Abstract

The paper presents the resources offered by the Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen (WAB) on Wittgenstein Source. Moreover, it describes the conditions for their use. Finally, the paper also briefly introduces WAB's "Nachlass transcriptions" site from which all of WAB's transcriptions of the Wittgenstein Nachlass can be downloaded, and the tool WiTTFind which permits lemmatized online search in the entire Nachlass and is the result of more than five years of close cooperation between WAB and the Centrum für Informations- und Sprachverarbeitung (CIS) at the Ludwig Maximilians Universität München.

Alois Pichler

A brief update on editions offered by the Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen and licences for their use (as of June 2018)

Most Wittgenstein scholars will already know that the Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen (WAB, http://wab.uib.no/) not only published "Wittgenstein's Nachlass: The Bergen Electronic Edition" (BEE 2000),[1] but also runs Wittgenstein Source (Wittgenstein 2009-). In this paper I will first briefly present the resources available on Wittgenstein Source and then describe the conditions for their use. I will end by drawing the reader's attention to two additional resources: a website from which all of WAB's transcriptions of the Wittgenstein Nachlass can be downloaded, always in their newest and most updated versions (IDP 2016), and the tool WiTTFind which permits lemmatized online search in the entire Nachlass (Hadersbeck, Pichler et al. 2016).

Editions

Wittgenstein Source was created within the scope of the European Union financed Discovery project[2] and began in 2009 with publishing five thousand pages from the Wittgenstein Nachlass, including items from the *Notes on Logic* complex, the *Lecture on Ethics* complex, the *Big Typescript* complex and the

---

[1] WAB continues cooperation with Oxford University Press towards a new *Bergen Electronic Edition*.

[2] http://wab.uib.no/wab_discovery.page, 2006-09

Brown Book complex.[3] The items were published in both facsimile and text editions, since from the start the intention has always been that users shall be able to browse facsimiles and transcriptions in parallel. In 2015-17, in the Wittgenstein Source *Bergen Nachlass Edition* (BNE 2015-), WAB significantly enlarged the facsimile part of the edition so that it today comprises more than twenty thousand image files (some of them offering alternative captures of one and the same page). In the coming years WAB's transcriptions of all Nachlass items will be added to the BNE and interlinked with the images. It is expected that the facsimile and the text editions will be complete by 2021 at latest, and will thus be browsable on BNE in parallel. As mentioned, all of WAB's transcriptions are currently available from IDP 2016; moreover, they are also already linked from the IDP to the BNE facsimile edition site.

While the five thousand pages Wittgenstein Nachlass facsimile originally published on Wittgenstein Source in 2009 still comes from the BEE, the user can find new and much better facsimiles produced in recent years in the BNE.[4] The new facsimile set was made possible thanks to the generous support of the London Stanhill Foundation which covered the costs for scans of the Wren and Austrian National Library (ÖNB) materials, the Ontario Bertrand Russell Archives which covered the costs for scans of its own Wittgenstein materials, and the Vienna Christian Doppler Forschungsgesellschaft which covered the costs for scans of the materials at the Bodleian Library. In addition, the Wren Library, the ÖNB, the Bertrand Russell Archives, the Bodleian Library, the Section for Digital Services at the University of Bergen Library and the Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen all provided substantial in-kind contributions in the form of personnel resources.

Wittgenstein Source was initially home only to WAB's own resources, but in 2015 it was adapted to house also editions provided by others. As of June 2018, besides the BNE, three more editions are available on Wittgenstein Source: the *Facsimile Edition of Moore's Notes of Wittgenstein's Lectures*, edited by David Stern, Brian Rogers, and Gabriel Citron (MWN 2015); the *Facsimile Edition of Tractatus Publication Materials*, edited by Alfred Schmidt (LPA 2016); and the *Prototractatus Tools* by Martin Pilch (PTT 2016-).

MWN gives access to the manuscripts containing G.E. Moore's holograph notes of Wittgenstein's lectures at Cambridge University 1930-33. These are: (i) Six notebooks that Moore used to take notes at Wittgenstein's Cambridge lectures from January 1930 to May 1933 (items 10.7.4-10.7.9); (ii) Loose-leaf summary notes, based on those notebooks, which Moore composed in the early

---

[3] The items were in detail: Ts-201a1, Ts-201a2 (1913-14); Ms-139a, Ts-207 (1929); Ms-114, Ms-115 (first part), Ms-153a, Ms-153b, Ms-154, Ms-155, Ms-156a, Ms-148, Ms-149, Ms-150, Ts-212, Ts-213 (1931-34); Ms-115 (second part), Ms-140 (p. 39v), Ms-141, Ms-152, Ts-310 (1934-36).

[4] With the exception of Ts-212 for which still the BEE images are displayed.

1950s (item 10.7.10); (iii) The manuscript of a short paper on Wittgenstein on grammar which Moore read in Wittgenstein's class in February 1932 (item 15.10). The originals of these items are kept at Cambridge University Library, Department of Manuscripts and University Archives, George Edward Moore: Correspondence and Papers, MS Add.8875, 10.7.4-10, and 15.10. They are reproduced in MWN 2015 by kind permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library, Perry Moore, and Thomas Baldwin. An edition with edited transcriptions of these manuscripts has appeared in Wittgenstein 2016.

LPA gives access to four highly important items from the publication history of Wittgenstein's *Logisch-philosophische Abhandlung* and *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*: (i) Print pages of "Logisch-philosophische Abhandlung" in *Annalen der Naturphilosophie* 14 (1921) with corrections by Wittgenstein (ÖNB, Cod.Ser.n. 39.597); (ii) The English translation of the *Logisch-philosophische Abhandlung* by Frank Ramsey with corrections by Wittgenstein (ÖNB, Cod.Ser.n. 39.598); (iii) Ogden's list of questions concerning the translation of "Logisch-philosophische Abhandlung" with comments by Wittgenstein (ÖNB, Cod.Ser.n. 39.037); (iv) The proofs of "Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus" (1922) with corrections by Wittgenstein (ÖNB, Cod.Ser.n 39.039). These materials were previously partly published in CCO 1973 and TLP 2004, but now for the first time they are here made available in open access and in high-resolution colour facsimiles.

PTT is a resource in dynamic development, giving access to transcriptions of manuscripts and typescripts of the *Tractatus* corpus. The resource has a strong focus on the genetic processes which led up to the so-called "Prototractatus" in Ms-104 and the first typescripts of the *Tractatus*, Ts-204 with carbon copy Ts-202 (which are all included in BNE 2015-). PPT 2016- is conceived of as complementary to the existing text editions, including B. McGuinness and J. Schulte's critical edition of the *Tractatus* and *Prototractatus* (TLP 1989). It contains impressively ultra-diplomatic and linearized transcriptions of Ms-104, utilizing colour-coded representations as well as graphical representations of the various text-genetic and compositional relations that exist within the *Tractatus* corpus. As of January 2018, the resource contains an introduction, a presentation of edition plans, an overview of the site's overall structure (all in German), as well as the following sub-parts: (i) Ms-104 diplomatic representation; (ii) Ms-104 linearized representation; (iii) Ms-104 colour-coded representation; (iv) "Prototractatus" ordered representation; (v) Ms-104 regularized representation; (vi) Ms-104 normalized representation. Extensions of the edition that are in the works include representations of the Ts-202 complex, bidirectional comparisons between the *Tractatus* and the "Prototractatus", as well as representations of intermediate stages of the "Prototractatus".

Licenses

All materials made available on Wittgenstein Source are made available open access in the sense that access to them is not restricted by a paywall. Everyone with an internet connection can directly access the materials on the Wittgenstein Source site and can browse, read, study and (within fair use) cite them entirely for free. However *gratis open access* (removal of price barriers) and *libre open access* (removal also of permission barriers, see Suber 2003) are two different things, and most materials published on Wittgenstein Source are *not* available on the terms of *libre* open access. It is thus important that the user of Wittgenstein Source pays attention to the fact that there are restrictions on the use of its materials and keeps in mind that different licences may apply to the different editions on Wittgenstein Source, as well as that even within one and the same edition different licences may apply to its different parts.

The facsimiles in MWN are all reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library, Perry Moore and Thomas Baldwin. Use of the facsimiles is governed by the "All rights reserved" regulation. The same applies to use of the LPA facsimiles. This means, for example, that users who wish to obtain a facsimile from these editions have to first contact the rights holders for permission in order to receive the file(s) from WAB.

The intellectual rights to the texts of the Wittgenstein Nachlass reside since the death in 2004 of the last of Wittgenstein's literary heirs, G.H. von Wright, with Trinity College Cambridge. In 2014 WAB obtained permission from Trinity to make facsimiles of the entire Nachlass open access available in BNE. While the entire set of BNE facsimiles that originate from Trinity College and the Bertrand Russell Archives have since February 2017 been available under the Creative Commons (CC) BY-NC 4.0 licence, this is not the case for the facsimiles stemming from the ÖNB and the Bodleian Library. The latter are again governed by the "All rights reserved" regulation, and an ÖNB or Bodleian facsimile stemming from the BNE can therefore, in distinction to a facsimile of the Wren Library or Bertrand Russell Archives items, *not* be used in a publication without specific permission from the rights holders, even if the publication should be non-commercial.

It must be remembered that the use of the facsimiles from the Wren and Bertrand Russell Archives, even though they are available under the CC BY-NC 4.0 licence, is still governed by regulation: namely precisely by the BY-NC terms. They can be shared, copied and redistributed in any medium or format, adapted or non-adapted without needing further permission. However, appropriate credit must be given to the author and rights holders as well as a link provided to the licence; if adaptations and changes are made, this is to be indicated; only non-commercial use is permitted. This implies that, for example, for any inclusion in commercial publications, an explicit and separate

permission act is required.[5] Giving appropriate credit to the author and rights holders means in the case of BNE facsimiles from the Wren Library: Ludwig Wittgenstein, the Master and Fellows of Trinity College, Cambridge (as both the owner of the intellectual rights in the Wittgenstein Nachlass and the owner of the Wren Library), the University of Bergen, Bergen. And in the case of BNE facsimiles from the Russell Archives: Ludwig Wittgenstein, the Master and Fellows of Trinity College, Cambridge (as the owner of the intellectual rights in the Wittgenstein Nachlass), the Bertrand Russell Archives at McMaster University, Ontario, the University of Bergen, Bergen.

In order to help users avoid making illegitimate use of the image files on Wittgenstein Source, downloading is restricted for *all* facsimiles in the three editions, and users have to contact WAB in order to obtain any image files including those of the materials from the Wren and Russell Archives published in the BNE under the CC BY-NC licence.[6] There is as of today only one edition on Wittgenstein Source which permits straightforward download, namely Martin Pilch's PTT. But even in this case the user must remember that the intellectual rights for the texts of the Wittgenstein Nachlass reside with Trinity College Cambridge.

WAB's Nachlass transcriptions and the search tool WiTTFind

I want to conclude by first briefly describing a second website at WAB, the "Nachlass transcriptions" site, and then the Nachlass search tool WiTTFind which might both prove very useful to the reader. In 2014 WAB obtained permission from Trinity to not only make the new facsimiles, but also its own transcriptions of the Nachlass open access available on the WAB website. As a consequence WAB was able to open its entire set of Wittgenstein Nachlass transcriptions for fair use in May 2016. This is done on WAB's interactive dynamic presentation site (IDP 2016)[7] where users can download diplomatic and lightly normalized linear, but also other, *user definable*, outputs from WAB's XML transcriptions of the Nachlass. The site had a precursor in the "Using XML to generate research tools for Wittgenstein scholars by collaborative groupwork" project that, back in 2002-03, applied interactive dynamic

---

[5] This is a rough and common usage description of the terms; for details and a legal phrasing see https://creativecommons.org/licences/by-nc/4.0/.

[6] The ÖNB offers on its own website free download of lower resolution image files of the ÖNB materials. See for example http://data.onb.ac.at/rec/AL00050254 for images of Nachlass item Ms-105.

[7] http://wab.uib.no/transform/wab.php?modus=opsjoner. For a description of the idea and some features of interactive dynamic presentation see Pichler 2010 and Pichler and Bruvik 2014.

presentation to a part of Wittgenstein Nachlass item Ms-101.[8] With the previously mentioned Discovery project, the corpus was extended in 2009 with the addition of five thousand "Discovery pages", published under the (CC PL) BY-NC-SA 3.0 licence. Since May 27, 2016, the IDP site finally offers access to *all* of WAB's transcriptions, always in their newest versions and with the most recent corrections and improvements included. Thus, while the BNE, as of March 2018, still only contains transcriptions of the five thousand "Discovery pages" - and *as they were made available in 2009* - the "Nachlass transcriptions" site IDP 2016 already today offers access to *all* transcriptions and in their newest and continuously improved versions. While Wittgenstein Source is the open access platform for stable online editions, be they facsimile or text, the interactive dynamic presentation site is intended more as an atelier where one, always with the newest versions of the transcriptions as one's basis, is equipped to interactively produce and access the specific text sequence or text selection needed for the specific context, and in the specific presentation one needs it.

With regard to the conditions of use of IDP 2016, one must note that only the transcriptions of the five thousand "Discovery pages" continue to be available under the (CC PL) BY-NC-SA 3.0 licence under which they were first made available in 2009. The use of all other transcriptions is governed by the "All rights reserved" regulation which does of course permit fair use.

WiTTFind (Hadersbeck, Pichler et al. 2016)[9] offers lemmatized text search access to the entire Nachlass.[10] Although already BEE did offer a number of advanced search and analysis tools which in part remain unmatched, it did not yet include lemmatized search. WiTTFind displays each sentence containing any grammatical form of the word searched for within the context of the larger remark, and additionally highlights the hit in the corresponding facsimile of the remark. The tool is the result of more than five years of close cooperation between WAB and the Centrum für Informations- und Sprachverarbeitung (CIS) at the Ludwig Maximilians Universität München, the former contributing its facsimiles and encoded XML transcriptions of the Wittgenstein Nachlass as well as XSLT stylesheets for their processing, the latter programming and computational linguistics skills as well as a grammatically encoded digital lexicon of the German language. Users need to keep in mind that for the use of the transcriptions and facsimiles displayed on the WiTTFind site precisely the same regulations apply as on the respective other sites already described above.

---

[8] http://wab.uib.no/sept1914/

[9] http://wittfind.cis.uni-muenchen.de/

[10] For search in Nachlass *metadata* (e.g. information about the relation between the Nachlass and the published works or explicit and implicit references to other philosophers) use the semantic faceted search and browsing site http://wab.uib.no/sfb/.

For any remaining questions or requirements for further clarification regarding the resources offered by WAB and the licences for their use please write to wab@uib.no.[11]

References

Hadersbeck, Max; Pichler, Alois; Bruder, Daniel; Schweter, Stefan: New (Re)Search Possibilities for Wittgenstein's Nachlass II: Advanced Search, Navigation and Feedback with the FinderApp WiTTFind, in: Stefan Majetschak and Anja Weiberg (eds.): Aesthetics Today. Contributions of the Austrian Ludwig Wittgenstein Society, 90-93, Kirchberg am Wechsel 2016.

Pichler, Alois: Towards the New Bergen Electronic Edition, in Nuno Venturinha (ed.): Wittgenstein After His Nachlass, 157-172, Houndmills 2010.

Pichler, Alois; Bruvik, Tone Merete: Digital Critical Editing: Separating Encoding from Presentation, in: Daniel Apollon, Claire Bélisle, Philippe Régnier (eds.) Digital Critical Editions, 179-199, Urbana Champaign 2014.

Suber, Peter: Removing the Barriers to Research: An Introduction to Open Access for Librarians, in: College & Research Libraries News 64 (2003), 92-94, 113 [http://legacy.earlham.edu/~peters/writing/acrl.htm].

Wittgenstein, Ludwig: Wittgenstein Source, curated by the Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen under the direction of Alois Pichler [wittgensteinsource.org], Bergen 2009-.

Wittgenstein, Ludwig: Wittgenstein Source Facsimile Edition of Moore's Notes of Wittgenstein's Lectures, ed. by David Stern, Brian Rogers and Gabriel Citron, in: Wittgenstein Source (2009-) [wittgensteinsource.org], Bergen 2015. [MWN 2015]

Wittgenstein, Ludwig: Wittgenstein Source Bergen Nachlass Edition, ed. by the Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen under the direction of Alois Pichler, in: Wittgenstein Source (2009-) [wittgensteinsource.org], Bergen 2015-. [BNE 2015-]

---

[11] I would like to thank Martin Pilch, Alfred Schmidt, Jonathan Smith and David Stern for comments on an earlier version of this paper.

Wittgenstein, Ludwig: Interactive Dynamic Presentation (IDP) of Ludwig Wittgenstein's philosophical Nachlass [http://wab.uib.no/transform/wab.php?modus=opsjoner], ed. by the Wittgenstein Archives at the University of Bergen under the direction of Alois Pichler, Bergen 2016. [IDP 2016]

Wittgenstein, Ludwig: Wittgenstein Source Facsimile Edition of Tractatus Publication Materials, ed. by Alfred Schmidt, Österreichische Nationalbibliothek (ÖNB), in: Wittgenstein Source (2009-) [wittgensteinsource.org], Bergen 2016. [LPA 2016]

Wittgenstein, Ludwig: Wittgenstein Source Prototractatus Tools, ed. by Martin Pilch, in: Wittgenstein Source (2009-) [wittgensteinsource.org]. Bergen 2016. [PTT 2016]

Wittgenstein, Ludwig: Wittgenstein: Lectures, Cambridge 1930-1933, From the Notes of G. E Moore, ed. by David Stern, Brian Rogers and Gabriel Citron, Cambridge 2016.