in the introduction, the Polish older migrants in this study have a more scattered residential pattern than do the Pakistani older migrants. This means that not all of them reside in the kind of proximity that enables them to meet with other polish migrants on a regular basis. Some of the polish older migrants who live

in a rural area, state that they sometimes travel to the bigger cities to meet a smaller group of older polish migrants for coffee or lunch. One of the women, Maria, told me that she and some of her Polish friends had formed a club, which they named "the breakfast club", which meet in one member's home for breakfast. The members take turns hosting the breakfast[58]. However, this is only occasional and requires much planning. Beyond this breakfast club, Maria mentioned attending the local church for music concerts. Her children live approximately one hour away, and often come by to visit her.

Aside from these more informal gathering points established by smaller friendship circles among Polish older migrants, a more formal ethnic community organisation – The Polish Club – was established in 2000. This association is not limited to older people but hosts gatherings for Polish migrants in all ages. Gatherings in the polish club takes two forms: as information meetings and as cultural events, such as classical music concerts and dance parties. The information meetings are often organised in cooperation with a local branch of the humanitarian organisation Caritas[59]. These meetings mostly consist of formal presentations about different aspects about life in Norway – about the health care system, labour union membership and so on. One of these meetings – in which I attended – consisted of an information meeting about ageing in Norway. In this meeting I gave a presentation on the system of social care for older people. Mostly recently arrived migrants – that is migrants who are in mid adulthood and who have come to Norway for work – attend these meetings. By contrast the older Polish migrants in this study do not attend such information meetings, but rather seem to prefer to attend the cultural events organised by the Polish club. It is primarily the older Polish migrants who live in urban areas who attend these gatherings regularly. Compared to meetings in the NPEF, which take place several times a week, gatherings in the Polish Club are organised on an

---

[58] I asked Maria if I could join one of these breakfasts. After consulting with the other members, she said that some of them felt uncomfortable with me being there, as it would create a more strained and formal atmosphere.

[59] The Norwegian branch of Caritas was initially entitled "Norwegian Catholic help for refugees" and was run by the Catholic Church. Today it describes itself as an independent humanitarian organisation helping people both in Norway and across the world (Caritas Norge, 2019).

occasional basis. Gatherings in the Polish Club are also characterised by being formally organised events, such as classical music concerts, dance parties, and theatre performances – for instance if a theatre group or musician from Poland is visiting Norway. Thus, the nature of these gatherings can mainly be described as high cultural events – aimed at celebrating the cultural heritage of Poland, accentuating Polish intellectual and artistic contributions to the field of music and arts, and to Polish and Norwegian cultural life. There is a class component to attending events in the Polish club. The activities that the older migrants attended in the Polish Club may be regarded as middle-class consumption practices, i.e. practices that demand a high degree of cultural capital (Bourdieu, 1979), which most of the Polish older migrants in this study have. Consequently, organising and participating in such events expresses the cultural capital inhabited by this group of migrants and serves as a basis for distinguishing themselves from others (Bourdieu, 1979).

The Polish Club also represents a space where Polish intellectual traditions and cultural contributions to the international field of arts and music can be showcased. This is something that many of the Polish interviewees describe as important to them – particularly in the wake of the EU accession in 2004. The large influx of migration from Poland after the accession has led to an increased stereotyping of Polish migrants. For instance, the mainstream media constructs the new polish labor migrants as representing cheap labour, being victims of exploitation and highlights the potential of them taking advantage of welfare benefits (Dyrlid, 2017). In fact, after the EU accession in 2004, the life situation of Polish migrants in Norway has been compared to the situation of Pakistani migrants who came in the late 1960s and early 70s. For the Polish older migrants in this study this means that they have gone from being an invisible migrant group, to becoming defined and stereotyped as migrants. Thus, they describe feeling the need to showcase and promote alternative constructions of "Polishness" and what it means to be Polish. These recent representations of Polish migrants may also serve to contextualise the ambivalent relationship that the older Polish migrants have with the younger migrants who have arrived after 2004. Thus, in light of Lamont's (1992;2000) concept of boundary work, the Polish Club seems to constitute a place where the older Polish migrants restore

some sense of dignity and a class specific identity in the wake of the growing number of labour migrants from Poland.

5. Barriers to social embeddedness when ageing in place in Norway

Although many of the older migrants in the study describe having social spaces where they could get together on a regular basis, there are also some of the older migrants who for different reasons are prevented from participating.

As we have seen attending church on Sundays constitutes an important arena for nourishing social ties to other Polish people in Norway. However, some are prevented from attending as much as they want to. This is the case with Jelena. Due to her arthritis she is sometimes unable to attend church ceremonies. Although she can follow a church ceremony in the Polish language through Skype, she describes the weeks where she is unable to attend church as particularly lonely, and that she tends to get depressed. She also describes enjoying going to classical musical concerts in her former place of work. However, when doing so she also tends to get sad by the fact that she is no longer able to play.

As I have already described in previous chapters, Jelena lives alone, and she does not have any family members living nearby. This makes her especially vulnerable to loneliness and social isolation. However, she does mention that keeping in touch with her son, who lives in the U.S and her mother – who lives in Poland, via Skype which alleviates her feelings of loneliness.

The situation of Jelena illustrates how lack of physical mobility due to health problems may become a barrier to social participation (Palmberger, 2017). Both for the Pakistanis and the Polish older migrants, attending events in faith communities – or any other public event is – only possible for those who are physically mobile enough to do so.

Another barrier to social embeddedness in later life, is the feeling of having nothing in common, neither with the native Norwegians or with the migrant community in Norway. This is the case with Abid, who was introduced in chapter 6. He described

feeling very safe in Norway, but he also feels lonely. This feeling of loneliness creates a sense of dissatisfaction with his current life situation:

> Abid: "If I am not satisfied these are my own problems – my personal problems. I do not want to die here for example, I want to die in my own country. I want to die there in Pakistan, but this is my own problem. The society does not give me any problems so it would be due to the cultural differences you know – differences in general way of thinking and the people you like. So, I have more friends in Pakistan than here "

> Interviewer: "you have more friends in Pakistan"

> Abid: "Yeah they are likeminded people. It is very difficult to find likeminded people. Mostly people who are from Pakistan [in Norway] they are uneducated, and they have their whole family here and they are engaged with them. We are only one family here, so we do not have very many people gathering all the time"

> Interviewer: "so you maintain close ties with your friends and family in Pakistan?"

> Abid: "Mhm yes yes I really want to live there but my family they are here. They are all grown up and they do not want to move"

In the above excerpt, several dimensions can be identified as contributing to Abid's sense of exclusion in Norway. First, he feels a distance to mainstream Norwegian society which he describes in terms of "the cultural, and general way of thinking". At a later point in the interview he elaborates on this point stating that these cultural differences relate to differences in cultural reference points such as Pakistani and Islamic philosophy, literature, and poetry. He also feels isolated from mainstream Norwegian society because of his lack of Norwegian language skills. Although he can express himself in a way that is understood by most Norwegians, he still feels uncomfortable and insecure when in the company of Norwegian speakers.

The second dimension contributing to his feelings of exclusion in Norway is that he feels he has little in common with the other older Pakistani migrants in Norway, which he describes as uneducated. This relates to Abid's education, where he has two master's degrees from Pakistan. Thus, he not only feels unable to discuss topics of interest to him with native Norwegians, but also finds this difficult with other Pakistanis in Norway, as he feels that they lack the reference points that he has. He also makes a different statement about the other Pakistanis in Norway. He states that

they, unlike him, have their extended families in Norway, whereas he only has his wife who he lives with and his children, who do not visit often.

As the excerpt reveals, Abid describes having more friends in Pakistan than he does in Norway, and this constitutes one of the reasons why he wants to move there. His wife and children, however, do not want to move back to Pakistan. According to Abid this is a source of conflict and tensions within the family.

Abid's life situation may be described as one of misidentification (May & Muir, 2015). He does not identify with any collectivity or fellowship in Norway – neither mainstream Norwegian society nor the community of Pakistani migrants in Norway. By stating that the other Pakistani migrants in Norway are uneducated he expresses a somewhat negative attitude towards other Pakistani migrants and draws a class-based distinction between himself and them.

Although all of the migrants in this study maintain transnational social ties, whether it be through telephone calls or Skype, or it be through travels back and forth between the two countries, the situations of Jelena and Abid serve to illustrate how this transnational social embeddedness may become an important alternative in situations where a more localised social embeddedness is – for different reasons – hampered.

6. Concluding discussion

This chapter has explored older migrants' social embeddedness while ageing in place in Norway. This social embeddedness needs to be understood in relation to the life course phase in which the older migrants are in – most notably in relation to the transition from working life to retirement. This constitutes a major life course transition and is associated with a shift in roles – where people must adhere to a different set of norms regarding behaviours, roles and identities. As I have already described in chapter 3 on theoretical frameworks, improvements in living conditions means that entering retirement is no longer directly associated with a rapid decline in health, followed by death. This has spurred researchers to develop a conceptual distinction between the third and fourth age – marking different phases of later life. In

this conceptualisation the third age has come to be understood as a period of life where many people are in relatively good health while at same time not having the commitments associated with employment, and/or raising children (Laslett, 1991; Moen, 2011). According to Moen (2011) the third age constitutes a new phase of life without many taken for granted blueprints and the experiences of – and opportunities in – the third age are shaped by the intersections of ethnic background, gender and class.

Former studies have emphasised how migrants are particularly vulnerable to feelings of loneliness and loss after retirement because of their precarious position in the country of settlement (Fokkema & Naderi, 2013). Thus, loneliness is one risk factor associated with triple jeopardy, where older migrants are socially excluded due to poverty, old age, and racial prejudice (Dowd & Bengtson, 1978; Mutchler & Burr, 2011). Others, however, have argued that compared to the mainstream older population, older migrants may experience less loneliness because of a strong family unity, tight knit ethnic and religious communities, and strong transnational ties (cf. Ciobanu & Fokkema, 2016; Grewal et. al., 2004; Maynard et. al., 2008; Palmberger, 2017).

The aim of this chapter has been twofold. Firstly, I have explored the various different contexts of older migrants' social embeddedness, in relation to the life course, specifically focusing on the migration and occupational trajectories of each group, but also in relation to individual life course experiences in Norway. fangeSecondly, I have explored the meanings of so-called habitual spaces – that is faith communities and ethnic community associations that reproduce migrants' allegiance to their respective country of origin.

The migration trajectories of the Pakistani and Polish older migrants in this study are very different. Pakistani migration to Norway has taken the shape of a chain migration, whereby networks between people who had already migrated to Norway spurred others to come to Norway. Chain migration also facilitated a support system and a relatively tight knit community of Pakistani migrants in Norway centred in and around the larger cities. The migration trajectories of the older Polish migrants took

the shape of individual migration, whereby individual persons or families came to Norway, mainly due to job opportunities. Consequently, their residential patterns are more dispersed than it is for the Pakistani older migrants. Their occupational trajectories in Norway are also very different from those of the Pakistani older migrants. Whereas the Polish migrants have mainly had high skilled occupations, most of the Pakistanis have – regardless of their educational level – had low-skilled manual occupations. In the chapter I have argued that these migration and occupational trajectories have implications for their social embeddedness in later life in various ways.

For instance, the older Pakistani migrants have extensive contact with other Pakistani migrants in Norway, and with their family members, both immediate and extended kin. Although findings from this chapter indicate that the Polish older migrants do maintain contact with other Polish migrants in Norway on a regular basis this contact is less frequent and extensive than the Pakistanis' experience. This is also related to differences in religious practice, whereby Pakistani older men have more extensive social contact because of their duty to attend the mosque for prayers four times a day, whilst the Polish older migrants have the choice to attend mass only on Sundays.

Both the Polish and the Pakistani older migrants also talked about having good relationships with their families. For the Pakistani migrants this includes frequent visits from extended kin as well as more immediate family members. The fact that many of the Pakistani older migrants live in extended households, with adult children and grandchildren contributes to their social embeddedness in Norway. However, as Amman & Holten (2013) point out there is a tendency to overestimate and idealise the coherence of the migrant family. As former chapters have shown, the unity of the Pakistani family does not necessarily ward off against feelings of loneliness and social exclusion. Moreover, one of the findings presented in this chapter is that many of the Pakistani older migrants do express that the degree of contact between family members has decreased, because their family members (both adult children and extended kin) have busy schedules. Thus, some of the older Pakistanis see a tendency

towards an organisation of the family in nuclear families – rather than extended families. This is something which saddens some of them – the men in particular.

The Polish and Pakistani older migrants who have had high-skilled occupations and with the opportunity to make use of their education in their work also maintained ties to their former workplace and colleagues after retirement. The chapter has argued that this may have to do with the quality of work, whereby high-skilled occupations offer more intrinsic rewards such as autonomy, skills development, and self-realisation. Furthermore, this may have created a stronger identification with their workplace, than those who worked in low-skilled manual occupations.

Both the Pakistani and Polish older migrants talked about having a good relationship with their neighbours. However, in urban settings these relations do not amount to much more than maintaining a friendly distance, involving polite greetings in the hallways or streets. However, I do find a difference here between older migrants living in urban and rural areas – whereby older migrants living in rural neighbourhoods seemed to have more extensive contact with their neighbours. The lack of neighbourhood social contact in urban areas may be attributed to qualities of cities and urban environments, where the size and social heterogeneity may lead to more short-lasting, fragmented relationships, than in rural areas where social life is more transparent and people may have more similar reference points (Haugen & Villa, 2005).

Former studies on experiences of neighbourhood inclusion and exclusion among migrants find that racism or racialisation processes constitute a major factor for experiences of everyday exclusion on a local level (cf. Wessendorf, 2017). However, the empirical material in this study yields no indication that the older migrants have experienced racist treatment in their neighborhood. Given that the focus of my study has not been specifically about processes of exclusion and inclusion in their neighbourhoods of older migrants, the topic of neighbourhood exclusion based on racism, and how this influences older migrants' social embeddedness should be examined further.

Although I have pointed to dissimilarities in the migration trajectories of both migrant groups facilitating different kinds of embeddedness within the two migrant communities, the chapter also finds that ethnic and religious communities are important to both migrant groups, albeit in different ways. In the chapter I have explored the meanings of these communities as contexts for older migrant's social embeddedness after retirement.

Former studies have identified that active engagements in religious and ethnic community associations provide older migrants with a sense of having a role after retirement, and serve to add structure to the day, which makes the loss of a workplace to go to less challenging (cf. Grewal et. al., 2004; Maynard et. al, 2008; Wray, 2004). They are also identified as places where older migrants exchange social and emotional support, and contexts where older migrants gain recognition for skills that are not necessarily recognised in the mainstream societies, in which they live (cf. Markussen, 2018). The findings presented in this chapter support these findings. However, these social support functions are stronger among the Pakistani older migrants, Pakistani men in particular. They participate in the mosque, or the ethnic community associations several days a week, which is more frequent than the Pakistani women and the Polish older migrants. The Pakistani women do host gatherings in relation to their households, but these are only organised on an occasional basis. Polish older migrants only attend church ceremonies once a week and activities in the Polish Club only occur on an occasionally. This puts the older Polish migrants, who do not have alternative contexts of social embeddedness, at greater risk of feeling lonely and bored, particularly during weekdays.

Beyond being in support of findings from former studies, the chapter also finds some added meanings of these contexts of social embeddedness in later life. The study has found that these contexts are important arenas for negotiations of roles, identities, and forms of belonging in terms of ethnicity, gender, class, and generation in later life. These negotiations are based on one of these dimensions, or in different kinds of intersections with the other dimensions depending on the specific contexts in which these negotiations take place.

The negotiations taking place within the different settings needs to be understood in relation to the organisational structure of the settings, and the cross-cutting divisions of gender, class, age and generations that have developed in the settings. For instance, the gender segregation of the mosque means that women are not given access to the same rooms for worship as the men. This has made the arenas into what Predelli (2008, p. 245) conceptualises as "contested spaces", i.e. spaces that are shaped by a patriarchal Islamic value system, while at the same time being a space where women can negotiate and contest the patriarchal system and gender roles in different ways. Predelli (2008) focuses primarily on how younger women contest the system in different ways. In this study, I also find that some older women engage actively in such negotiations both in relation to gender as well as in relation to their ageing roles in Norway.

Among the Polish older migrants, the negotiation of identities in relation to the ethnic community is more strongly tied to class, particularly in the wake of a strong influx of Polish labour migrants after the EU accession in 2004. Consequently, activities, particularly in the Polish club both serve as an arena where older migrants can attend high cultural events, and where Polish contributions to the international field of music and arts, can be consumed, celebrated, and showcased. Thus, these arenas not only constitute spaces for older migrants cultural consumption practices, but they also represent settings where they can assert a class specific Polish identity, which has become more important in the wake of the growing numbers of labour migrants in Norway

Chapter 8. Conclusions

1. Introduction

In this chapter I summarise my study and discuss the central findings of the thesis. I start with reiterating the methodological approach and the characteristics of the sample, before briefly describing the theoretical perspectives and my approach to "ageing in place" as an overall frame of the thesis. Next, the central findings of the thesis are presented and discussed, before finally suggesting directions for future research.

2. Methodological approach – a comparative biographical case study

The aim of this study has been to examine the experiences of ageing in place among migrants in Norway. This has been explored through a comparative biographical case study where I have conducted biographical interviews with 21 Pakistani and Polish migrants in Norway. In addition, I have conducted participant observations in habitually visited public settings that form an important part of their daily lives when ageing in place in Norway.

The Pakistani and Polish older migrants have been chosen because I wanted to compare the experiences of ageing in Norway among migrants from a country within Europe, and from a country outside Europe. This comparison represents an important empirical contribution to research on ageing and migration. As Warnes et al. (2004) argues, there are differences between European and non-European labour migrants in terms of religion and culture, experiences of racism and social exclusion, and in terms of access to European countries due to EU friendly policies. These differences increase the likelihood that non-European labour migrants are more disadvantaged than European labour migrants on several accounts, particularly in relation to the formal support system in the destination country of migration. Despite this assertion, there are heretofore few comparative studies of ageing migrants from within and from outside of Europe.

The initial aim of the study was to explore how ageing migrants coming from a national context with a different welfare system and mode of care provision go about covering their care needs in Norway. Both Pakistan and Poland are countries where family care represents the dominant mode of provision (Synak,1990; Perek-Bialas & Slany, 2016; Qureshi, 2012). In Norway, public provision of care is extensive, and family plays a complementary – albeit growing – role in provision of care for older people (Christensen & Wærness, 2018; Øydgard, 2018). Thus, a major aim of the study has been to explore how older migrants develop care arrangements in the interplay between family care as the dominant mode of provision in their country of origin, on the one hand, and the Norwegian system of social care for older people, on the other. I also wanted to explore how older migrants interacted with formal care providers and their experiences – if they had any – with the formal home-based care services that they receive. However, difficulties with recruiting participants who have long-term care needs, and whose care needs are met through the home-based care services, entailed a slight shift in focus. Caregiving arrangements and the cultural expectations that undergird them have still constituted an important part of the thesis. However, the focus of the study has also expanded – focusing more broadly on older migrants' relation to the welfare state, and their negotiations of roles, identities and belonging when ageing in place in Norway.

In the initial sampling plan of the study, I established criteria, which would attend to variations among migrants ageing in place. Gender and ethnic background (understood in terms of national background), constitutes the overall selection criteria, but I also wanted to gain variation in terms of other dimensions such as class (defined in terms of education and occupation), health situation, care needs and relations to family members in Norway. Because of the already mentioned recruitment difficulties, which have been described in detail in chapter 5 of this study, I did not manage to obtain the diverse sample I was opting for. Rather, the participants in this study may be described as relatively resourceful. For instance, skills in the language of the destination country constitutes an important resource, among other things, because it shapes the older migrants' ability to interact with

mainstream society, welfare and health care providers (cf. Kannick, 1997; Warnes et al., 2004; White, 2006; Ute et al., 2017). The fact that all interviews – except one that was conducted in English – were conducted in Norwegian, speaks to this resourcefulness. Furthermore, most of the participants in the study are highly educated, and many of them are still in good health.

Rather than seeing this relative resourcefulness as an inherent weakness of the study, I would argue the opposite – that it constitutes one of its strengths. As has already been discussed, much of the research on post-war labour migrants and refugees ageing in place has tended to focus almost exclusively on migrants who are less resourced – thereby drawing a homogenising picture of this population as – on the whole – disadvantaged and vulnerable (Ciobanu et al., 2017; Torres, 2006). The relative resourcefulness of the participants in my study contributes to provide nuance to the overall depiction of ageing migrants as being vulnerable and disadvantaged on numerous accounts. This depiction has, historically speaking, been dominant in research on ageing and migration (cf. Bolzman et al., 2004; Dowd & Bengtson, 1978; Mutchler & Burr, 2011; King et al., 2014). At the same time, I am not denying that there are situations and circumstances where older migrants are vulnerable and disadvantaged. By linking situations of disadvantage and vulnerabilities to the life courses of ageing migrants, my study highlights both between and within group variation among migrants and relates this to their lived lives. Consequently, the thesis contributes to the emerging research emphasising heterogeneity amongst migrants ageing in place, while also demonstrating how they possess and mobilise resources in order to overcome various forms of disadvantage in later life (cf.Cioban et al., 2017; Näre et al., 2017).

3. Theoretical frameworks of the thesis

Three theoretical perspectives – a contextual life course perspective, a transnational perspective, and an intersectionality perspective – have informed the study. These perspectives serve a "sensitizing" function, meaning that rather than specifying exactly what to find in the empirical material they provide analytical direction

(Blumer, 1954). The theoretical perspectives have raised my awareness about certain dimensions which may be considered of importance in the study of ageing in place in contexts of migration. The contextual life course perspective has drawn my attention to how experiences of ageing as a migrant are shaped by forces operating at the macro, meso and micro level. At the macro level, this includes considering the social, economic, and cultural characteristics of the migrant's country of origin, as well as Norway as a context of immigration. At the meso level, experiences of ageing in place have been examined in relation to community formations, and in relation to family and kin, in Norway as well as Poland and Pakistan, respectively. At the micro level, the experience of ageing in place is analysed in relation to the migrant's individual life course experiences.

Before the transnational turn in the social sciences, migrants' ties to their countries of origin were regarded as temporary and transient. In consequence, continued ties to migrants' countries of origin tended to be "cut off analytically" (Wimmer & Schiller, 2003, p.579). This means that important parts of the experiences of migrants – both in terms of their former experiences in the countries in which they grew up – and in terms of their continuing ties to these countries – were unexplored. In response to this critique, my study has adopted a transnational perspective, paying attention to transnational dimensions, as they are biographically articulated – through migrants having spent parts of their lives in a different national context – as well as through their continuing transnational ties. Using the transnational perspective as a sensitising heuristic in this study means that I have paid attention to the tangible as well as the less tangible dimensions and expressions of transnationalism. Tangible dimensions of transnationalism include travels back and forth between the country of origin and the country of residence, and the maintenance of ties through, for instance, telephone calls, emails, letters, or Skype. The less tangible dimensions include transnationalism as a mode of consciousness and a mode of cultural reproduction. Both concepts emphasise how older migrants live their lives in-between two different sociocultural national contexts simultaneously, which shape how they experience, as well as how they organise, their lives when ageing in place in Norway.

The intersectionality perspective has served to highlight how inequality dimensions such as gender, ethnic background and class intersect in shaping older migrants' experiences of ageing in place in different ways. In the study ethnicity and gender have constituted anchor points. However, I have also paid attention to other intersecting dimensions throughout the analysis of the empirical material, including class (defined in terms of education and occupation), health situation and care needs. In addition, the intersection of these inequality dimensions, have been analysed as they emerged empirically in different constellations in relation to different settings, situations, and circumstances.

In the study I have adopted a multidimensional approach to ageing in place, combined with a life course perspective this entails that I have looked at how forces operating at macro, meso and micro levels have served to the shape the experiences of ageing in place among the migrants. The multidimensional approach to ageing in place also entails that I have interrogated migratory experiences of ageing in place through the concept of "belonging", rather than the narrower concept of "place attachment", exploring older migrants' attachment – not only to only to place – but also to their social, relational, material and cultural surroundings (May & Muir, 2015, p. 1).

Although migrants are ageing in place in the migration specific meaning of the word, their experiences of this may be described through the concept of *in-between*. Writing on the experiences of retirement migrants from Denmark to Spain, Blaakilde (2015, p. 148) writes;

> Many retired migrants feel 'betwixt and between' (O'Reilly, 2000), because their lives comprise 2 countries, 2 nations, 2 languages, and many other bipartite phenomena enriched by their transnational situation.

Although Blaakilde's (2015) conceptualisation is specific to the situation of retirement migrants, through my empirical analyses I have shown that circumstances of being in-between are also highly applicable in approaching the experiences of ageing labour migrants as well. This illustrates, in line with the assertion made by

Näre et al. (2017), that there are significant parallels between the circumstances of post-war labour migrants and refugees ageing in place, on the one hand, and retirement migrants on the other. In this sense, the lives of ageing migrants represent lives balancing between two different – sometimes contradictory – socio-political, structural, and cultural contexts. A major aim of this study has been to shed light on how this position of being in-between shapes different aspects of older migrants' lives and experiences of ageing in place in Norway.

If applying statistical logics to the question of generalisation, the findings from this study cannot be generalised. However, as I have argued in the chapter on methods and methodology, the study has produced knowledge of general value. In the words of Gobo (2008) the study has produced general knowledge of what he refers to as *key structural features* (Gobo, 2008, p. 9) of the case. In this sense, the analysis illustrates key structural features of the experiences of ageing in place among migrants. More specifically the key structural features in which this thesis sheds light upon are, firstly, how expectations and practices in relation to family obligations – caregiving in particular – are negotiated while ageing in place in a transnational context. Secondly, the analysis provides insights into the key structural feature of ageing migrants and their relation to the welfare state, and the ambivalences embedded in these relationships. Thirdly, the thesis sheds light upon the key feature of ageing migrants' social embeddedness, and the meanings of such social embeddedness for their roles and identifications in later life. Fourthly, placing the experience of ageing in the context of the migrant's individual life course also provides general knowledge of how dimensions such as gender, class, as well as former life experiences and choices may influence the experiences of transnational ageing in place. In the following I shall present and discuss central findings in relation to these key structural features.

4. Caregiving expectations and arrangements – between family and state

In a transnational perspective negotiations of care are regarded as taking place within a context comprising, on the one hand, a context where caregiving for older people is

normatively framed as a family issue, and a context where the state takes on a large part of the responsibility of providing care, on the other. This must also be understood in relation to the Norwegian ideal of promoting dual-earner, dual-carer family arrangement (Ellingsæter, 2018; Kitterød & Lappegård, 2012). This ideal shape the capacity to provide care among older migrants' adult children. They are often subject to the competing demands of paid work and family life, including childcare and care for older people who have care needs. Based on biographical interview material I have explored how ageing migrants' expectations and practices of family care are maintained, negotiated, or transformed in the Norwegian context.

There is one major difference between the Pakistani and the Polish older migrants when it comes to cultural expectations of care. In line with previous research on ageing Pakistani migrants in Norway (cf. Moen, 2002; Nergård,2008; Næss & Vabø, 2014), and research on South Asian older people in the UK (cf. Gardner, 2002; Victor et al, 2012) most of the Pakistani older migrants in this study have a strong preference for family care. Among the Pakistani older migrants there is a strong conviction that joint family living, and care provided within the family is an important ideal, which all the Pakistani participants refer to. They specifically identify this as the typical Pakistani family. This indicates that for the Pakistani older migrants in this study, cultural expectations of family care takes the form of what Finch & Mason (1993) conceptualise as normative obligations, which refers to hegemonic ideas about duties and responsibilities among family members – which are also of importance in defining the moral fabric of community. In this sense, the ideal of Pakistani family life, and family care as the dominant mode of care provision is collectively shared and upheld in Norway and is also central to a sense of Pakistani identity in Norway. These expectations are also underscored by a gendered division of labour whereby women – mostly daughters-in-law – are regarded as responsible for care provision within the family. I also find a gendered dimension in relation to the maintenance of these practices – whereby the Pakistani women are much more involved in developing strategies in order to maintain tradition, than the men who – at least in this study – seems to take such arrangements for granted. This may be interpreted in

terms of gender roles where women are regarded as central to the intergenerational transmission of cultural traditions, customs, and norms (Yuval-Davis, 1998).

By contrast, the older Polish migrants in my study do not hold a collectively shared and upheld cultural expectation of family care. Rather, the exchanges of care and support among the Polish older migrants seem to be purely products of negotiation, whereby different forms of support are provided according to the needs of family members in different phases of the life course. Most of the Polish older migrants are in good health, and they also have a good income and a good pension, which means they manage well financially. Consequently, family care and support mostly occur in the form of economic support, in one direction – from the older Polish migrants to their adult children across the life course. The fact that most of them are in good health may mean that they have not reflected on what they would do if they were to develop more extensive care needs. A potential scenario, in such circumstances may be that they would expect more from their adult children. However, the accounts from the polish older migrants who have long-term care needs suggests otherwise. In this account, formal care is utilised to maintain independence from family members and protect the loving and affectionate family relationship by avoiding being a burden to them.

Although there is a strong consensus among the older Pakistani migrants that family care constitutes an ideal, I also find that there is some evidence of a shift in orientations to this. In line with Torres (1992) this shift in orientation is either practically based or ideologically based. Practical shifts in orientations occur in situations where the options of family care are – for different reasons – not available. The ideological shift in orientation is related to changing ways of thinking about practices of family care when these are confronted with new ones in a transnational migratory context. In this study, the ideological shift in orientation is related to class, as well as related to positive experiences of being a migrant in Norway. This finding is in line with findings from previous studies on ageing migrants (cf. Liversage & Mirdal, 2017; Naldemirci, 2013). Moreover, having positive experiences with the Norwegian formal support system also shapes this ideological shift in orientation.

Thus, by adopting a life course approach, this study has been able to identify both between group variation, and within group variation in experiences, linking these variations to the lived lives of older migrants.

Few of the participants in this study make use of formal care services. This reflects a common pattern among older migrants in Norway as well as in other European countries (cf. Albin et al, 2005; Hansen, 2014; Hjelm & Albin, 2014; Hovde, Edberg & Hallberg, 2008; Moen, 2002; Nergård, 2009). For the Pakistani older migrants this may be understood in terms of strong cultural expectations of family care, which have been discussed in the above. For the Polish older migrants, this may relate to the fact that most of the participants do not have long-term care needs. One of the participants, however, does have long-term care needs – but is reluctant to apply for long-term care services as she perceives the process of applying to be overly demanding – and the chances of getting any help as meagre.

Although few of the participants in the study make use of formal care services, I have also examined the experiences of these services among the ones who do. In examining older migrants' relation to the home-based care services, and its associated demands of active participation, user-involvement and rehabilitation, I find that both the Pakistani and Polish older migrants enact a strong sense of agency in different ways and according to the specific circumstances they find themselves in. One of the ways in which this is done is through engaging in self-care based on the advice from their home-based nurse or nurse assistant. Another way is through expressing their dissatisfaction with the system, and through actively making choices about the provision of care. Both Pakistani and Polish older migrants have complaints which relate to the structural organisation of care services, but the Pakistani older migrants are also somewhat dissatisfied with the lack of cultural adaptation of services. For instance, many older Pakistani migrants adhere to Islamic prescriptions of interactions between the sexes. This means that having a care provider of the opposite sex performing care tasks of an intimate nature is perceived as problematic for many of them. However, in this study, I find that the Pakistani older migrants attempt to find ways – often creative – to adapt to the way in which the system is organised.

This adaptation does not entail abandoning their own norms and customs, but rather consists of finding ways to reconcile Islamic normative behaviours, with the demands of the situation in which they are in. This finding is also in line with the findings of Næss & Vabø (2014) who assert that modification and improvisations in relation to care are possible, as long as these are not in breach of Islamic prescriptions and norms, and as long as they can be justified with reference to the specific circumstances the migrants are in. This illustrates how older Pakistani migrants enact agency within the opportunity structures and scope of possibility ingrained in the transnational context within which they are ageing.

The low number of participants who utilise formal care means that this needs further exploration, particularly in relation to gender. For instance, Thorsen (2001) finds clear gender differences in how older people relate to the quality of the home-help that they receive. Historically speaking women have overseen the home – including cooking, cleaning, and caring. Hence, having a clean home may be considered more important to the presentation of self to women, than it is to the men. Thorsen's (2001) study is 20 years old and much has changed in terms of gender equality since then. For instance, although research has shown that women still perform most of the housework, the dual-earner/dual-carer ideal has also become widely practiced among families in Norway (Bergsvik, Kitterød & Wiik, 2016; Ellingsæter, 2018). However, it would be interesting to further explore if there are any differences between how Polish older women and men relate to the quality of care services, including both home-help and home nursing services. Moreover, further research needs to be done exploring how Pakistani women in Norway relate to formal care services. As one of the Pakistani men points out: reconciling Islamic prescriptions of cross-sex interaction and the level of intimacy involved in personal hands-on care may be more challenging to women than men because of the stricter normative prescriptions regarding dress code and extent of intimacy.

Both older migrants from Pakistan and from Poland enact agency in the sense that they evaluate opportunities and constraints – operating at a meso and macro level. Within these opportunities and constraints, they make choices about how to arrange

for their care needs in the Norwegian context. However, they do so in different ways. In the case of the Pakistani older migrants, agency is enacted in their attempts and strategies to find ways to reconcile the cultural practice of joint living arrangements and family care with the opportunities and constraints of the Norwegian context. One of these strategies is transnational marriage – arranging for adult children's marriage partners from Pakistan, who have been socialised into the Pakistani tradition of family life – which in turn enables the maintenance of tradition in Norway. Among the Polish older migrants, agency is revealed in their evaluations of the opportunities of formal care in Norway, and their decision to make use of these services, in order to maintain their independence from – and avoid being a burden on – family members. Although many of the Pakistani older migrants are able to maintain joint living arrangements in a somewhat modified form, and their adult children seem to be very much willing to provide them with care, tensions do occur. This means that the Pakistani older migrants are at a greater risk of being vulnerable when it comes to care, than the Polish older migrants are. This is particularly so, in situations where reliance on family care co-occurs with marginalisation in relation to the formal support system. I shall now turn to discuss older migrants' overall relation to the welfare system.

5. Ageing migrants and the Norwegian welfare system

Previous research has identified that older migrants are often marginalised and disadvantaged in relation to the formal support system in the destination country of migration. This marginalisation is caused by a number of different factors such as lack of knowledge of available benefits and services, language barriers, lack of adaptation of care services to the needs of older migrants, and strong cultural expectations of family care (cf. Ahmed & Jones, 2008; Bolzman et al. 2004; Hansen, 2014; Hjelm & Albin, 2014; Linne, 2005; Victor et al., 2011; Wu, Penning & Schimmelee, 2005).

The findings on ageing migrants and their relation to the welfare state in my study contrasts with these overall findings. Rather than being marginal to the formal

support system, the analyses illustrates how older migrants have developed an intimate familiarity with the Norwegian welfare system. In the thesis, this is analysed through the concept of "insideness". Initially developed by Rowles (1983) the concept refers to how older people develop a deep seated and intimate familiarity with their physical and social surroundings, through life long or long-term residence within the same place. In the thesis this concept of insideness has been stretched and applied to older migrants' relation to the welfare state, as this relationship has developed over the time that the older migrants have lived in Norway. Unlike the insideness, which is described by Rowles (1983), the insideness of the older migrants in this study has been shaped by the process of migration. Consequently, I have developed the concept of "migratory insideness". Like Rowles' (1983) concept, migratory insideness is biographically articulated, albeit through experiences with two different socio-political systems. Thus, it is characterised by being in-between – balancing between two different socio-political systems simultaneously. Inspired by Simmel's (1908) concept of the stranger, I propose that migratory insideness is expressed through the process of being simultaneously inside and outside in relation to the Norwegian welfare state. This process manifests itself both in ambivalent relationships with the welfare state, and in ambivalence towards life in Norway in general.

On the one hand, migratory insideness is exhibited in older migrant's intimate familiarity with the welfare system. Sometimes such intimate familiarity is expressed through a detailed knowledge of how the welfare system works, but this is not necessarily always the case. Sometimes it is not based on detailed knowledge of the system, but rather through what Giddens (1990, p. 80) refers to as *"trust in abstract systems"* – that is an abstract conception of the welfare state, and a trust that they will receive assistance if they are ever in need. Both the Pakistani and Polish older migrants express this sentiment – a sentiment that contributes to a sense of safety and security for both groups. Although most of the participants in this study places a great deal of trust of in the system, this trust is a fragile one – and can easily be challenged by negative experiences, as was the case with some of the participants in this study.

In this situation, the combination of strict eligibility criteria, and a lack of familiarity with what Ahmed & Jones (2008, p. 64) refer to as "the tacit rules of the system" shaped these negative experience which in turn manifested itself in distrust of the Norwegian welfare system.

Incorporation within the Norwegian welfare system also serves to shape older migrants' transnational mobility pattern, particularly the length of cross-border travels. These findings are in line with findings in the literature on older migrants. Migrants experiencing increased frailty and care dependence in old age contrast and compare their access with informal and formal health and social care services for older people in at least two nation-state contexts, and utilise the advantages in both (Ammann & Holten, 2013; Gardner, 2002; Hunter, 2011; Näre, 2016). The extensive delivery of formal care services by the Norwegian welfare state, which assists with independence from private arrangements such as family or market forces serves to increase older migrants' attachment to Norway. However, the findings presented in this study suggests that the importance of access to health care services and incorporation within the Norwegian health care system is more important to the Pakistani older migrants and their mobility patterns than it is to the Polish. This is because Poland is a member of the EU, and thereby have the right to the same level – if not quality – of health care in Poland as they do in Norway.

However, there are also ambivalences in the older migrants' relation to the welfare state. For the Pakistani migrants, this ambivalence is particularly revealed in how they assess the strengths and weaknesses of both the Norwegian sociopolitical system as well as the Pakistani one. The strengths of the Norwegian system is the affordable and accessible benefits and services, which are in Pakistan only available to a select few. However, the weaknesses in the Norwegian context are what the Pakistani older migrants perceive as a lack of family solidarity, and a lack of people with a similar reference frame as they have.

Ambivalences are also present in the way in which older migrants relate to dominant representations of welfare dependency in Norway. Debates about welfare dependency gained pace from the 1980s onwards, both internationally and in Norway (Vogt, 2018). Migrants, ethnic and racial minorities are strongly implicated in these debates (Fraser & Gordon, 1994; Vogt, 2018; Wimmer & Schiller, 2003). As described in the chapter on contextual backgrounds, since the 1980s migrants have, to increasing degrees, come to be regarded as unworthy recipients of support and benefits – as placing a burden on welfare budgets – at the expense of the needs of native Norwegian people, who in this juxtaposition are more worthy by virtue of being Norwegian (Gullestad, 2002a). I have argued that this illustrates another dimension of migratory insideness, whereby older migrants may be perceived of as simultaneously inside and outside in relation to the welfare state, conceived of as a community of solidarity (Wimmer & Schiller, 2003). Through having lived in Norway for significant parts of their adult and working lives, the older migrants have been integrated in the welfare state – both being at the receiving end of welfare state benefits and services – as well as contributing to the welfare state through having worked and paid taxes. At the same time, they have been perceived of as being outside of the Norwegian welfare state because they come from outside. The study finds that ageing migrants relate to and draw on these dominant representations of welfare dependency by emphasising that they are not solely receivers of benefits and support but have also contributed to the welfare state in different ways. The findings also indicate that both the Polish and the Pakistani migrants draw on these representations by engaging in boundary work, in order to distinguish themselves from other groups who they perceive of as exploiting the generous benefits and services in the Norwegian society.

6. The social embeddedness of ageing migrants

The last key feature of which this study has shed light upon is the social embeddedness of ageing migrants after retirement. Loneliness is an issue which many older people may experience. Studies on loneliness among native Norwegians indicate that experiences of loneliness are strong among older people, particularly

among older persons in the age groups of 70-79, and in the oldest age group of 80+ (Thorsen & Clausen, 2009). Loneliness and lack of social contact is considered to have damaging effects on the physical and mental health of older people and, in fact, social contact has come to be seen as an important unmet care need among native Norwegian older people (Munkejord et al. 2017). Consequently, the social embeddedness of ageing migrants is important to their overall experience of ageing in place in Norway.

A central finding in literature focusing on vulnerabilities and disadvantage among ageing migrants is that they are at greater risk of becoming lonely, particularly after retirement (cf. Fokkema & Naderi, 2013; De Jong Gierveld et al., 2015; Victor et al., 2012; Wu & Penning, 2015). However, some studies also find that for ageing migrants, ethnic community associations and faith communities serve as a buffer against loneliness and social isolation in later life (cf. Ciobanu & Fokkema, 2016; Maynard et al., 2008; Palmberger, 2017).

My study locates the social embeddedness of older migrants in relation to the life course, particularly in relation to migration trajectories, settlement- and residential patterns, education, and former occupation. In doing so, the study presents a broader picture of older migrants' social embeddedness, than what has been done in former research. Findings from my analyses indicate that the process of chain migration, and the development of a residential pattern where older Pakistani migrants live in close proximity to one another entails that the Pakistani older migrants' family and the ethnic community constitute a vital source for their social embeddedness in later life. Older Polish migrants are also active in faith communities and ethnic communities, but not to the same extent as the Pakistani migrants. In contrast to most of the Pakistani older migrants, many of the Polish older migrants also maintain social ties to their former workplaces, and those who live in rural areas also have strong ties to their neighbours. I have argued that the ties to their former workplace, relates to the nature of their former employment in so-called high skilled occupations, which in the

literature has been identified as offering more intrinsic rewards and a strong sense of identification with the job (Svalfors et al., 2001; Gallie et al., 2012).

Nonetheless, as I have already stated, a vital context for the social embeddedness of both Pakistani and Polish older migrants in this study are the ones revolving around their religious and ethnic identifications. Ageing migrants have actively transformed their current place of residence into transnational social spaces, amongst other things, by establishing faith communities and ethnic community associations. As former studies confirm, these are important for developing a sense of belonging to their current place of residence (Buffel, 2017; Buffel & Phillipson, 2016). Active engagements in these communities provide older migrants with a sense of having a role after retirement, and serve to add structure to the day, which makes the loss of a workplace to go to less challenging (cf. Grewal et al., 2004; Maynard et al., 2008; Wray 2004). The communities constitute settings where older migrants exchange social and emotional support, and where older migrants gain recognition for skills that are not necessarily recognised in the mainstream societies in which they live (cf. Markussen, 2020). The findings presented in this thesis support these findings. However, such social support functions are stronger among the Pakistani older migrants – Pakistani men in particular – who attend the mosque, or the ethnic community associations several days a week. This is much more frequent than for the Polish older migrants, who only attend church ceremonies once a week, and where activities in the ethnic community association only occur on an occasional basis. This puts the older Polish migrants, who do not have alternative contexts of social embeddedness, at greater risk of feeling lonely and bored, particularly during weekdays.

Although the Pakistani faith and ethnic community performs several important social and emotional support functions, they also exhibit a strong degree of what Kivisto (2003, p.14) refer to as enforced conformity with norms, traditions, and values which members of the community are expected to uphold. In the Pakistani migrant community this enforced conformity is illustrated in the way in which idealised

versions of the family and cultural expectations of family care are maintained. Within this tight knit community these cultural expectations live on, whereas a failure to live up to this for different reasons, is considered a tabooed subject and a source of stigma within the community. A lack of opportunity to maintain this tradition may in some cases manifest itself in feelings of embarrassment and shame. This finding is supported by findings from former studies among Pakistani older migrants in Norway (Moen,2002; Næss & Vabø,2014), and by studies on how norms and values are maintained and reproduced in tight knit ethnic communities (cf. Zontini, 2010).

Beyond being in support of findings from former studies, my study also finds some added meanings of these contexts of social embeddedness in later life. The study finds that they are important arenas for the negotiations of roles, identities, and forms of belonging in terms of ethnicity, gender, class, and generation in later life. These negotiations are based on one of these dimensions, and in different kinds of intersections with the other dimensions depending on the specific contexts in which these negotiations took place.

The organisational structure of the communities is of importance in shaping older migrants' opportunities to participate, the roles they attain, and how identities are negotiated in the different settings. For instance, the gender segregation of the mosque means that women are not given access to the same rooms for worship as the men. This has made the arenas into what Predelli (2008) conceptualises as contested spaces, meaning they are arenas that are shaped by a patriarchal Islamic values system, while at the same time being a space where women can negotiate and contest the patriarchal system and gender roles in different ways. Predelli (2008) focuses primarily on how younger women contest the system in different ways. In this study, I also find that some older women engage actively in such negotiations both in relation to gender as well as in relation to their ageing roles in Norway. Among the Polish older migrants, the negotiations of taking place within the ethnic community relates more strongly to class, particularly in the wake of a strong influx of Polish labour migrants after the EU accession in 2004. Consequently, activities – particularly in the Polish club – both serve as arenas where older migrants can attend

high cultural events, and where Polish contributions to the international field of music and arts can be consumed, celebrated, and showcased. Thus, these settings – not only facilitate the older migrants cultural consumption practices – but they also constitute arenas where they can assert a class specific Polish identity, which has become more important in the wake of the growing numbers of labour migrants in Norway.

An overall finding from the thesis is that the position of being in-between characteristic of migratory ageing in place appears more strongly among the Pakistani older migrants, than it does among the Polish migrants. This is mainly because of greater differences between the sociocultural contexts of Pakistan and Norway, than between Poland and Norway. This means that older migrants from Pakistan must balance and negotiate at times contradictory cultural expectations and social norms from the two national contexts simultaneously. For instance, they must negotiate cultural expectations of family care in a context where adult children might not have the capacity to take on full responsibility for care provision. Moreover, Pakistani men must deal with contradictory locations of having a high social status in Pakistan, in terms of both gender, age and class, to having a low social status in Norwegian society. This creates tensions within the family and contributes to the experience of dismay while ageing in place in Norway. In addition, while the Polish older migrants have access to a health care system in both Poland and Norway, due to membership in the European Union, Pakistani migrants do not have similar access to a health care system in Pakistan as they do in Norway. This means that for the Pakistani older migrants, incorporation in the Norwegian health care system is more important and shapes their transnational mobility patterns. Combined, these dimensions put the Pakistani older migrants at greater risk of being vulnerable and disadvantaged than the Polish migrants. However, as the analyses have shown, most of the Pakistani older migrants find ways to reconcile cultural expectations and normative behaviours from Pakistan, with the structural, cultural, and institutional demands of the Norwegian context. Moreover, the vibrant ethnic and religious community serves to provide a buffer against some vulnerabilities, particularly feelings of loneliness and boredom for both migrant groups who are active within these contexts. The frequency

of attendance in the mosque, however, means that at least for older Pakistani men, this buffer is stronger than for Pakistani women, and Polish older migrants, who only attend religious services on an occasional basis.

7. Directions for future research

The research contributes new insights into the field of social gerontology and migration studies. To the field of social gerontology, the thesis provides nuance to the assumption that continuity in relation to life-long residence in one specific place is important for older peoples' well-being, identities, and sense of belonging in later life. As this thesis has shown, older migrants have achieved a sense of belonging to Norway through having lived here for a large part of their adult lives.

In my study I find that the welfare state plays an important part in older migrants' sense of belonging and safety in Norway. Through having lived significant parts of their adult lives in Norway, the older migrants in this study have developed an intimate familiarity with the welfare state, and trust that the welfare state is there in times of need. In the thesis the sense of belonging in relation to the welfare state is captured in the concept of migratory insideness. This migratory insideness in relation to the welfare system, may be understood in relation to the relative resourcefulness of older migrants, and their length of residence in Norway. Their skills in the Norwegian language makes it easy for most of them to interact with welfare providers and navigate the system. This accounts for most of them having positive experiences when interacting with welfare providers in relation to different life course transitions. It also relates to the make-up of the Norwegian welfare system – with its relatively universal provision of welfare benefits and services, in relation to different life course phases. The question remains, however, whether the concept of migratory insideness is applicable to resourceful older migrants in other welfare contexts – both characterised by a relatively universal provision of welfare benefits and services such as the Nordic welfare states – but also in relation to different welfare systems relying more on the family or markets.

Although my study finds that older migrants have developed a sense of belonging in Norway, they also continue to foster ties to their respective and friends and family in their countries of origin. The form of belonging which they developed in Norway does not exclude having a sense of belonging to their country of origin. Consequently, my study contributes to the literature emphasising the dynamic nature of belonging and understandings of home in a migratory context (Gardner, 2002; Näre & Walsh, 2016; Näre, 2017; Zontini, 2015).

Future studies on ageing migrants and belonging could also attend more fully to the temporal dimensions of transnational practices and forms of belonging. As Elder and Hitlin (2007) argue, people make plans and take actions based on their former experiences, present circumstances, and future expectations. Plans and actions may also change in relation to specific changes in circumstances, including changes in circumstances which the process of ageing brings about. This temporal dimension is also emphasised in the works of Levitt & Schiller (2004, p. 1012) who argue that transnational practices "ebb and flow" through the life course in response to shifting circumstances and life phases. This has implications for how we understand how migrants' experience ageing in place as well as their future expectations and plans. For instance, most of the migrants in this study do not consider permanent return and are content with travelling back and forth between their countries of origin and Norway. However, with a decline in health which ageing often brings about, the transnational mobility may also become hampered (Näre, 2017; Zontini, 2015). Although many studies do attend to these temporal dimensions (cf. Liversage & Mirdal, 2017; Zontini, 2015), I would suggest – inspired by the work of Liversage and Mirdal (2017) – a longitudinal approach in addressing these issues in future research. Such an approach enables the exploration of how expectations and future plans change in response to different life phases and circumstances, for instance in relation to a gradual decline in health and the development of more extensive care needs in later life.

May and Muir (2015) explore issues related to older British peoples' sense of belonging, and how this sense of belonging changes with regard to – not only changes in their own life circumstances – but also changes in their material, relational and cultural surroundings. Inspired by their approach I would suggest older migrants' sense of belonging could also include such temporal aspects of belonging, that is how changes in their material, relational and cultural surroundings both in the destination country of migration, and in the country origin shapes their sense of belonging to both places. One of the findings of my thesis indicates the emergence of a generational divide. Among the Pakistani older migrants this generational divide relates to their adult children having developed a lifestyle which is influenced by the mainstream Norwegian way of life. Many of the Pakistani older migrants worry that this will eventually lead to more loneliness and social isolation among Pakistani migrants in later life. Among the Polish the generational divide relates to the influx of Polish labour migrants in the wake of the EU accession in 2004. These more recently arrived migrants do not share similar reference frames and are, by the older polish migrants, perceived as holding a working-class lifestyle that they have difficulties identifying with. These generational divides point to changes in the older migrants relational and cultural surroundings. How such changes influence their sense of belonging needs further exploration. Consequently, in exploring the question of belonging, the intersection between sense of geographic belonging and what May & Muir (2015) describe as temporal belonging represents a promising topic of inquiry.

Regarding older migrant's negotiations of cultural expectations of care, my study as well as most other studies in the field (cf. Gardner, 2002; Moen, 2002; Næss & Vabø, 2014; Naldemirci, 2013; Victor et al. 2012) only explores what these look like from the point of view of the older migrants. Future studies should also include what these negotiations look like from the point of view of adult children. Exploring how adult children perceive of these negotiations would also be allow one to be more attentive to unequal power relations within the family – and how these play out in relation to care. One of the interesting discoveries during the process of analysis was that the Pakistani older migrants who have maintained joint living arrangements – and who

receive care by their daughter-in-law – do not seem to perceive of this care as work or toilsome, but as a natural part of daily life. This serves to illustrate a point made by Glucksmann & Lyon (2006) that when care is undertaken by love or obligation the labour of care becomes hidden within the sphere of domestic activity. This is something which future research should follow up on, examining how the activity of care is perceived by different members of the family, and how the understandings of care varies according to whether this is provided informally or formally through public or market based care provision. By extension, I find that the experiences of formal long-term care services provided by the state should also be analysed in terms of unequal power relations between care provider and care recipient. In doing so, a comparison between power relations emerging from family care, and power relations emerging from formal care provided by the welfare state could be an interesting added dimension.

The above suggestions of directions for future research serves to illustrate the promise of more comprehensive and longitudinal approaches in the intersecting research fields of social gerontology and migration studies in order to gain insights into the diversity of lifestyles and experiences of ageing in place in multicultural societies.

References

Ackers, L. (2004) Citizenship, Migration, and the Valuation of Care in the European Union. Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies,30 (2), 373-396. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183042000200759

Ahmed, N., & Rees Jones, I. (2008). `Habitus and Bureaucratic Routines', Cultural and Structural Factors in the Experience of Informal Care: A Qualitative Study of Bangladeshi Women Living in London. Current Sociology, 56(1), 57–76. https://doi.org/10.1177/0011392107084379

Ajrouch, K.J., Abdulrahim, S. (2013) Intersections Among Gender, Race and Ethnicity: Implications for Health. in Whitfield, K. & Baker T. (Eds.) Handbook of Minority Aging (p. 455-469). New York: Springer Publishing Company

Albin, B., Albertsson, M., Ekberg, J., & Hjelm, K. (2005). Health and Consumption of Health Care and Social Service among old Migrants in Sweden. Primary Health Care Research & Development, 6(1), 37-45. https://doi.org/10.1191/1463423605pc212oa

Alver, B.G., Øyen, Ø. (1997) Forskningsetikk i forskerhverdag: Vurderinger og praksis. Otta: Tano Aschehoug

Amelina, A. & Faist, T. (2012) De-naturalizing the National in Research Methodologies: Key Concepts of Transnational Studies in Migration. Journal of Ethnic and Racial Studies, 35 (10), 1707-1724, https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2012.659273

Amman, E.S. & Holten, K.V. (2013) Getting Old Here and There: Opportunities and Pitfalls of Transnational Caregiving arrangements. Transnational Social Review,3(1), 31-47. https://doi.org/10.1080/21931674.2013.10820746

Andersson, M. (2003). Immigrant youth and the dynamics of marginalization. YOUNG, 11(1), 74–89. https://doi.org/10.1177/1103308803011001077

Andrews, T. & Vassenden, A. (2007) Snøballen som ikke Ruller. Utvalgsproblemer i Kvalitativ forsking. Sosiologisk Tidsskrift,2 (15), 151-162.Retrieved from

https://www.idunn.no/st/2007/02/snoballen_som_ikke_ruller_utvalgsproblemer_i_kv alitativ_forskning

Angel, R.J & Angel, J.L. (2006) Diversity and Aging in the United States, in Binstock, R.H. & George, L.K (Eds.) Handbook of AGING and the Social Sciences, 94-110. Burlington (MA): Academic Press

Anthias, F. (2012) Transnational Mobilities, Migration Research and Intersectionality: Towards a Translocational Frame, Nordic Journal of Migration Research,2(2),102-110. https://doi.org/10.2478/v10202-011-0032-y

Anwar, M. (1979) The myth of return: Pakistanis in Britain. London: Heinemann Educational Books

Askheim, O., Christensen, K., Fluge, S., & Guldvik, I. (2017). User participation in the Norwegian Welfare Context: An Analysis of Policy Discourses. Journal of Social Policy, 46(3), 583-601. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0047279416000817

Atkinson, R. & Flint J (2001) Accessing hidden and hard to reach populations: snowball research strategies. Social Research Update 33, 1–4. Url: http://sru.soc.surrey.ac.uk/SRU33.pdf

Bajekal, M., Blane, D., Grewal, I., Karlsen, S., & Nazroo, J. (2004). Ethnic differences in influences on quality of life at older ages: A quantitative analysis. Ageing and Society, 24(5), 709-728. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X04002533

Bakken,R.(2016) "Forestillinger om alderdom – betydninger for omsorgsarbeid" in Neumann, C.B, Olsvold, N. & Thagaard, T. (Eds.) Omsorgsarbeidets Sosiologi (p.187-214). Bergen: Fagbokforlaget

Bakken, R. (2018) Alle vil leve lenge – men ingen vil bli gammel. Bergen: Fagbokforlaget

Barglowski, K. (2018) "Where, What and Whom to Study? Principles, Guidelines and Empirical Examples of Case Selection and Sampling in Migration Research, in Zapata-Barrero & R. & Yalaz, E. (Eds.) Qualitative Research in European Migration

Studies (p.151-170). IMISCOE: Springer Open. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-76861-8_9

Basch, L.,Schiller, N.G. & Blanc, C.S (1994) Nations Unbound. Oxon: Routledge

Baldassar, L.,Baldock, C.V & R. Wilding (2007) Migration, Ageing and Transnational Caregiving. New York: Palgrave Macmillan

Baldassar, L., Nedelcu, M., Merla, L., & Wilding, R. (2016). ICT-based co-presence in transnational families and communities: challenging the premise of face-to-face proximity in sustaining relationships. Global Networks, 16, 131–256. https://doi.org/10.1111/glob.12108

Baldassar, L. (2008). Missing Kin and Longing to be Together: Emotions and the Construction of Co-presence in TransnationalRrelationships. Journal of Intercultural Studies, 29, 247–266. https://doi.org/10.1080/07256860802169196

Bangstad, S. (2011) The Morality Police are Coming! Muslims in Norway's Media Discourses. Anthropology Today,27 (5), 3-7. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8322.2011.00825.x

Baykara-Krumme, H. (2013) Returning, Staying or both? Mobility Patterns Among Elderly Turkish Migrants After Retirement,Transnational Social Review,3(1), 11-29. https://doi.org/10.1080/21931674.2013.10820745

Becker, G (2003) Meanings of Place and Displacement in three groups of older immigrants. Journal of Aging Studies,17, 129-149. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0890-4065(03)00007-0

Berge, T.,Øien, H., Jakobssen, L.N. (2014) Formell og Uformell Omsorg – Samspillet mellom Familien og Velferdsstaten (Nova note 3/2014) Oslo: Nova

Bergsvik, J., Kitterød, R.H. & Wiik, K.A. (2016) Forsørgermønstre blant par – Likestilling eller Spesialisering?, Søkelys på Arbeidslivet,33(4). 379-402. Url: https://www.idunn.no/spa/2016/04/forsoergermoenstre_blant_par_likestilling_eller_spesialisr

Bertaux, D.(1981) From the Life-History Approach to the Transformation of Sociological Practice., in Bertaux, D. (Ed.) Biography and Society. London; SAGE Publications

Bertaux, D.,Kohli, M. (1984) The life Story Approach: A Continental View, Annual Review of Sociology, 10, 215-237. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.so.10.080184.001243

Bertaux, D., Thompson P, (1997) Pathways to social class. Oxford: Clarendon Press

Biggs, S. & Daatland, S.O. (2004) Ageing and Diversity: A critical introduction, in Daatland, S.O. & Biggs, S. (Eds.) Ageing and Diversity: Multiple Pathways and Cultural Migrations.(p.1-12). Bristol: Policy Press

Bikova, M. (2017) The Egalitarian Heart. Glocal Care Chains and Philipino Au Pair Migration to Norway (PhD dissertation). University of Bergen: Bergen

Bjerke, K.M. (2017) Bodily Attachment to Place: The Case of Elderly Migrants in Norway. Transnational Social Review, 7(3),300-313. https://doi.org/10.1080/21931674.2017.1317196

Blaakilde, A.L. (2015)Where Is "Place" in Aging in Place? Transnational Issues for the Danish State and Its Retirement Migrants Abroad. Journal of Housing For the Elderly, 29 (1-2), 146-163. https://doi.org/10.1080/02763893.2015.989773

Blakemore, K. (1999) International Migration in Later Life: Social Care and Policy Implications. Ageing and Society, 19(6), 761-774. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X99007503

Bloemraad, I. (2013) The Promise and Pitfalls of Comparative Research Design in the Study of Migration, Migration Studies, 1 (1), 27–46.https://doi.org/10.1093/migration/mns035

Blumer,H. (1954) What is Wrong With Social Theory?. American Sociological Review,19(1), 3-10. Url: https://www.jstor.org/stable/2088165

Blumer, H. (1969). Symbolic interactionism. Perspective and method. Berkeley: University of California Press

Boccagni, P. (2012) Rethinking Transnational Studies: Transnational Ties and the Transnationalism of Everyday life, European Journal of Social Theory,15(1), 117-132. https://doi.org/10.1177/1368431011423600

Boccagni, P. & Schrooten, M. (2018) Participant Observation in Migration Studies: An Overview and Some Emerging Issues, in Zapata-Barrero, R. &Yalas, E. (Eds.) Qualitative Research in European Migration Studies (p.209-225), IMISCOE Research Series: Springer Open Access. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-76861-8_12

Bolzman, C., Ponciono-Derigo, R., Vial, M., & Fibbi, R. (2004). Older labour migrants' well being in Europe: The case of Switzerland. Ageing and Society, 24(3), 411-429. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X03001557

Bolzman, C.,Fibbi, R., & Vial M. (2006) What to do after retirement? Elderly Migrants and the Question of Return, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies,32,1359-1375. https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830600928748

Bolzman, C. & Vagni, G. (2017) Forms of care among native Swiss and older migrants from Southern Europe: a comparison, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 43 (2), 250-269. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238908

Borchorst, A., & Siim, B. (2008). Woman-friendly policies and state feminism: Theorizing Scandinavian gender equality. Feminist Theory, 9(2), 207–224. https://doi.org/10.1177/1464700108090411

Brannen, J. & Nilsen, A. (2011) Comparative Biographies in Case Based Cross-National Research: Methodological Considerations, Sociology, 45(4), 603-618. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038511406602

Brannen,J. & Nilsen, A. (2013) Methodological approaches, practices and reflections., In Nilsen, A., Brannen, J. & S. Lewis (Eds.) Transitions to parenthood in Europe – A comparative Life Course Perspective (p.27-40). Bristol: Policy Press

Breckner, R. (2007) "Case Oriented Comparative Approaches. The Biographical Perspective as Potential and Challenge in Migration Research, in Schittenhelm, K. (ed.), Concepts and Methods in Migration Research. Conference Reader. (p.113-152).Available at: www.cultural-capital.net [Retrieved February 27. 2020]

Breckner, R. & Massari, M. (2019) Biography and Society in Transnational Europe and Beyond. An Introduction, in Rassegna Italiana di Sociologia, Rivista trimestrale fondata da Camillo Pellizzi.3-18. http://doi.org/ 10.1423/93557

Brochmann, G. (2003) "Del 2-1975-2000" in Kjelstadli, K (2003) (ed.) Norsk innvandringshistorie – Bind 3: I globaliseringens tid 1940-2000. Oslo: Pax Forlag

Brochmann, G. & Hagelund, A. (2005) Innvandringens Velferdspolitiske Konsekvenser – Nordisk Kunnskapsstatus. København: Nordisk Ministerråd

Brochmann, G.& Kjelstadli, K.(2008) A History of Immigration: The Case of Norway 900-2000.Oslo: Universitetsforlaget

Brochmann, G. & Hagelund. A. (2010) Velferdens Grenser. Oslo: Universitetsforlaget

Brochmann, G. & Hagelund, A. (2012) "Norway: The land of the Golden Mean" in Brochmann, G.,Hagelund, A. (Eds.) Immigration Policy and The Scandinavian Welfare State (p.149-224). London:Palgrave Macmillan

Brochmann, G. & Djuve, A.B. (2013) Multiculturalism or Assimilation: The Norwegian Welfare State Approach. In Kivisto,P. Wahlbeck, Õ. (eds) (2013) Debating Multiculturalism in the Nordic Welfare States. New York: Palgrave Macmillian

Brochmann, G., Grødem, A.S (2017) "Den Norske Modellens møte med Innvandring – et Regime I endring, in Stamsø, M.A. (ed.) Velferdsstaten i Endring: Norsk Helse og Sosial Politikk.pp.362-381. Retrieved from http://hdl.handle.net/11250/2487278

Brown, D. L. (2002). Migration and Community: Social networks in a Multilevel World. Rural Sociology, 67(1), 1-23. http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1549-0831.2002.tb00091.x

Brown, J. (2011) Expressions of Diasporic Belonging: The divergent emotional geographies of Britain's Polish communities,Emotion, Space & Society,4 (4),229-237. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.emospa.2011.01.004

Buffel, T., Phillipson,C. (2016) "Constructions of "Home" Among First-Generation Migrants Living in Belgium and England" in Walsh, K., Näre, L. (eds.) Transnational Migration and Home in Older Age (p.63-75). New York: Routledge

Buffel, T. (2017) Ageing Migrants and the Creation of Home: Mobility and the Maintenance of Transnational ties, Population, Space and Place,23: e1994. https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.1994

Buscatto, M. (2018) «Doing Ethnography: Ways and Reasons in Flick, U. (Ed.) The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Data Collection (p.327-343). London: Sage Publications

Bygnes, S. (2013). Ambivalent Multiculturalism. Sociology, 47(1), 126–141. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038512448560

Bø, B.P. (1987) Innvandring eller Utestengning?: Om Arbeidsvandringen til Norge og Norsk Innvandringspolitikk. Oslo: TANO

Caritas Norge (2019, 25.06) About Caritas Norge. Retrieved from https://www.caritas.no/aboutus/

Cassum, L. A., Cash, K., Qidwai, W., & Vertejee, S. (2020). Exploring the Experiences of the Older Adults who are Brought to Live in Shelter homes in Karachi, Pakistan: a qualitative study. BMC geriatrics, 20(1). https://doi.org/10.1186/s12877-019-1376-8

Carling, J. (1999) Arbeidsinnvandring og familiegjenforening 1967-1980: En oversikt med hovedvekt på Statistikk, Kulturstudier nr 4, Oslo: Norges forskningsråd

Carling, J., Erdal, M.B. & Ezzati,R. (2014) Beyond the Insider–Outsider Divide in Migration Research, Migration Studies, 2(1),36-54. https://doi.org/10.1093/migration/mnt022

Carr, D.C. & Komp, K.(2011) Introduction. In Carr, D.C., Komp, K.(eds.) Gerontology in the Era of The Third Age: Implications and Next Steps (p.1-20). New York: Springer

Cela, E. & Fokkema, T. (2017). Being Lonely Later in Life: A Qualitative Study Among Albanians and Moroccans in Italy. Ageing and Society, 37(6), 1197-1226. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X16000209

Chamberlain,K.,Hodgetts, D. (2018) "Collecting Qualitative Data with Hard-to-Reach groups, in Flick, U. (ed.) The SAGE handbook of Qualitative Data Collection (p.668-685). London: Sage Publications

Charsley, K.& Liversage, A. (2013), Transforming Polygamy: Migration, Transnationalism and Multiple Marriages among Muslim minorities. Global Networks, 13, 60-78. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-0374.2012.00369.x

Christensen, K. (1994) Hvad indebærer det at udvikle empiristyret sociologisk teori? Sosiologisk Tidsskrift, (4), 243-261.

Christensen,K. (1998) I skyggen af Hellevik. Om udfordringer ved at arbejde empirinært.In Christensen, K., Jerdal, E., Møen, A., Solvang, P. & L. Syltevik (Eds.) Prosess og Metode (p.68-86). Oslo: Universitetsforlaget

Christensen, K. (2005) The Modernisation of Power in Norwegian Home Care Services, in Dahl & Eriksen (eds.) Dilemmas of Care in the Nordic Welfare States. Continuity and Change (p.33-47). Aldershot: Ashgate

Christensen, A.D., & Siim, B. (2006). Fra køn til diversitet – Intersektionalitet i en dansk/nordisk kontekst. Kvinder, Køn & Forskning, (2-3). https://doi.org/10.7146/kkf.v0i2-3.28083

Christensen,A.D. & Jensen, S.Q. (2012) Doing Intersectional Analysis: Methodological Implications for Qualitative Research, NORA – Nordic Journal of Feminist and Gender Research, 20(2), 109-125. https://doi.org/10.1080/08038740.2012.673505

Christensen, K. (2012a) Aldring sett i et Sosiologisk Perspektiv [Aging in a Sociological Perspective], in M. Bondevik & H. Nygaard (eds.) Tverrfaglig Geriatri (p.33-50). Bergen: Fagbokforlaget

Christensen, K. (2012b). Towards a Mixed economy of Long-term Vare in Norway? Critical Social Policy, 32(4), 577–596. https://doi.org/10.1177/0261018311435028

Christensen, K. (2013) "Negotiating Cultural Differences" in Christensen, K.,Guldvik, I. (eds) Migrant Care Workers: Searching for New Horizons (p.123-147).Farnham: Ashgate

Christensen, K. (2016). Personalised care funding in Norway: A case of gradual co-production. In M. Fenger, J. Hudson, & C. Needham (Eds.), Social Policy Review 28: Analysis and debate in social policy, 2016 (p. 233-249). Policy Press. https://doi.org/10.1332/policypress/9781447331797.003.0012

Christensen, K. (2018) Myten om eldrebølgen I Christensen K. & Syltevik L.J (Eds.) Myter om velferd og velferdsstaten .(p.75–97). Oslo: Cappelen Damm Akademisk.https://doi.org/10.23865/noasp.47.ch4

Christensen, K. & Pilling, D. (2018)Introduction. In Christensen,K. & Pilling, D. (eds.) The Routledge Handbook of Social Care Work Around the World (p.1-12). Oxon: Routledge

Christensen,K. & Wærness, K.(2018)"Long-term Care Services in Norway: A historical sociological perspective, in Christensen, K. & Pilling, D. (Eds.)The Routledge Handbook of Social Care around the World (p.15-28).Oxon,New York: Routledge

Ciobanu, R.O. & Ramos, A.C (2016) Is there a way back? A state of the art review of the literature on retirement return migration", in Karl, U., Torres, S. (eds) Ageing in Contexts of Migration (p.96-107). Oxon: Routledge

Ciobanu, R.O., Hunter, A. (2017) Older migrants and (im)mobilities of Ageing: An introduction. Population, Space & Place, 23 (e2075). https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.2075

Ciobanu, R.O., T. Fokkema & M. Nedelcu (2017). Editors' introduction. Ageing as a migrant: Vulnerabilities, Agency and Policy Implications. Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 43(2). 164-181. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238903

Ciobanu, R.O. & T. Fokkema (2017). The Roles of Religion in Protecting Older Romanian Migrants from Loneliness. Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies 43(2): 199-217. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238905

Coldron, K., & Ackers, L. (2007). (AB)Using European Citizenship? EU Retired Migrants and the Exercise of Healthcare Rights. Maastricht Journal of European and Comparative Law, 14(3), 287–302. https://doi.org/10.1177/1023263X0701400306

Corbin, J. & Strauss, A. (1990) Grounded Theory Research: Procedures, Canons, and Evaluative Criteria, Qualitative Sociology,13(1), 3-21. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00988593

Corbin, J. & Strauss,A. (2008) Basics of Qualitative Research. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications

Daly, M. & Lewis, J. (2000) The Concept of Social Care and the Analysis of Contemporary Welfare States, The British Journal of Sociology, 51(2),281-298. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-4446.2000.00281.x

Debesay, J., Harsløf, I., Rechel, B. & H. Vike (2014) Dispensing emotions: Norwegian Community nurses' handling of diversity in a changing organizational context, Social Science And Medicine, 119,74-80. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2014.08.025

Deegan, M.J (2011) "The Chicago School of Ethnography". In Atkinson, P., Coffey, A., Delamont, S., Lofland, J., & Lofland, L. (eds) Handbook of Ethnography, (pp. 11-23). SAGE Publications Ltd. https://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781848608337

De Jong Gierveld, J., Van der Pas, S. & Keating, N (2015) Loneliness of Older Immigrant Groups in Canada: Effects of Ethnic-Cultural Background. Journal of Cross Cultural Gerontology, 30, 251–268. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10823-015-9265-x

Deloitte. (2012). Kostnader og gevinster knyttet til bestiller−utfører-modellen. Senter for storbyrettet forskning (Report August 2012). Retrieved from http://docplayer.me/2744851-Oslo-8-august-2012-kostnader-og-gevinster-knyttet-til-bestiller-utforer- modellen.html

Denzin, N.K,.Lincoln, Y.S (2005) "The art and practices of interpretation, evaluation and representation" in Denzin, N.K,.Lincoln, Y.S (eds) Handbook of Qualitative Research, Thousand Oaks: SAGE publications

De Valk, H. & Schans, D. (2008). 'They ought to do this for their parents': Perceptions of Filial Obligations among Immigrant and Dutch older people. Ageing and Society, 28(1), 49-66. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X07006307

De Valk,H.,Windzio,M.,Wingens,M. & Aybek, C.(2011) Immigrant Settlement and The Life Course, in Wingens,M.,Windzio, M.,De Valk, H & Aybek, C. (Eds.) A Life-Course Perspective on Migration and Integratiom (pp.283-297).Dortrecht Heidelberg London New York: Springer

DeWalt, K. M., & DeWalt, B. R. (2002). Participant observation: A guide for fieldworkers. Walnut Creek: Altamira Press

Donnan, H (1997)" Family and Household in Pakistan" in Donnan, H.,Selier, F., (1997) Family and Gender in Pakistan: Domestic Organization in a Muslim Society, New Delhi: Hindustan Publishing Corporation

Dowd,J.J., Bengtson, V.K. (1978) Aging in Minority Populations an Examination of the Double Jeopardy Hypothesis, Journal of Gerontology, 33 (3), 427-436. https://doi.org/10.1093/geronj/33.3.427

Dyrlid, L.M. (2017) Transnasjonalisme mellom stolthet og stigma: Polske migranters narrativer om arbeid, tilhørighet og posisjonering (Doctoral Thesis, NTNU). Retrieved from http://hdl.handle.net/11250/2444405

Dzamarija,M.T. (2008) Hva skal Innvandreren hete?, Samfunnsspeilet (2008/4) Retrieved from https://www.ssb.no/befolkning/artikler-og-publikasjoner/hva-skal-innvandreren-hete

Dzamarija,M.T. (2019, March 5th) Slik definerer SSB Innvandrere. Retrieved from https://www.ssb.no/befolkning/artikler-og-publikasjoner/slik-definerer-ssb-innvandrere

Eggebø, H (2010) The Problem of Dependency: Immigration, Gender and the Welfare State, Social Politics 17 (3), 295-322. https://doi.org/10.1093/sp/jxq013

Egger de Campo M. (2007). Exit and voice: an investigation of care service users in Austria, Belgium, Italy, and Northern Ireland. European Journal of Ageing, 4(2), 59–69. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10433-007-0047-3

Elder, G.H (1994) Time, Human Agency and Social Change: Perspectives on the Life Course, Social Psychology Quarterly,57 (1), 4-15.Url: http://www.jstor.org/stable/2786971

Elder, G.H.,Hitlin,S.(2007) Time,Self and the Curiously Abstract Concept of Agency, Sociological Theory, 25(2),170-191.doi: 10.1111/j.1467-9558.2007.00303.x

Ellingsæter, A.. (2006) The Norwegian Childcare Regime and its paradoxes. In Ellingsæter, A.L & Leira. A. (eds.) Politicising Parenthood in Scandinavia: Gender Relations in Welfare States.(pp.121-144). Bristol: Policy Press

Ellingsæter, A. (2018) Familiepolitikkens kjønnsforståelser– to spor og fire tiår, Nytt Norsk Tidsskrift,33 (3-4), 246-255. Url: https://www.idunn.no/nnt/2018/03-04/familiepolitikkens_kjoennsforstaaelser

Elwoood,S.A.,Martin, D.G (2000) "Placing" Interviews: Location and Scales of Power in Qualitative Research, The Professional Geographer, 52 (4), 649-657. https://doi.org/10.1111/0033-0124.00253

Esping-Andersen, G. (1999) Social Foundations of Postindustrial Economies. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Eurostat (2015, 12.06.2017): Quality of life in Europe - facts and views. Retrieved from: http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Quality_of_life_in_Europe_-_facts_and_views

Faist, T. (2000) Transnationalization in International Migration: Implications for the Study of Citizenship and Culture, Ethnic and Racial Studies,23(2),189-222. https://doi.org/10.1080/014198700329024

Fangen, K. (2007). Citizenship among young adult Somalis in Norway. YOUNG, 15(4), 413–434. https://doi.org/10.1177/110330880701500405

Fangen, K. (2010) Deltagende Observasjon. [Participant Observation] Bergen: Fagbokforlaget

Ferge,Z.(1998) Women and social transformation in Central- Eastern Europe: "the old left" and "the new right", Social Policy Review,10,159-178. Url: www.jstor.org/stable/41133037

Finch, J.,Mason, J. (1993) Negotiating Family Responsibilities. London: Routledge

Fine, M. & Glendinning, C.(2005) Dependence, independence, or inter-dependence? Revisiting the concept of 'care' and 'dependency', Ageing & Society, 25,601-621. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X0500360

Flybjerg, B. (2006) Five Misunderstandings About Case Study Research, Qualitative Inquiry,12(2),219-245. http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/1077800405284363

Foner, N.& Dreby, J. (2011) Relations Between the Generations in Immigrant Families, Annual Review of Sociology,37,545-564. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-soc-081309-150030

Fokkema, T., & Naderi, R. (2013). Differences in Late-life Loneliness: A Comparison between Turkish and Native-born Older adults in Germany. European journal of ageing, 10(4), 289–300. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10433-013-0267-7

Fortier, A.M. (2000) Migrant Belongings – Memory, Space, Identity. Oxford:Berg

Fokkema, T, Cela, E, & Witter, Y. (2015). Pendular migration of older adults: misconceptions and nuances. In In: Horn, V. & C. Schweppe (eds), Transnational Aging: Current Insights and Future Challenges (pp. 141-161), New York: Routledge 2016. Retrieved from http://hdl.handle.net/1765/79764

Fraser, N.,Gordon,L.(1994) A Genealogy of Dependency: Tracing a Keyword of the US Welfare State, Signs,19(2),309-336. Url:https://www.jstor.org/stable/3174801

Friberg, J.H.,Eldring, L.(2011) Polonia i Oslo: Mobilitet, arbeid og levekår blant Polakker i Oslo (Fafo Report 2011:7) Retrieved from https://www.fafo.no/index.php/zoo-publikasjoner/fafo-rapporter/item/polonia-i-oslo-2010

Friberg, J.H., Golden, A. (2014) Norges største innvandrergruppe: Historien om migrasjon fra Polen til Norge og om Andrespråkskorpuset ASK, NOA norsk som andrespråk, 30 (2), 11-23

Friberg, J.H., Elgvin, O. (2016) Når velferdsstaten bryter tilliten ned: Somaliske innvandrere i møte med NAV, Tidsskrift for Samfunnsforskning,3 (57), pp. 257-284. https://doi.org/10.18261/issn.1504-291X-2016-03-02

Frønes, I., Brusdahl, R. (2000) På sporet av den nye tid: Kulturelle Varsler for en Nær Framtid. Bergen: Fagbokforlaget

Førland, O.F., Folkestad, B. (2016) Hjemmetjenestene i Norge i et befolknings- og brukerperspektiv. En populasjonsstudie basert på innbyggerundersøkelsene fra 2010, 2013 og 2015 (Senter for Omsorgsgforskning,Report 1/16). Retrieved from http://hdl.handle.net/1956/5626

Førland O.F, Fagertun A, Hansen R, Kverndokk S. (2017) Normtider til besvær. Senter for omsorgsforskning,vest. (Report 4/2017). Retrieved from http://hdl.handle.net/11250/2444232

Gallie, D.,Felstead, A. & Green, F. (2012) Job Preferences and the Intrinsic Quality of work: The Changing Attitudes of British Employees 1992-2006, Work, Employment and Society,26 (5),.806-821. https://doi.org/10.1177/0950017012451633

Ganga, D. (2006) From Potential Returnees into Settlers: Nottingham's Older Italians, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 32 (8), 1395-1413. https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830600928789

Gardner, K. (2002) Age, Narrative and Migration: The Life Course and Life Histories of Bengali Elders in London.Oxford: Berg

Geertz, C. (1973) The interpretation of cultures : selected essays. New York: Basic Books

Giddens, A. (1990) The Consequences of Modernity. California: Stanford University Press

Gilleard, C., Higgs, P.F.D. (2010) Aging without agency: Theorizing the fourth age, Aging & Mental Health, 14 (2), 121-128. https://doi.org/10.1080/13607860903228762

Giuntoli, G., Cattan, M. (2012) The experiences and expectations of care and support among older migrants in the UK, European Journal of Social Work, 15 (1), 131-147. https://doi.org/10.1080/13691457.2011.562055

Glaser, B., Strauss, A. (1967) The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research, London: Routledge

Glucksmann, M., Lyon, D. (2006) Configurations of Care Work: Paid and Unpaid Elder Care in Italy and the Netherlands, Sociological Research Online, 11 (2) Retrieved from http://www.socresonline.org.uk/11/2/glucksmann.html

Gobo, G. (2008) «Re-conceptualizing Generalization: Old issues in a New Frame", in Alasuutari, P.,Bickman, L. & J. Brannen (Eds.) The Sage Handbook of Social Research Methods (pp.193-207), London: Sage Publications

Godzimirski, J. (2011) Polsk Diaspora og norsk utenrikspolitikk, Internasjonal Politikk, 4(69), 617-643. Retrieved from https://www.idunn.no/ip/2011/04/art03

Golinowska, S., Sowa-Kofta, A. (2018) "Imbalance Between Demand and Supply of Long-term care: the Case of Post-communist Poland" in Christensen, K. & Pilling, D. (Eds.)The Routledge Handbook of Social Care around the World (pp.171-184).Oxon,New York: Routledge

Grewal, I., Nazroo, J., Bajekal,M., Blane, D. & Lewis, J. (2004) Influences on Quality of Life: a Qualitative Investigation of Ethnic Differences among Older People in England, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 30(4,) 737-761. https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830410001699595

Grundy, E. (2005) Reciprocity in relationships: socio-economic and health influences on intergenerational exchanges between Third Age parents and their adult children in Great Britain, The British Journal of Sociology, 56, 233-255. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-4446.2005.00057.x

Gubrium, J.F., Holstein, J.A. (2008) «Beyond Stereotypes» in Gubrium, J.F.,Holstein,J.A. (eds.) Ways of Aging (pp. 3-10). Malden: Blackwell Publishing

Gullestad,M. (2002a) Det Norske sett med nye øyne – kritisk analyse av norsk innvandringsdebatt.Oslo: Universitetsforlaget

Gullestad,M.(2002b) Invisible Fences: Egalitarianism, Nationalism and Racism, Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute, 8 (1),pp.45-63. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/3134875

Guarnizo, L.E. (1997) The Emergence of a Transnational Social Formation and The Mirage of Return Migration Among Dominican Transmigrants, Identities Global Studies in Culture and Power, 3(2),281-322. https://doi.org/10.1080/1070289X.1997.9962591

Hagelund, A. (2002) Problematizing Culture: Discourses on Integration in Norway, Journal of International Migration and Integration 3 (3 & 4),401-415. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12134-002-1022-7

Hagelund, A. (2003), "THE IMPORTANCE OF BEING GOOD: POWER AND MORALITY IN NORWEGIAN IMMIGRATION POLITICS", Brochmann, G. (Ed.) Multicultural Challenge (Comparative Social Research, Vol. 22) (pp. 177-203), Emerald Group Publishing Limited, Bingley,. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0195-6310(03)22007-X

Hagelund, A. (2008) 'For Women and Children' – The Family and Immigration Politics in Scandinavia. In Grillo, R.(Ed.) The Family in Question: Immigrant and ethnic minorities in Multicultural Europe (pp.71-88). Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press

Hagestad, G.O. & Dykstra, P.A. (2016) Structuration of the Life Course: Some Neglected Aspects, in Shanahan, M.J., Mortimer, J.T., & M.J. Kirkpatrick. (Eds.) Handbook of the Life Course (pp.131-157). Switzerland: Springer International Publishing

Halkier, B. (2011) Methodological Practicalities in Analytical Generalization. Qualitative Inquiry, 17(9), 787–797. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077800411423194

Hammarstrøm, G. & Torres,S. (2008) Being, Feeling and Acting: A Qualitative Study of Swedish home-help care recipients' understandings of dependence and independence, Journal of Aging Studies, 24,75-87. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaging.2008.10.002

Hammersley, M., Atkinson, P. (1995) Ethnography: Principles in Practice. London: Routledge

Hammersley, M.,Gomm, R. (2000) «Introduction» in Gomm, R., Hammersley, M & P. Foster (eds) Case Study Method – Key Issues, Key Texts (pp.1-17), London: Sage Publications

Hammersley, M. (2008) Questioning Qualitative Inquiry: Critical Essays. London: SAGE Publications

Hammersley, M. (2012) "Assessing Validity in Social Research" in Alasuutari, P., Bickman, L. & J. Brannen (eds) The SAGE handbook of Social Research Methods (pp. 42-53). London: SAGE Publications. https://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781446212165.n4

Hammersley, M. (2013) What is Qualitative Research?.London: Bloomsbury Publishing

Hansen, E.B. (2014) Older Immigrants Use of Public Home Care and Residential Care, European Journal of Ageing,11 (1), .41-53.https://doi.org/10.1007/s10433-013-0289-1

Haugen,M.S.,Villa, M. (2005) Naboskap i bygda, Sosiologisk Tidsskrift,3(13),213-233.Retrieved from https://www.idunn.no/st/2005/03/naboskap_i_bygda

Havens, B., Chappell, N.L. (1983) Triple Jeopardy: Age, Sex and Ethnicity, Canadian Ethnic Studies,15 (3),119-132.

Head, E. (2009) The Ethics and Implications of Paying Participants in Qualitative Research, International Journal of Social Research Methodology, 12 (4), 335-344. https://doi.org/10.1080/13645570802246724

Henriksen,K. (2007) Fakta om 18 innvandrergrupper i Norge (Statistics Norway Report 29). Retrieved from https://www.ssb.no/a/publikasjoner/pdf/rapp_200729/rapp_200729.pdf

Henriksen, K. & Mørk, E. (2010) Seniorer blant innvandrerne. In Mørk, E. (Ed.) Seniorer i Norge (Report Statistics Norway). Retrieved from https://www.ssb.no/sosiale-forhold-og-kriminalitet/artikler-og-publikasjoner/_attachment/157022?_ts=14370df7000

Herlofson, K. & Daatland, S.O. (2016). Forskning om familiegenerasjoner. En kunnskapsstatus. (NOVA report 2/16). Retrieved from http://www.hioa.no/Om-OsloMet/Senter-for-velferds-og arbeidslivsforskning/ NOVA/ Publikasjonar/ Rapporter/ 2016/ Forskning-om-familiegenerasjoner

Hirschman A.O (1970) Exit, voice, and loyalty: responses to decline in firms, organizations, and states. Cambridge: Harvard University Press

Hjelm, K. and Albin, B. (2014) Limited Focus on the Use of Health Care by Elderly Migrants—A Literature Review. Open Journal of Nursing, 4, 465-473. . http://dx.doi.org/10.4236/ojn.2014.46049

Hockey, J., James, A. (1995) Growing up and Growing old –Ageing and Dependency in the Life Course. London: Sage Publications

Hochschild, T. R. (2010). "Our Club": Place-Work and the Negotiation of Collective Belongingness. Journal of Contemporary Ethnography, 39(6), 619–645. https://doi.org/10.1177/0891241610378857

Holstein, J.A. and Gubrium, J.F. (2007), Constructionist Perspectives on the Life Course. Sociology Compass, 1,335-352. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1751-9020.2007.00004.x

Hopkins, P. E. (2004) Young Muslim men in Scotland: inclusions and exclusions. Children's geographies, 2(2), pp.257-272. https://doi.org/10.1080/14733280410001720548

Horn, V. (2019) Aging within Transnational Families: The Case of Older Peruvians. London: Anthem Press.

Horn,V., Schweppe, C., Um, S.G. (2013) Transnational Aging – A Young Field of Research, Transnational Social Review,3 (1),7-10. https://doi.org/10.1080/21931674.2013.10820744

Horn, V., Schweppe, C. (Eds.) (2017) Transnational Aging: Current Insights and Future Challenges. New York: Routledge

Horn, V.,Schweppe,C.(2017) Transnational Aging: Toward a Transnational Perspective in Old Age Research, European Journal of Ageing,14,335-339. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10433-017-0446-z

Hovde, B., Hallberg, I. R., & Edberg, A-K. (2008). Public Care among Older Non-Nordic Immigrants in Sweden in Comparison with Nordic Born Controls. Vard i Norden, 28(4), 9-13. https://doi.org/10.1177/0107408308028004

Hovden, J.F. & Mjelde, H. (2019) Increasingly Controversial, Cultural and Political: The Immigration Debate in Scandinavian Newspapers 1970-2016, Javnost – The Public,26 (2),138-157. https://doi.org/10.1080/13183222.2019.1589285

Hunter, A. (2016)" Emotional or Instrumental? Narratives of Home Among North and West African Seniors in France", in Walsh, K & Näre, L.(Eds.) Transnational Migration and Home in Older Age (pp.75-86). New York: Routledge

Hunter A. (2018) Retirement Home? Ageing Migrant Workers in France and the Question of Return. IMISCOE Research Series. Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-64976-4

Iglicka, K. (2019) Poland's Post-War Dynamic of Migration.New York: Routledge

Ingebretsen, R. Nergård, T.B. (2007) Eldre med innvandrerbakgrunn – tilpasning av pleie og omsorgstibudet (NOVA-report 2007:13). Oslo: NOVA

Ingebretsen,R.(2010) Omsorgstjenester for elder innvandrere. Samlede prosjekterfaringer (NOVA report 15/10). Oslo: NOVA

Ingebretsen, R. (2011) Omsorgstjenester til personer med etnisk minoritetsbakgrunn. (NOVA Report 28/11). Oslo: NOVA

Isaksen,A.L.W. (1994) Den Tabubelagte Kroppen: Kropp, Kjønn og Tabuer i dagens omsorgsarbeid (PhD Thesis). Bergen: The Department of Sociology

Jenkins, R. (2008) Rethinking Ethnicity. London: Sage Publications

Joas, H. (1993) Pragmatism and Social Theory. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press

Johansson, K.,Rudman, D.L.,Mondaca,M.,Park,M.,Luborsky,M.,Josephsson, S. & E. Asaba (2013) Moving Beyond 'Aging In Place' to Understand Migration and Aging: Place Making and the Centrality of Occupation. Journal of Occupational Science, 20(2), 108-119. https://doi.org/10.1080/14427591.2012.735613

Justesen,L. & Mik-Meyer, N. (2012) Qualitative Research Methods in Organisation Studies. Copenhagen: Gyldendal

Kafkovà, M. P. (2016) The "Real" Old Age and the Transition Between the Third and Fourth Age, Sociològia Slovak Sociological Review, 48(6), 622-640. Retrieved from http://cejsh.icm.edu.pl/cejsh/element/bwmeta1.element.cejsh-32958c69-c313-4bb5-993c-5de4dcc249d3

Kannick, L. (1997) Omsorg – til glede eller bekymring. Rapport fra en studie av innvandrerkvinners omsorgsansvar for eldre innvandrere. Norsk folkehjelp

Karl, U., Torres, S. (Eds.) (2016) Ageing in Contexts of Migration. Oxon: Routledge

Karl,U., Ramos, A.C & B. Kühn (2017) Older migrants in Luxembourg – care preferences for old age between family and professional services, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, (43)2, 270-286. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238909

Kavli,H.C (2006) Med rett til å lære. Det offentlige Kvalifiseringsregimet for innvandrere og flyktninger In Integreringskart 2006 (IMDI Report 2006:1). Oslo: Integrering og Mangfoldsdirektoratet

Khan,M.(2009) Tilbakeblikk: Da Pakistanerne kom til Norge . Oslo: Pax Forlag

Kildal, N., Kunhle, S. (2005) "The Nordic Welfare Model and The Idea of Universalism" in Kildal, N., Kunhle,S. (eds) Normative Foundations of the Welfare State: The Nordic Experience. pp. 13-33. Oxon: Routledge

Kilkey, M., & Merla, L. (2014). Situating transnational families' caregiving arrangements: The role of institutional contexts. Global Networks, 14, 210–229. https://doi.org/10.1111/glob.12034

King, R., Cela, E., Fokkema, T. and Vullnetari, J. (2014) The migration and wellbeing of the zero generation: Transgenerational care, grandparenting and loneliness amongst Albanian older people. Population, Space and Place, 20(8).728–738. https://doi.org/10.1002/psp.1895

Kitterød, R.H. and Lappegård, T. (2012), A Typology of Work-Family Arrangements Among Dual-Earner Couples in Norway. Family Relations, 61,671-685. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1741-3729.2012.00725.x

Kivisto, P. (2001) Theorizing Transnationalism Immigration: A Critical Review of Current Efforts,Ethnic and Racial Studies, 24(4), 549-577. https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870120049789

Kivisto, P. (2003). Social Spaces, Transnational Immigrant Communities, and the Politics of Incorporation. Ethnicities, 3(1), 5–28. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468796803003001786

Kjelstad, R. (2001) Gender Policies and Gender Equality. In Kautto,M et al (Eds.) Nordic Welfare States in the European Context (pp.66-97).London: Routledge

Klok, J., van Tilburg, T.G., Suanet, B., Fokkema, T. & M. Hujsman (2017). National and transnational belonging among Turkish and Moroccan older migrants in the Netherlands: protective against loneliness?.European Journal of Ageing,14,341–351. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10433-017-0420-9

Kohn, M.L (1987) Cross-national research as an analytic strategy: American Sociological Association 1987 presidential address, American Sociological Review, 52 (6),713-731. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/stable/2095831

Korbøl,A., Midtbøen, A. (2018) Den kritiske fase – Innvandring til Norge fra Pakistan 1970-1973.Oslo: Universitetsforlaget

Korinek, K., Entwisle, B., & Jampaklay, A. (2005). Through Thick and Thin: Layers of Social Ties and Urban Settlement among Thai Migrants. American Sociological Review, 70(5), 779–800. https://doi.org/10.1177/000312240507000503

Kohli, M., & Meyer, J. W. (1986). Social structure and social construction of life stages. Human Development, 29(3), 145-149. https://doi.org/10.1159/000273038

Krause,M.(2019) What is Zeitgeist? Examining Period Specific Cultural Patterns, Poetics, 76, 1-10. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.poetic.2019.02.003

Krzyzowski, L.,Mucha,J. (2014) Transnational Caregiving in Turbulent time: Polish Migrants in Iceland and their Elderly Parents in Poland, International Sociology, 29 (1),22-37. https://doi.org/10.1177/0268580913515287

Kusenbach,M. (2018) "Go-alongs", in Flick, U. (ed.) The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Data Collection,pp.344-361. London: SAGE Publications

Kvale, S. & Brinkman, S. (2011) Det kvalitative forskningsintervju. Oslo: Gyldendal Akademisk

Lamb, S. (2002) Intimacy in a Transnational Era: The Remaking of Aging among Indian Americans, Diaspora: A Journal of Transnational Studies,11(3), 229-330.doi: 299-330. https://doi.org/10.1353/dsp.2011.0003

Lamont, M. (1992) Money, Morals & Manners: The Culture of the French and American Upper-Middle Class. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press

Lamont, M. (2000) The Dignity of Working Men: Morality and the Boundaries of Race, Class and Immigration. New York: Russel Sage Foundation

Laslett,P. (1991) A Fresh Map of Life: The Emergence of The Third Age. Cambridge: Harvard University Press

Lau D.T, Scandrett K.G, Jarzebowski M, Holman, K & Emanuel L. (2007) Health-related safety: A framework to address barriers to aging in place, The Gerontologist, 47,830–837. https://doi.org/10.1093/geront/47.6.830

Lawrence, S. & Torres, S. (Eds.) (2016). Older People and Migration: Challenges for Social Work. New York: Routledge.

Levitt, P. & Schiller,N.G.(2004) Conceptualizing Simultaneity: A Transnational Social Field Perspective on Society, International Migration Review, 38(3),1002-1039. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-7379.2004.tb00227.x

Levitt, P., Jaworsky, N. (2007) Transnational Migration Studies: Past Developments and Future Trends, The Annual Review of Sociology,33, 129-156. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.soc.33.040406.131816

Lewis, D.C. (2009)Aging out of Place: Cambodian Refugee Elders in The United States, Family Consumers Sciences Research Journal, 37(3).376-393. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077727X08330684

Lima, I.A. & Slagsvold, B. (2009) Det gode nabolag finnes mest på bygda: Naboskapsintegrasjon i Norge – forskjeller mellom by og land, Samfunnsspeilet (2009:1). Retrieved from https://www.ssb.no/sosiale-forhold-og-kriminalitet/artikler-og-publikasjoner/det-gode-nabolag-finnes-mest-paa-bygda

Lincoln, Y.S., Guba, E.G (1985) Naturalistic Inquiry. California: Sage Publications

Lithman, Y. (2010). The Holistic ambition: Social cohesion and the culturalization of citizenship. Ethnicities, 10(4), 488–502. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468796810378321

Liversage, A. (2016). Twice as many helpers: Unpacking the connection between marriage migration and older labour immigrants' access to family support. Migration Letters, 14(1), 50-62. https://doi.org/10.33182/ml.v14i1.315

Liversage, A., Mirdal, G.M (2017) Growing old in exile – a longitudinal study of migrant women from Turkey, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 43 (2), 287-302. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238910

Lukowski, J.,Zawadski,H. (2006) A Concise History of Poland. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Lyon, D., & Glucksmann, M. (2008). Comparative Configurations of Care Work across Europe. Sociology, 42(1), 101–118. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038507084827

Majid, H., Memon, S. (2018, February 19) Elderly Care in Pakistan. Retrieved from https://www.dawn.com/news/1390240

Markides, K.S. & Gerst, K. (2011) "Immigration, Aging and Health in The United States, in Settersten, R.A.,Angel, J.L (eds.) Handbook of Sociology of Aging (pp.103-116),New York (NY): Springer

Markussen, M.K.G (2020) 'Nobody comes to Baba for advice': negotiating ageing masculinities in the Somali diaspora, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 46 (7), 1442-1459. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2018.1496817

Martiniello, M. (2013) Comparisons in Migration Studies, Comparative Migration Studies,1 (1), 7-22. https://doi.org/10.5117/CMS2013.1.MART

Marshall V.W. & Bengtson V.L. (2011) Theoretical Perspectives on the Sociology of Aging. In: Settersten R. & Angel J. (Eds) Handbook of Sociology of Aging. Handbooks of Sociology and Social Research (pp.17-33). New York: Springer

May, V., & Muir, S. (2015). Everyday Belonging and Ageing: Place and Generational Change, Sociological Research Online, 20(1), 72–82. https://doi.org/10.5153/sro.3555

Mayblin, L, Piekut, A. & Valentine, G. (2014) 'Other' Posts in 'Other' places: Poland through a Postcolonial lens?, Sociology,50 (1), 60-76. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038514556796

Mayer, K.U. (2004) Whose lives? How History, Societies and Institutions Define and Shape the Life Course, Research in Human Development,1(3),161-187. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15427617rhd0103_3

Maynard, M. Afshar, H.,Franks, M., & S. Wray (2008) Women in Later Life: Exploring Race and Ethnicity.Berkshire:Open University Press

Mazumdar, S., & Mazumdar, S. (2009). Religious Placemaking and Community Building in Diaspora. Environment and Behavior, 41(3), 307–337. https://doi.org/10.1177/0013916508320459

McHugh,K.E., Mings, R.C (1996) The Circle of Migration: Attachment to Place in Aging, Annals of the Association of American Geographers, 86 (3), 530-550. Stable URL: https://www.jstor.org/stable/2564183

Mead, G.H (1934) The self. In Calhoun,C.,Gerteis,J.,Moody,J.,Pfaff, S, & I. Virk (2008) (Eds.) Classical Sociological Theory (p.283-294). Malden: Blackwell Publishing

Meisingset, K.,Kawecka, A., & E. Czapka (2011) Polakk.Oslo: Frekk Forlag

Memon, A.P., Memon, P.S., Shaikh, S., & F. Memon (2011) "Political Instability: A Case Study of Pakistan", Journal of Political Studies, Retrieved from https://go.galegroup.com/ps/i.do?p=AONE&sw=w&u=googlescholar&v=2.1&it=r&id=GALE%7CA260588575&sid=googleScholar&asid=7f0dfee1

Merriam, S.B, J. Johnson-Bailey, Y. Kee, G. Ntseane & M. Muhamad (2001) Power and Positionality: Negotiating insider/outsider status within and across cultures,

International Journal of Lifelong Education,20(5), 405-416.
https://doi.org/10.1080/0260137012049

Midtbøen,A.H.(2009) Statsborgerrettslig revisjon og Integrasjonspolitisk Variasjon i de Skandinaviske Landene, Tidsskrift for Samfunnsforskning 50 (4),523-547. Retrieved from: https://www.idunn.no/tfs/2009/04/art06

Midtbøen, A.H.; S.R Birkvad; & M.B Erdal (2018) Citizenship in the Nordic Countries. Copenhagen: TemaNord, Nordic Council of Ministers.

Miller, D. (1981). The 'sandwich' generation: Adult children of the aging. Social Work, 26(5), 419-423. Retrieved from www.jstor.org/stable/23712207

Milligan,C.,Bingley, A. & Gatrell, A." 'Healing and feeling': The Place of Emotions in Later Life" in Davidson, J.,Bondi,L & Smith, N. (eds)(2007) Emotional Geographies.Aldershot: Ashgate Publishers

Mills. C.W. (1939) Language, Logic and Culture, American Sociological Review, 4 (5),670-680. Retrieved from https://www.jstor.org/stable/2083575

Mills,C.W (1959) The Sociological Imagination.New York: Oxford University Press

Ministry of Health and Care Services (2011) The Norwegian Public Health Act (ACT-2011-06-24-29). Retrieved from https://www.regjeringen.no/globalassets/upload/hod/hoeringer-fha_fos/123.pdf

Ministry of Health and Care Services. (2012) Future Care (White Paper to Parliament, 2012-2013). Retrieved from: https://www.regjeringen.no/en/dokumenter/meld.-st.-29-2012-2013/id723252/

Min, J.W. (2005): Cultural competency: A key to Effective Future Social Work With Racially and Ethnically diverse Elders, Families in Society, 86 (3), 347–358. https://doi.org/10.1606/1044-3894.3432

Ministry of Health and Care Services (2013) Likeverdige helse- og omsorgstjenester – god helse for alle (National Strategy for immigrant health 2013-2017) Retrieved from

https://www.regjeringen.no/contentassets/2de7e9efa8d341cfb8787a71eb15e2db/likev
erdige_tjenester.pdf

Moen, B., (2002) Når hjemme er et annet sted – omsorg for eldre med
minoritetsetnisk bakgrunn (Report 8/02) Oslo: NOVA

Moen,B.(2009) Tilhørighetens balanse – Norsk Pakistanske kvinners hverdagsliv i
transnasjonale familier (Report 13/09). Oslo: NOVA

Moen,P.(2011) A Life Course Approach to the Third Age, in Carr, D.C., Komp,
K.(eds) Gerontology in the Era of The Third Age: Implications and Next Steps
(pp.13-32), New York: Springer

Morill,C. & Fine, G.A.(1997) Ethnographic Contributions to Organizational
Sociology, Sociological Methods and Research,25(4),424-451.
https://doi.org/10.1177/0049124197025004003

Munkejord, M.C., Eggebø, H. & W. Schönfelder (2017) HVORDAN IVARETAS
DEN SOSIALE OMSORGEN? En studie av brukeres, pårørendes og ansattes
erfaringer med hjemmebasert eldreomsorg (Report 3/17). Uni Research Rokkan.
Retrieved from http://hdl.handle.net/11250/2626985

Mutchler, J.E. & Burr, J.A.(2011) "Race, Ethnicity and Aging", in Settersten, R.A. &
Angel, J.L (Eds.) Handbook of Sociology of Aging (pp.83-102), New York (NY):
Springer

Mæland, S. (2016) «Hva har vi felles?» En studie i kulturell kompleksitet og
multikulturelle prosesser i Den katolske kirke i Norge (PhD Dissertation) University
of Oslo. Retrieved from http://urn.nb.no/URN:NBN:no-53767

Nadim, M. (2017) Familien som ressurs eller hinder? Etterkommerkvinners
deltagelse i arbeid, Norsk Sosiologisk Tidsskrift,1 (1), 35-52.
https://doi.org/10.18261/issn.2535-2512-2017-01-03

Naldemirci,O.(2013) Caring (in) Diaspora (PhD Dissertation). University of
Gothenburg, Gothenburg. Retrieved from:
https://gupea.ub.gu.se/bitstream/2077/34304/1/gupea_2077_34304_1.pdf

Näre, L. (2016) Home as Family: Narratives of Home Among Ageing Gujaratis in the UK in Walsh, K, & Näre, L.(eds.) Transnational Migration and Home in Older Age (pp.50-62). New York: Routledge

Näre, L. (2017) Identity and ambivalence in everyday transnationalism: older-aged Gujaratis in London, Identities, 24(5), 625-640. https://doi.org/10.1080/1070289X.2017.1345550

Näre, L.,Walsh, K. Baldassar, L.(2017) Ageing in Transnational Contexts: Transforming Everyday Practices and Identities in Later Life, Identities,24(5),515-543. https://doi.org/10.1080/1070289X.2017.1346986

Nergård,T.B.(2009) Mangfoldig Omsorg:Tre Innvandrergrupper forteller om sine forventninger til alderdommen (Report 16/09). Oslo: NOVA

Neugarten,B. (1974) Age Norms, Age Constrains and the Rise of The Young Old, The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science,415(1),187-198. https://doi.org/10.1177/000271627441500114

Nilsen, A. (1994) Life stories in context. A discussion of the linguistic turn contemporary sociological life story research, Sosiologisk Tidsskrift, (2) Oslo: Scandinavian University Press

Nilsen, A. (2008) "From Questions of Methods to Epistemological issues: The Case of Biographical Reseach". in P. Alasuutari, L. Bickman,. & J. Brannen (eds) The Sage Handbook of Social Research Methods (pp.81-94). London: SAGE publications

Nilsen, A. & Brannen, J. (2010) "The Use of Mixed Methods in Biographical Research" in Tashakkori, A. & Teddlie, C. (Eds.) SAGE Handbook of Mixed Methods in Social & Behavioral Research(pp.677-696). California: SAGE Publications

Norwegian Ministry of Health and Care Services (2013) Future Care. (Report to the Storting no.29 2012-2014) Retrieved from: https://www.regjeringen.no/en/dokumenter/meld.-st.-29-2012-2013/id723252/

NOU 2011:7 (2011) Velferd og Migrasjon: den norske modellens framtid. Retrieved from: https://www.regjeringen.no/no/dokumenter/nou-2011-07/id642496/

NOU 2011:17 (2011) Når Sant Skal sies om Pårørendeomsorg:Fra Usynlig til Verdsatt og Inkludert. Retrieved from https://www.regjeringen.no/no/dokumenter/nou-2011-17/id660537/?ch=1

Næss, A., Vabø, M. (2014) Negotiating Narratives of Elderly Care: The Case of Pakistani Migration to Norway. Ageing International 39, 13–3. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12126-012-9147-2

Orupabo,J.(2014) Interseksjonalitet i Praksis: Utfordringer med å Anvende et Interseksjonalitetsperspektiv i empirisk forskning. Sosiologisk Tidsskrift, 4 (22),329-351.Retrieved from wwww.idunn.no/ts/st

Otnes, B. (2015) Utviklingen i pleie- og omsorgstjenestene 1994-2013, Tidsskrift for omsorgsforskning, 1(1), 48-61. Retrieved from https://www.idunn.no/tidsskrift_for_omsorgsforskning/2015/01/utviklingen_i_pleie-_og_omsorgstjenestene_19942013

Owens T.J. (2006) Self and Identity. In Delamater J. (Ed.) Handbook of Social Psychology. Handbooks of Sociology and Social Research (pp.205-232). https://doi.org/10.1007/0-387-36921-X_9

Padela, A. I., & Del Pozo, P. R. (2011). Muslim patients and cross-gender interactions in medicine: an Islamic bioethical perspective. Journal of medical ethics, 37(1), 40–44. https://doi.org/10.1136/jme.2010.037614

Paganini-Hill A. (2013). Aging in Place in a Retirement Community: 90+ Year Olds. Journal of housing for the elderly, 27(1-2), 191–205. https://doi.org/10.1080/02763893.2012.754822

Palmberger, M. (2017) Social ties and embeddedness in old age: older Turkish labour migrants in Vienna, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 43 (2), 235-249. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238907

Parreñas, R.S. (2001) Servants of Globalization – Women, Migration and Domestic Work. California: Stanford University Press

Parreñas, R.S. (2010), Homeward bound: the circular migration of entertainers between Japan and the Philippines. Global Networks, 10: 301-323. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-0374.2010.00288.x

Pascall, G. & Lewis, J. (2004) Emerging Gender Regimes and Policies for Gender Equality in a Wider Europe, Journal of Social Policy, 33(3): 373-394. https://doi.org/10.1017/S004727940400772X

Patzelt, A.(2017) 'A totally new world has been opening up for me' – experiences of older German migrants who are actively involved in the German-speaking community in Ottawa, Canada, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 43 (2), 218-234. https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238906

Payne, G. & Williams, M. (2005) "Generalization in Qualitative Research", Sociology,39 (2),295-314. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038505050540

Penninx R., Garcés-Mascareñas B. (2016) The Concept of Integration as an Analytical Tool and as a Policy Concept. In: Garcés-Mascareñas B., Penninx R. (Eds.) Integration Processes and Policies in Europe. IMISCOE Research Series. Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-21674-4_2

Perek-Bialas,J., Slany, K. (2016) The elderly care regime and migration regime after the EU accession: The case of Poland. In Karl, U. & Torres, S. (Eds) Ageing in Contexts of Migration (pp.27-38). London; New York: Routledge

Phillips, J.E., Ajrouch, K.J. & S. Hillcoat-Walletamby (2010) Key Concepts in Social Gerontology, SAGE Publications, ProQuest Ebook Central, https://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/bergen-ebooks/detail.action?docID=743515.

Phillipson, C. (2015) Placing ethnicity at the centre of studies of later life: Theoretical perspectives and empirical challenges. Ageing and Society, 35(5), 917-934. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X14001032

Phillipson,C., Ahmed, N. (2004) "Transnational Communities, migration and changing identities in later life: A new Research agenda, in Daatland, S.O.,Biggs, S. (eds.) Ageing and Diversity: Multiple Pathways and Cultural Migrations. Bristol: The Policy Press

Phillipson, C. (2007). The 'elected' and the 'excluded': Sociological perspectives on the experience of place and community in old age. Ageing & Society, 27(3), 321–342. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X06005629

Polanyi, M. (1966) The Tacit Dimension. Michigan: Doubleday

Portes, A. & Sensenbrenner, J. (1993) Embeddedness and Immigration: Notes on the Social Determinants of Economic Action, American Journal of Sociology 98 (6), 1320-1350. https://doi.org/10.1086/230191

Portes, A,.Guarnizo, L. & Landolt,P. (1999) The study of Transnationalism – Pitfalls and Promise of an Emergent Research Field, Ethnic and Racial Studies, 22 (2),217-237. https://doi.org/10.1080/014198799329468

Predelli, L. N (2008) Religion, Citizenship and Participation – A Case Study of Immigrant Muslim Women in Norwegian Mosques, European Journal of Women`s Studies,15 (3), 241-260. https://doi.org/10.1177/1350506808091506

Qadeer, M.A (2006) Pakistan – Social and Cultural transformations in a Muslim nation. London: Routledge

Qureshi, K. (2012) Ageing: Gender, Social Class and Health in Pakistan. Centre for Public Policy and Governance (Online). Retrieved from http://cppg.fccollege.edu.pk/ageing-gender-social-class-and-health-in-pakistan/

Ragin, C.C., Amoroso L.M (2011) Constructing Social Research. California: Pine Forge Press

Razum,O., Sahin-Hodoglugil, N.N., Polit, K. (2005) Health, Wealth or Family Ties? Why Turkish Work Migrants Return from Germany, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 31 (4), 719-739. https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830500109894

Rehmatullah, S (2002) Social Welfare in Pakistan. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Riley,M., Johnson, M., Foner, A.(1972) Aging and Society,Vol.3: A Sociology of Age Stratification. New York: Russel Sage Foundation

Rowles, G.D (1983) Place and Personal Identity in Old Age: Observations from Appalachia, Journal of Environmental Psychology, 3,pp.299-313. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0272-4944(83)80033-4

Rubinstein R.I. & Parmelee P.A. (1992) Attachment to Place and the Representation of the Life Course by the Elderly. In: Altman I., Low S.M. (Eds.) Place Attachment. Human Behavior and Environment (Advances in Theory and Research)(pp.139-163).Boston: Springer

Sasson, S. (2001) The Impact of Ethnic Identity upon the Adjustment and Satisfaction of Jewish and African American Residents in a Long-Term Care Facility, Social Work in Health Care, 33 (2), 89–105. https://doi.org/10.1300/J010v33n02_06

Schaeffer, F. (2001). Mythe du retour et réalité de l'entre-deux. La retraite en France, ou au Maroc? Revue Européenne de Migrations Internationales, 17(1), 165–176. https://doi.org/10.3406/remi.2001.1768

Schiller, N., Basch, L., & Blanc, C. (1995). From Immigrant to Transmigrant: Theorizing Transnational Migration. Anthropological Quarterly, 68(1), 48-63.Retrieved from https://www.jstor.org/stable/3317464

Schunck,R.(2011) Immigrant Integration,Transnational Activities and the Life Course, in Wingens,M.,Windzio, M.,de Valk,H & Aybek, C. (Eds) A Life-Course Perspective on Migration and Integratiom (pp. 259-282),.Dortrecht Heidelberg London New York: Springer

Settersten, R. A., Jr. (2006). Aging and the Life Course". In R. H. Binstock & L. K. George (Eds.), Handbook of aging and the social sciences (p. 3–19). Elsevier. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-012088388-2/50004-3

Settersten,R.A & Angel, J.(2011) Trends in The Sociology of Aging: Thirty Years Observations, in Settersten, R.A., Angel,J.(eds.) Handbook of Sociology of Aging (pp.3-16), New York: Springer

Shaw, A. (2000) Kinship and Continuity: Pakistani families in Britain. London: Routledge

Shaw, A. (2004) "British Pakistani elderly without children: An invisible minority", in Kreager P., Schöder-Butterfill M. (eds) Aging without Children: European and Asian Perspectives (pp.198– 222). Oxford: Berghahn Books

Silverman, D. (2011) Interpreting Qualitative Data. London: Sage Publications

Silverstein,M., Gans, D.,Lowenstein,A.,Giarrusso,R, & V.L Bengtson (2010) Older Parent-Child Relationships in Six Developed Nations, Journal of Marriage and Family, 72,1006-10021. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1741-3737.2010.00745.x

Silverstein, M. & Giarrusso,R.(2011) Aging Individuals, Families and Societies: Micro-Meso -Macro linkages in the Life Course. In Settersten, R.A. & Angel, J.(Eds.) Handbook of Sociology of Aging (pp.35-50). New York: Springer

Simmel, G. (1908) "The Stranger", in Appelrouth, S.A. & Edles, L.D (Eds.) (2012) Classical and Contemporary Sociological Theory (pp.242-245). Los Angeles: SAGE

Steinkellner,A. (2020, March 9) Nesten 15 prosent er innvandrere. Retrieved from https://www.ssb.no/befolkning/artikler-og-publikasjoner/nesten-15-prosent-er-innvandrere

Stenning,A. (2005) Post-Socialism and the changing geographies of the Everyday in Poland, Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers,30 (5), 113-127. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1475-5661.2005.00155.x

Spradley, J. (1979) The Ethnographic Interview. New York: Rienhart & Winston

Svalfors, S.,Halvorsen,K. & Andersen,J.G. (2001) Work Orientations in Scandinavia: Employment Commitment and Organizational Commitment in Denmark, Norway

and Sweden, Acta Sociologica, 44(2), 139-156. https://doi.org/10.1177/000169930104400203

Swidler, A.(1986) Culture in Action: Symbols and Strategies, American Sociological Review, 51(2), 273-286. Retrieved from https://www.jstor.org/stable/2095521

Syltevik, L.J. (1996) Fra relasjonelt til individualisert alenemoderskap: En studie av alenemødre som mødre, lønnsarbeidere og klienter i velferdsstaten (PhD dissertation, University of Bergen) Retrieved from http://bora.uib.no/handle/1956/19026

Synak,B (1989) Formal Care for Elderly People in Poland, Journal of Cross-Cultural Gerontology, 4, 107-127. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00116390

Synak, B. (1990) The Polish Family: Stability, Change and Conflict, Journal of Aging Studies, 4 (4),333-344. https://doi.org/10.1016/0890-4065(90)90003-Q

Szelagowska, G. (2011) Politisk emigrasjon fra Polen under unntakstilstanden – tradisjon eller et nytt fenomen. In Jurgo-Puszcz, M.(Ed.) Polske Politiske flyktninger til Norge på 1980-tallet. Milanòwek:Archivum Panstwowe

Thorsen, K. (2001) Et kjønnsperspektiv på makt og avmakt hos tjenestemottakerne.pp.31-60 In Makt og Avmakt i Helse og Omsorgstjenestene (pp.31-60) (Nova Report,18/01). Retrieved from https://www.idunn.no/tidsskrift_for_omsorgsforskning/2015/01/utviklingen_i_pleie-_og_omsorgstjenestene_19942013

Thorsen, K. & Clausen, S.E. (2009) Hvem er de ensomme? Samfunnsspeilet,1. Retrieved from https://www.ssb.no/sosiale-forhold-og-kriminalitet/artikler-og-publikasjoner/hvem-er-de-ensomme

Timmermans, S. & Tavory, I. (2012) Theory Construction in Qualitative Research: From Grounded Theory to Abductive Analysis, Sociological Theory, 30(3), 167-186. https://doi.org/10.1177/0735275112457914

Tjelmeland, H (2003) Del 1: 1940 -1975, In Kjelstadli, K (Ed.) Norges innvandringshistorie, Bind 3: I globaliseringens tid 1940-2000.Oslo: Pax Forlag

Tjora, A. (2012) Kvalitative Forskningsmetoder i Praksis. Oslo: Gyldendal Akademisk

Torres, S. (1999) A culturally relevant framework for the study of successful ageing, Ageing and Society,19, 33-51. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X99007242

Torres, S. (2001). Understanding 'successful aging' : Cultural and migratory perspectives (PhD dissertation). Acta Universitatis Upsaliensis, Uppsala. Retrieved from http://urn.kb.se/resolve?urn=urn:nbn:se:uu:diva-94</div>

Torres, S. (2002) Relational Values and Ideas Regarding "Succesful Aging", Journal of Comparative Family Studies,33(3),417-431. Retrieved from https://www.jstor.org/stable/41603831

Torres, S. (2004) "Making Sense of the Construct of Successful Ageing: the migrant experience", in Daatland, S.O.,Biggs, S. (eds.) Ageing and Diversity: Multiple Pathways and Cultural Migrations (pp.125-140). Bristol: The Policy Press

Torres, S. (2006) Elderly Immigrants in Sweden: 'Otherness' Under Construction, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 32(8), 1341.1358. https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830600928730

Torres,S., Lawrence, S. (2012) An introduction to 'the age of migration' and its consequences for the field of gerontological social work, European Journal of Social Work, 15(1), 1-7. https://doi.org/10.1080/13691457.2012.661562

Torres,S.(2013) Transnationalism and the Study of Aging and Old Age, In: Phellas C. (Ed.) Aging in European Societies. International Perspectives on Aging, vol 6,(pp.267-281),Boston, MA: Springer

Torres, S. & Karl, U. (2016) A Migration Lens on Inquiries nto Ageing, Old age and Elderly Care: Carving a space while Assessing the State of Affairs. In Karl,U. & Torres, S. (eds.) Ageing in Contexts of Migration (pp.1-12). New York: Routledge

Vabø ,M. (2011) Changing Governance, Changing Needs Intepetations: Implications for Universalism. International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy, 31 (3/4),197-208. https://doi.org/10.1108/01443331111120618

Vestel, V. J. (2009). The process of Hybridization: Cognition, Emotion and Experience Among Multicultural Youngsters in "Rudenga", East side Oslo. In Alghasi, S., Eriksen, T.H. & Ghorashi, H. (eds,). Paradoxes of cultural recognition: Perspectives from Northern Europe (pp.181-199). London: Routledge

Vertovec,S. (1999) Conceiving and Researching Transnationalism, Ethnic & Racial Studies, 22(2), 447-462. https://doi.org/10.1080/014198799329558

Victor,C.R.,Martin, W., & M. Zubair (2012) Families and caring amongst older people in South Asian communities in the UK: a pilot study, European Journal of Social Work, 15 (1), 81-96. https://doi.org/10.1080/13691457.2011.573913

Vignes, B. (2011) Førtidspensjon og Innvandrere (Masters thesis, University of Bergen. Retrieved from http://hdl.handle.net/1956/4895

Vogt, K. (2008) Islam på Norsk – Moskeer og Islamske Organisasjoner i Norge. Oslo: Cappelen Damm

Vogt, K.C.(2018) Myten om Velferdsavhengigh.In Christensen, K.,Syltevik, L.J (eds.) Myter om Velferd og Velferdsstaten (pp.59-73). Nordic Open Access Scholarly Publishing: Cappelen Damm Akademisk. https://doi.org/10.23865/noasp.47

Vrålstad, S. (2012). Deltakelse i organisasjoner og politisk virksomhet. Mer aktive med tillit til andre. Samfunnsspeilet, 26(2), 14–20. Retrieved from https://www.ssb.no/kultur-og-fritid/artikler-og-publikasjoner/mer-aktive-med-tillit-til-andre--87121

Walsh, K. & Näre, L. (eds.) (2016) Transnational Migration and Home in Older Age. New York: Routledge

Walsh, K. & Näre, L. (2016) "Introduction: Transnational Migration and Home in Older Age" in Walsh, K., Näre, L. (eds) Transnational Migration and Home in Older Age. (pp.1-24). New York: Routledge

Warnes, A.M., Friedrich, K., Kellaher, L. & Torres, S. (2004) The Diversity and Welfare of Older Migrants in Europe, Ageing and Society, 24 (3). 307-326. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X04002296

Warnes, A.M., Williams, A. (2006) Older Migrants in Europe: A New Focus for Migration Studies, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 32(8), 1257-1281. https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830600927617

Watson,P,(1993) Eastern Europe's Silent Revolution: Gender, Sociology, 27 (3),471-487. Retrieved from www.jstor.org/stable/42855234

Wessendorf, S. (2017) Migrant belonging, social location and the neighbourhood: Recent migrants in East London and Birmingham', Urban Studies56(1), 131–146. https://doi.org/10.1177/0042098017730300,.

White, P. (2006) Migrant Populations Reaching Old Age: Prospects in Europe, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 32 (8),1283-1300.https://doi.org/10.1080/13691830600927708

Wigfall, V., J. Brannen, A. Mooney & V. Parutis (2012) Finding the right man: recruiting fathers in inter-generational families across ethnic groups, Qualitative Research, 13(5),591-607. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794112446109

Wiles, J.L., Leibing, A., Guberman, N., Reeve, J. & Allen, R.S. (2012) The Meaning of "Aging in Place" to Older People, The gerontologist, 52 (3), 357-366. https://doi.org/10.1093/geront/gnr098

Williams, A. M., King, R., & Warnes, T. (1997). A Place in the Sun: International Retirement Migration from Northern to Southern Europe. European Urban and Regional Studies, 4(2), 115–134. https://doi.org/10.1177/096977649700400202

Wikan, U. (1995) Mot en ny norsk underklasse. Innvandrere, kultur og integrasjon. Oslo: Gyldendal.

Wimmer, A.,Schiller, N.G (2003) Methodological Nationalism, the Social Sciences and the Study of Migration: An essay in historical epistemology, International Migration Review, 37 (3),576-610. Retrieved from www.jstor.org/stable/30037750

Wingens,M.,de Valk, H.,Windzio,M & Aybek, C. (2011) The Sociological Life Course Approach and Research on Migration and Intregration. In Wingens,M.,Windzio, M.,de Val,H & Aybek. C. (Eds.) A Life-Course Perspective

on Migration and Integratiom (pp.1-26).Dortrecht Heidelberg London New York: Springer

Wolfinger, N.H. (2002) On writing fieldnotes: collection strategies and background expectancies, Qualitative Research,2 (1),85-95. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794102002001640

Wray, S. (2003) Women growing Older: Agency,Ethnicity and Culture, Sociology,37(3), 511-527. https://doi.org/10.1177/00380385030373007

Wray,S.(2004) What Constitutes Agency and Empowerment for Women in Later Life?, The Sociological Review,52(1), 22-38. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-954X.2004.00440.x

Wu, Z., Penning, M. J., & Schimmele, C. M. (2005). Immigrant status and unmet health care needs. Canadian journal of public health = Revue canadienne de sante publique, 96(5), 369–373. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF03404035

Wu,Z. & Penning, M. (2015) Immigration and Loneliness in Later Life. Ageing and Society, 35 (1): 64–95. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X13000470

Wærness, K. (1998) The Changing 'Welfare Mix' in Childcare and Care for the Frail Elderly in Norway in Lewis, J. (Ed.) Gender, Social Care and Welfare State Restructuring in Europe (pp.207-228).Aldershot: Ashgate.

Yin, R.K (2003) Case Study Research. Design and Methods. London: Sage Publications

Zechner, M. (2008) Care of Older Persons in Transnational Settings, Journal of Aging Studies, 22(1), 32-44. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaging.2007.02.002

Zontini, E. (2010) Enabling and constraining aspects of social capital in migrant families: ethnicity, gender and generation, Ethnic and Racial Studies, 33 (5), 816-831. https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870903254661

Zontini, E. (2015) Growing old in a transnational social field: belonging, mobility and identity among Italian migrants, Ethnic and Racial Studies, 38 (2), 326-341, https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2014.885543

Zubair, M., & Norris, M. (2015). Perspectives on ageing, later life and ethnicity: ageing research in ethnic minority contexts. Ageing and society, 35(5), 897–916. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X14001536

Zubair, M., Victor, C. (2015)Exploring gender, age, time and space in research with older Pakistani Muslims in The United Kingdom: formalized research "ethics" and performances of the public/private divide in the "field". Ageing & Society, 35, 961-985. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0144686X14001378

Øydgard, G.(2018) Individuelle Behovsvurderinger eller Standardiserte Tjenestetilbud? En institusjonell etnografi om kommunale saksbehandleres oversettelse fra behov til vedtak Tidsskrift for Omsorgsforskning, 1 (4),27-39. https://doi.org/10.18261/issn.2387-5984-2018-01-04

Attachment 1 Information letter to the municipality

Bergen 24.9.2013

Informasjon om prosjektet:

Transnasjonal aldring i den norske velferdsstaten

Prosjektet har finansiering fra Det samfunnsvitenskapelige fakultet ved Universitetet i Bergen. Sluttidspunktet for prosjektet er Høsten 2017.

Prosjektleder: Katrine Mellingen Bjerke, PhD stipendiat, Sosiologisk institutt

Veileder: Karen Christensen, Dr. Polit., sosiologi, professor ved Universitetet i Bergen

Prosjektets formål:

Hovedformålet er å få innsikt i hvordan eldre innvandrere med bakgrunn fra Pakistan og Polen forholder seg til alderdom i Norge. Prosjektet vil ved hjelp av et nedenfra perspektiv belyse innvandreres erfaringer med Norge som velferdsstat, og norske velferdstjenester i form av eldreomsorgstjenester. Generelt sett vil prosjektet bidra til forståelsen av møtet mellom migranter og den norske velferdsstat. Jeg vil via en livshistorisk tilnærming søke innsikt i hvordan kultur, ressurser, migrantenes erfaringer med det norske arbeidsmarkedet, og deres tilgjengelige nettverk influerer på deres konkrete livssituasjon når de blir gammel utenfor eget hjemland. I prosjektet vil også betydningen av om de kommer fra et europeisk land eller et land utenfor Europa være sentral. Migranter fra land innenfor og utenfor Europa har ulike rettigheter, og det vil være viktig å se på hvordan dette influerer den enkelte migrants møte med alderdom i Norge. Ettersom polske innvandrere er den nest største gruppen av innvandrere til Norge i dag fra europeiske land, og de pakistanske innvandrerne utgjør den største gruppen fra land utenfor Europa, har jeg valgt å fokusere på disse to gruppene.

Prosjektsammendrag

Norge står i dag overfor en omfattende aldring i befolkningen. I følge tall fra Statistisk sentralbyrå(SSB) er antallet eldre, i alderen 67 år og utover, per 1. januar 2010 på 624 000, tilsvarende 13 prosent av befolkningen, og SSB anslår at dette tallet vil dobles innen 2060. Dette innebærer at eldreomsorgssektoren står ovenfor betydelige utfordringer i fremtiden. Differensiering av brukere, herunder det økende antall brukere med innvandrerbakgrunn, er en av utfordringene som sektoren står overfor, og det er behov for å følge dette opp forskningsmessig. Prosjektet er en empirisk studie som tar for seg eldre med innvandrerbakgrunn sine forventninger til alderdom i Norge og deres praksis når denne alderdommen på ulike vis inntrer. Jeg undersøker hvordan etnisitet og kultur, ressurser og kjønn influerer på de eldre innvandrerne og deres perspektiv på alderdom, og det å motta tjenester i Norge.

Den norske eldreomsorgssektoren har gjennomgått en rekke endringer de siste tiårene, som blant annet kjennetegnes av økt konsum- og markedsorientering. Det frie brukervalget innen de hjemmebaserte tjenestene, hvor brukeren kan velge mellom offentlige og private

leverandører som har kontrakt med kommunen, representerer et eksempel på en slik markedsorientering. Studien vil søke innsikt i de eldre innvandrernes kjennskap til og erfaringer med bl.a. det frie brukervalget som en del av deres erfaringer med eldreomsorgstjenester.

Prosjektets metoder

Metodisk vil jeg ta i bruk livshistorieintervjuer og deltagende observasjon. Intervjuene vil gjennomføres som halvstrukturerte intervju og brukes for å få innsikt i den enkeltes migrasjonshistorie-, og erfaringer med møtet med det norske samfunn, i tillegg til den enkeltes erfaringer med og forhold til det å tilbringe alderdommen i et land utenfor hjemlandet. Jeg vil også stille spørsmål om det å motta hjelp fra det offentlige, herunder deres erfaringer med det frie brukervalget, og deres forventninger til framtiden.

I tillegg til livshistorieintervjuer planlegger jeg deltagende observasjon. Den deltagende observasjonen vil jeg bruke for å få innsikt i de eldre innvandrernes daglige rutiner, hvordan de handler for å få dekket sine behov på ulike måter, hva som kjennetegner deres relasjoner til omsorgsyter, både formelle og evt. familiemedlemmer, hvilke boforhold de lever under, hvordan nettverket deres er utenfor familien, og om de har noen møteplasser utenfor hjemmet hvor de evt. møter andre jevnaldrende.

Ettersom det frie brukervalget er innført i Bergen og Oslo, i tillegg til at det er her et stort antall eldre innvandrere bor er det disse to byene jeg vil rekruttere utvalget fra. Jeg vil ta i bruk ulike rekrutteringskilder slik som kommunen og private tjenestetilbydere, interesseorganisasjoner for og av innvandrere, og religiøse organisasjoner.

Studien vil ta etiske hensyn til innvandrernes sårbare situasjon, samt kulturelle og språklige utfordringer.

Min intensjon når det gjelder antall intervjuer er å få 6 informanter fra hver av de ulike kombinasjoner av dimensjonene kjønn og etnisitet (Pakistan og Polen). Dette danner 4 grupper, med tilsammen 24 informanter til intervju. I tillegg kommer den deltagende observasjonen som jeg ønsker å gjennomføre med 2 personer fra hver gruppe av informanter, tilsammen 8 personer. Med de to dimensjonene kjønn og etnisitet som hovedvariabler ønsker jeg å oppnå spredning på informantene i forhold til alder, hjelpebehov, og tilgjengelige ressurser.

Oversikt over kriterier for den konkrete utvelgelsen av informanter til prosjektet:

-Kvinne eller mann bosatt fast i Norge, men som er født og oppvokst i Polen eller Pakistan og i dag er pensjonert, og/eller er bruker av en hjemmebasert omsorgstjeneste (praktisk bistand, omsorgslønn, hjemmesykepleie, matombringing, trygghetsalarm i hjemmet, omsorgslønn eller støttekontakt)

-Har tilstrekkelig erfaringer fra Pakistan eller Polen til å ha erfaringer med å være migrant i det norske samfunn

-Er villig til å la seg intervjue i om lag halvannen time om sin livshistorie med fokus på sin situasjon som innvandrer, sin livssituasjon i dag, og forhold som angår deres aktuelle bruk av formell og uformell eldreomsorg i dag.

De som deltar vil i etterkant få tilsendt en kort rapport fra prosjektet dersom de ønsker det.

Vennlig hilsen

Katrine Mellingen Bjerke, E-mail: katrine.bjerke@sos.uib.no, Tlf. mobil: 92468387

Attachment 2: Information letter to participants

Informasjonsskriv om forskningsprosjekt tilknyttet Sosiologisk institutt, Universitetet i Bergen

Transnasjonal aldring i den norske velferdsstaten

Kjære deltaker

Jeg vil invitere deg til å delta i en intervjustudie om ditt forhold til å bli gammel i Norge, og dine tanker om og erfaringer med både formelle og uformelle tjenester fra familie og andre.

Studien, som er finansiert av Det samfunnsvitenskapelige fakultet ved Universitetet i Bergen, vil belyse eldre innvandreres erfaringer med og syn på eldreomsorg, og hvordan det oppleves å bli gammel i et land utenfor hjemlandet. Jeg bruker et såkalt nedenfra- og- opp- perspektiv hvor fokus er på dine livserfaringer, livet før migrasjonen, dine tanker om det å flytte og bosette deg i et annet land og møtet med Norge, norske institusjoner og det norske arbeidsmarkedet, viktige familiehendelser og hvordan du tilbringer livet i dag. Når det gjelder livet ditt i dag er jeg spesielt interessert i hvordan du du går frem for å motta den formelle og uformelle hjelpen du trenger og ønsker å motta. Jeg er også interessert i å vite om dine erfaringer med den hjelpen du har mottatt fra det offentlige ved alderdom, og hvilke tanker du gjør deg om framtiden, og framtidig bruk av offentlige omsorgstjenester. Videre er jeg interessert i relevante temaer som du selv ønsker å ta opp.

Jeg ønsker å gjennomføre et personlig intervjuer i ditt hjem, om du tillater det. Intervjuet spilles inn på båndopptaker for å sikre korrekt gjengivelse av intervjumaterialet Jeg vil selv intervjue og transkribere i etterkant. Dersom du ønsker at intervjuet skal gjennomføres ved hjelp av tolk er dette også mulig. Tolken vil da ha taushetsplikt. Informasjon gitt i intervjuet vil ikke komme tilbake til offentlige ansatte, institusjoner du har kontakt med, eller noen andre.

I tillegg til å intervjue deg ønsker jeg, dersom du er åpen for det, å følge deg 1-2 dager for å se hvordan du organiserer din hverdag. Din deltagelse i dette er helt frivillig, og uavhengig av om du sier ja til intervjuet.

Tidspunkt for prosjektavslutning er 1.08 2017. Innen den tid vil lydopptakene ha blitt slettet. De transkriberte dataene vil lagres, men de vil bli grovkategorisert slik at det er umulig å gjenkjenne den enkelte deltaker. Med andre ord vil datamaterialet være anonymisert. Ingen deltagere i studien vil gjenkjennes i prosjektets publikasjoner.

Det er frivillig å delta i studien, og du kan når som helst trekke ditt samtykke uten å oppgi noen grunn. Dersom du trekker deg, vil alle opplysninger om deg bli anonymisert. Din deltagelse i prosjektet har ingen innvirkning på dine aktuelle omsorgstjenester og den hjelp du får.

Studien er meldt til og godkjent av Personvernombudet for forskning, Norsk samfunnsvitenskapelig datatjeneste AS.

Dersom du ønsker å delta eller har noen spørsmål til studien, ta kontakt med prosjektansvarlig, Katrine Mellingen Bjerke, Telefon: 924 68 387 eller 55584841, eller epost: katrine.bjerke@sos.uib.no

Vennlig hilsen Katrine Mellingen Bjerke Bergen 24.9.2013

Attachment 3: Interview guide

Intervjuguide.
Takke for deltagelse, snakke litt løst om prosjektet-hva det handler om, informert samtykke enda en gang, informere om båndopptaker og at innspillingen vil slettes ved avslutning av prosjektet.
Om livet i Pakistan/Polen
Jeg vil først stille noen spørsmål om livet i Pakistan /Polen før du kom til Norge-

- Når ble du født?
- Hvor ble du født?

- Kan du fortelle litt om livet i Pakistan/Polen før du kom hit? Noen minner som er spesielt fremtredende?

- Har du gått på skolen i Pakistan/Polen
    - Hvor mange år gikk du på skolen i Pakistan/Polen?

- Hadde du arbeid utenfor hjemmet i Pakistan/Polen?
- Kan du fortelle litt om dette arbeidet?

Om migrasjonsprosessen

- Når kom du til Norge?
- Hva var det som gjorde at du flyttet fra Pakistan/Polen?
- Hvordan fikk du adgang til Norge? (migrasjonsårsak, flukt, familiegjenforening, arbeidsinnvandring?)
- Hvilke tanker gjorde du deg om å flytte og bosette deg i Norge før du kom hit?
- Hvilke språk kunne du når du kom hit?
- Husker du hvordan den første tiden i Norge var?
- Hvilke personer hadde du kontakt med i den første tiden her?
- Lærte du deg norsk når du kom hit? (Fikk du noe undervisningstilbud eller lærte du det på andre måter?).
- Fikk du arbeid utenfor hjemmet når du kom til Norge`?
- Hvilket arbeid gjorde du?
- Hvordan opplevde du forholdene på arbeidsplassen?

- Når bestemte du deg for å bli i Norge? Hva var det som gjorde at du tok denne avgjørelsen?

Om hverdagslige handlinger/praksis

- Kan du beskrive en vanlig dag i livet ditt i dag?
- Hvilke mennesker har du kontakt med?
- Hvordan opplever du din relasjon til familien?
- Hvilke forpliktelser har du (til familien, venner, i Norge/Polen/Pakistan?)
- Tilhører du noen religion? Hvilken betydning har religionen for deg?

Familie og andre nettverk.

- Bor du alene eller sammen med ektefelle/familie?
- Hvordan trives du der hvor du bor i dag?
- Bor mange av familiemedlemmene dine i Norge?
- Hvordan opplever du relasjonen til familien?
- Har du kontakt med familien/ i Pakistan/Polen? Hvordan opplever du kontakten med familiemedlemmer/venner i Pakistan/Polen?
- Hvor viktig er det for deg å opprettholde kontakten med familiemedlemmer i Pakistan og Polen?
- Hvilken betydning har familien i livet ditt?
- Har du noen steder du går til for å treffe andre på din alder? Hvilke mennesker har du kontakt med utenfor familien?

Livet ved aldring.

- Når ble du pensjonert?
- Hva ville ha vært vanlig i Polen/Pakistan dersom du fortsatt bodde der?
- Hva synes du om norsk pensjonsalder?
- Hva synes du om å bli pensjonist?
- På hvilken måter føler du at livet har endret seg etter du ble pensjonert?) Bare til dem som har vært i arbeid.
- Hvordan vurderer du at helsen din har vært i livet?
- Hva ville vært vanlig å gjøre i Pakistan/Polen dersom du ble syk og fortsatt bodde der?
- Hva gjør du/Hvordan går du frem når du trenger hjelp i dag?
– i forhold til helse
– praktisk hjelp

- Mottar du noe hjelp fra det offentlige? Hvilke tjenester mottar du?
– Hvilken informasjon fikk du av kommunen om muligheter for å motta hjelp fra det offentlige?
(Hvordan fikk du informasjon om ulike tilbud og muligheter?)

- Hvordan opplever du kontakten med det formelle hjelpeapparatet? (Saksbehandler,hjemmehjelp, hjemmesykepleier?
- Hva kjennetegner god omsorg for deg`?

- Har du kjennskap til ordningen med fritt brukervalg?

Om tanker om fremtiden

- Hvilke tanker gjør du deg om framtiden?

- Dersom situasjonen skulle endre seg og du måtte flyttet på institusjon, hva tenker du er viktig for at du skal kunne finne deg tilrette og trives?

Oppsummering.

- Hvilke hendelser i livet tenker du at har hatt stor betydning for livet ditt i dag?

- Vi har nå snakket om ulike faser i livet ditt og hvordan du tenker om livssituasjonen i dag. Jeg oppsummerer kort hvilke hovedpoenger som har kommet fram.

- Hvordan synes du at intervjuet har gått?

Er det noe mer du ønsker å fortelle som vi ikke har snakket om?

Utfylling av skjema med oversikt over hvilke tjenester informanten mottar og om han/hun bruker privat eller offentlig leverandør-

uib.no